

# Terminal Evaluation

## Asia

### 1. Outline of the Project

**Country:**

Singapore

**Project title:**

APEC-PFP Management Consultancy for Small and Medium Enterprises

**Issue/Sector:**

Business Management

**Cooperation scheme:**

Third-Country Training Program

**Division in charge:**

Southeast Asia Division, Regional Department I

**Total cost:**

24 Million Yen

**Period of Cooperation** Fiscal Year 1999 - 2001

**Partner Country's Implementing Organization:**

Technical Cooperation Department, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Singapore  
Productivity and Standard Board (PSB)

**Supporting Organization in Japan:**

Ministry of International Trade and Industry (MITI)

**Related Cooperation:**

Project-type Technical Cooperation; "Productivity Management"

Third-country Training Program; "Products Protection Engineering in Logistics"

### 1-1 Background of the Project

In 1994, the Foreign Minister, Mr. Kono, proposed the Partnership for Progress (PFP) plan for Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation (APEC). The objective of the PFP project was mutual development for the promotion of liberalization and facilitation of trade and investment within the region through the resources of each member country.

Economic structural reform was necessary in Asian countries, which had been suffering from the economic crisis in 1997. Because they considered that the bloated debt in the private sector had caused the economic crisis, their prime task was upgrading of consulting capacity in order to restore management ability. These countries also recognized the importance of developing supporting industries in upgrading the manufacturing industry. It was also necessary to cooperate with the small and medium size enterprises making up the support industry of the manufacture industry in technology as well as in management.

In addressing the above issues, the Third-country Training Program, "APEC-PFP Management Consultancy for Small and Medium size Enterprises (the Program)" was endorsed at the Human Resources Development working group of the Asia Pacific Economic Cooperation Conference in Sapporo in January 2000 as a contributing project for the economic development of APEC member countries.

### 1-2 Project Overview

The Government of Japan in collaboration with the PSB implement the Third-country Training Program on management consultancy to participants from the Asia Pacific region and Central and South American countries, who have been engaged in management consultancy services for small and medium size enterprises for more than three years.

#### (1) Overall Goal

The participants take on a major role in their organization in improving management consultancy services for SMEs.

#### (2) Project Purpose

Participants improve knowledge and skills in management consultancy for SMEs.

### (3) Outputs

- 1) Participants understand the techniques and skills required in the provision of management consultancy services to SMEs.
- 2) Participants systematically identify managerial and operational deficiencies and develop practical solutions to enhance profitability and sustain the growth of SMEs.

### (4) Inputs

Japanese side:

Short-term Experts	5
Local Cost	377,000 Singapore dollars (24 Million Yen)

Singaporean Side:

Counterparts	35
Local Cost	155,000 Singapore dollars (8 Million Yen)

### (5) Participant Countries

Chile, China, Mexico, Papua New Guinea, Ghana, Peru, the Philippines, Korea, Thailand and Vietnam.

## 2. Evaluation Team

**Members of Evaluation Team** JICA Singapore office  
(Commissioned to Acequia Information Services)

**Period of Evaluation** 18 January 2002 - 28 March 2002  
**Type of Evaluation:** Terminal Evaluation By Overseas Office

## 3. Results of Evaluation

### 3-1 Summary of Evaluation Results

---

#### (1) Relevance

The Program satisfied the needs of many of the APEC member countries that prioritize the development of industries, and especially the promotion of SMEs. Selecting Singapore as the Program implementing country was relevant because the training environment was well organized, and Singapore was a successful example of technology transfer from Japan and had actively implemented Third-country Training Programs.

Seventy-nine percent (25 out of 46 former participants) of the respondents to the questionnaire survey said that the content of the Program was appropriate.

#### (2) Effectiveness

The participants acquired the level of knowledge necessary for management consultancy for SMEs because the Program lectures were appropriate. Seventy-two percent (18 out of 25) of the respondents said that the proportion of theory to practice was appropriate. Moreover, 84 percent (21 out of 25) of the respondents said that they had applied the knowledge and skills attained in the Course. Based on these indicators, the training objectives were, for the most part, accomplished.

#### (3) Efficiency

The Program was efficiently implemented as a result of the combination of the training management ability of the PSB, the training facility, visiting firms and the quality of the lecturers. Over half of the participants said that they were satisfied with the training contents, such as the level of the lectures, exercises, and duration of the training, and were able to understand the concept of management consultancy. Furthermore, 84 percent of the respondents said that the level of the lectures was appropriate. The PSB commented that input for the training was of the highest efficiency, which achieved a high-quality program.

#### (4) Impact

Most of the participants disseminated the attained knowledge and skills in the organizations where they worked by way of participation in projects or organizing workshops. According to the results of the survey, 19 percent (4 out of 21) said they had organized workshops and utilized the acquired knowledge and techniques, and 76 percent (16 out of 21) said they had utilized these in their own organization.

Because the participants were mid-level officers from organizations related to SMEs, the Project had an important impact on policy, social services and management in their respective countries. For the participating countries, support to SMEs by the public services has become more and more important, so the introduction of knowledge and skills related to the management consultancy for SMEs is considered to have had a positive impact in these countries.

#### (5) Sustainability

Over half of the respondents to the questionnaire said that the level of knowledge, subjects, and duration of the training were appropriate, and that they had utilized the acquired knowledge and skills in developing manuals or submitting reports.

### **3-2 Factors that promoted realization of effects**

---

#### (1) Factors concerning Planning

- 1) Selecting PSB, which had previous experience in technical transfer from Japan as the counterpart agency, enhanced the effects on curriculum development and lecturer appointment.
- 2) Selection of PSB as the implementing organization fully met the needs of the participants, and PSB's appointment of lecturers who had experience in management consultancy in Singapore and in other participating countries further enhanced the effect of the cooperation.

#### (2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process

N/A

### **3-3 Factors that impeded realization of effects**

---

#### (1) Factors concerning Planning

N/A

#### (2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process

- 1) PSB could not have been aware of the request for more practice than theory until the terminal evaluation.
- 2) In the evaluation of the English ability, all participants rated their ability at level three on a scale of five levels. However, the participants from some countries, even though rated three or four, could not express their opinions in English during presentation and question-and-answer sessions.

### **3-4 Recommendations**

---

(1) JICA and the MFA-TCD need to make further efforts to determine more accurately the needs of participants and to confirm English proficiency at the application and selection stages.

(2) The PSB should carefully consider the suggestions from the participants and try to improve the training by narrowing down course subjects, making the lectures more practical, visiting more appropriate companies, etc.

### **3-5 Lessons Learned**

---

(1) The implementing organization should understand how the former participants utilize their acquired knowledge and skills after returning home by conducting a questionnaire survey and the results of the survey should be reflected in the next training to make the training more applicable to the daily work of participants.

(2) JICA should consider requesting the applicants' scores on an international-level English ability test and interview the applicants, a practice already implemented at some JICA offices, to replace objective judgment of English proficiency.

### **3-6 Follow-up Situation**

---

N/A