

# Terminal Evaluation

## Latin America and the Caribbean

### 1. Outline of the Project

**Country:**

El Salvador

**Project title:**

Project on Strengthening of Nursing Education in El Salvador

**Issue/Sector:**

Human Resources Development

**Cooperation scheme:**

Project-type Technical Cooperation

**Division in charge:**

Second Medical Cooperation Division, Medical Cooperation Department

**Total cost:**

678 million yen

**Period of Cooperation**

1 June 1997 - 31 May 2002

**Partner Country's Implementing Organization:**

Ministry of Public Health and Social Welfare

**Supporting Organization in Japan:**

Health, Labour and Welfare Ministry,  
Nursing colleges

**Related Cooperation:****1-1 Background of the Project**

El Salvador was ravaged by a civil war (1980-1992) socially and economically, but after the war ended, the rehabilitation plan, foreign aid and renewed inflow of investment have been bringing about economic recovery. President Calderon Sol, elected in the first general election in 1994 after the peace accord developed the five-year "Social and Economic Development Plan (1994-1999)" aimed at economically and socially reconstructing the war-ravaged country along with a new economic plan promoting structural adjustment.

The development plan prioritized countermeasures in the field of medicine and health, and recognized improvement of the medical system, activation of medical and health institutes, the training of health personnel and their appropriate allocation as major issues to be addressed. According to UN statistics in 1995, the population of the El Salvador was 5.9 million, and GNP per capita was 1,680 dollar, positioning El Salvador among the lowest of the middle-income countries. However, actual development of the health system was far below a level that could be considered sufficient, again because of the devastation caused by the war, and especially among the poor the mortality rate of the pregnant women and infants remained high. Under these circumstances the Government of El Salvador made the development of the capacity of the nurses and assistant nurses directly serving in the health care of El Salvador its prime task, requested Project-type Technical Cooperation from the Government of Japan to review the training plan, nursing personnel system and to upgrade their quality.

**1-2 Project Overview**

The Project develops course materials, prepares textbooks and revises the content of lectures and practices, targeting the six (originally eight) training institutions for nurses, with an aim to train high quality nurses under an appropriate human resources development and allocation plan.

**(1) Overall Goal**

Nursing service is improved in El Salvador.

**(2) Project Purpose**

The quality of nursing education is improved in El Salvador.

### (3) Outputs

- 1) Education for the nursing teachers is improved.
- 2) Education for nursing is standardized.
- 3) The linkage between the education and clinical service of nursing is strengthened.
- 4) The environment for nursing education is improved.
- 5) Activities for achieving sustainability are promoted.

### (4) Inputs

Japanese side:

Long-term Experts	8	Equipment	165 Million Yen
Short-term Experts	13		
Others (development of foundation for the Project) Local cost			134 Million Yen
Trainees received	18		
Third-country Training	1		

El Salvadoran Side:

Counterparts	82
--------------	----

Local Cost

## 2. Evaluation Team

### Members of Evaluation Team

Team Leader: Michiyo HASHIGUCHI, Director, Second Medical Cooperation Division, Medical Cooperation Department, JICA  
Nurse Administration: Yayohi TAMURA, Director, Nursing Division, Health Policy Bureau, Health, Labour and Welfare Ministry  
Nurse Education: Masako YANO, Professor, Faculty of Nursing, University of Shizuoka  
Cooperation Plan: Mai OKADA, Second Medical Cooperation Division, Medical Cooperation Department, JICA  
Evaluation Analysis: Takenori TANAKA, International Department, Regional Planning International Co., LTD.  
Interpreter: Sachiko KATO, Japan International Cooperation Center

### Period of Evaluation

2 January 2002 - 17 January 2002

### Type of Evaluation:

Terminal Evaluation

## 3. Results of Evaluation

### 3-1 Summary of Evaluation Results

---

#### (1) Relevance

The Project Purpose and the target groups of the six target schools were appropriate for both El Salvador and Japan. As shown in the 5 Year Health Strategic Plan, health services were the key issue for El Salvador. Human resources development that would yield excellent nursing personnel was essential to producing good health services, and supporting nursing teachers who foster nursing personnel were matched with the needs of the target groups. Therefore, the relevance is judged to be high. For the Government of Japan as well, health service is one of the priority sectors of the JICA Country Program for El Salvador.

## (2) Effectiveness

The Project Purpose has been accomplished due to the following reasons. According to the answers to a questionnaire from students of the target schools, the teaching methods were evaluated to be 3.9 on a scale of five grades, which was above the target of 3.5. A total of 92 percent of the students passed the objective examination to engage in social services, which was over the 90 percent target of the Project. The following attainment of outcomes promoted accomplishment of the objectives. The curriculum for each assistant nurse, nurse and BS nurse course was prepared and authorized by the Ministry of Education, as the standard curriculum. Spirited activities were conducted, such as the holding of periodical committee meetings by each committee; the organizing of textbooks, the preparing of lecture contents, and the developing of video materials. A variety of training sessions were also implemented for teachers and clinical nurses, and workshops for dissemination of skills. As for teachers, by evaluating their lectures, they could improve their teaching skills. Further improvement of the quality of education is expected as a result of each school organizing its own curriculum, which is in line with the standard curriculum and strengthening of the linkage between education and clinical services from now on.

## (3) Efficiency

The number of experts was less than originally planned; however, with the active participation of counterparts on the El Salvadoran side, the Project was managed efficiently. To promote the project activities, a new nursing training and research center (hereafter called "the Center"), organized as a part of Project infrastructure development was established and effectively utilized as a venue for many of the training sessions and committee activities.

Due to two severe earthquakes in 2001, regular project activities were halted for about three months, and some parts of scheduled activities were delayed.

## (4) Impact

As the students who received an improved education through the Project will graduate in three to five years, it is too early to evaluate the Overall Goal; "Nursing services are improved in El Salvador", however, and the Overall Goal for the future will be accomplished because qualified nursing personnel will be created through the Project.

Some positive impacts are confirmed as follows:

- 1) All target schools expanded and improved facilities such as the laboratory and library by themselves.
- 2) After the implementation of the training, some committees and study meetings were organized, and the participants were well motivated through the activities.
- 3) As a standard curriculum of higher education had not existed in fields other than nursing, the Ministry of Education demonstrated increased interest in standardizing the curriculums in other health related occupations.
- 4) By applying the standard curriculum, it became easy to certify credits when the students changed schools and it made possible the continuation of their academic work.
- 5) By participating in the Project's training course, students earned an official certification, which gave them an advantage when they applied for work as teachers.
- 6) Through the Project, cooperation among the Nursing Unit of the Ministry of Public Health and Social Welfare, the Nurses Association and the Professional Nurse Control Council was enhanced.
- 7) A committee for the directors of the nursing school was established.
- 8) To disseminate the transferred techniques over a wider area, the Government of El Salvador requested a Third-country Training Program from the Government of Japan in order to gather participants from Central America and Caribbean countries.

## (5) Sustainability

In the 5 Year Health Strategic Plan (1999-2004), the role of nursing personnel has been strongly emphasized, and the continuing education of nursing personnel needs to be strengthened. Therefore, government support to the activities of the Center is expected. The convention on the organization and management of the Center upon termination of the Project is under discussion and will be approved by the Minister of Public Health and Social Welfare upon the completion of the convention. After the Project, there will be an insufficiency of necessary personnel even though the head of the Center, nursing teachers, Nurses Association and the Professional Nurse Control Council support the activities.

Financially, the Center requested that the Ministry of Public Health and Social Welfare approve the sale of the textbooks and video materials developed during the Project to meet the need of ensuring independent finance resources. Through Third-country Training, where the outputs of the Project will be disseminated, use of the techniques will expand to Central American and Caribbean countries.

### **3-2 Factors that promoted realization of effects**

---

#### (1) Factors concerning Planning

- 1) The Project Purpose was set up clearly in line with the policy of El Salvador and related persons were united in participating in the activities.
- 2) JICA's head office proposed to settle the model school in the selected target schools. However, considering the scale of El Salvador and the necessity to upgrade the level of nursing education on nationwide basis, a plan targeting all the nursing schools was prepared to promote early achievement of the Overall Goal.

#### (2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process

- 1) Many committees and workshops were organized, and through continuous activities, communication among the organizations related to nursing in El Salvador were expanded and activated. This enhanced the cooperative system of the Project and achieved concrete Project outputs.
- 2) Wide-ranging government support such as that from the Minister of Public Health and Social Welfare as well as that from local health administrations helped the Project.
- 3) The Expert team well understood the circumstances of El Salvador and built a favorable relationship with counterparts, which made it possible to develop the activities in line with the needs of the El Salvadoran side and to realize a variety of ideas (e.g., organizing committees is an example) from both sides.
- 4) JICA as well as the Japanese Embassy and supporting committees in Japan provided strong support by using e-mail to communicate timely information, which contributed to the achievement of the Project purpose in both administrative and technical aspects.
- 5) By implementing monitoring of the Project every six months, the Project was appropriately managed and the project purpose was accomplished as planned.

### **3-3 Factors that impeded realization of effects**

---

#### (1) Factors concerning Planning

At the planning stage, the dispatch of long-term experts was planned in the field of maternal and child health care and community nursing. However, there were difficulties in recruitment and the issue was solved by using other forms of cooperation, such as short-term experts or third-country experts. Even so, this made it difficult to establish and disseminate transferred techniques.

#### (2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process

N/A

### **3-4 Conclusion**

---

The Project, as a result of the concentrated effort and enthusiasm of related persons on both Japanese and El Salvadoran sides, accomplished the planned outcome along with many other achievements. Through continuing education to the nurses, which will be strengthened even further as the country goes ahead, the possibility of attaining the Overall Goal is extremely high. Good communication based on the friendship and reliance among related persons of Japan and El Salvador will make it possible for the Project to be highly evaluated as one of the examples of success.

### **3-5 Recommendations**

---

- (1) It is recommended to give the Center the status of, under the Ministry of Public Health and Social Welfare, "center of continuing education for nursing personnel" and to develop and enhance the human resources, physical, and financial conditions to support the activities.
- (2) The roles and functions of the Center are expected to be as follows:
  - 1) It is necessary to promote research on nursing. Especially important is developing methods to measure the quality of nurses to realize the Overall Goal of the Project.
  - 2) It is recommended to enhance training not only for the teachers but also for specific nursing areas and nursing management.
  - 3) It is recommended for the Center be the base for the transmission of information in the Central American and Caribbean areas.

### **3-6 Lessons Learned**

---

- (1) Usage of PDM contributed to clarifying the project purpose. The periodical monitoring and evaluation in line with the PDM were effective in terms of Project management.

(2) It was efficient for the settlement and dissemination of the transferred technology that a variety of committees were organized and activities were spirited.

(3) The support of related parties on the Japanese side, such as the Japanese Embassy, JICA and supporting committees in Japan, contributed positively to accomplishment of the objectives in administrative and technical aspects of the Project.

(4) To settle and disseminate the techniques transmission by the experts of third-countries, it is necessary to thoroughly discuss the preliminary Project plan.

### **3-7 Follow-up Situation**

---

To disseminate the transferred techniques from the Center across broader areas, the Government of El Salvador requested a third-country training program from Government of Japan, and the first training course was implemented for eight weeks from October 2002 to December 2002. Making the "development of audiovisual materials" and the "development of textbooks" themes, 20 participants from seven Central American and Caribbean countries (Guatemala, Honduras, Nicaragua, Costa Rica, El Salvador, Panama and Dominica) joined the training course. Eleven lecturers from the El Salvadoran side and one lecturer from the Japanese side were assigned, and the Government of El Salvador bore 30 percent of the training costs.

The participants highly evaluated the training course and the outputs of the "Project on Strengthening of Nursing Education in El Salvador", terminated May 2002, were clearly evident.