

Terminal Evaluation

Asia

1. Outline of the Project

Country:

Malaysia

Project title:

Course on Engine Electrical & Electronics System Services (EEESS)

Issue/Sector:**Cooperation scheme:**

Third-Country Training

Division in charge:

Southeast Asia Division, Regional Department
I(Southeast Asia)

Total cost:

Period of Cooperation Fiscal Year 1998 -
2003

Partner Country's Implementing Organization:

Vocational training instructors of the Ministry of Human Resources, Center
for Instructor and Advanced Skills Training (CIAST)

Supporting Organization in Japan:**Related Cooperation:**

Third Country Training Program; "Advanced Skill Training on Fuel Injection System Services

1-1 Background of the Project

Center for Instructor and Advanced Skills Training (CIAST) was established with the sponsorship of the government of Japan under "the ASEAN Human Resource Development Project," which was initiated by former Japanese Prime Minister, Zenko Suzuki. CIAST is a vocational training center under the Ministry of Human Resources in Malaysia. The Japanese government has transferred techniques to CIAST through the dispatch of experts, provision of equipment, and acceptance of trainees.

In order to utilize the results of technical transfer and to promote South-South cooperation, CIAST implemented its first Third Country Training Program (TCTP) entitled "Advanced Skill Training on Fuel Injection System Services" from 1992 to 1996. Due to its positive achievements, the Malaysian government suggested continuing the course. However, this was not realized because of the Asian Economic Crisis.

The Asian Economic Crisis acted as a turning point, and the project was selected as part of the urgent human development support measures. It was initially designed for all ASEAN countries, and was to be continued for the duration of one year. However, the Malaysian government requested to continue. Discussion on project design was held in August 1999 between the Malaysian and the Japanese governments. Upon consideration of the ripple effect of past technical transfers and the promotion of cooperation in the region, both governments signed the Record of Discussion (R/D) on August 24, 1999 to execute the training course. The target of the project was expanded to other developing countries in Asia-Pacific region.

1-2 Project Overview

(1) Overall Goal

To provide participants from countries in the Asia-Pacific region with an opportunity to learn techniques in the field of electronic mechanical engineering as well as the Engine Electrical and Electronic System Services (EEESS).

(2) Project Purpose

1) To acquire the latest techniques in Engine E&E system relating to:

Servicing various E&E devices related to the engine such as charging, starting and ignition system;

Handling engine electrical rewiring and fault finding;

Carrying out proper testing procedures;

Using correct tools and measuring instruments to determine measurements on clearance and limit required and specified 2) To cooperate in strengthening Asia-Pacific network for the practice of advanced skill training on EEESS.

(4) Input

Japanese side: (at 2002)

Short-term Experts	3	Equipment	5.82 Million ten (in 1999)
Trainees received	61	Local Cost	approx.21.6 million yen (70% of total)

Malaysian Side:

Counterparts	4		
Local Cost		RM 292,336.5 (approx. 9.28 million yen: 30% of total)	
Others:		Facilities, repairing equipment, management and development of training contents	

(5) Participating Countries

Cambodia, Laos, Indonesia, Malaysia, Philippines, Papua New Guinea, Thailand, Nepal, East Timor, Fiji, Kiribati, Tonga, Solomon, Vanuatu and Nauru

2. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team JICA Malaysia Office
(Commissioned to: P.E Research Sdn Bhd)

Period of Evaluation 17 January 2003 - 17 March 2003
Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation

3. Results of Evaluation

3-1 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

Seventy-seven percent (77%) of ex-participants who responded to the questionnaire mentioned that the acquired knowledge and skills are related to their work, or they are being utilized at their respective working places. Hence, relevance of the training was evaluated as high.

(2) Effectiveness

Eighty percent (80%) of the ex-participants responded that the contents of the training met their expectation and they have fully utilized the skills and knowledge. Hence, the level of achieving the objectives of the project was high.

(3) Efficiency

As a result of losing experienced lecturers at CIAST and the appointment of new lecturers for 2000, the participants did not rate the efficiency highly. The efficiency of input quality was also evaluated as being lower in the latter half of the project.

As for the contents of the training, 99% of the ex-participants who responded to the questionnaire indicated that the training was efficiently managed as a whole, even though some complained that the time allocation on lectures and practices was not very well managed. Therefore, the project was highly efficient as a whole.

(4) Impact

Eighty-five percent (85%) of the ex-participants responded that they transferred the acquired knowledge and skills at CIAST to the colleagues and students through trainings and workshops in their respective countries. There was a machine workman (a participant in 1999) who was promoted lecturer. Judging from these facts, the training had substantial impact.

(5) Sustainability

Judging from the results of the survey, the acquired skills and knowledge in the training was shared among those who worked with ex-participants to some degree. Moreover, the target fields were directly connected to the business of private companies, and the demand for the training was high. Hence, the sustainability of the knowledge and skills acquired through the training was high. As for the sustainability of CIAST in the target fields, its sustainability of techniques and knowledge was evaluated as somewhat low because CIAST had not actively gathered enough information on the rapidly progressing techniques in the target fields.

3-2 Factors that promoted realization of effects

(1) Factors concerning Planning

There was a need from the participating countries to master the skills and knowledge in maintaining and repairing automobile devices.

(2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process

Experience and capacity of the participants were appropriate for the course.

3-3 Factors that Impeded Realization Effects

(1) Factors Concerning the Planning

N/A.

(2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process

1) Factors concerning Japanese side:

There were some difficulties in conducting lectures in English.

2) Factors concerning Malaysian Side:

There was a tendency among experienced technicians to move from the public to the private sector in Malaysia. The same tendency was also observed in CIAST.

Know-how gained through the training was not accumulated in CIAST.

Visual-aid equipment was rarely used in lectures. Due to this, more time had been spent in explanation thus resulting in reduced time for practical sessions.

The efforts of CIAST were insufficient to improve the knowledge level of lecturers.

3-4 Recommendations

(1) Recommendations for government and implementing agency of the recipient country (Malaysia)

1) It is necessary to prepare for the possibility of losing experienced lecturers and to foster the successors.

2) The contents of the training should always reflect the real needs of the current market, and the teaching materials and equipment should be upgraded accordingly.

3) A comprehensive course report should be prepared by gathering documents related to the training appropriately in order to accumulate the know-how for training.

4) It is necessary to enhance the effectiveness of delivering lectures by utilizing visual-aid equipment and gathering necessary materials for lectures.

5) The training curriculum should include on-the-job training at related organizations or companies for a short period in order to acquire practical working experience.

6) An evaluation by the implementing organization should be completed at the completion of the course in order to improve the course.

(2) Recommendations for JICA

1) Although this may be beyond the scope of this evaluation, the burden on the implementing organization was extensive, due to the wide target country for the training. As for the invitation fee, which accounted for a large portion of the budget, the gap was too wide between the estimated budget and the actual total expense. In some cases, this large gap may become an obstacle in implementing the course. In order to prevent these risks in implementing cooperation, it may be desirable to reduce the number of invited countries by being more regionally focused.

2) Upon acceptance of the project, JICA should explain clearly to the implementing agency that it is very important to conduct a comprehensive evaluation and to provide feedback.

3-5 Lessons Learned

(1) Matters related to the host country and the target fields (policy, technical level, society/culture/custom, organizational system, economy/politics, etc.)

Malaysia is a preferred choice for a partner country of JICA's South-South cooperation because Malaysia will be committed in playing a more positive role towards building South-South ties. This is emphasized in the Eighth Malaysia Plan settled in FY 2001.

(2) Matters relating project operation and management

1) Due to wide disparities among various implementing agencies to conduct courses, a thorough survey must be carried out on the organizational structure of the implementing agency at the commencement of a project.

2) There are substantial hidden costs inherent in the program (including unexpected transportation and communication costs, electricity, invitation fee, etc.) which must be taken into account to ensure that the real expenses will not exceed the estimated amount.

3) The implementing agency frequently had communication troubles with the contact agencies of external assistance and dispatch agencies of the invited countries, which hampered the acceptance process of trainees. It is necessary to improve the communication network for smoother acceptance process of trainees.