

# Terminal Evaluation

## Asia

### 1. Outline of the Project

**Country:**

Republic of Indonesia

**Project title:**

The Project for the National Vocational Rehabilitation Center for Disabled People

**Issue/Sector:**

Vocational Training

**Cooperation scheme:**

Project-type Technical Cooperation

**Division in charge:**

First Technical Cooperation Division,  
Social Development Cooperation Department

**Total cost:**

510 million yen

**Period of Cooperation**

20 December 1997 - 19  
December 2002

**Partner Country's Implementing Organization:**

National Vocational Rehabilitation Center for Disabled People (NVRC)

**Supporting Organization in Japan:**

Japan Association for Employment of Persons with Disabilities (JAED),  
Employment and Human Resources Development Organization of Japan,  
Overseas Cooperation Division, Human Resources Development Bureau,  
Health, Labour and Welfare Ministry,  
Employment Measures for the Disabled Division, Employment Security  
Bureau, Health, Labour and Welfare Ministry

**Related Cooperation:**

Project-type Technical Cooperation; "The Project for Development of Vocational Rehabilitation System in the National Rehabilitation Center for Physically Disabled People "  
Dispatch of Expert; "Vocational Rehabilitation Policy"  
Grant Aid; "Project for Construction of National Vocational Rehabilitation Center for Disabled People"

#### 1-1 Background of the Project

In the Republic of Indonesia, in spite of its rapid economic growth in recent years, the development of social infrastructure such as social welfare and the health care system has been relatively slow. Although persons with disabilities (PWD) accounted for approximately seven million among the total population, the PWD's participation in the society was very limited because rehabilitation services for the PWD were not fully developed. Under these circumstances, the Indonesian government planned to construct the National Vocational Rehabilitation Center for disabled people (NVRC) with the aims of developing a new rehabilitation (vocational rehabilitation) system, which implemented vocational training to the PWD that directly linked to employment. NVRC was constructed by the financial support from the Japanese Grant Aid program (with 1,650 million yen in FY 1996 - 1997).

On the basis of achievement of the pilot project of "The Project for Development of Vocational Rehabilitation System in the National Rehabilitation Center for Physically Disabled People", the government of Indonesia made a request to the Japanese government for a project-type technical cooperation with plans to establish an offering and planning employment service system to the PWD nationally through implementing five vocational training courses (metal processing, electronics, printing, sewing and computers) while implementing training to the staff of other public rehabilitation centers and conducting research and development (R&D) on employment/labor markets for the PWD whose aim was to train the personnel involved in the operation of the NVRC.

#### 1-2 Project Overview

The project establishes a vocational training rehabilitation system, which is directly linked to the employment of the PWD thus

implemented vocational training, staff training prior to the vocational training and the R&D on employment/labor markets for the PWD.

#### (1) Overall Goal

The employment for PWD is promoted by the establishment of a vocational rehabilitation system in the Republic of Indonesia.

#### (2) Project Purpose

A vocational rehabilitation system is established in the NVRC.

#### (3) Outputs

- 1) The organization and function of the NVRC are established.
- 2) The recruitment and selection system and job placement systems are established in wide areas.
- 3) Vocational training is strengthened.
- 4) The skills of staff of social welfare institutes etc. are improved.
- 5) The function of R&D is established.

#### (4) Inputs

Japanese side:

Short-term Experts	22	Equipment	231 million yen
Long-term Experts	12	Local Cost	55 million yen

Trainees received 26

Indonesian Side:

Counterparts 65

Land and Facilities

Local Cost 7,701 million Indonesian rupee

## 2. Evaluation Team

### Members of Evaluation Team

Team Leader/General: Junsaku KOIZUMI, Special Technical Advisor, JICA  
Management of Training Center: Iwaho IGARASHI, Advisor, Disabled Workers Affairs Division, Employment Security Bureau, Health, Labour and Welfare Ministry  
Vocational Training: Masaju MARUYAMA, Advisor, International Cooperation Division, Human Resources Development Planning Department, Employment and Human Resources Development Organization of Japan  
Vocational Rehabilitation: Mamoru NARUOKA, Director, Nara Vocational Center for Persons with Disabilities, Japan Association for Employment of Persons with Disabilities (JAED)  
Cooperation Planning: Miki Yamauchi, First Technical Cooperation Division, Social Development Cooperation Department, JICA  
Evaluation Analysis: Shinobu MAMIYA, Global Link Management

### Period of Evaluation

27 June 2002 - 6 July 2002

### Type of Evaluation:

Terminal Evaluation

### 3. Results of Evaluation

#### 3-1 Summary of Evaluation Results

---

##### (1) Relevance

The Indonesian government declared Law No.4 in 1997 for the promotion of employment for PWD. The Ministry of Social Affairs (MOSA) has been assigned to be the coordinator of the improvement of social welfare for the PWD by the Presidential Decree No.83 in 1999. In PROPENAS (a national development plan) (2000 - 2004), enhancing the social capability of PWDs and converting them into a working force with producing power are a part of the social welfare program. As the needs of vocational rehabilitation of PWDs have been increased, the number of applicants to the NVRC also has been increasing every year.

Judging from the above, the overall goal and the project purpose were consistent with the development policy of the Indonesian government and the needs of PWD, the beneficiary of the project. JICA's assistance to Indonesia defined the development of social security including enrichment of the social welfare and improvement of the environment of employment and labor as one of the key issues. Therefore, the overall goal and the project purpose were matched with the aid policy of the Japanese government to Indonesia, and the relevance of the plan was extremely high.

##### (2) Effectiveness

The dismantled governmental organizations accompanied by the Indonesian economic crisis and the introduction of decentralization affected the project, but the project purpose was mostly accomplished because the employment rates of NVRC graduates of the second and the later classes were respectively higher than the targeted 62% at the terminal evaluation. The NVRC established a vocational rehabilitation system, and the techniques and knowledge of NVRC graduates were highly appreciated by their companies.

The organizational function of the NVRC was established, and the number of applicants was expanding. The employment rate of NVRC graduates was increased, and the techniques and knowledge of NVRC graduates were highly appreciated by their companies. However, the system organization in wide areas to support employment needs further efforts. Job training was about to be enhanced, the training was implemented as planned, and the curriculum had the mechanisms to be amended reflecting the market needs. The guideline for staff training was developed and effectively utilized as the textbook for staff training. The R&D department was established as well, but did not reach the stage that survey results could be reflected in its activities.

##### (3) Efficiency

The inputs of the project were mostly utilized effectively for the achievements. The inputs from the Japanese side were provided as planned as a whole. However, the inputs from the Indonesian side were affected by the organizational reform of the main ministry, the former Ministry of Social Affairs due to the economic crisis and decentralization. The number of counterparts also decreased, and the budget was insufficient. The Indonesian side needs to gain maintenance and management techniques of the equipment and to assure the budget for maintenance and management and for training materials for the future.

##### (4) Impact

The impact of the overall goal of improvement in employment situations for the PWD at a national level could not be assessed because of insufficient data. However, the employment rate of NVRC graduates has increased during the term (first: 57%, second: 64%, third: 72% and forth: 80%). The project also contributed to the improvement of job training for PWD in Indonesia.

There were other positive impacts as follows:

- 1) The new concept of vocational rehabilitation for PWD has gradually been recognized mainly by the society and a number of companies in JOBOTABEK (capital Jakarta and its neighboring areas).
- 2) The discipline and hardworking attitude of NVRC graduates have been encouraging and motivating the colleagues.
- 3) The PWD have gained self-confidence and people's recognition of the abilities of the PWD as a workforce. The negative impact of the project was that the graduates tended to remain in the JOBOTABEK area, which made the employment more competitive in this particular area.

##### (5) Sustainability

The sustainability of the project almost reached a sufficient level while there still remained some concerns on the commitment or efforts of related organizations as follows:

- 1) As for organizational sustainability, the project purpose was consistent with the Indonesian development policy, and there was a great demand of vocational rehabilitation for PWD. Other regional centers and social welfare institutes were interested in the NVRC activities, therefore the support from the government and related organizations should be continuously secured.
- 2) As for the financial sustainability, the Indonesian government has made efforts of increasing the budget, however the government should keep the current budget allocation level for the NVRC I to maintain the conditions of the vocational rehabilitation center. In particular, the budget for training materials, maintenance of equipment and job selection and placement should be secured.
- 3) As for the technical sustainability, technical transfer to the Indonesian counterparts has progressed according to the plan. It is necessary that the staff of the NVRC should be increased in numbers, and the transfer of techniques by the Japanese experts should be shared among them.

### **3-2 Factors that promoted realization of effects**

---

#### (1) Factors Concerning the Planning

The project tried to improve its quality by implementing the appraisals on the accomplishment such as the evaluation of the NVRC services by participants and the evaluation of the quality of NVRC graduates by companies who hired the graduates, which contributed to the realization of effects.

#### (2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process

Just after the commencement of the project, an unexpected change occurred due to the change in social conditions such as the economic crisis and political uncertainty. However both the Japanese and Indonesian sides flexibly coped with those situations by handling the budget, thus the project purpose was accomplished within five years as planned.

### **3-3 Factors that impeded realization of effects**

---

#### (1) Factors concerning Planning

At the midterm evaluation, there was an announcement of a policy to expand the job introduction services to NVRC graduates. However without the linkage system with related organizations to implement it, the policy was over the range of its practicability and could not bring about any specific achievements. The reason that it did not lead to any significant outputs was that there was no clear annual plan or concrete methods to expand the job introduction system widely.

#### (2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process

- 1) The progress of the project was hampered as there was a considerable change or outflow of NVRC staff due to the organizational reform of the governmental organizations accompanied by the economic crisis and the introduction of decentralization.
- 2) There was little chance for periodical communication between Japanese experts and Indonesian counterparts, especially because the Steering Committee was not held as planned. Therefore, there was a difference of recognition between the Indonesian and the Japanese sides in terms of the progress of the project and its subject matters.
- 3) There was a language barrier between the Indonesian and the Japanese sides that led to a lack of communication. The barrier had negative impact on the activities of the short-term experts, especially in the field of technical transfer.

### **3-4 Conclusion**

---

The project contributed to the establishment of a vocational rehabilitation system for PWD in Indonesia and the improvement of vocational training techniques in the field of vocational rehabilitation for PWD in Indonesia. In the meantime, it is necessary for the Indonesian government to understand that securing the budget and improving relationships with related ministries/organizations and regional governments is a key issue for the NVRC to act as the national center in Indonesia.

### **3-5 Recommendations**

---

- (1) It is recommended that MOSA should make the necessary arrangement in consultation with the related ministries and organizations in order to make a development policy for the NVRC, which is the sole national center for vocational rehabilitation in Indonesia.
- (2) It is necessary that appropriate budgets should continuously be secured for the NVRC's activities including job selection and placement, staff training, maintenance (equipments & facilities including spare parts), procurement of consumables, and R&D.
- (3) It is necessary that national regulations (training subjects, training facilities and license of vocational training instructors) on vocational training are settled so that the vocational training at the NVRC is evaluated objectively in terms of its level of fulfillment.

(4) It is necessary that temporary instructors are to be hired as regular instructors because the number of instructors is insufficient at the NVRC.

### **3-6 Lessons Learned**

---

(1) As for the dispatch of short-term experts, the project was different from other training at ordinary vocational training facilities. Therefore, it is necessary to take account of several factors such as the types, degrees of disabilities of each participant and the dispatch duration.

(2) It is desirable that vocational rehabilitation for PWD should be flexibly planned, implemented and assessed, having surveyed and understood the participants' conditions (types and degrees of disabilities, types of jobs desired, and adequacies) and the market demands (the type of jobs for PWD to apply to, duties, desirable abilities).

### **3-7 Follow-up Situation**

---

Upon the above recommendations, the dispatch of long-term experts has been implemented since July 2003 until July 2005 with the aims of enhancing the organization of the NVRC and developing a cooperation system with MOSA and other related organizations.