

Terminal Evaluation

Latin America and the Caribbean

1. Outline of the Project

Country:

Republic of Paraguay

Project title:

Japan - Paraguay Skill Development Promotion Center Project

Issue/Sector:

Vocational Training

Cooperation scheme:

Project-type Technical Cooperation

Division in charge:

Second Technical Cooperation Division,
Social Development Cooperation Department

Total cost:

1,177 million yen

**Period of
Cooperation**

20 September 1997 - 19
September 2002

Partner Country's Implementing Organization:

Occupation Training Bureau, Ministry of Justice and Labour (SNPP)

Supporting Organization in Japan:

Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare, Employment and Human
resources Development Organization of Japan

Related Cooperation:**1-1 Background of the Project**

The Southern Common Market (MERCOSUR) founded in 1995, decided that member states must abolish tariffs by 2006. Paraguay was thus trying to restore and revitalize the economy through the acquisition of foreign investment to promote industrialization. Therefore, there were increasing needs for technical experts required for the establishment of plants and renewal of old equipment.

In order to meet the industrial needs, within the Occupation Training Bureau, the Ministry of Justice and Labor (SNPP) of the Paraguay government established the Japan-Paraguay Skill Development Promotion Center (SPP-PJ) for the training of electronic technology workers and re-education of vocational trainers of SNPP, to cope with advanced and diversified technology. The government of Paraguay requested the government of Japan to provide Project-type Technical Cooperation.

1-2 Project Overview

In order to foster technical experts in the electronics sector and to modernize the industry in Paraguay, the project supports the following: (1) Implementation of an improvement training course, (2) implementation of a re-education course for vocational trainers, and (3) Establishment of an operation and management system of SPP-PJ in the field of electronic techniques (electrics, electronics, control, and refrigeration and air conditioning) at SPP-PJ.

(1) Overall Goal

To meet the demand for skilled workers in the field of electronic technology in Paraguay.

(2) Project Purpose

To enable SNPP to provide a upgrading training course and instructor's retraining course with improved quality at SPP-PJ on its own, mainly in the field of electronic techniques (electrics, electronics, control, and refrigeration and air conditioning).

(3) Outputs

- 1) SPP-PJ's operation and management system is established.
- 2) SPP-PJ's facilities, machineries, and equipment are improved and prepared.
- 3) Ability of instruction at SPP-PJ improves.

- 4) Vocational training materials (textbooks, etc.) are developed.
- 5) SPP-PJ is able to plan and implement the upgrading training courses which meet the needs of the industry.
- 6) Instructor's capacity development (training) scheme is established.
- 7) SPP-PJ is able to plan and implement publicity activities on its own.

(4) Inputs

Japanese side:

Long-term Experts	14	Equipment	386 million yen
Short-term Experts	11	Trainees received	15

Paraguayan Side:

Counterparts	30		
Local Cost		6,467 million guaran (154 million yen)	

2. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team

Team Leader/General: Junsaku KOIZUMI, Special Technical Advisor, JICA
 Control, Refrigeration and Air Conditioning, and Training Management: Masatoshi SHIMIZU, Officer, Overseas Cooperation Division, Human Resources Development Bureau, Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare
 Electrics and Electronics: Masaju MARUYAMA, International Department, Employment and Human resources Development Organization of Japan, Employment and Human resources Development Organization of Japan
 Cooperation Planning: Satoshi SEKIJU, Staff, Second Technical Cooperation Division, Social Development Cooperation Department, JICA
 Evaluation Analysis: Yoko IIZUKA, Japan Development Services, Ltd.

Period of Evaluation

10 July 2002 - 19 July 2002

Type of Evaluation:

Terminal Evaluation

3. Results of Evaluation

3-1 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

The National Development Plan of Paraguay (1999 - 2003) advocated the needs—"to activate economy, create employment, and conduct training" and the overall goal; To meet the demand for skilled workers in the field of electronic technology in Paraguay, was a part of the development plan of Paraguay. As the effects of MERCOSUR, in the influx of electrics and electronics equipment and products with high quality, the needs to foster technical experts in the electronics sector increased to a huge extent. Therefore, the project purpose met the needs of the beneficiary country. JICA's ODA plan for Paraguay put the importance on—"fostering engineers and managers to developing small and medium-scale companies", and the project was in line with the Japanese ODA policy. Judging from the above, the relevance of the project was high.

(2) Effectiveness

The project purpose was mostly accomplished as the improvement of the training course and re-education course for vocational trainers was achieved with improved quality at SPP-PJ. Based on the questionnaire survey of the participants and organizations they worked for, most of the respondents indicated that they were satisfied with the contents of the improvement training course and re-education course for vocational training. The annual training plan, syllabus and instruction plan were put into a manual. The capabilities of the counterpart in terms of their techniques and instruction abilities were improved through the project.

In the meantime, under the circumstances where industrialization is being promoted—even more, it is necessary for SPP-PJ to conduct training courses which correspond with even more advanced electronic techniques. The delay of inputs from the

Paraguay side in the former part of the project hampered establishment of a gradual or systematical training system on re-education courses for vocational training and delayed the original plan, some courses that need to be conducted remained unimplemented.

(3) Efficiency

The inputs of experts and equipment from the Japanese side were appropriately conducted. As a result of training in Japan, the counterparts improved their technical levels as well as acquired how to manage quality through experiencing work principles and habits in Japan. On the other hand, the inputs from the Paraguay side were not appropriately implemented on the first half of the project, which was characterized by problems such as delays in reforming of buildings and vacancies of counterparts. However, with the self-support effort from the Paraguay side, these problems were mostly overcome or improved in the latter half of the project. Especially with the allocation of counterparts as seven counterparts, including sub-counterparts were allocated which was four more than planned. The delivered equipment of the project and granted equipment before the commencement of the project were mostly effectively utilized.

(4) Impact

By the end of May 2002, 7,732 people had participated in the training course. This number showed a great increase compared to 1,491 participants at the end of June 2000. Hence, it could be estimated that 16.9% of workers in the secondary industry of the Great Asuncion have participated in the upgrading training course. Accordingly, positive impact is continuously expected from the project from now on. There were ripple effects observed such that many of the ex-participants have been playing a role of "instructor" to their colleagues. On the other hand, observed were the differences between the training courses offered at the upgrading training course and re-education course for vocational trainers and the needs for the state-of-the-art techniques that the electronic technique sector seeks. Therefore, it is necessary to reconsider the contents of training courses for the future. As the needs to the upgrading the training course had increased in local centers, the expansion of the project to local centers is also necessary.

(5) Sustainability

SNPP had implemented institutional reform and mainly the number of staff in office work sections was reduced to less than half for further efficiency in its implementing system, so as to change its personnel ratio between technical staff and clerical officers from 3:7 to 7:3. For the sustainability of SNPP, including SPP-PJ, the instructors of the technical department including the local branches need to be strengthened in terms of both their number and quality.

In the meantime, in the first half of the project, the inputs had not been made in an appropriate manner from the Paraguayan side. However, in the latter half, the financial contribution to the project was made smoothly in spite of the difficult financial situation of SNPP. As the special budget was assured by being financed by the labor tax rate which is to be 1% of the earned income collected from the workers, the financial sustainability of the project is expected.

From a technical point of view, the equipment procured by Japanese side was maintained and managed in good condition and used appropriately. The counterparts had the basic capability to maintain the equipment, to implement the upgrading training courses and to develop teaching materials. However, the level of technical transfer for the retraining of vocational training instructors to counterparts in the field of electronic technique is at a low level due to the delayed commencement of the related courses. Meanwhile, as the specification of computers could not satisfy the requirements of electronic techniques, procurement of new equipment is necessary to develop SPP-PJ as the core of centers under SNPP.

3-2 Factors that promoted realization of effects

(1) Factors Concerning the Planning N/A.

(2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process

There were some factors that promoted the project activities; the high enthusiasm of Japanese experts to the project, high retention rate of counterparts and favorable communication between the Japanese experts and the counterparts by the efforts on both sides.

3-3 Factors that impeded realization of effects

(1) Factors Concerning the Planning N/A.

(2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process

At the commencement of the project, as a result of the austerity budget from the Paraguayan side, repair work of the facilities of SPP-PJ and allocation of counterparts were delayed. The labor tax was one of the major financial resources of SNP, but the

allocation of the tax was delayed, and the salaries of the staff at local centers were not paid on schedule, and the activities of local centers were stopped for a while. As a result, the commencement of the re-education course of vocational trainers was delayed.

3-4 Conclusion

SNPP could provide the upgrading training course and the instructor's retraining course with improved quality at SPP-PJ, and the project purpose was mostly accomplished. The inputs from the Paraguay side were delayed and insufficient in the first half of the project, which was mostly resolved by the self-support efforts from the Paraguay side, and the number of participants to the upgrading training course increased to a large extent. In the meantime, the late inputs from the Paraguay side delayed the commencement of the re-education course for vocational trainers, and the course started in full swing in the latter half of the project. Therefore, at the termination of the project, there remained some courses unopened, and further technical transfer by the Japanese experts to the Paraguayan side might be necessary.

There were some gaps between the needs that the electronic technique sector seeks and the training offered at the training courses of the upgrading training course and re-education course for vocational trainers, so it is necessary to be careful and to conduct training courses that match the needs of the section. To improve the techniques of instructors in the field of electronics techniques, it is required to implement an upgrading training course at the three centers of the east (Este), central (Coronel Oviedo) and south (Encarnacion). Institutional support to SPP-PJ must be sufficiently provided by the central government and SNPP, however, for the further sustainability, further enhancement must be necessary in terms of the quality and quantity of the necessary personnel at the technical section.

3-5 Recommendations

- (1) As the progress of the instructor's retraining course is behind schedule, it is necessary to review, redevelop and implement the course.
- (2) It is necessary to implement the upgrading training course and instructor's retraining course to those which reflect the needs of the electronics industry.
- (3) To improve the levels of instructors other than in Great Asuncion, it is necessary to implement an upgrading training course at other training centers.

3-6 Lessons Learned

- (1) When implementing training for the participants who have a job, it is difficult for the participants to leave the job for a long time. Therefore, it is recommended to settle a training system, from which effects can be obtained in a relatively short period of time, such as a module courses which breaks regular long-term courses into parts.
- (2) It is necessary to review the plan of the project activities to meet the needs in the targeted field for the accomplishment of the overall purpose.
- (3) To grasp the needs of the targeted industry, it is effective to visit companies as often as possible with the counterparts and to implement an interview survey on current or future training courses (the project implemented interview surveys to 110 companies in four sectors).
- (4) It is effective to organize a training system which gradually or systematically connects to each module from a basic level to application level to transfer techniques or to reform training courses, which is also effective for those participants who try to develop training courses themselves or for those who are in the human resources department in the targeted industry.

3-7 Follow-up Situation

There remain some courses necessary to be developed in instructor retraining. It is necessary to implement upgrading training courses and instructors' retraining courses which meet the needs of the electronics techniques sector of the industry and to develop upgrading training courses in local centers. The 18 months extension project is now being implemented which is to terminate in March 2004, narrowing down the scale of inputs.