Terminal Evaluation

Middle East

1. Outline of the Project

Country: Project title:

Turkey The Infectious Diseases Control Project

Issue/Sector: Cooperation scheme:

Health/Medical Care Project-type Technical Cooperation

Division in charge: Total cost:

Second Medical Cooperation Division, Medical Cooperation Department

Period of Cooperation 1 October 1997 - 30 September

2002 Ministry of Health

Partner Country's Implementing Organization:

Supporting Organization in Japan:

Biomedical Science Association, National Institute of Infectious Diseases

Related Cooperation:

Project-type Technical Cooperation; "The Project of Development and Evaluation of Quality Control on Biological Products"

1-1 Background of the Project

The government of Turkey recognized immunization as the most efficient means to promote its Primary Health Care (PHC) activities and implemented various activities to eradicate polio and measles under the technical guidance of the World Health Organization (WHO). The government of Japan assisted the implementation of Turkey's Expanded Program on Immunization (EPI) policy by supporting the Biological Control and Research Laboratories of the Refik Saydam Hygiene Center Presidency (RSHCP) between January 1993 and June 1996, in order to enhance the quality management capability on vaccine manufacturing, settle the National Standards on quality assurance and to develop a medical inspection system at the central government level.

The Turkish government requested the Japanese government for the Project-type Technical Cooperation, as Phase 2 of the above project, to establish a surveillance system on judgment effects of immunization.

1-2 Project Overview

To eradicate EPI related infectious diseases in Turkey, the project developed a research network on seroepidemiology, established an epidemiological surveillance system on EPI related to six diseases, and cooperated on the technical instruction on disease agent surveys to the RSHCP, a central research center in the field of infectious diseases.

(1) Overall Goal

EPI related infectious diseases are controlled.

(2) Project Purpose

A laboratory supported epidemiological surveillance system is established.

- (3) Outputs
- 1) Laboratory techniques on EPI related infectious diseases (DPT, polio and measles) are strengthened.
- 2) The management and technical skills for epidemiological surveillance on EPI related infectious diseases (DPT, polio, measles and hepatitis B) are acquired.

- 3) Technical collaboration between RSCH and PHC is established.
- 4) A serum-bank is established.

(4) Inputs

Japanese side:

Long-term Experts 9 Equipment 269 million yen

Short-term Experts 26 Local Cost 23 million yen

Participants Received 20

Tanzanian side:

Counterparts 63

Land and Facilities

Local Cost 101,500 million Turkish lira (10 million yen)

Laboratory convention work expenditure 2,662,500 million Turkish lira (263 million yen)

2. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team

Team Leader/General: Kayoko MIZUTA, Special Technical Advisor, JICA

Infectious Diseases Control: Akira OYA, Emeritus Member, National Institute of Infectious

Diseases

Infectious Diseases Information System: Shudo YAMAZAKI, Emeritus Member, National Institute

of Infectious Diseases

Virus Control: Masato TASHIRO, Director, Department of Virology 3, National Institute of

Infectious Diseases

Cooperation Planning: Keiichi TAKEMOTO, Staff, Second Medical Cooperation Division, Medical

Cooperation Department

Evaluation Analysis: Ayako NAMURA, IC-Net Limited

Period of Evaluation

7 May 2002 - 27 May 2002

Type of Evaluation:

Terminal Evaluation

3. Results of Evaluation

3-1 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

The control of the EPI related infectious diseases was still given a high priority in the MOH's plan, "Health for All in 21st Century: the Target and Strategies of Turkey," and the contents of the project was consistent with the Turkish policy. As the mission of Primary Health Care General Directorate (PHC GD) played a leading role to control infectious diseases, the project met the needs of the targeted group of the project, the PHC GD. During the planning stage, a common perception of the new concept of an "epidemiological surveillance system" was not shared among personnel of both the Japanese and Turkish side, and thus the relevance of the project plan was evaluated to be low.

(2) Effectiveness

The project purpose; "a laboratory supported epidemiological surveillance system is established" was half accomplished at the time of terminal evaluation, though its indicators of a "regular notification system on the epidemiological surveillance system is established" and "immunization strategy, countermeasures, or action plans are formulated" were about to be accomplished. The project purpose will be accomplished by the end of 2002 or in 2003 after the completion of the project if all following

requirements are fulfilled by the approval for revision by the MOH: A "notification system on infectious diseases", the inspection process proceeds without delay and each report will be prepared as scheduled. Each output of the project was evaluated to be effective in order to accomplish the project purpose.

(3) Efficiency

In its first half, the project was not implemented efficiently because of the frequent change of the head of the RSHCP, the delay of equipment installation and the lack of coordinators and counterparts on the Turkish side. However, in the latter half of the project, these factors were mostly solved and the efficiency of the project was improved. The quality, quantity and timing of the inputs were mostly appropriate.

(4) Impact

It was difficult to measure the impact toward the overall goal at the evaluation stage. However, there were some positive impacts. The improvement of laboratory techniques allowed the MOH to include the information from laboratories in their revision of a "notification system on infectious diseases", and the cooperation between central organizations (RSHCP and PHC GD) and regional organizations (Provincial Health Directorate of Ministry of Health, Prefectural Health Department) improved.

(5) Sustainability

The MOH is working on the revision of the notification system of infectious diseases. The system includes the laboratory-based epidemiological surveillance system, and the ministry is anticipated to develop this epidemiological surveillance system across the country. Therefore the project has organizational and political sustainability. If the planned technical transfer will be completed by the end of the cooperation period, there remains high potential that counterparts will develop the techniques acquired through the project. However, as it there is no evidence that the MOH can take concrete budgetary steps, the financial sustainability of the project is not high at the stage of terminal evaluation.

3-2 Factors that promoted realization of effects

(1) Factors Concerning the Planning

N/A.

- (2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process
- 1) As decision makers of the Turkish side (MOH, PHC GD and head of RSHCP) were not actively involved, the project was not smoothly implemented. However, the experts patiently encouraged them to participate in the project which was effective for the promotion of the project.
- 2) As horizontal connection among counterparts and related personnel was established, the project activities smoothly proceeded, and that contributed greatly to the accomplishment of the project purpose.

3-3 Factors that impeded realization of effects

- (1) Factors Concerning the Planning
- 1) At the planning stage, as a common perception of the "epidemiological surveillance system" was not shared among the personnel of the project, each activity did not proceed smoothly.
- 2) As the project did not promote the voluntary involvement of PHC GD at the planning stage, it was difficult to implement a laboratory-based epidemiological surveillance until PHC GD was involved in the project.
- (2) Factors concerning the Implementation Process

The laboratory was repaired at an early stage of the project. However, the progress of the repair work was greatly behind schedule and the technical transfer was also delayed. As decision makers of the Turkish side (MOH, PHC GD and head of RSHCP) were not actively involved in the project, it took time for them to make decision in many cases.

3-4 Recommendation

- (1) It is necessary for the project to ensure financial sustainability in order to establish the laboratory-based epidemiological surveillance system.
- (2) It is necessary to publish the effects of the project in Turkey and to notify the effects to the world by publishing research papers to enhance the recognition of the project.

3-5 Lessons Learned

- (1) To promote the project efficiently, it is important to make sure that all parties concerned are involved in the planning sessions at the start of a project. It is also necessary that responsible personnel are actively involved in the project for quick decision making.
- (2) It is necessary to share a clear project purpose among related personnel to promote each project activity smoothly.
- (3) It is important to establish a monitoring system based on the schedule to accomplish the project purpose within cooperation period.
- (4) It is necessary to establish a cooperation system and to promote team work smoothly to enhance the effects of individual work.

3-7 Follow-up Situation

N/A.