

# Terminal Evaluation

## Africa

### I. Outline of the Project

- Country: Tanzania
- Project title: Ethics Training Programs
- Issue/Sector: Public Services
- Cooperation scheme: Education
- Division in charge: Dept. Ethics Inspection
- Division: Public Service Management, President's Office
- Total cost: 37,801,941 yen
- Cost per participant: 108,005 yen
- Share of Japan's Contribution: 93%
- Period of Cooperation (R/D): 2000-2004  
(Extension): -  
(F/U): -
- Partner Country's Implementing Organization: JICA
- Supporting Organization in Japan:
- Related Cooperation: Dispatch of two long term experts  
Accepting twenty two participants (Country-focused training "National Government Administration" 20 participants, counterpart training 2 participants)

### 1. Background of the Project

The implementation of Ethics Training Programme emanates from the Public Service Reform Programme (PSRP) which commenced in 2000 and planned to end by the year 2011. The overall purpose of the PSRP is to support the attainment of a high rate of economic growth and ensure that delivery of quality services within the priority sectors conforms to public expectation for value, satisfaction and relevance.

Thus the Government of Japan and the Government of Tanzania (GoT) agreed to cooperate in organizing a training course in Public Service Ethics under JICA's In-country Training. The course being conducted with the support of the technical cooperation scheme of the Japanese Government was expected to run from 2000 to 2004 Japanese Fiscal year (JFY). The course was still in progress at the time of commencing the evaluation report in January 2004.

### 2. Project Overview

The training programme was envisaged to train 100 participants per year from Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) which are Government Institutions. The course was to be carried out four times yearly with 25 participants per course intake.

#### (2.1) Overall Goal

To enable the Government of Tanzania provide effective and efficient public services delivery to the people.

#### (2.2) Project Purpose

To have a pool of trainers in the Ministries, Departments and Agencies (MDAs) who will in turn continuously train other fellow employees at work places.

### 3. Output

1. Trained employees perception on ethics is understood.
2. Trained employees have acquired skills to train fellow employees on Public Service Ethics in their respective offices.
3. Enhance trained employees capabilities in making ethical decisions
4. Strengthened ethics training capacities of MDAs.

## 4. Inputs

### Japanese side:

Long term Expert	-	0
Medium/short term Expert	-	2
Trainees received	-	350

Equipment - 1,118,000 yen

Local cost:

Others:

### Tanzanian side:

Counterpart - 9 Resource persons

Equipment

Land and  
Facilities

## II. Evaluation team

### Members of Evaluation Team

Ms. Veronica Msinjili and Mr. Juma Ngwembanoy  
TISCO

### Period of Evaluation

Day/Month/Year-Day/month/Year

15<sup>th</sup> January 2004-12<sup>th</sup> March 2004

### Type of Evaluation:

## III. Results of Evaluation

### 1. Summary of Outcomes.

- 350 people were trained as trainers
- 70% of target people to be trained
- 3,637 employees trained by trainers from sampled MDAs
- So the project purpose which is to create a pool of trainers in Ministries, Independent Departments and Agencies (MDAs) who will continue to train others was achieved because as high as 70% of those to be trained have been trained so far and the project is still in progress indicating more people will be trained leading to the training of more employees.

### 2. Summary of Evaluation Results

#### (1) Relevance

The overall goal of the project falls within the ongoing Public Service Reform Programme (PSRP) which stresses on the need for providing quality services to the Tanzanian Public. Secondly, the implementation of the Ethics Training Programme is within the priority areas as set out in Japan's Development Assistant for Tanzania. Therefore, the overall goal of the project is relevant both in the context of Tanzania needs and Japan Development Assistance Policy

#### (2) Effectiveness

More than half of the sample heads of MDAs who responded to the questionnaire feel trained trainers have transferred knowledge and skills to fellow employees at work places. Trained trainers who form a pool of ethics trainers have confessed that the ethics training was constructive and educative. Given that a pool of employees capable of training has been established as explained above, the project implementation is effective.

#### (3) Efficiency

Seventy percent (70%) of the sampled trained trainer's interview rated the overall management of the project activities to be quite sufficient and efficient though 54% felt the period provided (2 weeks) to be short. The evaluation study has shown that the project activities link with other activities supported by other donor agencies and the Government of Tanzania. On the strength of the above study evaluation results it can be concluded that the overall project implementation was efficient.

#### **(4) Impact**

There is a common thinking among many, including representative clients of public services that signs of good public services delivery can be seen in some MDAs whose employees have received training in ethics. Majority of the sampled stakeholders (75%) think the impact of the project to the achievement of the overall goal has yet to be fully felt given that only a small number of employees have so far received training in ethics.

Our conclusion is that in the MDAs whose employees have been trained in ethics the project brought a positive impact.

#### **(5) Sustainability**

It has been established through the survey findings that, the overall government policy, policies and future plans of sampled MDAs are supportive to the project activities.

A workable and lasting project management system has been established. Regular formal retraining of trained trainers will remain to be a prerequisite for them to be able to disseminate the knowledge and skills gained. In the absence of a specific budget to cater for the ethics training there has been no organized system of procuring equipment/facilities for conducting continuous ethics training in the MDAS.

It can be concluded from the above that in terms of the management systems established the supportive plans and policies, the project is sustainable.

### **3. Factors Promoting Sustainability and Impact**

#### **(1) Factors Concerning to Planning**

Project stake holders be involved in the design and planning stages to enable them be fully aware of the importance of the project from the start.

#### **(2) Factors Concerning to Implementation Process**

Historical inbuilt cooperation between the Government of Japan and PSMO, deployment of two (2) Japanese experts who assisted in the preparation, management and coordination of the project activities, involvement of JICA staff in Tanzania and monitoring/follow-up measures by the PSMO and TPSC made the project implementation possible.

In order to attain a more sustainable project implementation process the following measures need to be taken:

- Involvement of stake holders in regular review of the project.
- Treasury to introduce a budget line to cater for ethics training
- Introducing ethics training in higher and lower institutions of learning.
- Creating awareness on ethics amongst high ranking officials by giving them training.
- Emphasizing maximum use of in-house resources in ethics training by MDAs.
- Improving the welfare of Public Civil Servants in terms of better working conditions, facilities and remuneration.
- Government issuing a directive making it compulsory for the MDAs to institute ethics training in their annual operational plans.

### **4. Factors inhibiting Sustainability and Impact**

#### **(1) Factors concerning to planning stage**

- Guidelines on selection of employees to be trained as trainers were either not adequately conveyed to the MDAs or intentionally not adhered to. As it turned out later some trainers did not have the time to train others.
- Ensured availability of the necessary funds and equipments facilities to conduct ethics training at work places continuously was overlooked just from the launching of the project.

#### **(2) Factors concerning to the implementation process.**

- Main factors which impede the project implementation process include:
- Lack of commitment and cooperation by the top management/leadership
- Wrong selection of trainers who do not find time to train others.

## 5. Conclusion

The project is relevant and valuable for the Government of Tanzania in its quest to have a workforce that can provide effective and efficient public services delivery to the people of Tanzania.

Both trainers and trainees have confessed an improvement in their understanding of public services ethics. Most of the employees who have received training have become more accountable, productive and customer oriented. A core pool of ethics trainers has been established and given adequate time, funds, facilities, regular retraining and commitment from top leadership; it should be possible for the trained trainers to implement continuous ethics training at work places.

## 6. Recommendations

### (1) For Tanzania Government

- To continue with the effort being made in financial contribution to the project up to its final completion in 2004.
- Top management in MDAs to show enough commitment and cooperation.
- To select right employees to be trained as trainers who would ultimately be available to carry out training in ethics at work places continuously.
- To ensure that management in MDAs provide regular feedback reports to PSM office and regard ethics training as an obligation
- Improve communication between MDAs Management and PSM office to obtain the planned number of trainers to be trained.

### (2) For JICA

- To continue project funding and management till the end of the project period.

## 7. Lessons Learned

### (1) For Tanzania Government

- (i) In planning and implementation of such projects all stakeholders to be fully involved so that the overall goal will be fully achieved.
  - (ii) Funds should be budgeted to cater for the project's full implementation and sustainability
  - (iii) A broad management and monitoring systems of the Project be installed and known at the planning stage
  - (iv) All institutions involved in project implementation to keep relevant records of project vital information
  - (v) Involvement and cooperation of top decision makers in the project areas both at the planning and implementation stages are crucial for the projects to be successful
  - (vi) Giving the budgetary constraints faced by Government of Tanzania, technical and financial support from donors will greatly enhance implementation of programmes requiring substantial amounts of funding. Thus the following projects being contemplated may require these supports.
- Training of top management in ethics in the MDAs including Members of Parliament to be able to achieve fully the overall goal of the Ethics Training Programme.
  - To roll out the Ethics Training Programme to the up-coming generation in primary schools, secondary schools and other higher institutions of learning.
  - Designing special Ethics Training Manual for specific MDAs.

### (2) For JICA

- (i) Timely dispatched of experts at the planning and project implementation stages will continue to be an important factor in future projects.
- (ii) Awareness in the differences in fiscal years of both countries to ensure inflow of financial support is smooth and timely.