

JBIC ODA Loan Projects: Mid-term Review

Project Title: Philippines "Provincial Cities Water Supply Project III" (PH-P149)

[Outline of Loan Agreement]

Loan Amount/Disbursed Amount: 6,212 million yen/2,328 million yen (as of March 2005)

Loan Agreement: December 1994 (12th year)

Executing Agency: Local Water Utilities Administration (LWUA)

This project's objective was to provide safe, good quality water to residents (individual households) living in regional hub cities (Butuan, Cagoyan de Oro, Kalibo, Davao and Tuguegarao) throughout the Philippines by expanding and upgrading water supply facilities of the Water Districts, thereby contributing to improvements in sanitary conditions in these cities.

Consultants: NJS Consulting (Nippon Jogesuido Sekkei Co., Ltd.), etc. Contractors: Local companies, etc.

[Outline of Results] (Field Survey : December 2004)

Item	Ex-ante Evaluation (June 1989)	Mid-term Review																																																																																												
[Relevance]	<p>(1) The development of water supply infrastructure was one of the priority policies outlined in the five-year Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan (1993-1998).</p> <p>(2) The goal of the Local Water Utilities Administration (LWUA), which is responsible for executing water supply projects in cities other than Metro Manila, was to increase the rate of population served from 67% (actual figure for 1993) to 71% (target for 1998).</p> <p>(3) Although households in the five regional hub cities targeted have individual connections, deficiencies in the absolute volume of supplies and inoperable facilities meant that demand was not being met. Expanding facilities to meet projected increases in demand had been identified as a policy issue and assigned high priority by the government.</p>	<p>(1) The development of water supply infrastructure continues to be identified as a priority measure in the current five-year Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan (2004-2010), and the government is aiming to achieve nationwide coverage by 2010.</p> <p>(2) LWUA has set itself the goal of raising the rate of population served from 88.1% (result for 2001) to 89.6% (target for 2004) in all cities besides Metro Manila.</p> <p>(3) The significance of this project, which was designed to meet current and future demand for water in five regional cities, remains high.</p> <p>* F/S: Executing agency (1991, 1993), USAID (1992)</p>																																																																																												
[Effectiveness] (1) Changes in water supplies ²	<p>(1) Butuan Water District</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td></td> <td>1993 result</td> <td>2000 [scheduled completion date] target</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Average daily supply:</td> <td>20,664m³</td> <td>26,811m³</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rate of population served:</td> <td>43.6%</td> <td>48%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Population served:</td> <td>106,413</td> <td>135,811</td> </tr> </table> <p>(2) Cagoyan de Oro Water District (/2000 [scheduled completion date] target)</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td></td> <td>1990 result</td> <td>2000 [scheduled completion date] target</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Average daily supply:</td> <td>82,166m³</td> <td>N.A.</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rate of population served:</td> <td>72.9%</td> <td>90.5%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Population served:</td> <td>247,628</td> <td>429,381</td> </tr> </table> <p>(3) Kalibo Water District</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td></td> <td>1993 result</td> <td>2000 [scheduled completion date] target</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Average daily supply:</td> <td>N.A.</td> <td>9,928m³</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rate of population served:</td> <td>36%</td> <td>66%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Population served:</td> <td>21,640</td> <td>44,830</td> </tr> </table> <p>[Reference]</p> <p>(4) Davao Water District</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td></td> <td>1992 result</td> <td>2000 [scheduled completion date] target</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Average daily supply:</td> <td>N.A.</td> <td>158,899m³</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rate of population served:</td> <td>58.4%</td> <td>69.3%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Population served:</td> <td>530,442</td> <td>745,629</td> </tr> </table>		1993 result	2000 [scheduled completion date] target	Average daily supply:	20,664m ³	26,811m ³	Rate of population served:	43.6%	48%	Population served:	106,413	135,811		1990 result	2000 [scheduled completion date] target	Average daily supply:	82,166m ³	N.A.	Rate of population served:	72.9%	90.5%	Population served:	247,628	429,381		1993 result	2000 [scheduled completion date] target	Average daily supply:	N.A.	9,928m ³	Rate of population served:	36%	66%	Population served:	21,640	44,830		1992 result	2000 [scheduled completion date] target	Average daily supply:	N.A.	158,899m ³	Rate of population served:	58.4%	69.3%	Population served:	530,442	745,629	<p>(1) Butuan Water District (Completed in June 2005.)</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td></td> <td>2004 results</td> <td>June 2005</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Average daily supply:</td> <td>20,669m³/day</td> <td>20,642m³/day</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rate of population served:</td> <td>61.6%</td> <td>55.5%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Population served:</td> <td>175,973</td> <td>178,255</td> </tr> </table> <p>* Although supplies fall short of the target, the rate of population served is higher than the target.</p> <p>(2) Cagayan de Oro Water District (Completed in June 2005.)</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td></td> <td>2004 results</td> <td>June 2005</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Average daily supply:</td> <td>118,652m³/day</td> <td>122,247m³/day</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rate of population served:</td> <td>97.5%</td> <td>92.1%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Population served:</td> <td>480,857</td> <td>472,598</td> </tr> </table> <p>* The access rate target was reached in 2004.</p> <p>(3) Kalibo Water District (completed in July 2000)</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td></td> <td>2000 results</td> <td>June 2005</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Average daily supply:</td> <td>7,874m³/day</td> <td>21,952m³/day</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rate of population served:</td> <td>65.1%</td> <td>95.1%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Population served:</td> <td>44,064</td> <td>78,485</td> </tr> </table> <p>* Value of water supply and rate of population served were higher than target.</p> <p>Judging from the results mentioned above, there will be no problem about the future effectiveness of this project.</p> <p>(4) Davao Water District</p> <table border="1"> <tr> <td></td> <td>June 2005</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Average daily supply:</td> <td>206,649m³/day</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rate of population served:</td> <td>60.0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Population served:</td> <td>726,355</td> </tr> </table>		2004 results	June 2005	Average daily supply:	20,669m ³ /day	20,642m ³ /day	Rate of population served:	61.6%	55.5%	Population served:	175,973	178,255		2004 results	June 2005	Average daily supply:	118,652m ³ /day	122,247m ³ /day	Rate of population served:	97.5%	92.1%	Population served:	480,857	472,598		2000 results	June 2005	Average daily supply:	7,874m ³ /day	21,952m ³ /day	Rate of population served:	65.1%	95.1%	Population served:	44,064	78,485		June 2005	Average daily supply:	206,649m ³ /day	Rate of population served:	60.0%	Population served:	726,355
	1993 result	2000 [scheduled completion date] target																																																																																												
Average daily supply:	20,664m ³	26,811m ³																																																																																												
Rate of population served:	43.6%	48%																																																																																												
Population served:	106,413	135,811																																																																																												
	1990 result	2000 [scheduled completion date] target																																																																																												
Average daily supply:	82,166m ³	N.A.																																																																																												
Rate of population served:	72.9%	90.5%																																																																																												
Population served:	247,628	429,381																																																																																												
	1993 result	2000 [scheduled completion date] target																																																																																												
Average daily supply:	N.A.	9,928m ³																																																																																												
Rate of population served:	36%	66%																																																																																												
Population served:	21,640	44,830																																																																																												
	1992 result	2000 [scheduled completion date] target																																																																																												
Average daily supply:	N.A.	158,899m ³																																																																																												
Rate of population served:	58.4%	69.3%																																																																																												
Population served:	530,442	745,629																																																																																												
	2004 results	June 2005																																																																																												
Average daily supply:	20,669m ³ /day	20,642m ³ /day																																																																																												
Rate of population served:	61.6%	55.5%																																																																																												
Population served:	175,973	178,255																																																																																												
	2004 results	June 2005																																																																																												
Average daily supply:	118,652m ³ /day	122,247m ³ /day																																																																																												
Rate of population served:	97.5%	92.1%																																																																																												
Population served:	480,857	472,598																																																																																												
	2000 results	June 2005																																																																																												
Average daily supply:	7,874m ³ /day	21,952m ³ /day																																																																																												
Rate of population served:	65.1%	95.1%																																																																																												
Population served:	44,064	78,485																																																																																												
	June 2005																																																																																													
Average daily supply:	206,649m ³ /day																																																																																													
Rate of population served:	60.0%																																																																																													
Population served:	726,355																																																																																													

² The sources for the various data used at appraisal are as follows. Butuan, Kalibo, Davao and Tuguegarao: appraisal survey report/data; Cagoyan de Oro: results for 1991 were taken from the appraisal report; but 1990 intake/2005 targets for average daily supplies were taken from questionnaire responses provided by the executing agency. Note that, in cases where there are discrepancies in the figures listed in the appraisal survey report/data, in principle, those cited in appraisal data are used.

	(5) Tuguegarao Water District (1992 result/2000 [scheduled completion date] target)	(5) Tuguegarao Water District																				
	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>1992 result</th> <th>2000 [scheduled completion date] target</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Average daily supply:</td> <td>N.A.</td> <td>13,810m³</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rate of population served:</td> <td>55%</td> <td>73%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Population served:</td> <td>25,982</td> <td>88,638</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		1992 result	2000 [scheduled completion date] target	Average daily supply:	N.A.	13,810m ³	Rate of population served:	55%	73%	Population served:	25,982	88,638	<table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>June 2005</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Average daily supply:</td> <td>21,064 m³/day</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Rate of population served:</td> <td>97.0%</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Population served:</td> <td>130,069</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		June 2005	Average daily supply:	21,064 m ³ /day	Rate of population served:	97.0%	Population served:	130,069
	1992 result	2000 [scheduled completion date] target																				
Average daily supply:	N.A.	13,810m ³																				
Rate of population served:	55%	73%																				
Population served:	25,982	88,638																				
	June 2005																					
Average daily supply:	21,064 m ³ /day																					
Rate of population served:	97.0%																					
Population served:	130,069																					
Reference Information																						
[Efficiency]																						
(1) Outputs	(1) Outputs (as follows) Water facilities infrastructure in the five cities of Butuan, Cagoyan de Oro, Davao, Kalibo and Tuguegarao was expanded as follows. 1. Development of water intake infrastructure (boring of shallow and deep wells, installation of pumps, etc.) 2. Development of water mains infrastructure (laying of mains pipes) 3. Development of distribution infrastructure (construction of reservoirs, laying of service pipes, installation of faucets, etc.) 4. Consulting services: 408 M/M (man-months)	(1) Work in the two cities of Davao and Tuguegarao was financed by the respective LGUs and not using Japanese ODA loan funds as the LGUs were able to procure the necessary funds. No major changes were made to the outputs for Butuan, Cagoyan de Oro and Kalibo. Man/Months of the consulting service was 533 m/m.																				
(2) Project period	(2) Dec. 1994 – Oct. 1999 (59 months) Scheduled completion dates for respective Water Districts: · Butuan: July 1999 · Cagoyan de Oro: October 1999 · Kalibo: January 1998	(2) Dec. 1994 – Jun. 2005 (127 months) Completion dates for respective Water Districts: · Butuan: June 2005 · Cagoyan de Oro: June 2005 · Kalibo: July 2000 (Reasons for delays) · There were holdups in both F/S and D/D reviews and delays in bidding procedures, and procedures required to obtain the approval of the various executing agencies for land acquisition procedures, changes to design, and excavation work proved time consuming.																				
(3) Project cost	(3) 8,283 million yen	(3) 2,918 million yen																				
[Lessons Learned and Recommendations]	Some of the values of indicators in the effectiveness part are not consistent. It is hoped that data and data measuring methods will be examined by the time of the ex-post evaluation.																					
[Indicators set for the ex-post evaluation]	N.A.	1. Population served in the service area 2. Supply volume 3. Non-revenue water rate 4. Ratio of population served (Consultation between JBIC and implementing agency is needed regarding target value.)																				