

Terminal Evaluation

Asia

I. Outline of the Project

- Country : Indonesia
- Project title : Human Resource Development for Local Governance Phase II
- Issue/Sector : Governance
- Cooperation scheme : Technical Cooperation
- Division in charge : Social Development Department
- Total Cost : 3,50 million yen
- Period of Cooperation : 01.04.2005 — 31.03.2007
- Partner Country's Related Organization(s) : Ministry of Home Affairs
- Supporting Organizations in Japan : Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications, Local Autonomy College, Hyogo Prefecture
- Related Cooperation : Human Resource Development for Local Governance Phase I

1-1 Background of the Project

Japanese supports for decentralization process have given the focal point on the training of local government officials in order to support the Indonesian self-efforts for the improvement of capacity of human resources for local governance in the field of administrative management and regional development.

The project namely "Human Resources Development for Local Governance Phase II" had commenced its activities in April 2005 setting main purposes as shown below, and now by extending its support by aiming at further achievement for the higher level of implementation skill of training management and the socialization related activities on Decentralization Policy from central level to Local Government,

Project Purposes

I. Capacity of training management for human resources development of local governmental officials is improved in Education and Training Agency of Ministry of Home Affairs (B. Diklat) and Education and Training Board of North Sumatra Province (Provincial Diklat).

II. Public administration methods or techniques based on new policies or guidelines related to decentralization and regional autonomy of Indonesia are widely disseminated and understood by local governments.

1-2 Project Overview

(1) Project Purpose

1) Project Purpose I

In the area of the Bili-Bili Irrigation System, the proper operation and maintenance of irrigation facilities is introduced through empowerment of WUAs by Local Government assistance and collaboration between Local Government and WUAs.

In Jakarta, B.Diklat of MoHA has accumulated experience and knowledge of managing training course for human resource of local governments through the Project activities. It will complete formulation of "Manual" in November 2006. Therefore, the Project will have conducted training courses along the manual by its end.

Due to enforcement of No.79/2005 Governmental Regulation, which legitimates the role of B.Diklat of MoHA to supervise B.Diklat of all provinces, MoHA is going to issue Ministerial Decree in which the "Manual" will be institutionalised in MoHA, therefore provinces need to refer it to conduct training courses. (Back ground and content of the Manual is shown in ANNEX 10)

In North Sumatra, B. Diklat of Sumut has prepared "Standard of Training Management" based on quality management system

of ISO 9001:2000. After certification of ISO 9001:2000 with own budget of 2006, It will have conducted all duties including training courses along the Standard by the end of Project. In addition, introduction of ISO standard will force B. Diklat of Sumut to create independent and sustainable improvement process of training management to deal with external and internal audit twice a year for re-certification every three years. Therefore, B. Diklat of Sumut will try to strengthen its capacity continually. (Back ground of this process described in ANNEX 11)

2) Project Purpose II

Public administration methods or techniques based on new policies or guidelines related to decentralization and regional autonomy of Indonesia are widely disseminated and understood by local governments.

Total numbers of heads of sub-district who participated in training course of "Camat" counted 1,213 out of 5,263 head of sub-district in Indonesia. Provincial governments are expected to conduct the above training course by themselves to train the rests. Results of the course, many ex-trainees have carried out their action plan on improving public services at Camat office. (List of conducted training of "Camat" course is shown in ANNEX 12)

On the other hands, OTDA has reached its purpose for conducting training course for inter regional partnerships through the Project. Training of "Local Government Cooperation" course disseminated the importance of regional partnerships for 21 provinces out of 33 through out the Phase I to Phase II of the Project. Additionally, Governmental Regulation concerning regional partnership will be in effect to strengthen it legislatively soon.

(2) Project Outputs

1) Outputs for Project Purpose I

Output 1: Training curriculum and modules are improved to be more practical ones based on the needs of local governments (in B.Diklat of MoHA and B. Diklat of Sumut).

In Jakarta, B.Diklat of MoHA has formulated practical training course for "Transformation of Sub-district Public Service Policy" (based on the training called "Public Management Reform" course and hereinafter referred as "Reform for Camat"). Curriculum and module of the course was revised from theoretical to practical, therefore participants implement their action plans immediately after the course ended. Also, B.Diklat of MoHA has developed its capacity for management of training course to correspond to local government needs through the formulation process of the above course. In addition, as final output of capacity development of B.Diklat of MoHA by the Project, "Manual for Planning, Implementation and Evaluation of Effective Training"(hereinafter it is called "Manual") has been prepared to improve quality of training courses as well as to supervise training management of local governments.

In North Sumatra, curriculum and modules of training courses of "Management of Training" was modified to be practical. Through experience of conducting the course, B.Diklat of Sumut clarified the policy of management of training course and is going to produce "Standard of Training Management". Through conducting training courses of "Good Governance" and follow up activities of post training, B.Diklat of Sumut has tried to identify the reason of success or failure of those practices, in order to improve curriculum and method for improving public service.

Output 2: Collaboration between B.Diklat of MoHA and B. Diklat of Sumut to conduct training courses is enforced.

351 local government staffs and provincial Diklats officers from 32 provinces in Indonesia have participated in "Training of Trainers (TOT) for Head of Sub-district Capacity Development Training" (hereinafter refer as "TOT for Camats") and 20 provinces has already implemented training course of The Head of Sub District Capacity Development (hereinafter refer as "Camats") in regions by themselves based on the TOT. In order to contribute for efficient management of training of "Camat" course in the region, displacement of several number of lectures form B.Diklat of MoHA to Provincial Diklats were carried out for 16 provinces.

Also, B.Diklat of MoHA and Sumut have collaborated especially through conducting training course of "Camat", "Management of Trainings" and "Good Governance" and formulation process of the "Manual".

Output 3: Training curriculum aiming at improvement of public service is improved and its training is implemented (in North Sumatra).

Training course of "Good Governance" is conducted in order to implement good governance principles at local governments, which regulated in Governor's instruction of North Sumatra in 2002. This course has been implemented three times for JFY 2005, 86 local government staffs in public service sectors from Province, Districts and Municipalities participated the course. For JFY 2006, the course was conducted once with 30 participants of local government staffs, and, one more course is planned in November. This course was evaluated and improved after its implementation, and it was conducted practically. It consists of focus group discussion with stakeholders, survey on services, and making action plan. As a result, many

participants have shown their performance on improving public services along the procedure introduced during the course and their action plans. Modules and materials of this course have been edited and published, then distributed to concerned institutions of Central and Local governments.

Output 4: Partnership among the training institutions (between province and provinces or between province and district /municipality) is established.(in North Sumatra)

Partnership among B.Diklat of Sumut and Other Provinces (such as East Java, West Java, Jakarta, West Nusa Tenggara) has been progressed through acceptance of trainers to training courses, discussing management of training and implementing field visits. B.Diklat of Sumut was strongly influenced from this partnership with East Java, West Java, and Jakarta, which have introduced ISO 9001:2000 as a method of sustainable improvement of management of training of B.Diklat of Sumut.

Also, B.Diklat of Sumut has strengthened partnership among the training institutions in North Sumatra Province. It has planned training course of "Good Governance" by collaboration with Tanjung Balai Municipal Government to deal with local government's needs and, also it has planned training course of "Camat" for supporting districts/municipal governments in November 2006.

2) Outputs for Project Purpose II

Output 1: Guideline for the inter-regional partnership and its implementation methods are understood by the local governmental officials.

OTDA implemented the survey of selected inter regional partnership organizations which already started activities and it has edited the report as a result. Utilizing the report, OTDA formulated a set of modules for training of regional partnership, which consist of six fields. Consequently, "Intensive Training Course for Local Government Cooperation Management in Regional Autonomy Era" (hereinafter, referred to as "Local Government Cooperation" course) has been conducted totally four (4) times, and 112 participants from local governments participated in the courses. Target of the training course was focused on four regional partnership organizations such as MAMMINASATA, SARBAGITAKU, BARLINGMASCAKEB, and SUBOSUKAWONOSRATEN. Participants of the course were able to obtain practical knowledge to strengthen their partnerships, especially legitimacy issue.

Output 2: Guideline for the new roles of sub-district head (Camat) responding to the new Decentralization and Regional Autonomy Law and its implementation methods are understood by sub-district head

Training course of "Camat" will be implemented in 23 provinces by the ends of year 2006, mainly by participants of "training course on TOT for Camats". (The Project has sent lecturer party in the courses for 16 provinces, and conducted the course directly in 3 provinces. On the other hands, 4 provinces conducted the courses by themselves.) Totally, 1,213 head of sub-district participated those courses at present. The courses implemented by the Project include Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam Province for the purpose of supporting recovery of tsunami disaster.

(3). Inputs

1. Inputs to the Project (at the point of terminal evaluation)

Inputs made by both Japanese and Indonesian sides during the past about one and half year since the inception in April 2005 are summarized as follows.

1-1 Inputs from the Japanese side are as follows.

1) Long-term experts : 3 (three) persons (Totally 72 MM)

2) Short-term experts : 4 (four) persons (Totally 0.8 MM)

3) Counterpart training in Japan :

4 (four) persons participated in training in JFY 2005 and other 13 (thirteen) persons will participate in JFY 2006.

4) Provision of Equipment :

The equipment which provided during phase I has been used continuously in the Project. Therefore, additional equipment has not been provided.

5) Operational expenditure:

The operational expenditure borne by Japanese side for JFY 2005 (as of April 2005 to March 2006) is Rp.6,636,565,497. Also, it is estimated Rp.3,906,480,700 for JFY 2006 (as of April 2006 to March 2007). Therefore, total operational expenditure for the Project would be estimated Rp.10,543,046,197. (see Table 1-1 Operational expenditure of Japanese side)

Cultivated Area of New Varieties 2004-2007

Year (JFY)	Administrative costs	Activity costs	Total
2005	1,894,278,113	4,742,287,384	6,636,565,497
2006	1,178,336,700	2,728,144,000	3,906,480,700
Total	3,072,614,813	7,470,431,384	10,543,046,197

*Activity costs have been spent among Activities in PDM such as conducting In-country training courses and seminars.

1-2 Inputs from the Indonesian side are as follows:

1) Counterpart Personnel necessary for the Project

Totally, 124 counterpart personnel are allocated for the Project. There are 15 personnel from Centre for Management of Overseas Cooperation (hereinafter referred to as "AKLN"), 30 personnel from Education and Training Agency (hereinafter referred to as B.Diklat of MoHA"), 21 personnel from Regional Autonomy Directorate General (hereinafter referred to as "OTDA"), and 58 personnel from Education and Training Agency of North Sumatra Province (hereinafter referred to as "B.Diklat Sumut"), respectively. (List of Counterparts are shown in ANNEX 6)

2) Necessary budget for the operation of the Project

Amount of expenditure for the Project was Rp.769,740,000. in JFY 2005. For JFY 2006, a budget for the Project is estimated Rp.1,516,026,250. Total amount of expenditure is estimated Rp.2,285,766,250. (see Table 1-2 Operational expenditure of Indonesian side)

Table 1-2 Operational expenditure of Indonesian side (in Rp.)

Year (JFY)	Amount of expenditure
2005	769,740,000
2006	1,516,026,250
Total	2,285,766,250

*Activity costs have been spent among Activities in PDM such as conducting In-country training courses and seminars.

3) Land, Facilities and Equipment

In Jakarta, two (2) rooms have been provided in B.Diklat of MoHA. In North Sumatra, one (1) has been provided in B.Diklat Sumut.

II. Evaluation Team

Members of the Evaluation Team:

- Mr. Nobuhiko HANAZATO, Team Leader
- Mr. Kazuyoshi KURODA, Evaluation Planning
- Mr. Harumi IIDA, Evaluation Analysis

Period of Evaluation:

September 11, 2006 – September 22, 2006

Type of Evaluation:

Terminal Evaluation

III. Results of Evaluation

3-1 Summary of Evaluation Results

The summary of 5-criteria evaluation of the Project is shown below.

(1) Relevance

According to the Law No.22/1999 on Local governance, and its amendment as Law No.32/2004, local governments in

Indonesia are required to elaborate development plan, provide public services and take on other functions. In order to take those responsibilities, local governments need to build their capacity. Therefore, human resource development is essential for their capacity development. In this context, the aim of Project that development of human resources through training courses is consistent with the need in Indonesia.

Japanese ODA policy for Indonesia concerns mainly three categories; those are namely "Sustainable Growth by private sector", "Democratic and Equal society" and "Peace and Stability". Support for "Good Governance", which includes decentralization is one of important components of "Democratic and Equal society". In JICAs' technical assistance policy for Indonesia, supporting decentralization is considered as one of the important subjects. From above consistency, the Project is highly relevant to be implemented.

(2) Effectiveness

The Project has been effective for capacity development of training management of B.Diklat of MoHA and B. Diklat of Sumut. From experience of managing training courses in the Project activities, those institutions have been highly motivated and have improved their ability and knowledge. As a result of the Project, B.Diklat of MoHA has strengthened its role and function as central institution for education and training for public sector. It will pursue quality of training course at national level, by utilizing the "Manual". In North Sumatra, B. Diklat of Sumut will represent as qualified institution for education and training at provincial level, by adoption of the Standard and introduction of ISO 9001:2000.

On the other hands, most provinces have already implemented training of "Camat" course based on "TOT for Camat" conducted by the Project. And, the Project has implemented "Good Governance" for North Sumatra. Those courses have contributed to disseminate the essence of decentralization, as improvement of providing public services by the local governments. Also, training course of "Local Government Cooperation" has contributed to strengthen regional cooperation as one of administrative approach in decentralization. Due to above situation, the Project has done its duty by promoting and facilitating decentralization policy in Indonesia.

(3) Efficiency

Inputs from Japanese side and Indonesian side have been executed along the plan. By Inputs and activities, each Output has been produced smoothly along the plan, even though the project term is short. Relationship, such as communication and mutual understanding between Japanese experts and Indonesian counterpart organizations has been kept well in Jakarta and North Sumatra.

In terms of project design, due to recover the damage of tsunami disaster, special attention was paid to support Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam Province as emergency relieves. Even those activities were outside of original project framework, the Project implemented without negative effect to ordinal activities.

Regarding the management of the Project, official dialogue between both sides such as Joint Coordinating Committee has been organized once a year. From above situation and condition, the Project has been efficiently implemented.

(4) Impacts

From a view point of impact of the Project, mostly positive impact are observed along the project activities while the negative impact is minimal.

1) Positive impact: some positive impacts are observed such as follows;

- Many activities for improving public services have been implemented by ex-trainees of "Camat", "Reform for Camat" and "Good Governance" training courses in Several Provinces. (List of post training activities done by ex-trainees of above training courses are shown in ANNEX 13, ANNEX 14 and ANNEX 15, respectively)
- In Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam Province, 25 Camats selected as representative of participants of training of "Camat" in Aceh done by the Project submitted the Recommendation to the Governor. Provincial government of Nanggroe Aceh Darussalam has strongly supported camats through guidance to District/Municipality governments such as promotion of Echelon of camat and direct allocation of budgets to sub-district office based on the Recommendation. It will plan to organize workshop for dissemination of decentralization.
- OTDA has obtained necessary capacity for supervision to promote Central Government Policy of local government's cooperation.

2) Negative impact:

The terminal evaluation team has not found any negative impact brought by the Project.

(5) Sustainability

In Jakarta, B. Diklat of MoHA will keep their acquired knowledge for managing training course, by utilizing "Manual" prepared with support from the Project. By enforcement of No.79/2005 Governmental Regulation, the utilization of "Manual" will be endorsed, in which B. Diklat of MoHA has an function to supervise and promote all provinces on management of training courses. OTDA will be able to utilize their knowledge to promote its policy on regional cooperation from dissemination stage to implementation of pilot project by itself.

In North Sumatra, adoption of "Standard of Training Management" and introduction of ISO 9001 to B.Diklat of Sumut will strengthen capacity of managing training continuously. It has already increased the budget for those improvements.

Taking in to consideration of such conditions and will of the above three institutions, those effects of the Project will be sustained.

IV. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Conclusion

The team confirmed that the Project is considered to have achieved its Project purposes as set in R/D. The Impacts of the Project are observed as the fruit of high level of achievements which are more than expected results from the beginning. In accordance with the foregoing observations, both sides concluded that the Project will be completed in March 2007 as planned. Following items clarified in Recommendations are expected to be implemented through activities of the Project until the end of March 2007, thereafter by the initiatives of counterparts themselves.

Education and Training Agency of Ministry of Home Affairs (B.Diklat of MoHA)

~Mar 2007

- "Manual" is to be completed through sharing information of formulation of the manual with provincial B.Diklats including B.Diklat of Sumut. Guidance and Advice are expected to assist the process of foregoing manual to be enacted as Government Regulation. Additional 2 courses of "Reform for Camat Training" to be implemented.
- Dissemination of Information regarding to the results from Monitoring of Training courses of "Camats" and "Good Governance" is to be reinforced to local governments through Newsletter and in other measures.
- Information regarding to the implementation of decentralization collected by B.Diklat of MoHA is to be disseminated to the other Directorate Generals of MOHA.

Directorate General of Regional Autonomy (OTDA)

~Mar 2007

- "Implementation Guidance for Monitoring" is to be prepared.
- Monitoring activity based on foregoing guidance is to be implemented as well as a report of the results to be produced.

Apr. 2007~

- Ongoing "Local Government cooperation Course" is to be implemented for other regions.

Education and Training Board of North Sumatra Province (B.Diklat of Sumut)

~Mar 2007

- Training Management Standard implemented by B.Diklat of Sumut is expected to be synchronised with "Manual" Following Training courses to be implemented.
 1. Inter Regional Cooperation Training (Training for Capacity Development of Heads of Sub District in North Sumatra Province)
 2. Inter Regional Cooperation Training (Training course of "Good Governance" in Tanjung Balai)
 3. Training course of "Legal Drafting"
- Follow-up Activities for the training course of "Good Governance"
 - a. Monitoring b. Revision of Training materials c. Implementation of TOT Training. (Subject to further discussion)

Apr. 2007~

- (1) Ongoing "Local Government cooperation Course" is to be implemented for other regions.
- (2) Training Management Standard implemented by B.Diklat of Sumut to be sustained.