

Terminal Evaluation

Asia

I. Outline of the Project

- Country: Republic of Indonesia
- Project title: Project for Training of Agricultural Extension Officers on Improvement of Farm Management
- Issue/Sector: Agriculture
- Cooperation scheme: Technical cooperation project
- Division in charge: Indonesia office
- Period of Cooperation
(R/D): October 29th, 2003
Implementation: January 5, 2004 - January 4, 2007
- Partner Country's Implementing Organization: Agency of Agricultural Human Resources Development, Ministry of Agriculture (AAHRD)
- Supporting Organization in Japan: Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries
- Related cooperation: Project for Improvement of Agricultural Extension and Training System ("PIAETS") , September 1, 1999 – March 31, 2002

1 Background of the Project

The Indonesian government had shifted its policy focus of the agricultural sector development from the increase of food production to the improvement of farm income. Under the new policy environment, emphasis was put on "agribusiness and agribusiness system development" by which the farmers and other players concerned with the sector were encouraged to pursue higher profitability through the increased production of high-value products and strengthening of efficient marketing channels. To achieve this, the government had come to recognize that it was essential to improve the agricultural extension services by enhancing the capacity of agricultural extension workers. The government, however, had not had an effective training system for field extension workers, which led to a request to the Japanese government for a technical cooperation on this development issue. The *Project for Improvement of Agricultural Extension and Training System* ("PIAETS") was implemented from September 1999 to March 2002 with an aim of developing a new training system for extension workers in the country. Through this project, the PIAETS training approach (method) was developed and piloted with a great success. The project was completed on March 31, 2002 but the Indonesian government had requested the Japanese government to continue support for a successor project through which the newly developed PIAETS training system was to be further improved and extended to other areas of the country. Under this context, the *Project for Training of Agricultural Extension Officers on Improvement of Farm Management* was initiated and has been implemented since January 5, 2004.

2 Project Overview

The project under review has been carried out with an aim of enhancing the training system for field extension workers involving national training institutions.

(1) Overall Goal

Farm management in selected districts is improved through the MP3* training.

*MP3 method: Renamed from "*PIAETS method*" after the Project started

(2) Project Purpose

Field extension officers in selected districts acquire skills in extension methodology through the improved training program (MP3 method).

(3) Outputs

- i) MP3 training program is improved in BDA-Kayuambon

ii) TOT (training of trainers) program is established in BDA-Kayuambon

iii) The training program is applied to selected districts.

(4) Inputs

Japanese side:

Long-term Experts: 3 (2 in the 3rd year)

Short-term Experts: 2

Trainees received: 7

Equipment: 12,492 million yen

Local cost: 25,342 million yen

Indonesian side:

Counterpart personnel: 10

Local cost: 2,477 million IDR

Others: Provision of project offices (Jakarta, Kayuambon), 4 wheel drive vehicle

II. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team

1) Leader:

Mr. Nobuhiko HANAZATO, Deputy Resident Representative, Indonesia Office, JICA

2) Evaluation Planning:

Mr. Makoto YAMANE, Assistant Resident Representative, Indonesia Office, JICA

3) Evaluation Analysis:

Mr. Atsushi SUZUKI, IC Net Co., Ltd.

Period of Evaluation

September 4 — 15, 2006

Type of Evaluation

Terminal

III. Results of Evaluation

1. Summary of evaluation results

(1) Relevance

In Indonesia, agricultural extension services were largely provided in the past in a "top-down" manner with an aim of increasing food production, notably rice. Policy focus was, however, shifted to high value agriculture. At the same time, the decentralization reforms initiated in 1999, and most agricultural extension functions including staff recruitment, training and funding have been devolved to district level. In this context, it was recognized essential to improve the capacity of agricultural extension agents at district and village levels so that they could respond to the needs of farming community as well as other stakeholders.

Introduction of a participatory extension approach/methodology was regarded as an effective way to improve the national agricultural extension system under a new policy context. The aim of the Project under review was to enhance the knowledge and skills of field-level extension officers necessary for the demand-driven extension services that were in turn expected to contribute to the improvement of farm management. Therefore, the implementation of the Project was in accordance with the development policy of the Indonesian government and was highly relevant to the local needs.

On the other hand, Japanese government has defined social development and poverty alleviation as one of the significant development issues in the latest assistant policy for Indonesia. In line with this, a program for establishment of stable food supply system and increase of farm/fishery income has been identified. The project evaluated was designed as one of inputs under this program; hence, it is considered that the consistency with the assistance policy of the Japanese government toward Indonesia was high.

Through the above analysis, the Team has concluded that the relevance of the Project was "high".

(2) Effectiveness

Based on the following analysis, the overall Effectiveness of the Project could be judged as "high".

1) Achievement level of the expected outputs

Output 1: Except the maintenance and use of computer-based database, all the indicators for the Output 1 are likely to be achieved within the project period.

Output 2: Since the Indonesian C/P staff has been able to conduct, monitor and evaluate TOT for BBDA/BDA's instructors by themselves, the expected Output 2 can be regarded as having been achieved completely as a result of project activities.

Output 3: While it is still difficult at this stage to assess the level of understanding of the participants concerning the MP3 methodology, as far as assessed based on available information obtained by the Evaluation Team in the field study, the level of achievement of the Output 3 will be possibly high.

2) Achievement level of the Project Purpose

Since the MP3 has been applied in 7 districts, the target set at the beginning of the Project has been achieved. Out of 7 districts, the post-evaluation information was collected only from 2 districts. Consequently, it is still difficult to conclude the level of achievement regarding the Project Purpose; however, it appears to be very high as far as assessed based on available information and interviews conducted by the Team. The contribution of outputs realized as a result of the Project was also observed high, which means theoretical logic between Outputs level and Project Purpose level was generally good.

(3) Efficiency

Based on the following analysis, the Team has concluded the Efficiency of the Project has been moderate to high.

According to the results of the evaluation questionnaire and interviews with project personnel, it appears that inputs have been appropriately provided by the Japanese side and utilized efficiently to carry out the project activities. Although the number of long-term experts was reduced from 3 to 2 in the third year, planned activities have been properly conducted that have brought about the successful results.

The Team has learned that disbursement of operational funds for the Project from the Indonesian side was sometimes delayed particularly in the first year, which had affected the progress of the Project to some extent. It was inevitable since there was a gap of timing between the budgetary request and the R/D signing. And also, there was a change in the government budgetary system in 2004. However, after the Project had commenced, the C/Ps made efforts to secure budget and the amount released has remarkably increased from the second year, which contributed to the efficient implementation of the project activities. The preparatory work between Indonesia and Japanese side to detail the activities and budget plan before the commencement of the Project would have improved the first year operation.

While it is difficult to accurately assess the cost-effectiveness of the Project in monetary terms, looking at the fact that the Project has managed to cover 7 districts within a period of three years with relatively small inputs, it is considered that the cost-effectiveness of the Project has been reasonably high.

(4) Impact

It is apparent that the Project has brought or will bring about a number of expected and unexpected positive impacts on the national training system for extension agents as well as extension services delivered by the public extension system. According to the interviews made with instructors, it was confirmed that the acceptance of the methodology by each center has been quite high and its internalization as one of ordinary training courses has been in progress. The results of the evaluation questionnaire also supported the assessment result that overall impact of the Project may be generally high.

On the other hand, it was difficult in this study to assess as to what extent the Project has brought or will bring about impact on the Overall Goal. This is due to the following reasons:

There is a logical gap between the Overall Goal and the Project Purpose in the PDM

There are still a number of external factors (assumptions) that must be satisfied before realizing the Overall Goal although all the factors had not necessarily been addressed in the PDM

Any comprehensive study to objectively measure the level of impact on the Overall Goal has not been conducted since the commencement of the Project.

Based on the above analysis, it was concluded that the Impact of the Project could be "moderate".

(5) Sustainability

The Team has concluded that overall Sustainability of the Project outcome would be high from the following observations.

Technical and organizational sustainability: Through the Project, instructors at 7 national training centers under the AAHRD will be able to acquire adequate knowledge and skills in conducting MP3 trainings for extension officers. According to anecdotal information obtained by the Team, the technical as well as organizational sustainability of the MP3 methodology appears very high since most instructors have already been able to conduct the MP3 training for extension officers without much assistance from master instructors or Japanese experts.

Financial sustainability: It is observed that the sustainability of MP3 from next year will largely depend on the fund availability for the training. After the Project terminates, the BBDA/BDAs and districts need to secure the budget for the training expense. In regard to this issue, the Team has learned that AAHRD headquarters had already instructed each BBDA/BDA to secure the budget to run at least one MP3 training in the year 2007. It is reported that all the BBDA/BDAs are willing to continue it. It can be concluded that securing the budget will lead to the further expansion of the MP3 target areas in the future.

2. Factors promoting sustainability and impact

Several factors were recognized to have contributed to the smooth implementation of the project. They included:

- 1) Indonesian counterparts and Japanese experts have made substantial efforts to increase communication through regular meetings and solve various problems concerning the project activities as quickly as possible;
- 2) The same officers who had worked for the previous project were assigned as the counterparts to the current Project, which has ensured the continuity of the activities;
- 3) The Indonesian counterparts (instructors) have had high ability to understand the MP3 and apply to their training;
- 4) Japanese experts had high level of communication skills using local language.

3. Factors inhibiting sustainability and impact

On the other hand, it was observed that the following factors had negatively affected the project implementation:

- 1) There was a logical gap between the Overall Goal and the Project Purpose in the project design, which has led to confusion among project members over the concept of the Project, that is, whether the Project tries to institutionalize the MP3 training system, or to improve farm management through the improvement of extension activities using the MP3.
- 2) Lack of communication among project members and inadequate allocation of local costs by Indonesian government were observed particularly in the first year of the project. Two project offices were set up in Jakarta and Kayuambon, which caused difficulty in frequent communication among project members.

4. Conclusion

Based on findings and analysis made in the study, the Team has concluded that the project activities have been successfully carried out under the close collaboration between Japanese experts and Indonesian C/Ps. All the Outputs and Project Purpose are expected to be achieved by the end of the Project on 4th January, 2007. In this regard, the Project could be regarded as having been "successful". Contributing factors to the smooth implementation of the Project included: high commitment of both of Japanese experts and Indonesian C/Ps towards the realization of the project purpose, good relationship between them, and high competency of C/Ps and instructors of training centers.

On the other hand, a theoretical gap between the Overall Goal and Project Purpose in the project design was recognized. In order to make the Indonesian agricultural extension services to be beneficial for the farming community and achieve the Overall Goal, a lot of efforts are still required though it is considered beyond the scope of the current project. It is, therefore, expected that efforts be continued to improve the farm management based on valuable experience and lessons learned from the Project.

5. Recommendations

The Team has recommended the following measures to be taken before the termination of the Project:

- 1) Follow-up workshop: The Project is planning to organize a follow-up workshop in October for the BBDA/BDAs' instructors who have conducted MP3 training in the respective areas. A number of instructors who did not attend the TOT need to be involved in the follow-up workshop.
- 2) Socialization of the MP3: To further expand the MP3 target areas and increase the number of extension officers trained, it is crucial for local governments (districts) to be aware of the benefits of the methodology since the training expense is shared between the national and local governments. Therefore, it is important for the BATD as well as BBDA/BDAs to continue the socialization activities targeting district authorities.

3) Mid-term action plan: To ensure the sustainability of the expansion beyond year 2007, it is recommended that the Project formulate a mid-term action plan to cover the next few years, in which actions and schedule to undertake socialization, training and evaluation is described. Collaboration with other related projects also needs to be considered in the plan.

6. Follow-up situation

In regard to the measures that need to be taken after the termination of the Project in January 2007, the Team has recommended the following issues:

- 1) Securing budget
- 2) Post-training evaluation
- 3) Impact assessment
- 4) Use of database
- 5) Use of equipment
- 6) Collaboration within the AAHRD
- 7) Incorporation of the Project outcome into other projects
- 8) Exchange of experience with other countries