

Evaluation Summary (Terminal Evaluation)

1. Outline of the Project

Country: Republic of Indonesia

Project Title: Project on Enhancement of Civilian Police Activities

Issue/Sector: Governance

Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation Project

Division in Charge: Social System & Peace Building Team, Social Development Department

Total Cost (at the end of FY2006): 556,011,000 yen

Period of Cooperation

(R/D): 15 July 2002

Period of Cooperation: 5 years

(August 2002 - July 2007)

Partner Country's Implementing Organization(s):

1) Competent Government Agency: Indonesian National Police (INP)

2) Implementing Agencies: INP Headquarters; Jakarta Metropolitan Police; *POLRES Metro Bekasi* (Metro Bekasi Police Resort); and *POLRES Bekasi* (Bekasi Police Resort)

Supporting Organization(s) in Japan: National Police Agency

Related Cooperation: Support Program for Reform of Indonesian National Police

Individual Expert Assignment (advisor to the Chief of INP)

Technical Cooperation Project (Project on Drug Enforcement; Project on Enhancement of Civilian Police Activities for Bali Regional Police [in the tourism sector])

Grant Aid (Project for Enhancement of the Civilian Police; Project for Capacity-building of the Indonesian National Police)

Country-focused Training (Comparative Study of Police System for Republic of Indonesia)

1-1 Background to the Project

Indonesia National Police (INP) was separated from the Indonesian Armed Forces (TNI) and re-launched as civilian police directly under the president of Indonesia following a decision by the People's Consultative Assembly in August 2000 to do so amid progress in democratization of the country. For three decades until then, INP as part of TNI was responsible for the maintenance of national public order. It is important that INP win public confidence as civilian police and maintain national order accordingly. This in turn contributes to economic stability and investment promotion. In fact, the Indonesia government regards reform of INP as a priority in the National Development Program (PROPENAS). These circumstances prompted the Indonesian government to ask Japan to provide assistance in modernizing police capabilities and building institutional capacity of INP. In response, Japan launched the Support Program for Reform of Indonesian National Police, which involved different schemes, including the Individual Expert Assignment of an advisor to the Chief of INP in February 2001. At the center of the program was this technical cooperation Project. This Project is aimed at upgrading the capabilities and organizational capacity of the former Bekasi Police Resort, located near Jakarta, to the levels appropriate as a civil police station, which in turn, is expected to become a model police resort in Indonesia. The Project

originally selected the Bekasi Police Resort as the target site. However, as part of the political reform movement in Indonesia, Bekasi Police Resort was divided into two police resorts, *POLRES Metro Bekasi* (Metro Bekasi Police Resort); and *POLRES Bekasi* (Bekasi Police Resort), in October 2004.

1-2 Project Overview

(1) Overall Goal

System of civilian police established by police stations and police officers is deployed throughout the country.¹

(2) Project Purpose

Civilian police activities are implemented at Bekasi Police Resorts (BPRs) as a model police stations.²

(3) Outputs

1. Management of BPRs, model police stations, is improved to ensure the civilian police activities.
2. Practice on criminal identification in BPRs is improved.
3. Communication control and command system of BPRs is improved.
4. Training programs of “police station management”, “criminal identification” and “communication and command control” are improved.

(4) Inputs (by the time of evaluation)

Japanese side:

Long-term Experts: 11 experts Counterpart Training in a Third Country: 14 persons
Short-term Experts: 23 experts Equipment: 59,828,000 yen
Counterpart Training in Japan: 185 persons Local Cost: 81,273,000 yen

Indonesian side:

Counterparts: 27 persons Offices and other facilities
Land for model three police boxes Utilities expenses of offices

¹ Activities as *civilian police*: Police are responsible for protecting “life, person, and property of the people,” and “maintaining public safety and order.” In performing their duties, individual police activity should be carried out sincerely and promptly with fairness under the law. A good example of the civilian police is that due process of law is observed including the respect for human rights of the accused identified based on the physical evidence obtained through criminal identification technique. They work on prevention and suppression of crime sincerely, are kind to people, and stay close to local communities. Prompt responses to the demands of the people and sincere actions are also the essence of the civilian police activities.

² Bekasi Police Resort is now reorganized into two police resorts, namely *POLRES Metro Bekasi* and *POLRES Bekasi*. In this report, two police resorts in Bekasi area, including Porseks and BKPMs under the two Police Resorts, are described as “BPRs”.

2. Evaluation Team

Members of the Evaluation Team

Number of Team Members: 6

- (1) Team Leader: Yuji OKAZAKI, Managing Director, Social Development Department, JICA
- (2) Indonesian Security Policy: Takashi KOHNO, Associate Professor, National Graduate Institute for Policy Studies
- (3) Technical Cooperation Policy: Yasuyuki SATO, Assistant Director, Grant Aid and Technical Cooperation Division, Economic Cooperation Bureau, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
- (4) Police Policy: Hiroshi IKEDA, Assistant Director, International Affairs Division, Commissioner-General's Secretariat, National Policy Agency
- (5) Evaluation Planning: Hajime IWAMA, Social System & Peace Building Team, Group I, Social Development Department, JICA
- (6) Evaluation Analysis: Michiyuki KENMOTSU, International Project Department, Chuo Kaihatsu Corporation

Period of Evaluation:

12 (Thu) - 31 (Wed) January 2007

Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation

3. Verification of the Project Performance

3-1 Achievement Level

(1) Production of Outputs

Output 1: Management of BPRs, model police stations, is improved to ensure the civilian police activities.

Many performance indicators suggest that the Project has produced Output 1. BPRs have also succeeded in promoting their activities, attracting many visitors and inspectors, including the top echelons of INP.

Output 2: Practice on criminal identification in BPRs is improved.

Performance indicators for criminal identification have improved significantly. The activities of three class-1 qualified instructors in the fields of fingerprinting and photographing deserve special attention. They have played a central role in developing VCDs that serve as manuals for the equipment provided under the Grant Aid scheme. They have also taken every opportunity to provide guidance to new recruits.

Output 3: Communication control and command system of BPRs is improved.

POLRES Metro Bekasi set up a communication and command control room for the first time in the history of INP, even though on an experimental basis. Japanese experts and Indonesian counterparts worked together and drafted working rules, which are now being studied by INP

executives. POLRES Metro Bekasi undoubtedly made progress toward achieving Output 3. The continuation of practical training will make certain that this output will be achieved.

Output 4: Training programs of “police station management”, “criminal identification” and “communication and command control” are improved.

The Project has produced many manuals and trained instructors. It is safe to conclude that Output 4 has largely been achieved. Nevertheless, these programs have yet to be officially incorporated into the training system of INP.

Achievement on the Outputs as a whole

POLRES Metro Bekasi has made significant progress toward achieving the outputs, especially at its headquarters and BKPM (*Balai Kemitraan Polisi dan Masyarakat* or Police-Citizen Partnership Center) in the field. POLSEKs (police sectors) need to make more progress. POLRES Bekasi, a newly created entity as a result of the reorganization of Bekasi Police Resort, tends to lag behind POLRES Metro Bekasi.

(2) Achievement of the Project Purpose “Civilian police activities are implemented at Bekasi Police Resorts (BPRs) as a model police station.”

“Civilian policing” in the Project Purpose (of ensuring that that BPRs practice civilian policing as model police stations) refers to activities to meet the needs of citizens promptly and with integrity (see the note to the PDM). The degree of achievement of the Project Purpose is ultimately assessed based on how citizens evaluate the activities of Bekasi Police Resort as civilian police stations. Both opinion polls by an external consultant (ACNielsen) and interview surveys by this Evaluation Team in the BKPM areas show that an increasing number of citizens feel the police are better now. This finding points to a steady progress in terms of civilian policing. This does not mean, however, that a majority of the 3.7 million residents of Bekasi feel the benefit of the police reform. First, the findings of the polls are not so encouraging. The increase in the number of citizens who evaluated BPRs highly was limited to a minimum, and citizens’ evaluation was lower with regard to some question items. Second, the Evaluation Team interviewed citizens within the BKPM areas only.

BPRs have a system of accumulating and organizing information from citizens regarding criminal cases. However, they do not have such a system for information on events on which they do not intend to build a case against. They need to learn to develop rules as to what kind of information should be reported to which level within the police organization according to its importance.

The Project team has observed that newly-created POLRES Bekasi is lagging behind POLRES Metro Bekasi in many aspects. In fact, POLRES Bekasi has yet to produce some important outputs that will ensure the attainment of the Project Purpose. Although the Project is making strides in achieving the Project Purpose, continued efforts should be made to raise the awareness at police resorts and produce the desired outputs at POLRES Bekasi.

3-2 Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

This Project is designed to upgrade the capabilities and organizational capacity of Bekasi Police Resort near Jakarta to the levels appropriate for a civil police station and make it a model for other police stations across the country. It is the core Project under the “Program of support for Reform of Indonesian National Police”, which involves different schemes to support INP, which has been separated from TNI and become civilian police. The Project is in line with both the development policy of Indonesia and Japan’s aid policy toward Indonesia. This was explicitly shown in “Partners for New Challenges”, the Japan-Indonesia Joint Statement that was made by H.E. Mr. Junichiro Koizumi, Prime Minister of Japan at the time, and H.E. Dr. Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono, President of the Republic of Indonesia on June 2, 2005. It was reconfirmed in a meeting between H.E. Mr. Shinzo Abe, Prime Minister of Japan and H.E. Dr. Susilo Bambang Yudhoyono, President of the Republic of Indonesia on November 28, 2006. The Project is consistent with Japan’s Country Assistance Program for Indonesia which was announced in November 2004. The Project is also in line with the Resolution issued by the Chief of INP, “Policy and Strategy of the operation of POLMAS (Indonesian version of the community policing) in fulfilling the responsibility of INP” (Skep/737; October 13, 2005).

The New Police Law of 2002 called for citizen-oriented policing but many police officers did not understand what it was about. The Resolution described specific examples of civilian policing, which included many of the activities introduced by the Project. The Project has a strategy for turning BPRs into model stations for national police reform, with the areas covered by BPRs being the Project sites. To achieve this strategy, the Project has identified three areas, namely police station management, criminal identification, and communication and command control, and focused on on-the-job training (OJT) and awareness building in the field. The approach is highly relevant to reforming the cultural awareness of INP that the Indonesian side considers as the biggest challenge for the reform initiative, and to the Project’s overall goal of applying the Project outcomes nationwide.

In all, this Project is extremely relevant.

(2) Effectiveness

Both opinion polls by external consultant (ACNielsen) and interview surveys by this Evaluation Team in the BKPM areas show that an increasing number of citizens feel police are better now. This finding points to steady progress in terms of civilian policing. BKPM activities, which were not included in the original Project plan but later included in the Project, played a major role in enlightening police officers and changing the public views of the police. This contributed to the attainment of the Project Purpose. It is a successful example of flexibility in the Project implementation process. Nevertheless, some outputs have not been fully achieved. This Evaluation Team observes that civilian policing is being practiced but has not taken root in the Project sites yet. In this sense, although the Project was effective, there is still some room for improvement.

(3) Efficiency

The Project may not have been efficient at the beginning due to insufficient supply of equipment and human resources. A subsequent series of provision of equipment and human resources improved the efficiency of the Project. The efficiency was further enhanced by

flexible arrangements in the Project implementation process, including the introduction of integrated training that involved communication and command control, and criminal identification, and crime scene preservation. The Project inputs were generally put to appropriate and effective use for Project activities. Therefore, the Project is judged to have attained efficiency, for producing proportional outputs to the inputs.

(4) Impacts

<Effects on the likelihood of the Overall Goal being attained>

Given budgetary constraints, attaining the Overall Goal is not easy because it essentially requires time-consuming awareness-building of police officers and officials across the country. The top echelons of INP are intent on achieving the Overall Goal as soon as possible, as highlighted by their strong commitment to promoting civilian policing at the policy level. As long as they maintain this strong intention, the Overall Goal will be attained sooner or later. At the time of this evaluation, however, there was no detailed plan toward its achievement. It is too early to determine when and how the Overall Goal will be realized.

<Other positive impacts>

The Project has attracted attention of various local actors. The deputy chief of INP and other senior officials, many police officers from different POLDA (regional police), members of the Parliament, as well as local authorities and citizens of Bekasi, have visited the BPRs to learn about the Project. Such visits and inspections allowed the Project to win the understanding and support of the citizens. At the beginning of the Project, it was difficult even to secure land for BKPM. Halfway into the Project period, however, there were growing calls for more BKPM from local authorities and citizens who were ready to provide land for that purpose.

The Project is producing other potentially positive effects. It is too early, however, to assess them. There seems to be no negative effects.

In all, the Project is expected to have a positive impact.

(5) Sustainability

Police reform is a priority issue for Indonesia. The Indonesian government has developed a strategy to implement the policy for police reform in the form of a Resolution by the Chief of INP on the policy and strategy regarding the practice of the POLMAS model in performing the duties of INP (Skep/737X/2005). This Resolution illustrated some of the activities of the Project. INP says it considers POLMAS high on its agenda and gives priority to it in allocating financial and human resources. The Evaluation Team considers the Project quite sustainable, although it has reservations about the maintenance of equipment.

3-3 Contributing Factors

(1) Consistency with the national development policy of Indonesia

The Project is aimed at addressing the challenge of international cooperation in building the awareness of officers at front-line police stations, a field in which Japan and Indonesia have little experience in. The main factor for the successful prospect of the Project is that the Project accommodates the needs of Indonesia. Police reform is an important component of the democratization policy of Indonesia. The new police law of 2002 paved the way for the institutional transformation of INP from military police into civilian police. The policy and strategy for civilian policing were not developed until October 2005, when the Chief of INP issued a Resolution on the practical aspect of civilian policing (popularly known as the Resolution on POLMAS). This Resolution illustrated civilian policing of BPRs. It is clear that the top echelons of INP observed and even supported the Project as a good practice of civilian policing. Consistency with the national policy was an important factor for the success of the Project. The issuance of the Resolution on POLMAS, which was in line with the Project, allowed all police officers to understand the direction of the Project. This in turn enhanced the effectiveness of the Project.

(2) Awareness of being “watched”

The Project has been attracting attention from all quarters, with lawmakers and local people as well as the top echelons of INP visiting BPRs for inspection. Stakeholders at BPRs are well aware that they are in the spotlight. This motivates them to strive for the success of the Project.

(3) Project as part of a larger program

The Project is at the center of the Support Program for Reform of Indonesian National Police, which involves different schemes to support capacity-building of INP as civilian police.

An incidental set of different Projects in the same sector with coordination and synergy among them may not be described as a cooperation program of JICA. In this particular program, the program manager was assigned to INP Headquarters on a permanent basis. The coordinators of the Project also served as a secretariat to this program. A regular program meeting was held every week. All these factors were effective in orienting the individual components of the program toward the same program purpose.

Another contributing factor was that the program manager communicated the status and progress of the Project to the executives at INP Headquarters, his counterpart organization. INP Headquarters supervises BPRs, the Project counterparts.

(4) Focus on technology transfer suitable for Indonesia

The Project design was not aimed at imposing a Japanese system on Indonesia. It was the principle of the Project to introduce Japanese experiences as a hint to develop and practice the Indonesian style in collaboration with the Indonesian side. The Japanese side never failed to consult with INP Headquarters and Jakarta Metropolitan Police before implementing each measure.

The Project also placed a premium on OJT in technology transfer. Although basic techniques and Japanese experiences were introduced mainly through lectures and workshops at BPR Headquarters, the Japanese side worked with POLSEKs and BKPM to study which techniques should be used and how. This time-consuming process enhanced the capacity of

the counterparts significantly and contributed to the development of a model to be applied throughout Indonesia.

(5) Appropriate inputs and activities

Project inputs and activities were sometimes not so effective at the beginning, when the Project was being implemented in a rather learning-by-doing manner. Those in the latter half of the Project period were both appropriate and effective. Some of the highly effective inputs/activities are shown below:

- (i) The input of excellent human resources from both Japan and Indonesia
- (ii) The input of appropriate equipment and activities using it
- (iii) The introduction of a system of certifying criminal identification skills
- (iv) Integrated training that involved communication and command control, criminal identification, and crime scene preservation
- (v) Counterparts' development of manuals, which were made suitable to the Indonesian police system

3-4 Inhibiting Factors

(1) Delay in putting telecommunication equipment in place

The communication and command control portion of the Project was expected to use the telecommunication equipment provided under another scheme. However, delay in placing the equipment caused a rescheduling of the activity plan in this field.

(2) Personnel changes

Although personnel changes are inevitable for the police organization, it became an inhibiting factor of the Project. Frequent personnel changes at BPRs resulted in the waste of trained personnel. It is worth noting, however, that some police officials and officers trained at BPRs put their experiences to good use at their new place of assignment. This is a contributing factor in the context of applying the Project outcomes nationwide.

(3) Reorganization of Bekasi Police Resort

In the middle of the Project period, Bekasi Police Resort was reorganized into two entities: POLRES Metro Bekasi in charge of the urban area, and POLRES Bekasi, a newly created entity in charge of the other areas of Bekasi. This reorganization posed a challenge to the Project. Although it was decided to support reform at both police stations, the Project faced some problems. For example, transport between the two stations required substantial amount of time and physical resources. The number of the counterparts simply doubled. Flexible arrangements were needed to address these problems and continue to provide effective assistance to the two stations. POLRES Bekasi lagged behind POLRES Metro Bekasi in terms of performance.

3-5 Conclusions

Overall, this Project has achieved a high level of relevance. It raised the awareness of police officers at BPRs and placed civilian policing on track. In other words, the Project had made great strides toward the attainment of the Project Purpose. There is room for improvement, however, for two major aspects shown below. These two aspects should be addressed as much as possible in the remaining Project period. It is advisable to start studying what follow-ups are needed and identify them by the end of the Project period.

(i) The level of awareness among middle-ranking officials, such as the chiefs of POLSEKs, is generally lower than those among executives at BPR Headquarters, and the front-line police officers who interact with civilians at BKPM, where the Project concentrated its activities.

(ii) In the middle of the Project period, Bekasi Police Resort was reorganized into two entities: POLRES Metro Bekasi in charge of the urban area, and POLRES Bekasi, a newly created entity in charge of the other areas of Bekasi. POLRES Bekasi lagged behind POLRES Metro Bekasi in all the performance indicators.

3-6 Recommendations

(1) Activities designed to ensure the attainment of the Project Purpose

The Project brought a significant progress in civilian police activities at BPRs. In some aspects, however, the Project recorded insufficient levels of achievement. To ensure the attainment of the Project Purpose, the Project stakeholders need to address these aspects in the remainder of the Project period. Some of these aspects are as follows:

(i) It is necessary to provide training at 11 BKPM to be set up under the grant aid scheme by taking advantage of the experiences and techniques gained at the existing three BKPM. Special focus should be placed on BKPM that will be established for the first time in the area of POLRES Bekasi.

(ii) POLSEKs are generally lagging behind the headquarters and BKPM of BPRs in awareness-building. They need organizational capacity building with their chiefs playing a pivotal role.

(iii) In all fields, newly-created POLRES Bekasi is falling behind POLRES Metro Bekasi, where Project activities started in the beginning of the Project period. Capacity-building at POLRES Bekasi is necessary.

(iv) Technical progress in the field of criminal identification is remarkable. Nevertheless, the criminal investigation sections at POLSEKs (especially those of POLRES Bekasi) need awareness-building with regard to criminal investigation.

(v) Japan and Indonesia should strive to solve technical problems with the radio communication network in accordance with the Memorandum regarding the Ex-Post Situation Survey of Grant Aid Basic Design Study, signed on September 29, 2006 between the JICA follow-up survey mission and the deputy chief of the planning and development section of INP.

(vi) Training in communication and command control is inadequate. In addition to setting up a communication and command control room in POLRES Bekasi, it is also necessary to

provide more training at BPRs and develop rules for communication and command control through such training experience.

(2) Studying the direction of cooperation

The Project has made significant progress in civilian policing in Bekasi. It is advisable to start studying what the Indonesia side should do and how the Japanese side can support it, as well as to identify specific steps to attain the Overall Goal by the completion of the Project. The Evaluation Team recommends the following steps be taken:

- (i) Further efforts shall be made to develop model(s) of civilian police activities, suitable for diverse regional characteristics of Indonesia;
- (ii) Further study to develop model(s) suitable to Indonesia is required. More specifically, it is important to develop an effective, simpler and less expensive system; and
- (iii) Further examination of framework of education and training institutions to diffuse the experience of BPRs is required.

(3) Strengthening the framework for equipment maintenance and supply procurement

Strengthening the framework for equipment maintenance, including the establishment of an appropriate system for supply procurement, is important to uphold the Project outcomes and to build on them toward the attainment of the Overall Goal.

3-7 Lessons Learned

(1) Program-based assistance

The Project is at the center of the Support Program for Reform of Indonesian National Police, which involves different schemes to support capacity-building of INP as civilian police. The program manager was permanently assigned to INP Headquarters, which supervises BPRs, the counterpart organizations. The coordinators of the Project also served as the Secretariat to this program. A regular program meeting was held every week. All these factors were effective in improving coordination among the Project components and orienting them toward the same program purpose.

(2) Equipment-based technology transfer

An essential requirement for equipment-based technology transfer is to have the necessary equipment fully adjusted when it is needed, regardless of whether the equipment completion is done within or outside of the Project framework. When the equipment is provided under a different aid scheme, it may be difficult for the Project stakeholders to keep track of the equipment provision schedule. Nonetheless, it is necessary to take full account of the schedule in developing the activity plan for the Project.