

Terminal Evaluation

Asia

I. Outline of the Project

- Country : Philippines
- Project title : The Project on Philippine Coast Guard Human Resource Development
- Issue/Sector : Transport
- Cooperation scheme : Technical cooperation project
- Responsible division in JICA : Philippine Office
- Cooperation amount (in the evaluation period): 581,533 yen
- Cooperation period : From July 1, 2002 to June 30, 2007
- Implementing Agency: Philippine Coast Guard (PCG) Coast Guard Education and Training Command (CGETC)
- Related cooperation Agency in Japan : Japan Coast Guard (JCG)
- Related cooperation activities:
 - An individual expert for Administration of Coast Guard
 - Basic Design (B/D) for Grant Aid program "Enforcement of PCG Coast Guard Communication system"
 - Group training course in Japan "Maritime rescue & Disaster Response"
 - Area-focused training course in Japan "Maritime Law Enforcement"

1-1 Project background and summary

There are many maritime accidents every year in the coastal area surrounding the Philippines archipelago, resulting in the loss of precious human lives and property. The lack of any marine salvage system means that there are a great many deaths and missing persons. Further, environmental contamination caused by oil spills from large tankers as well as piracy and drug trading on the ocean are all too frequent, making it absolutely essential that the capacity of the Philippine Coast Guard (PCG) to address these issues be reinforced. However, the PCG, which had been one division of the Philippine Navy, was moved under the jurisdiction of the Department of Transportation and Communications in 1998 and made responsible for the prevention of marine wrecks and marine rescue, maritime disaster prevention and maritime crime policing. However, all of the employees started their careers in the military and lack the knowledge and skill to adequately fulfill their new duties. This prompted the Philippine government to request that Japan carry out a technical cooperation project to train urgently the personnel in PCG.

This project provides cooperation in training personnel and is led by a core group of five long-term experts (Chief Advisor, Maritime Law Enforcement, Aid to Navigation/Search and Rescue, Maritime Environmental Pollution/Oil Spilled Combating and Coordinator). The cooperation period lasts from July 2002 to June 2007, with the Project Consultation Team dispatched in June 2004 and the Mid-Term Evaluation Team sent the following year in July 2005.

1-2 Project Summary

(1) Overall goal

Performance capability of PCG is improved

(2) Project purpose

PCG personnel with knowledge and skills to perform their functions are developed.

(3) Outputs

- 1) Education and training management system of PCG is enhanced.
- 2) Training courses and seminars (SAR, ATON, MARPOL & OSC, MARLEN) of PCG, including other governmental and private organizations concerned are improved.
- 3) Basic training courses including OJT/unit training are enhanced.

(4) Inputs (cumulative amount as of the evaluation)

Japanese side:

Dispatch of long-term experts	Total of 9 persons (300 Man Months)
Dispatch of short-term experts	Total of 37 persons (Man Months)
Local Cost	27,355,000 Pesos
Provision of Equipment and Machineries	Approximately 7,876,000 Pesos (by the end of 2005)
C/P training in Japan	Total of 32 persons

Philippine side:

Allocation of Counterpart Personnel	Total 26persons
Local cost	27,355,000 Pesos (Including the salaries for the C/P)
Procurement of land and facility for the Project	

II. Overview of the Evaluation Team

Leader of the Japanese study team:

Hozumi Katsuta, Development Specialist, Social Development Department, Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)

Human resource development:

CDR. Atsushi Toyama, Deputy Director, International Criminal Investigation Division, Guard and Rescue Department, Japan Coast Guard

Evaluation and analysis:

Hiroshi Osada, Senior Consultant, Public Administration, IC-Net Limited

Evaluation planning:

Masatoyo Ishihara, Transportation Team-1, Social Development Department, Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA)

Duration of Evaluation Study:

from October 15, 2006 to October 28, 2006

Type of study:

Terminal evaluation

III. Overview of evaluation results

3-1 Review of results

The three indicators for the project purpose (1. train PCG personnel so that they have the requisite knowledge and skills, 2. personnel from other organizations participate in the training and 3. some personnel are trained to serve as trainers) laid out in the PDM 3.0, revised as of the mid-term evaluation, are expected to be achieved by the project's completion. This can primarily be attributed to the seminars and training in basic skills provided by the short-term experts. By the time the project ends, it is expected that several outputs involving strengthening the education and training system will have been started and completed, namely the start of a full-time trainer system and improvements in the system for evaluating and providing feedback on the trainer training course (related to Output 1), and improvements in the curriculum, syllabus and materials for education/training and basic training courses (related to Output 2).

Achievement of project purpose

In accordance with the numerical targets set as indicators for the project purpose, 2,054 PCG personnel will eventually attend seminars and receive training in basic skills (1,779 have already completed training) and 454 personnel from other

governmental and private organizations will participate in the seminars (398 have participated thus far). Furthermore, 74 qualified trainers are expected to be trained in this role (56 have been trained thus far). By the time the project is completed, improvements to the curriculum for the existing education/training and basic education courses as well as the seminar must be completed; once this is done, the project purpose will have been fully achieved. The need for this was confirmed at the workshop held for the terminal evaluation study, when the seminars and basic skill training sessions carried out up until this point was put in context with the curriculum for the existing education/training and basic education courses*¹.

Achievement of outputs

Preparations for establishing a full-time faculty system have been started, and the number of unit training days held on site has increased almost three times (related to Output 1). Contents and material for use in the education/training courses and basic education courses have been developed in activities centered on seminars and training subjects. Materials for informational activities have also been completed. The items listed below must be completed by the time the project ends to achieve the Outputs.

- 1) Completion of final draft for full-time faculty system and start of system; authorization from the PCG director is necessary for this system to take effect officially (related to Output 1).
- 2) Review of and improvements to the course evaluation and feedback systems (related to Output 1).
- 3) Integration of contents for seminars and basic skills training in the
- 4) Replace deliverables for informational activities with the PCG's own materials (related to Output 2).

3-2 Summary of evaluation results

(1) Relevance

Consistency with the Philippine government's policies

The Project was initially intended to promote the national maritime policies stipulated in the Philippine's Medium-Term Development Plan for 1994-2004. The subsequent medium-term plan for 2004-2010 is based on discussions held at recent international meetings addressing this issue and is intended to enhance maritime safety and security. As such, the project purpose and the overall goal were consistent with the Philippine's policies and discussions at international maritime conferences, and can be seen as a policy protecting the national interest of the Philippine's and its neighbors as well as a tool for implementing international protocol.

Consistency with Japan's aid policy

The project is fully consistent within the framework of Japan's aid policy for the Philippines. The Japanese government established five priority areas*² and aid policies by issue, including "reinforcing economic structure for sustainable structure and overcoming factors inhibiting growth," in its Country-Specific Aid Plan*³ (Philippines) in August 2002. Based on this, JICA established a country-specific plan for the Philippines and decided that "maritime transportation safety programs" would be one of the steps in achieving these priorities. This project was designated as one of these programs*⁴.

Contribution to maintenance of regional order

The "Regional Cooperation Agreement on Combating Piracy and Armed Robbery Against Ships in Asia" (RECAAP) is an international agreement intended to counteract maritime piracy. The Japanese government proposed this agreement, and 16 nations—ASEAN, Japan, South Korea, China, India, Sri Lanka and Bangladesh—adopted it in Tokyo in November 2004. PCG is responsible for enforcing the international maritime laws in the Philippines. The Japanese government's efforts to build up PCG's capacity through this project are therefore extremely significant in terms of RECAAP's enforcement.

Commitment by Philippine government

PCG assigned two officers to serve as counterparts for every five long-term experts sent by JICA, and continued to pay for project costs exceeding the R/D commitment*⁵. The Philippines also provided the facilities and land needed for other activities, and there were no major obstacles impeding implementation that stemmed from the Philippine's input or lack thereof. Although there were chronic budget and material shortages, the Philippine government should be commended its commitment, as demonstrated by its continued fulfillment of the conditions for project implementation.

(2) Effectiveness

Special notes on achievement of project purpose*⁶

This project is expected to achieve its initial objectives regarding personnel training and strengthening organizational capacity. Nevertheless, we cannot yet conclude that PCG employees have the ability to adequately perform their roles as international

maritime security personnel. Furthermore, the rapid changes and developments in maritime security conditions mean that the demands made upon them and the level at which they must perform continues, particularly in the area of maritime law enforcement (MARLEN). As a result, it is essential that PCG continuously strengthens its educational training and adjust its content to reflect the changing environment in the field.

(3) Efficiency

Modifications to level of output achievement

When the project started, the aim was to bring PCG personnel's skills up to a level at which they would perform as specialists in marine security, with all the specialized knowledge and skills that entails. However, as the project got underway, we had to acknowledge that PCG personnel lacked the basic knowledge and skills required of the coastguard personnel, and had to improve their onboard skills and handling skills of rubber inflatable boats, as well as their arresting techniques. Accordingly, this was reflected in Output 3 of the PDM 3 revised after the mid-term evaluation. This resulted in a revision to Indicator 1 of the project purpose from "as specialists" to "take appropriate actions."

Support from related organizations^{*7}

The Japan Coast Guard provided cooperation in all areas, including the dispatch of short-term experts and holding seminars, throughout the project implementation period. This support was indispensable in terms of obtaining suitable techniques and personnel.

(4) Impact

Appearance of impacts contributing to achievement of overall goal

The indicators for the overall goal listed below have improved considerably at this point compared to the levels when the project started in 2002. With the achievement of the project purpose, the PCG personnel have been trained to take appropriate action in each of the specialized areas, and as a result indicators have improved in each area of the PCG's mission. In particular, we can surmise that PCG personnel's positive attitude toward job performance, cultivated in the project, has had a major role in increasing the volume of their activity.

(1) The proportion of search and rescue (SAR) missions to which the PCG was sent has been rising since 2005, although there are annual fluctuations depending on the scope of the accident and need for missions.

(2) The number of marine pollution (MARPOL) missions, including preventive measures, has risen significantly since 2002.

(3) The number of MARLEN missions has increased from 207 in 2001 before the project started to an average of 353 a year since 2002. The number of apprehended persons per mission has continued to increase, from 0.74 in 2002 to 1.93 in 2005. This is likely because of improvements in the PCG's ability to respond to large-scale crimes and their ability to take control in such situations^{*8}.

(4) The annual patrol hours for each patrol vessel have continued to increase from 96 hours in 2002 to 231 hours in 2005 and 282 hours as of September 2006.

While the following impacts are not directly related to the indicators for the overall goal, they can be considered as secondary information for impact evaluation.

(5) The number of oil spill combating (OSC) missions fluctuates considerably depending on the severity of the accidents at any given year, so it is difficult to assess the extent to which the PCG's capacity has improved based solely on numerical fluctuations. However, in the June 2006 tanker oil spill of Guimaras Island, the PCG's oil clean-up team utilized the technology transferred to it during the project and helped to clean up the oil spill on site as expected.

(6) The rate of dead and missing among the casualties of these marine accidents has been decreasing since 2003, falling sharply from 16% to 4%.

Other impact

(1) Many Asian countries as well as the US and Australia have pointed to the project's success in enhancing the PCG's capability as a maritime law enforcement organization as a model case^{*9}.

(2) The project invited some foreign coastguard officers from overseas for the 2nd - 4th MARLEN seminars, which was a very good opportunity for developing good relationships, sharing information and building mutual understanding among all participants. Some participants still stay in touch, demonstrating the success of these seminars in helping to build good international relationships for maritime law enforcement.

(3) Conducting large-scale exercises^{*10} develops comprehensive organizational capacity, including not only skills, but the ability to plan, manage and coordinate operations.

(4) There have been cases in which the PCG has pro-actively investigated crimes that have led to apprehensions, rather than merely responding passively with apprehensions after an incident has occurred^{*11}.

(5) Sustainability

Political, organizational and institutional sustainability

The PCG was established in 1967 under the Coast Guard Law and was transferred from under the jurisdiction of the Philippine Navy to the Department of Transportation and Communication in 1998. Today PCG has become a national organization made up of 10 districts, 52 stations and 182 detachments nationwide, with over 3,900 personnel. PCG is on its way to becoming a civilian organization as democracy becomes further entrenched in the Philippines. Also, the Philippine's Medium-Term Development Plan for 2004-2010 is based on recent discussions held at international meetings addressing this issue and is intended to enhance maritime safety and security. As such, the PCG's role is expected to remain a point of emphasis in policy as maritime transport and crime become increasingly international and global in scale. Accordingly, the PCG's political, organizational and institutional sustainability is high in its role as the foundation ensuring that the project's effect will be sustained.

Technical sustainability

The seminars have already succeeded in improving the knowledge and skills of PCG personnel, and the initial goal of training personnel looks certain to be achieved. On the other hand, ensuring that this training of good personnel is sustained requires improvements to the teaching training system, such as a full-time faculty system, unit training and a monitoring system (related to Output 1), as well as improvements to content such as education/training and basic education courses, seminars for external organizations and informational activities. If all of the PDM output, including the aforementioned, can be achieved by the time the project ends, we can expect a certain level of technical sustainability.

Sustainability of personnel

The total number of personnel has been stable at approximately 4,000 personnel since 2002. However, the plan aimed for a staff of 9,000 personnel from 2005, and the PCG is expected to work to boost personnel numbers in accordance with the government's situation.

Financial sustainability

The PCG's budget expenditures have continued to exceed the official R/D^{*12} amount during the project implementation period. On the other hand, CGETC's budget and PCG's overall budget for education and training have been on the decline since 2002. Money is expected to be needed for personnel training as listed below, and budget allocation for education and training will have to be augmented.

(1) Increase in education and training budget in line with strengthening of personnel training

(2) Budget^{*13} for maintenance and management of training pool and oil and heavy metal analytical laboratory provided by project budget

3-3 Factors that promoted realization of effects

(1) Effectiveness of project-type cooperation in developing human resources for maritime safety and security field

Adopting JICA's technical cooperation scheme to develop human resources in the maritime safety field turned out to be extremely effective in two respects, outlined below.

(1)The technical areas covered by this field are extremely broad and cannot be covered by a small-scale cooperation scheme.

(2)Equipment and infrastructure can be appropriately combined with technology transfer in this scheme.

(2) Importance of basic organizational capacity of counterpart organization

One of the reasons behind the success of this project's technology transfer was that the PCG possessed the following organizational strengths even before the project started.

(1) Well-organized recruiting system

(2) Clear promotion system

(3) Well-functioning decision-making process

(4) Consistent discipline in organization

(5) Although underneath the jurisdiction of the Department of Transportation and Communication, it can often make decisions as an independent organization.

3-4 Conclusion

Almost all of the indicators for the project purpose are expected to be achieved by the time the project ends, and as a result the knowledge and skills of PCG's maritime security officers will be strengthened, ensuring that they take more appropriate action than is currently the norm in marine salvage, navigation safety, conservation of the marine environment and oil spill protection, and law enforcement. Some of the education/training and basic education courses are expected to be augmented with the integration of the deliverables developed for each field in seminars and training with the curriculum and syllabus. We have confirmed that this integration as well as the review and improvements to the evaluation and feedback system will be completed by the time the project ends. The full-time faculty system, which is intended to ensure that high-quality instructors continue to be trained under a standardized training system, will be institutionalized and launched by the time the project ends.

3-5 Recommendations

Short-term recommendations

The remaining tasks listed below must be completed during the project period to ensure the sustainability of the project's effect. In particular, the full-time faculty system should be improved based on the understanding arrived at in discussions at the PCM workshop held during the terminal evaluation.

(1) Improvements to the curriculum and syllabus for SAR, ATON (Aids to Navigation), MARPOL & OSC and MARLEN as well as the evaluation and feedback systems.

(2) Start of full-time faculty system.

(3) Further expansion in number of opportunities for education and training at local districts and stations.

Medium and long-term recommendations

(1) Content of education/training for MARLEN must be updated. This content must be regularly revised to ensure that it is up to date because the requisite skills for this field change rapidly as international maritime crimes intensify.

(2) The basic skills and knowledge of maritime security officers should be enhanced. Onboard training and inflatable rubber boat training were included in the courses intended to strengthen basic knowledge and skills, but the training must continue to be reinforced as the PCG personnel's technical capacities are still not high enough to enable them to adequately address actual situations.

(3) A budget sufficient to cover future costs for upgrading training courses and maintaining equipment should be secured.

(4) Joint training with neighboring countries in the surrounding ocean area should be held so that maritime safety and security become issues without borders.

3-6 Lessons learned

(1) Effectiveness of administrative assistance mission to resolve problems impeding the project

The project's implementation plan was coordinated in line with progress in identifying the current progress of counterpart organizations. This indicated inconsistencies between the PDM and the project document on the one hand and the actual status on the other. It is advisable to dispatch project consultation team as necessary in order to review the actual situation which was not observed at planning stage and to discuss project activities.

(2) Methods for effectively spreading knowledge and skills acquired in seminars and training

The allocation of personnel who participated in the project's seminars and training is extremely important in terms of subsequently spread this knowledge and skills throughout the organization. Accordingly, these participants should be allocated with priority to the posts that would be most appropriate in this respect.

(3) Effective learning sequence

Knowledge and skills in risky operations such as piloting on the ocean are best obtained through a specific sequence of learning methods: a) lectures, b) simulation, c) actual practice and d) on-the-job training.

1 This contextualization at the workshop was based on the assumption of existing education/training and basic education courses that can use the contents developed and used in the seminars and training (either educational materials, syllabuses, curriculum, lectures content, practical training content or pedagogy). Accordingly, keeping these results in mind, the project team must once again thoroughly consider the kinds of content and methods that can improve the content of existing courses.

2 (a) "Reinforcing economic structure for sustainable structure and overcoming factors inhibiting growth," (b) redressing disparities, (c) protecting the environment and preventing disasters and (d) training personnel and forming training system.

3 This plan is currently being revised.

4 This is from the fiscal 2004 JICA Country-Specific Project Implementation Plan (August 2004).

5 Refer to (2) Philippine's Input in 2-1 Input Achievements, Chapter 2.

6 This is according to comments made by the team member in charge of personnel training at the time of this termination evaluation.

7 This section is from a report by a long-term expert.

8 This is according to a comment made by the team member in charge of personnel training at the time of this termination evaluation (assistant director of the International Crime Division, Guard and Rescue Department, PCG)

9 For example, Indonesia and Malaysia are currently petitioning Japan to begin this kind of project with their maritime law enforcement agencies, while the US and Australia acknowledged the importance and effectiveness of this project at the "Japan/U.S./Australian Anti-Terrorism Meeting" held in Tokyo in October 2005.

10 These exercises include anti-piracy training for mass communication, anti-terrorism training for the general public and joint anti-piracy exercises with the Japan Coast Guard.

11 Examples include (1) the apprehension of a terrorist group in Manila Bay on July 13, 2006 and (2) the seizure of explosive material in Zamboanga, Mindanao Island, on September 18, 2006.

12 Record of Discussion: record of discussions held between both countries before the project started.

13 This includes the cost of replacing consumables for analytical equipment and the cost of buying reagents for analytical use.