

Summary of the evaluation study result

1. Outline of the project	
Country: Kingdom of Thailand	Name of the project: Asia Pacific Development Center on Disability (APCD)
Sector: Assistance for Persons with Disabilities in Social Security	Form of assistance: Technical cooperation project
Office in charge: Social Security Division, Higher Education and Social Security Group, Human Development Department	Amount (at the time of evaluation): ¥600,000,000 (Technical cooperation project) ¥491,000,000 (Grant aid)
Duration	(R/D): Aug. 1, 2002 ~ Jul. 31, 2007
	(Extension):
	(F/U):
	(E/N): (Grant aid – Jun. 5, 2003)
	Executing agency in Thailand: Ministry for Social Development and Human Security
	Cooperation agency in Japan: NGOs in the field of disability, Ministry of Health, Labour and Welfare
	Other cooperation agencies:
1-1 Background and overview of cooperation	
<p>It is reported that there are approximately 400 million persons with disabilities (which is one out of 10 persons) in the Asia-Pacific region. However, it is estimated that the majority of them live under circumstances in which opportunities for social participation such as education and employment are not available, but also necessary services are not delivered.</p> <p>In order to remedy such situation, the United Nations adopted “the Decade of Disabled Persons (1983~1992)” and later, in 1992 the governments of the Asian and Pacific nations declared “the Asian and Pacific Decade of Disabled Persons (1993-2002)” in which the Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP) adopted the Agenda for Action that addressed twelve issues. Japan as one of the states proposed this adoption is requested to fulfill the leading role in international cooperation in the field of assistance for the persons with disability. As a part of its efforts, JICA conducted the project formulation study on welfare for persons with disabilities in Thailand and Indonesia in fiscal 1998.</p> <p>Based on the background, the government of Thailand requested the government of Japan in October 2000 to implement a technical cooperation project with the aim of promoting the “realization of social participation and equalization” of persons with disabilities living in the Asia-Pacific region through empowerment of them. In response to the request, Japan started a five-year project on August 1, 2002.</p>	

1-2 Content of cooperation

(1) Overall goal

Empowerment of persons with disabilities and a barrier-free society will be strongly promoted in developing countries in the Asia-Pacific region.

(2) Objective

The Asia-Pacific Development Center on Disability (APCD) will be established to promote empowerment of persons with disabilities and a barrier-free society in developing countries in the Asia-Pacific region.

(3) Outputs

- 1) Networking and collaboration among focal points / associate organizations will be facilitated by APCD.
- 2) Accessible information support will be provided by APCD for focal points / associate organizations, relevant organizations and people concerning disability issues.
- 3) Disability-related human resources development for focal points / associate organizations will be promoted by APCD.
- 4) Operation and management system of APCD will be developed.

(4) Inputs (at the time of evaluation)

Japanese side

Dispatch of long-term experts: 4 persons in total

Dispatch of short-term experts: 35 persons in total

Acceptance of technical training participants: 24 persons in total

Provision of equipment: 4,940,000 baht in total

Local costs: 79,000,000 baht

Thai side

Assignment of counterpart personnel:

21 persons in total (as of the end of the evaluation study)

Local costs: 26,000,000 baht

Land and facilities

2. Outline of the evaluation study team			
Team member	Field in Charge	Name	Position/organization
	Leader	Mr. Takao TODA	Group Director, Group II (Technical and Higher Education, Social Security) Human Development Department, JICA
	Networking and Operation of APCD	Mr. Ryosuke MATSUI	Professor, Faculty of Social Policy and Administration, Hosei University
	Information support	Mr. Hiroshi KAWAMURA	Director, Department of Social Rehabilitation, Research Institute, National Rehabilitation Center for Persons with Disabilities
	Human resource development	Ms. Yukiko NAKANISHI	President, Asia Disability Institute
	Cooperation planning	Ms. Mariko KINOSHITA	Social Security Team, Group II (Technical and Higher Education, Social Security), Human Development Department, JICA
	Evaluation and analysis	Mr. Isao DOJUN	International Project Department, Chuo Kaihatsu Corporation
		Ms. Chie YOSHIMURA	Personal Assistant for Ms. Yukiko Nakanishi
	Period of study: Sept. 5 - Oct. 5, 2006		Evaluation type: Terminal Evaluation
3. Overview of the evaluation result			
3-1 Verification of achievements			
(1) Inputs			
Both the Japanese side and the Thai side provided the inputs as planned.			
(2) Achievement of the outputs			
1) Networking and collaboration among focal points / associate organizations will be facilitated by APCD: The target has been almost achieved.			
In order to promote networking and collaboration among focal points and associate organizations, the APCD missions have been dispatched to the countries in Asia-Pacific region. As a result of these missions, 37 focal points in 32 countries and 140 associate organizations in 26 countries signed the Minutes of Memorandum.			
Thirty-three workshops and domestic/international seminars have been held so far as collaborative activity in the field of human resource development,.			
2) Accessible information support will be provided by APCD for focal points / associate			

organizations, relevant organizations and people concerning disability issues: The target has been almost achieved.

Seventy-one websites of the focal points and associate organizations have been already linked to the APCD's website (as of August 2006), out of which 41 websites provide accessible information. 43 organizations in 17 countries provided information on the disability related information of their respective countries to APCD.

A quarterly newsletter has been issued as planned. As for Newsletter Vol. 16, these were distributed to 775 organizations in 48 countries.

APCD prepares and updates three types of database ([1] List of focal points, associate organizations and other related organizations, [2] List of materials available in the resource room of APCD, [3] Country Profile on Disability).

- 3) Disability-related human resources development for focal points / associate organizations will be promoted by APCD: The target has been almost achieved.

488 participants have been trained in the training courses held 23 times by August 2006. It is expected that the project's initial target (approximately 640 participants in five years) would be achieved. In particular, the facts that more than half of the participants are persons with disabilities and that about 40% of them are women, show that APCD considered the selection of participants. The participant satisfaction survey conducted by APCD reveals that over 85% of the participants are satisfied with the content, method, materials and lecturers/resource persons of the training.

As the follow-up of the training, APCD dispatched missions to several countries for monitoring the ex-participants. While 98% of the 297 ex-participants answered that they shared the knowledge and skills that they had learned in their respective countries, 68.7% of them had begun their activities by using newly acquired knowledge and skills. It is also reported that 134 ex-participants have the capacity to become resource persons, and 26 persons out of them have sufficient knowledge, skills and experiences to act as international resource persons.

- 4) Operation and management system of APCD will be developed: It is not clear whether or not the target will be achieved by the end of the project.

Currently the procedures for establishing APCD as an independent administrative corporation have been in progress. However, the outlook for the possibility of achieving the target is vague, considering various reasons including the political situation in Thailand. Hence, it still remains unclear if the project will be able to achieve the following indicators; "APCD Roadmap," "APCD management strategy for and after the year 2007," "participation of an appropriate number of persons with disabilities in the APCD Executive Board," and "Fund planning, logistics planning, and personnel

planning.”

(3) Prospect for achieving the project objective

The terminal evaluation study team confirmed that APCD had a satisfying level of capacity for its operation/management as a regional center to promote the empowerment of persons with disability and a barrier-free society. In order to continue its system, it is necessary to establish APCD as an independent administrative corporation. However, it is not clear whether or not the establishment can be completed by the end of the project. Except for this point, the project objective will be achieved in general.

3-2 Overview of the evaluation result

(1) Relevance: High

The project’s overall goal and objective are consistent with the goals of “the second Asian and Pacific Decade of Disabled Persons (2003-2012)”, that is, “achieving full participation and equality of persons with disabilities in the region” declared by UN ESCAP.

The long-term development vision of Thai government focuses on the alleviation of poverty and upgrading of the quality of life for Thai people and equal access to social services and social security for persons with disabilities is emphasized. On the other hand, the government of Japan has a policy that Japan will actively promote South-to-South cooperation in partnership with more advanced developing countries in Asian, strengthening regional cooperation frameworks, and support region-wide cooperation that encompasses several countries. Also government of Japan emphasizes cooperation in “human security” in order to reduce the vulnerabilities faced by people, communities and countries. Therefore, this project is conformity with the policy of the Thai government and ODA policy of Japan.

The JICA’s country-specific project implementation plan for Thailand lists “human security” and “promotion of region-wide cooperation” as priority aid sectors based on the above-stated policy of the government of Japan. Thus, this project is in accordance with both policies.

As for the project approach, three components, *i.e.*, networking and collaboration, information support and human resource development, were appropriate to achieve the project overall goal and purpose.

(2) Effectiveness: High but partly uncertain

Based on the remark in the mid-term review report claiming that the project purpose “the establishment of APCD” needed to be clarified, the Project Design Matrix (PDM) was revised in July 2006 to make its indicators more clearly. The evaluation team concluded that the project’s objective has been almost achieved according to the modified indicators.

The output 1, 2 and 3 (networking, information support, and human resource

development) contributed towards achieving the project purpose. In other words, these outputs contributed to improvement of APCD's physical environment and operation, and the APCD could show its presence as a regional center for Persons with Disabilities. Moreover, APCD had been highly evaluated by the governments of the surrounding countries, NGOs, and related international organizations. However, Output 4 (management improvement) has not been achieved and the operation/maintenance plan for the future still remains uncertain. In particular, in considering the plan for organizational reforms, there is concern over the possibility that what has been done so far may not be carried out after the organizational reforms. It is necessary to watch carefully the procedure of the organizational reforms.

(3) Efficiency: Satisfactory level

The inputs from Japanese side were provided appropriately in general in terms of quantity, quality and timing, and used effectively for the project's activities.

The counterparts' frequent changes in personnel assignment negatively affected the effective management of the project. Except for this irregularity, the inputs were provided appropriately in general.

One of the factors that facilitated the efficiency is; 1) Participation of not only officials and staff of APCD in the project activities, but also persons with disabilities as task force member as well as lecturers of the training course, and 2) Various regular meetings have been functioned appropriately.

However, this was a project implemented with a new idea of directly targeting persons with disabilities, and it was difficult for the evaluation team to compare the project cost with that of other projects.

(4) Impact: Many impacts of the project have been observed.

1) The expectation of achievement of project's overall goal, "Empowerment of persons with disabilities and a barrier-free society will be strongly promoted in developing countries in the Asia-Pacific region."

In case when the APCD continued the same quality of activities, it will be possible to achieve the overall goal by 2012 considering the fact that many impacts observed as discussed in below 2). However, it is difficult to pass judgment on the outlook for the possibility that the activities at APCD will be maintained at a similar level as the present under the situation in which it is not clear whether output 4 can be attained or not.

2) Other impacts

Thailand and its surrounding countries have been in the process of stipulating laws and formulating programs on the empowerment of persons with disabilities and the creation of a barrier-free society. Moreover, APCD's associate organizations and/or ex-participants have been taking actions related to the disability issue.

(5) Sustainability: When APCD is founded as an independent administrative corporation, it is assumed that its personnel will be reshuffled, thereby making it difficult to keep its organizational sustainability. In addition, it cannot be stated that sufficient sustainability has been secured in terms of policy, finance, and skills.

1) Policy

Commitment of collaboration with APCD by the governments in the Asia-Pacific region is important. And also continuation of political support to APCD by the Thai government is important not only for becoming a public organization by also after becoming a public organization.

2) Organization

At present, APCD has the capacity to operate and manage the activities considering being decision-making organization and having an appropriate number of staff. However, APCD's position as an organization has not been cleared yet, and it is not assured that the present human and financial systems will be maintained in the future. As a result, its organizational sustainability involves many uncertain factors. Hence, a satisfactory level has not been achieved. Towards the establishment of an independent administrative corporation (including the recruitment of new staff with appropriate qualification and training of the new staff), it is important to continue the commitment by the government of Thailand, and necessary to watch carefully the relation between APCD and the government of Thailand.

On the other hand, the governments concerned in the Asia-Pacific region have high expectations for the activities of APCD and they have confidence in APCD. From this point of view, organizational sustainability of APCD is high.

3) Finance

The Thai side has allotted their budget as planned. In order to continue same quality of activities effective utilization of various resources should be considered.

4) Technique/Skills

Officials and staff of APCD, and also resource persons have the necessary capability to conduct the APCD's activities in general. After APCD become a public organization, change of officials/staff may occur and recruitment of new qualified staff may be scrutinized carefully in order to assure the technical sustainability. In this regard, it is expected to be needed to conduct a necessary training in order to secure sustainability.

Above mentioned problem has been recognized during the period of this project and the project have been taking measures to transfer skills to the staff members who will supposedly remain at APCD regardless of becoming a public organization, instead of

public officials. Thus, even if public officials leave APCD at the time of organizational change, it will be possible to keep its activities at a certain level. APCD executive board member's engagement in APCD (in particular, members with disabilities), which is assumed to be high even after the organizational change, will contribute to its sustainability. It is highly likely that the resource persons who have participated in training activities will continue their activities for developing human resources.

3-3 Contributing factors in the achievement of outputs

(1) Project planning

A holistic approach consisting of three components ([1] networking, [2] information support, [3] human resource development) was appropriate to achieve the project overall goal and purpose, and a synergistic effect among the three components was high as well.

(2) Project implementation process

The recognition that "it is important to involve persons with disability as main actors in APCD activities and the networks by APCD and APCD plays the role as a facilitator to promote it" was shared among the persons related to this project contributed to the achievement of its outputs.

3-4 Problem and its factor

(1) Project planning

None in particular.

(2) Project implementation process

Before the project was started, it has been recognized that APCD to a public organization is big issue. At present, although the procedures are underway towards this objective, the time of completion is unclear due to the political situation in Thailand. As a result, there remain uncertainties as to its sustainability in terms of personnel, finance, and operation/management.

3-5 Conclusions

The overall result of the project are outstanding from the viewpoint of empowering persons with disabilities and promoting a barrier-free society.

It is commonly recognized that the networks created and strengthened through the activities of the project are so useful and widely recognized by 32 countries in the Asia-Pacific region as well as Japan and Thailand. Various actors, such as organizations of persons with disabilities, local communities, governments in the region, and some related international organizations, express their interest in further collaborative with APCD.

In addition to the above, the expectations of many impacts in Thailand such as promotion of a barrier-free environment, improving ICT accessibility, and establishing / strengthening independent living centers. The synergetic effects on both the region and Thailand have resulted in further enhancing the reputation of APCD.

As discussed above, the project generated effects as had been expected. However, there still remain a few important issues as to the sustainability of APCD and the networks developed by APCD. First, it is as to the formulation of a roadmap and a management strategy for and after 2007 from the viewpoint of developing APCD into an international organization via the process of being public organization. Second, it is the establishment of an international advisory mechanism. To that end, it is desirable that assistance be provided in the way in which the networks will be continuously sustained after the end of this project.

3-6 Recommendations (Specific measures, suggestions and/or advice as to this project)

3-6-1 What should be done during the remaining period of this project

It is confirmed that all the activities specified in PDM should continue to be implemented. Above all, it is particularly important to establish the status of APCD as a public organization under the concerned Thai legislation by the time the project terminates.

3-6-2 Issues as to the future of APCD

- (1) The holistic approach which consists of the three components: a) networking & collaboration, b) information support, and c) human resource development, and in which persons with disabilities play a central role should be continually pursued. In particular, it is of great importance to monitor and follow up on activities of the ex-participants.
- (2) In order that networks, which have already been established and strengthened by APCD, can be further developed, it is expected that APCD should continue to promote a mutually beneficial mechanism, and provide facilities for various activities including information / knowledge / experience sharing. While enlarging and strengthening the networks, the establishment of sub-regional focal points and/or the partnership with existing sub-regional institutions such as, ASEAN, the South Pacific Forum of Governments of the Pacific Island Countries, and the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC).
- (3) From the viewpoint of sustainability of APCD and its networks, it is of critical importance to formulate and implement a roadmap to convert APCD to an international organization, in particular for this project, via a public organization. In the process the proactive participation of persons with disabilities, as well as governments in the region in addition to those from Japan and Thailand should also be encouraged. Also it is important that those people who have actively participated in the project will continually keep their commitment.

- (4) In addition to responding to the common needs of persons with disabilities, due consideration should also be given / taken to meet the specific needs vis-a-vis respective disabilities. In particular, APCD should take some actions to meet the needs of persons with intellectual disabilities and hearing impairment, who have been limited to participate in the activities during the implementation of the project.
- (5) It is necessary to study the possibility of including family member, advocates and other significant actors to persons with disabilities, noting their respective particularities, which might result in supporting communities in a more comprehensive and effective way.

3-7 Lessons to be learned (Lessons learned from this project which may be useful for the identification, formulation, implementation and management of other similar projects)

- (1) Empowerment of persons with disabilities by persons with disabilities: Role model Approach
The key success factor to promote empowerment of persons with disabilities and a barrier-free society is “the empowered persons with disabilities empowering the other persons with disabilities” by a role model approach. This approach enables the ex-participants to utilize its approach in their communities and be a role model of empowerment.
- (2) Promotion of accessible physical environment, transportation and, information & communication
APCD provides persons with disabilities with accessible facilities as well as accessible information to promote empowerment of persons with disabilities and a barrier-free society. Ensuring accessible built environments and information are prerequisites to achieve the project purpose.
- (3) Participatory Management and Operation
The participation of persons with disabilities in the management and operation led to the significant impacts of the Project since the needs of persons with disabilities for empowerment and a barrier-free society were well-identified by the persons with disabilities. It also promoted an increase in public awareness of disabilities which leads to an inclusive and accessible society for the empowerment of persons with disabilities.
- (4) APCD’s roles as a facilitator and a catalyst
In developing countries in general, there is limited contact between the governments and organizations of persons with disabilities, which is one constraint in promoting the empowerment of persons with disabilities and a barrier-free society. APCD as a regional cooperative entity endorsed by the regional initiative for the implementation of the BMF, played the role of facilitator or catalyst by making contacts between governments and organizations of persons with disabilities which increased the awareness of disabilities

(5) Pre-assessment of APCD Collaborators

In order to implement effective activities to realize the empowerment of persons with disabilities, essential to assess the needs and commitment of groups/organizations of persons with disabilities and other supporting organizations who would like to collaborate with APCD. However, document information is often not enough to properly assess group/organizations at the grass-roots level since their capacity and priority for documentation might not be high due to a lack of educational opportunities, etc. To have live information and up-date it, the project made efforts to visit these groups/organizations and meet people, some of whom can be candidates as training participants and practice the model of empowerment in their communities. In addition, the project visited and regularly communicates with its Government Focal Points so that they can fully understand the APCD's unique vision and collaborate with APCD and its Associate Organizations in their countries. The process of such pre-assessment of APCD's potential collaborators and their follow-up has enabled the project to achieve the outcomes expected.

3-8 Others

In the event that both the Government of Japan and Government of Thailand study the possibility of further cooperation regarding issues related to disabilities based on the current achievement of APCD, both sides should take into account the following additional points:

- (1) There have been increasing expectations of APCD and its networks on the part of various actors such as organizations of persons with disabilities, local communities, governments in the region, and some related international organizations.
- (2) In the years 2007 and 2012, the mid-term evaluation and final recapitulation of the Biwako Millennium Framework are expected respectively, to which APCD is closely related.
- (3) Since the UN Ad-hoc Committee approved the draft text of a Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in August 2006, there has been increasing interest in and an awareness of a rights-based approach to issues related to disability in the international community.
- (4) In the year 2007, both Japan and Thailand will celebrate their 120th anniversary of a diplomatic relationship between the two countries.