

パンジャブ州地方行政能力向上プロジェクト終了時評価調査結果要約表（英文）

<b>I. Outline of the Project</b>	
Country: Pakistan	Project title: Improvement of Public Administration for Local Governments in Punjab
Issue/Sector: Governance – Local Governance	Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation
Division in charge: JICA Pakistan Office	Total cost: 220 million Yen (at the time of evaluation)
Period of Cooperation	(R/D): August 2004 to August 2006 (Extension): August 2006 to February 2007
	Partner Country's Implementing Organization: Local Government and Rural Development Department, Government of Punjab Government of Hafizabad District
	Supporting Organization in Japan:
Related Cooperation:	
<p><b>1. Background of the Project</b></p> <p>In Pakistan, new local government system was introduced in August 2001 (Local Government Ordinance 2001). There has been confusion due to unclearly defined functions of local governments and lacking human resources and their capacity at the local government level. Citizen Community Board (CCB) system was introduced under LGO2001 with an aim to promote citizen participation in local governance, however, it has hardly been functioned appropriately.</p> <p>Based on the situation above, JICA Technical Cooperation Project 'Improvement of Public Administration for Local Governments in Punjab' was requested by the government of Punjab. The first and second ex-ante evaluation teams were dispatched from April to May, and from October to November 2003 respectively, and the Project started in August 2004. With 6 months extension, the project is going to last until February 2007. The project aims to achieve transparent and efficient management of CCB through management improvement and capacity development of government officials with regards to CCB.</p> <p><b>2. Project Overview</b></p> <p>(1) Overall Goal</p> <p>The model of basic project cycle management on Citizen Community Board (CCB) Program is developed by improvements to components of CCB Improvement Activities in the model district.</p> <p>(2) Project Purpose</p> <p>Citizen Community Board (CCB) Program becomes more effective and efficient by improvement of performance in local governments in the model district.</p> <p>(3) Outputs</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Obstacles and needs in communities and people for the implementation of CCB activities in the model district are identified by the local governments through socio-economic survey.</li> <li>2) Room for improvement in public administration of CCB program in the model district is identified by the local governments through organization analysis.</li> <li>3) CCB Improvement Plan (CIP) is created and implemented with the concept of project cycle management in the model district.</li> <li>4) The local government executives, officials, and public representatives in the model districts acquire necessary skills and knowledge of the project activities.</li> </ol> <p>(4) Inputs</p> <p>Japanese side :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Long-term Expert 3 persons in total</li> <li>Short-term Expert 3 persons in total</li> </ul>	

<p>Equipment 4 desktop computers and 4 printers  Local cost 31,664,882 Rupees (by the end of February 2007)  Trainees received 5 persons</p>		<p><b>Total Cost</b>    <u>220 million Yen</u></p>
<p>Pakistani side :  Counterpart 10 persons in total  Office spaces in Hafizabad  Local cost 151,200 Rupees (by the end of February 2007)</p>		
<b>II. Evaluation Team</b>		
Members of Evaluation Team	<p>Mr. Takao Kaibara, Leader, Resident Representative, JICA Pakistan Office  Mr. Kenji Ishizuka, Evaluation Coordinator, Deputy Resident Representative, JICA Pakistan Office  Mr. Haroon-ur-Rashid Rana, Evaluation Coordinator, Senior Programme Officer, JICA Pakistan Office  Ms. Junko Saikawa, Evaluation Analysis, Senior Planner, Consulting Department II, KRI International Corp.</p>	
Period of Evaluation	14 to 27 January, 2007	Type of Evaluation: terminal evaluation
<b>III. Results of Evaluation</b>		
<b>1. Summary of Achievements</b>		
<p>(1) Activities for Output 1  General Condition Survey was conducted for 42 Unions and Union Profiles were prepared (2004/12-2005/03). Later, based on these Union Profiles, Union Face Sheets were prepared (2006/05-06). In addition, Community Survey was conducted for 10 Unions with participatory survey methods (2005/04-08).  As a result of these surveys, issues and priorities of communities, such as breeding bulls for income generation and renovation of community roads and mosques, were recognized by local government, and officials understood issues of communities better.</p>		
<p>(2) Activities for Output 2  Organization Analysis Survey on local governments in Hafizabad District was conducted (2004/11-2005/03). It included institutional analysis (policy, laws/rules/regulations) as well as organizational analysis (organizational structure, decision-making process, management control system, human resource management, local government culture).  As a result, issues surrounding local governments were shared through quarterly Project Coordination Committees and a workshop in May 2005, and promoted better understanding by government officials.</p>		
<p>(3) Activities for Output 3  The CCB Improvement Plan (CIP) was prepared with referring to the results of the above-mentioned Surveys, finalized and approved in December 2005. For implementing the CIP, preparatory activities (e.g. recruitment of senior trainers/CCB coordinators, training for CCB coordinators, opening of the CCB Support Centre (CSC), setting of the CCB Information Board, preparation of CCB Information Kit) were undertaken. Then, the CIP (covering 15 pilot Unions) was implemented and monitored, including such activities as: field facilitation by CCB coordinators; operation of CCB registration data base; monitoring of the record of the activities by senior trainers/CCB coordinators; series of meetings/workshops with executives and officers of Government of Punjab as well as those of Hafizabad District Government; establishment of CCB Monitoring Committee and selection of its members; and 1st Project Examination Committee (PEC) (June 2006). Based on the feedback from monitoring on its implementation, the CIP was revised in August 2006 in terms of its target (to all 42 Unions), way of facilitation (from visit-type to consultation at CFS), schedule of registration and approval procedure, position of the PEC. CCB Facilitation Station (CFS) were set at 8 sites (2006/10).  As a result, CIP was developed, and CCB has been managed through utilizing CIP. The idea of project cycle management is well incorporated into CIP process.</p>		

#### (4) Activities for Output 4

Several workshops and seminars were held for officials of Government of Punjab, the local government executives, officials, and public representatives to be shared with Project-related information as well as to acquire skills/knowledge necessary for the Project activities. According to interview results, 80% of participants have better knowledge and understanding of CCB, and it is believed that stakeholders acquire necessary knowledge and skills.

#### (5) Achievement of Project Purpose

Judging from the achievement of CCB Program since the Project started (e.g. 100 CCBs have been registered and 12 projects have been completed by the end of 2006), the pace of which is faster than those before the Project and the average of those in Punjab Province, it could be said that the project purpose has been achieved. This is also supported by the high appreciation from some of the CCBs toward the Project activities.

By comparing numbers divide CCB completed activities by CCB registration between national average and a model district, that is 7.7% for national average and 12% for a model district, it is considered that CCB activities were managed more appropriately. The number of completed CCB activities was much larger than national average. Therefore, project purpose is considered to be duly achieved.

## **2. Summary of Evaluation Results**

### (1) Relevance

The Project is relevant to Pakistani policies (Government of Pakistan's "Ten Year Perspective Development Plan 2001-2011" and "Local Government Plan 2000" as well as Government of Punjab's "Punjab Local Government Ordinance (PLGO) 2001" and "Punjab Local Government Rules 2003"). It is also relevant to "Japan's Country Assistance Program for Pakistan (February 2005)" and "JICA Country Program for Pakistan (July 2006)".

It was reasonable to select Hafizabad District as the model for the Project, considering i) its average feature in terms of socio-economic and human development index, ii) relying on agricultural sector, iii) its accessibility both from Lahore and Islamabad, iv) its administration's positive attitude to have the Project.

### (2) Effectiveness

#### (Achievements of Outputs and Project Purpose)

Output 1: The results of socio-economic survey and Union Face Sheets were properly shared with the local government executives/officials through the PCC and workshops to promote their understanding. Thus, it could be evaluated that this output has been achieved.

Output 2: The results of the Organization Analysis Survey was properly shared with local government executives/officials through the PCC and workshops to promote their understanding. It could be said that this output has been sufficiently achieved.

Output 3: The concept of project cycle management has been incorporated into the procedure of formulation, implementation, monitoring, and revision of the CIP, thus, it could be said that this output has been sufficiently achieved.

Output 4: Through several workshops and seminars undertaken by the Project, it could be thought that the persons concerned with the Project have acquired necessary skills and knowledge, thus, this output has been achieved.

### (3) Efficiency

Efficiency of Inputs: Inputs from Japanese side (e.g. Japanese experts, counterpart training in Japan, equipments, local cost expenditure, and local staff) have generally been utilized for undertaking Project activities. Regarding inputs from Pakistani side, however, since all the Pakistani C/P personnel have been involved with the Project as a part of their regular work, their transfer have been done without consideration of the Project, which sometime impaired efficiency of the Project.

Efficiency of Activities: Project activities (socio-economic survey, organization analysis survey, formulation/implementation/monitoring/revision of the CIP, workshops and seminars) have been efficiently undertaken for generating outputs, in terms of their quantity, quality, and timing.

Due to the huge earthquake in northern Pakistan, one of the long-term experts passed away, which delayed the project implementation. The project was extended for 6 months, and later one more long-term expert joined the project. During the period of extension, although there were some additional local running costs, there was only one long-term expert and it did not hinder efficiency of the project very much.

#### (4) Impacts

It is still difficult even at this completion stage to judge whether the overall goal of the Project could be achieved within few years, since whether the model of basic project cycle management on CCB Program demonstrated by the Project could be established and developed highly depends on the future directions of policy supports, institutional arrangements, and financial supports.

It would be difficult for a district government to apply CCB cycle management model due to financial constraint. On the other hand, it would be possible to achieve this if citizen could continuously monitor CCB management by the district.

It is noted that there are more citizen who set up CCB and work on community development through promotion of CCB which provided citizen with opportunity to consider about development of their communities.

#### (5) Sustainability

Policy support from the Government of Punjab for devolution and CCB Program is highly expected to continue since "Legal Framework Order" assures "Punjab Local Governance Ordinance 2001". Capacities of Pakistani side (CCBs and local government executives/officials) have been enhanced by the Project to certain extent; however, their further enhancement is required for continuing the CCB Program with efficient and effective manner. Regarding the institutional arrangement and budget allocation, discussion on how a system would be evolved to institutionalize the model demonstrated by the Project (e.g. setting of CSC for strengthening administrative functions and introducing CCB coordinators for undertaking such functions as field-level mobilization and facilitation) and how the budget would be allocated for them is underway. If these arrangements could be done, the effects of the Project are expected to be sustained.

### **3. Factors that promoted realization of effects**

#### (1) Factors concerning to Planning

None.

#### (2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

- 1) PCC meetings and PMU meetings have been held quite frequently. Through these meetings, the Project-related information has been shared and progress in the Project activities has been reviewed among the parties concerned. Thus, it could be said that these meetings have monitoring functions for implementation of the Project.
- 2) The Project has employed the senior trainers and the CCB coordinators, with expectation of their functioning as the neutral intermediaries between the local governments and CCBs/community groups. They have engaged in implementing the CIP (facilitating people, supporting implementation of CCB projects, and their monitoring), thus, contributed to improvement in CCB Program.

### **4. Factors that impeded realization of effects**

#### (1) Factors concerning to Planning

None.

#### (2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

- 1) Since the earthquake occurred in October 2005 delayed the Project activities, the Project duration was extended by six months.
- 2) Through above-mentioned frequent meetings and other discussions, it could be said that sufficient level of communication and information sharing among the persons involved with the Project (Pakistani C/P, Japanese Experts, and other Project staff) as well as understanding and commitment of the Pakistani C/P for the Project have been ensured. However, since all the Pakistani C/P personnel have been involved with the Project as a part of their regular work, their personnel transfer has been done without consideration of the Project, which sometime impaired efficiency of the Project.

## **5. Conclusion**

Since its commencement in August 2004, the Project has demonstrated the model of basic project cycle management on CCB Program through formulation and implementation of the CIP with series of Project activities. This has resulted in sufficient amount of accomplishment in the Outputs and the Project Purpose initially planned, which the Pakistani side has also appreciated. However, further time is required to accumulate more experiences on implementing and monitoring of CCB Program which could be feed backed for establishing and developing the model demonstrated by the Project as well as to examine post-Project arrangements to sustain the effects generated by the Project.

## **6. Recommendations**

It is recommended for both parties (Pakistani and Japanese) to take actions to continue the following functions and activities for certain period of time after the completion of the Project:

- functions and services of CCB Support Center (CSC)
- functions and services carried out by the CCB coordinators for CCBs and community groups
- implementation and monitoring on CIP (II)

At the same time, while post-Project institutional/organizational arrangements should be examined without any delay, possible options for financial arrangements (such as utilizing part of CCB fund, budget of District government, follow-up scheme of JICA, assistances from other donors, etc.) should be continuously searched by the both parties.

## **7. Lessons Learned**

The project targeted both provincial and district levels. Targeting grass-root level would promote outcomes and impact to reach local people.

## **8. Follow-up Situation**

Follow-up project has been launched in July 2007, with a planned duration until July 2009.