

Summary of the Terminal Evaluation

I. Outline of the Project		
Country: Islamic Republic of Afghanistan		Name of the Project: Strengthening of Non-Formal Education
Sector: Basic Education		Form of assistance: Technical cooperation Project
Office in charge: Basic Education Team 1, Group 1 (Basic Education), Human Development Department		Amount (at the time of evaluation): ¥311,146,000
		Implementing organization in the recipient country: Deputy Minister of Functional Literacy (DMFL)
Duration	(R/D) February 19, 2004	Supporting organizations in Japan: Japan International Cooperation Agency
	3 years (March 26, 2004 ~ March 31, 2007)	Other related cooperation: Support for Expansion and Improvement of Literacy Education in Afghanistan (LEAF)
<p>1. Background and overview of cooperation</p> <p>Afghanistan carries a big population of persons who have not been given an opportunity for primary education under the influence of armed conflicts extending over a period of more than 20 years. It is an urgent issue for Afghanistan to develop human resources that will support a new society. Japan, since immediately after the establishment of the Afghanistan Provisional Administration, has been actively promoting its assistance for the area of education with the purpose of “Human Resource Development.” In August 2002, the Ministry of Education in Afghanistan announced its reconstruction and development plan for Education Sector in Afghanistan which placed priority on the issues of providing a universal education opportunity, improving education environment (living environment improvements, quality improvements and increases in the number of teachers) and revising curricula and teaching materials.</p> <p>To address these issues, JICA has been extending its cooperation by dispatching Long-term experts to the Ministry of Education with the aim of improving the capacity for public education system, accepting participants in training for reeducating female teachers for whom employment opportunities have not be available for a long time, and rehabilitating and reconstructing school facilities in the city of Kabul. However, there are still a host of people who cannot enjoy the benefits of public education including adults who have not been able to benefit from educational opportunities or children for whom</p>		

going to school has been difficult. Therefore, it is also an emergency issue to extend assistance to Non-Formal Education to persons who cannot be covered by public education, and Japan's cooperation was requested.

Against this backdrop, JICA announced publicly a Non-Formal Education assistance project as a proposal-type technical cooperation Project in Afghanistan and selected the proposal provided by the National Federation of UNESCO Association in Japan (UFUAI) after careful screening. Based on the proposal, the Project formulation study (April 2003) and ex-ante evaluation study (September 2003) were conducted. In February 2004 the Record of Discussions (R/D) was signed and exchanged with the Government of Afghanistan to agree on the Project's basic plan.

2. Content of cooperation

(1) Overall goal

To reinforce Non-Formal Education in Kabul.

(2) Objective

To develop model-Community Learning Centers (CLCs) for Non-Formal Education.

(3) Outputs

1. To develop learning materials for Non-Formal Education (literacy, life-skills, and occupational training) programmes.
2. To increase the capacity of teachers by delivering training programmes for literacy and life-skill education.
3. To enable each CLC management committee to run its CLC and to enable local people to receive education.

(4) Inputs (at the time of evaluation – partly including the finalized plans)

Japan side

Dispatch of short-term experts:	12 persons in total	76M/M
---------------------------------	---------------------	-------

Acceptance of participants:	21 persons in total	7M/M
-----------------------------	---------------------	------

(Third-country training)

Provision of equipment:	¥9,502,000
-------------------------	------------

Local costs:	¥120,006,000 (including ¥18,179,000 for CLC construction costs)
--------------	---

Afghanistan side

Assignment of counterparts:	5 persons
-----------------------------	-----------

Provision of land and facilities: Land for CLC (at 3 sites)			
II. Outline of the evaluation study team			
Member	Leader:	Nobuko KAYASHIMA	Director, Group 1 (Basic Education), Human Development Department, JICA
	Education evaluation	Tomoko MASUDA	Senior Advisor, JICA
	Evaluation planning	Yumi TOKUDA	Basic Education Team 1, Group 1 (Basic Education), Human Development Department , JICA
	Evaluation analysis	Satoru TAKAHASHI	Senior researcher, IMG Inc.
Duration of study	Nov. 29 ~ Dec. 14, 2006		Type of evaluation: Terminal Evaluation
III. Summary of the evaluation result			
1. Achievement of the Project objective			
(1) Outputs of the Project			
The Project achieved sufficient outputs in the following three issues:			
a. <u>To develop learning materials for Non-Formal Education.</u>			
The following seven types of teaching materials have been developed for learners.			
	Title	Language	Number of copies
1	How to write Dari	Dari (D)	2,500
2	How to write Pashto	Pashto (P)	800
3	Calculation Practice Book	D & P	D 2,500 & P 800
4	Our Environment	D & P	D 3,000 & P 800
5	Pre – and Post-Natal Care for Mother and Babies	D & P	D 3,000 & P 800
6	Needlecraft	D & P	D 2,500 & P 800
7	Afghanistan Country Cooking Book	D & P	D 2,400 & P 800
b. <u>To increase the capacity of teachers by delivering training programmes for literacy and life-skill education.</u>			
Literacy teachers apply the teaching techniques that they have learned in training to their daily teaching. Training for literacy teachers was held for four times, in which 158 persons in total participated. Training for teaching material developers was held two times, in which 92 persons participated in total. The following table indicates the teaching materials used in the training.			

	Title	Language	Number of copies
1	Literacy teacher's guide video	D & P	Video 24, VCD 10, DVD 10 in each language
2	Teaching Aid Development Manual (Form I)	D & P	D 2,500 & P 2,000

- c. To enable each CLC management committee to run its CLC and to enable local people to receive education.

CLC has discussed various issues through the Community Learning Center Management Committee (CLCMC) and built a mechanism to solve problems. Currently, CLC is managed by CLCMC including both administrative officials (from the sub-bureau of the Literacy Department) and resident's representatives. The CLCMC meetings are held every two weeks. The following teaching materials have been developed for the operation of CLC. By using these materials, workshops, seminars and training courses were held 40 times in total, in which officials from the Literacy Department, the director of the sub-bureau of the Literacy Department, and CLCMC members participated totaling to the number of 1,010 persons.

	Title	Language	Number of copies
1	CLC Management Picture Book	D & P	D 2,000 & P 2,500
2	CLC Supervisor Picture Book	D & P	D 2,000 & P 800
3	Non-Formal Adult Education Facilitation Video	D & P	D Video 40, DVD 5, P Video 40, DVD 5
4	CLC Management Video	D	Video 50, VCD 10, DVD 10
5	CLC Management Guideline Framework Book (Draft)	D	200
6	Local Rule Enforcement Kit (FORM II)	D	Poster 4 types x 120 each, Sticker: 3 types x 240 ea.
7	CLC Manual (Draft)	D & P	D 500 & P 500

The Project Design Matrix (PDM) lays down the indicators that 1,500 persons will receive literacy education and that 35% of them will pass a final test. In fact, approximately 750 learned at three CLC's, which failed to reach the indicator. Main reasons for the failure lie in two factors: first, the initial target was set at a higher goal in comparison to the size of the facilities, and second, the completion of CLC construction lagged behind by nine months than the plan. The number 750 is neither necessarily small nor spoils the effectiveness of the model CLC's. Two hundred and seventy nine (279) persons, 37% of 750 persons, completed the literacy course. At present 330 persons are undergoing the course.

In the life skills course 759 persons have been registered so far, out of which 269 persons completed the course and 261 persons are learning. In addition, 270 persons are taking continuing study courses (Koran, English, computer, electricity, and supplementary lessons, etc.) for which no period has been set.

Through learning how to read and write, these learners are able to write letters, understand the signboards of stores, read newspapers, and help their children or siblings with their studies at home. They say that they have become more sociable and forward-looking in their lives. Some of the persons who have completed the literacy course (ordinarily, those who have completed the literacy course are admitted into the fourth grade of public education) were directly admitted into the seventh grade or the eighth grade for their excellent grades. Another example is that one student of the tailoring course became skilled to the extent to which he was able to sell his clothes during the course. Likewise, a few students of the tailoring course put up a signboard to begin a small-scale business at home after the completion of the course. Another case has been confirmed in which a person who has finished the beauty course works as a professional beautician.

CLC serves the whole community as well as its individual student. To put it more specifically, CLC is used for a wide range of social and cultural activities and events, thereby functioning as a public place where the residents have fun or get to know people.

The following table indicates the numbers of CLC users during the past one year.

District	2005			2006								
	Oct.	Nov.	Dec.	Jan.	Feb.	April	May	June	July	Aug.	Sept.	Oct.
5	150	60	50	30	20	520	550	520	450	736	420	890
8	260	180	100	-	150	1,474	774	601	534	40	100	130
12	160	320	30	50	-	828	928	508	828	1,283	240	500
Total	570	560	180	80	170	2,822	2,252	1,629	1,812	2,059	760	1,520

(2) Objective: “To develop model-Community Learning Centers (CLCs) for Non-Formal Education.”

Three CLC’s were completed during the period from June to September in 2005. At present, they are run by the sub-bureau of the Literacy Department and regional residents, but the former conducts daily office work. CLC has the following three features, and a model-CLC for Non-Formal Education has been evidently established.

(a) Collaboration between public administration and community

It cannot be expected that residents in urban districts will get involved of their own accord in promoting Non-Formal Education. The primary reason is that many urban residents have returned just in recent years after the end of prolonged civil wars, and community has not yet been fully formed. Hence, in this Project CLC was constructed under the leadership of public administration (Literacy Department). However, CLCMC was established together with residents, whereby it became possible to reflect residents' requests in CLC activities through CLCMC. This democratic and participatory approach successfully functions. Each CLC responds flexibly to its local diverse needs.

(b) Combination of the literacy course and the life skills course

The primary beneficiaries of CLC are women and children. They have a strong yearning to learn skills which will enable them to earn earnings to help their livelihoods as well as their wish to learn how to read and write. In addition to literacy, CLC offers wide-ranging courses of skills for life (tailoring, beauty, computer, English, Koran and etc.) to meet the needs of learners. Furthermore, CLC is constantly equipped with sufficient textbooks, teaching materials, computers, and other teaching aid equipment which the courses held in private houses will never be able to offer. In fact, it was confirmed that all literacy learners took a tailoring course simultaneously at CLC in districts 5 and 8.

(c) Function as key points in local communities

CLC offers a public place where residents are able to get together or learn together with a sense of safety. Different from Non-Formal Education classes held at private home, it is often the case that the family members of female learners (in particular, husbands and elder brothers who have negative views on women's education) give permission to leave house and attend a class. In addition, CLC fulfills the function as key point in a local community. That is, various social and cultural events are held, thereby offering a valuable place where strangers are able to get to know one another. Thus, it is used as multi-purpose facility: it is open to all community residents and all people regardless of their ethnicity are able to enjoy learning and socializing equally.

(3) Overall goal: "To reinforce Non-Formal Education in Kabul."

It is expected to attain this goal on coming days, but a meticulous and elaborate plan will be needed to do so. From the above-stated features and current circumstances, CLC is one of effective approaches to strengthen Non-Formal Education in Kabul. The Ministry of Education correctly understands the effectiveness and significance of CLC in a

local community. At present, the Ministry of Education plans to establish 442 CLC's throughout the nation. This plan is included in the Five-year Education Strategy which is under preparation by the Ministry of Education. Besides, the Literacy Department plans to set up a CLC section in its Program Designing Division with the aim of strengthening Non-Formal Education through CLC.

Such measures and efforts by the Ministry of Education can be highly evaluated. However, the construction of 442 CLC's needs time-series careful and elaborate planning. The Ministry of Education suggests that one CLC be established in each district, but we believe that it is not necessary to stick to the idea since there are wide disparities between urban and local regions in the population and area of each district.

2. Results of the five evaluation criteria

(1) Relevance: Very high

The New Constitution of Afghanistan declares the eradication of illiteracy in Article 44, and the importance of Non-Formal Education has been repeatedly emphasized in some policy documents issued by the government of Afghanistan. On the other hand, the government of Japan lists assistance for Non-Formal Education as one of priority aid issues in the Basic Education for Growth Initiative (BEGIN) announced in the year 2002.

(2) Effectiveness: High

Extensive effects were produced at individual and community levels in the process of building a model CLC. At the same time, a model CLC has three features ((1) collaboration between public administration and community, (2) combination of literacy course and life skills course, (3) function as key point in a local community). On the other hand, the model CLC built under this Project is a typical model of so-called urban CLC's. That is, the three CLC's are all situated in the city of Kabul, and officials from the Literacy Department regularly work at CLC. Accordingly, it is desirable that the model CLC be first verified in other districts in Kabul, followed by verification in other main cities. In case when CLC is constructed in rural areas, a careful plan is required and in some cases, the model CLC may need some modifications.

(3) Efficiency: Moderate

All inputs (C/P assignment by Afghanistan side, provision of CLC sites, dispatch of experts by Japan, provision of equipment including CLC construction, and overseas

C/P training) were carried out as scheduled. Nonetheless, the Project's efficiency was lowered, first, by the fact that it took nine months to prepare land (for transfer to the Ministry of Education from the city of Kabul) and, second, by the fact that all Japanese experts had to leave Afghanistan temporarily for Japan during the period from September to December 2004 with concern over deterioration in security owing to the presidential election. The completion rate of the literacy course is 37%, which needs to be improved in light of the inputs and outputs. Likewise, it will be needed to cut back the initial costs of CLC.

(4) Impact: Very high

An extensive impact has been observed at the levels of the individual, the region, the district, and the central government (ministry). Some examples are enumerated below.

- Literacy learners became more sociable and began to take a forward-looking attitude towards various matters.
- Regional residents were able to get to know one another through various activities. In the initial rehabilitation stage, CLC gave people the feeling of the advent of a peaceful new age.
- The sub-bureau of the Literacy Department could have its permanent office within CLC.
- Enlightenment activities and a wide range of items for the International Literacy Day not only heightened general citizens' awareness of literacy but also contributed to elevating the status of the Literacy Department.
- The Ministry of Education correctly understands the effectiveness and significance of CLC in a local community. It plans to build 442 CLC's throughout the nation, which has been included in the Five-year National Education Strategic Plan.

(5) Sustainability: High

Different from many other non-governmental organizations (NGOs), CLC did not spend a massive amount of money (for remunerations and entry fees) to attract teachers and participants. People perceive CLC as the place of learning and socialization. It is assumed that there will be a number of people who want to learn at CLC in the future as well. As long as CLC is run in consideration for social, cultural and demographic issues, it is expected that it will continue to meet diverse needs among community residents.

Currently, two CLC's are above the profit line, whereas one CLC is below the profit line. However, the scrutiny of the CLC's accounts demonstrates that CLC has

established its foundation towards its financial sustainability. At least, CLC has a mechanism to discuss and solve problems through CLCMC. On the other hand, it will inevitably face the necessity of additional expenses such as facility repairs and purchase of equipment/supplies, expendables, and wood for fuel, etc. Hence, we would like to emphasize the importance of taking into account some actions for collecting or raising funds from the region, municipal governments, and the private sector.

3. Factors contributing to achieving the outputs

(1) Factors related to the contents of the plan

This Project was designed in the way in which the public administration (Literacy Department and its sub-bureau) would take an active role in its activities, which greatly contributed to the achievement of its outputs. The public administration took an active role in carrying out household surveys to reap regional needs, making various teaching materials and a CLC operation manual, hiring teaching staff, preparing courses, and managing CLC. It would have not been possible only for residents to take such initiatives. An active role performed by the public administration contributed to the opening of CLC and setting its activities on the right track.

(2) Factors related to the implementation process

CLCMC, which was organized by involving resident's representatives to collect direct voices accurately and periodically from community residents, obviously enabled CLC to offer flexible and diverse courses of skills for life in response to residents' needs.

4. Problems and factors causing the problems

(1) Factors related to the contents of the plan

No particular deterring factors were found in the plan.

(2) Factors related to the implementation process

As abovementioned, the Project's efficiency was lowered by two factors. The first is that it took nine months to prepare land (in transfer from the city of Kabul to the Ministry of Education). The second is that all Japanese experts had to return to Japan in the period from September to December 2004 with concern over deterioration in security due to the presidential election. It deserves a special mention that the Afghanistan side assiduously went on with the Project's activities during the absence of Japanese.

5. Recommendations and Lessons Learned

5-1 Recommendations

【What the implementation team should do by the end of the Project】

(1) Documentation of CLC model

This Project operated three CLC's on a trial base, thereby accumulating valuable experiences about the CLC model. Currently, the preparation of a CLC manual is in progress by using valuable experiences and the model for CLC constructed based on such experiences. The manual should fully include exemplary cases of valuable experiences, make mention of the possibility and limit of the CLC model, and provide appropriate guidelines for spreading CLC throughout the nation in the future. We suggest that a summary brochure be made as well.

(2) Public relations and extension activities of the CLC model

The CLC model is indeed useful for a variety of administrative organizations and development organizations that support Non-Formal Education. It will contribute to the enhancement of Non-Formal Education through sharing the model with many related organizations. Hence, prior to the end of the Project, it is recommended to organize a workshop to introduce the CLC model and deepen discussions as to its possibility and limit by using the above CLC manual and a summary brochure. It is further recommended that the workshop should be held by inviting related organizations in Afghanistan such as the Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs, and Disabled, and development organizations including the United States Agency for International Development (USAID), the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), and the United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF).

(3) Elucidation of CLC model's cost

CLC adopted a number of ideas, for example, about the method of involving residents and the way in which activities are carried out. On the other hand, the CLC costs have not been fully examined. The case in point is, the CLC manual draft which is underway does not contain an overall picture of necessary costs. It is planned that the Five-year National Education Strategic Plan which is being prepared by the Ministry of Education will include a program to establish 442 CLC's. In order to materialize the extension program as early as possible, it is a must to conduct a cost analysis of the model CLC from its construction to operation. To start with, the costs of the three CLC cases should be disclosed. In the case of CLC's under this Project, the initial investment in the construction of the facilities was costly (¥7 million/CLC). Hence, some measures should be explored to cut back the amount as well.

【What should be done as medium/long-term measures after the end of the Project】

(4) Exploration on how to use the CLC model more broadly

This Project tested all the three CLC's within the city of Kabul, where CLC functioned concurrently as the sub-bureau of the Literacy Department. This enabled CLC to have its stable operation. No facilities which could function as key point in the urban district were available, and so new facilities had to be constructed with the Project money. In fact, this brought about a result that the facilities provided a safe place where women were able to gather together. However, no sub-bureaus of the Literacy Department are located in local and rural areas, and it will be difficult to make a big initial investment. Thus, it will be necessary to review the model further or to take some other measures to disseminate CLC's under different circumstances. For instance, possible measures may be, as to the former, partnerships with local administrative organizations such as the Community Development Council (CDC) and, as to the latter, the expansion of the sub-bureaus of the Literacy Department.

(5) Searching for the ways to improve the sustainability of CLC

CLC's under this Project have turned out to be successful in general by balancing the revenue and expenditure of CLC with various ideas. However, the needs for vocational training at CLC constantly change. It will become necessary to prepare new equipment/supplies and teaching materials for opening a new training course in the future. In the current situation, it will not be easy for a sub-bureau or any community to address this issue, although admittedly it depends upon the types of equipment and the content of teaching materials. In order to deal with such a situation, essential will be to develop further the capacity for Project planning and management (particularly the capacity for financial affairs) or to deepen partnerships with other fund sources (donors and NGOs).

5-2 Lessons Learned

This CLC Project's activities were limited only to the city of Kabul, but the following lessons were obtained.

【Lessons as to the operation of CLC】

(1) Significance of CLC as an organization for women's education in the region

In Afghanistan critical views on women's education still prevail. Amidst such views, CLC is used primarily by women and children. CLC is run in collaboration between public administration and residents and provides women with education on

literacy and life skills which are close to their needs at a place visible to regional society. This is the main reason why CLC offers women a place which they can use with a sense of ease and safety. In regions where women's education is not necessarily guaranteed, CLC will have its *raison d'être*.

(2) Measures to make CLC function

As discussed above, the organization and activities of CLC have the following three features: (1) collaboration between public administration and community, (2) combination of literacy course and life skills courses, and (3) function as a key point in regional society. They are the chief factors that enable CLC to function as a regional education organization.

(3) Measures to secure the continuity of CLC

The following actions are taken to increase the continuity of the literacy course and life skills courses which constitute CLC's core activities.

- The Literacy Department (sub-bureau) pays the salaries for the teachers of the literacy course.
- Per-diem allowance is not paid to participants in the courses.
- The products (clothes, etc.) which are made in the life skills courses are sold and their proceeds are used for CLC management.
- The literacy course is offered free. On the other hand, class fees are charged for the courses for English, Koran and etc. Revenues from the latter are appropriated to the former's expenses.

(4) Flexible and diverse ways of management in response to community needs

Among the three CLC's under this Project, there are differences in terms of the community's financial situation, the structure of ethnic groups, and literacy situation. Hence, the structures of the literacy course and the life skills courses are different. In order for grassroots Non-Formal Education organizations such as CLC, it is essential to collect regional needs through CLCMC and assure flexibility and diversity in its course design and management.

(5) CLC as the hub of satellite Non-Formal Education courses

CLC's under this Project offer a place for teaching-staff training for the literacy course in the region or rents equipment and technical aid to life skills classes held in the region. In Kabul, there are a number of small-scale literacy classes and life skills classes

and CLC plays the function as the hub of such satellite classes.

【Issues toward improvements in the quality of Non-Formal Education in Afghanistan】

(6) Quality assurance of Non-Formal Education and the necessity of assessment

At present, a standardized test is not given at the end of a literacy class in Afghanistan. As a result, literacy education has not been fully assessed, thereby making it difficult to assure the quality of and pick up problems as to literacy education. A standardized assessment will be needed in the future.

(7) Improvements in data management of literacy and life skills classes

Statistics on the total monthly number of learners are available at this Project's CLC's. However, no statistics on changes in the number of participants by course have been kept. Hence, no data were available on the number of those who have completed and on the number of dropouts. (According to an analysis made by our Team, the completion rate was 37%.) The management of such data and analysis based on the data will be essential to improve the quality of the literacy course and meet the needs of its participants.

5-3 Issues to be reviewed by JICA

(1) Sharing with other Projects

CLC builds a mechanism of collaborative activities between public administration and community, thereby proposing a method to meet the needs for learning skills for life, including various simple vocational training, in the community. Currently, JICA has been implementing its Projects in the sectors of rural development, basic vocational training, and improvements in women's livelihoods in Afghanistan. We believe that the experiences obtained in this CLC Project will provide useful information to these Projects. Hence, we strongly recommend that such information be shared among Project experts, JICA Afghanistan Office and JICA headquarters.

(2) Future development of the CLC Project and sharing information with the National Federation of UNESCO Association in Japan (NFUAJ)

JICA's aid to this Project will be brought to an end as of the end of March 2007. It is planned that NFUAJ, executing agency of this Project, continues its support to CLC Projects in Afghanistan as its own Project. On the other hand, JICA will execute its LEAF Project aiming for capacity building of the Literacy Department and implementing literacy Project by August 2008. Thus, JICA will continue its cooperation for education in

Afghanistan with focus on teacher training and literacy education as its priority aid sectors. Hence, it will be necessary to share information regularly with NFUAJ that continues its activities in Afghanistan, primarily in Kabul, and also watch carefully the future development of the CLC Project.