

終了時評価調査結果要約表（英文）

I. Outline of the Project	
Country : Laos	Project title : Project for Capacity Building in Public Investment Program (PIP) Management
Issue/Sector : Governance	Cooperation scheme : Proposal-based Technical Cooperation Project
Division in charge : Laos Office Dept. Division	Total cost : 280,000 (thousand)_yen
Period of Cooperation	(R/D): 01/11/2004~31/10/2007 Partner Country's Implementing Organization : Committee for Planning and Investment
Related Cooperation Project :	---
<p>1 Background of the Project</p> <p>Committee for Planning and Investment (CPI) of the Government of Lao PDR has authority and responsibility for the management of Public Investment Program (PIP), which is equivalent to a so-called development program in Laos. CPI provides advice for assessing and adopting new PIP projects, monitor and evaluate PIP projects on a regular basis as well as verify the relevance of PIP projects in each sector. However, the CPI and provincial Departments of Planning and Investment (DPI), which are a subordinate organization to the CPI, lack capacity for managing programs and projects so that domestically funded the PIP and PIP projects are planned and implemented arbitrarily. Also, it is unclear how much contribution the PIP has made to achieving overall goals in the national-level development plan. Consequently, there is a huge gap between the national development plan and implementation of the PIP.</p> <p>Under these circumstances, the Government of Lao PDR officially requested the Government of Japan to assist with the Project for Capacity Building in Public Investment Program (PIP) Management in 2003 (Hereinafter referred to as the Project). Based on the request, Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) started providing assistance to the Government of Lao PDR in November 2004 and implementing a proposal-based technical cooperation project for three years.</p>	
<p>2 Project Overview</p> <p>The Project aims to strengthen the capacity of both Department of Investment Monitoring and</p>	

Evaluation (DIME) and Department of General Planning (DGP) of the CPI in order for the CPI to assess, monitor and evaluate new and ongoing projects.

(1) Overall Goal

Effectiveness and efficiency of PIP planned and implemented by the Lao Government improve.

(2) Project Purpose

PIP Projects are appropriately appraised, monitored and evaluated/

(3) Outputs

1. Appraisal, monitoring and evaluation method which are suitable to Laos are developed.
2. Staff at supervising agencies attain knowledge and skills for PIP management, appraisal, monitoring and evaluation.
3. PIP projects are managed under the newly developed methods at the designated monitor provinces and ministry.
4. Organization-based coordination network in PIP management is established and functioning appropriately.

(4) Inputs

Japanese side : (Total 280,000 (thousand) Yen)

Long-term Expert	<u>0</u>	Equipment	10,670 (thousand)Yen
Short-term Expert	<u>10</u>	Local cost	41,343 (thousand) Yen
Trainees received	<u>0</u>	Others	--- (thousand) Yen

Laotian Side :

Counterpart	<u>11</u>	Equipment	---
Land and Facilities	provided by counterpart organization		
Local Cost	unknown		
Others	---		

II. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team	Mr. Koichi Takei, Team Leader, Deputy Resident Representative of JICA Laos Office Mr. Hideaki Matsumoto, Evaluation Planning, Assistant Resident Representative of JICA Laos Office Mr. Tatsuya Nishida, Project Evaluation, Consultant	
Period of Evaluation	22/07/2007 ~ 10/08/2007	Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation

III. Results of Evaluation

1 . Project Performance

- Inputs and Outputs

Most of project outputs have been or are expected to be achieved by the end of the project in October

2007. Specific achievements on each of project outputs are as follows:

Output 1 is expected to be fully achieved by the end of August 2007. All the manuals and handbook expected have been or will be completed and distributed to all the departments concerned.

Output 2 has been fully achieved until now. Specifically, 15 staffs of the DIME and 6 staffs of the DGP marked sufficient scores in the post-tests, received internal training of trainers, organized and implemented various training and seminars.

Output 3 has been and is expected to be achieved partially by the end of August 2007. Currently, the meta-evaluation of the new methods suggests that more PIP projects of the monitor organizations could be assessed, monitored and evaluated through the new methods. Also, the meta-evaluation finds that the quality of assessment reports using SPAS still needs to be improved, since the quality of many PIP project assessments were rated low.

Output 4 has been fully achieved until now. 4 annual seminars were successfully held from 2005 to 2007. A PIP management is now being finalized and is expected to be incorporated in the manuals and handbook, and distributed by the end of August, 2007.

- Project Purpose

9 of 19 middle-scale (Type 2) PIP projects under the responsibility of the monitor organizations were processed in line with the "PIP Manual for Project Management" and were submitted to the National Assembly in the 2007/08 fiscal year. Also, four inception or progress reports on Type 2 PIP projects in the monitor organizations have been submitted until now in line with the manual. In addition, the number of PIP projects for the 2007/08 fiscal year, which were assessed and evaluated under the manual and utilized for programming PIP, increased from 0 in the 2005/06 fiscal year to 115 including Type 1, 2, and 3 PIP projects in the 2007/08 fiscal year.

2 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

The Project has remained relevant to both the Laotian national development plans and the Japanese Official Development Assistant (ODA) policy and program since the start until now. Also, the Project meets the needs of direct beneficiaries of DIME, DGP, three monitor provinces and a ministry.

(2) Effectiveness

The project purpose has been only partially achieved while project outputs have been mostly achieved. This is because the purpose is ambitious compared with outputs and activities of the Project and there is a gap between the achievement of outputs and the attainment of the project purpose. The development of the manuals and handbook, training staffs of DIME, DGP and three monitor provinces, and holding annual seminars are necessary to build their capacity of assessment, monitoring and evaluation. But, building their capacity for only the three monitor provinces and the

monitor ministry is insufficient for outputs to cause the accomplishment of the project purpose, which covers the nationwide capacity of assessment, monitoring and evaluation.

(3) Efficiency

Overall, most of inputs were mobilized both properly and flexibly for this project in terms of the quantity, quality and timing of inputs. Note that the high level of motivation on the Laotian side is one of the most significant factors for achieving most of intended outputs. Also, the combination of workshop-type training and on-the-job training (OJT) were found extremely effective and efficient, because they had multiple effects by applying what they learned in FT and ITT to daily work under the supervision of a mentor through OJT. Also, an annual seminar was an effective tool for drawing attention from high ranking officials to project activities as well as disseminating results of the training widely. Some specific suggestions on inputs are available in the report. The shift of the assembly session to June 2006 hampered the implementation of training for staffs concerned along the budget formulation process for the 2006/07 fiscal year. Consequently, the Project was able to implement only one cycle of training during the project period, although it initially expected to conduct two cycles.

(4) Impact

It is necessary to achieve the project purpose in order to achieve the overall goal. However, note that achieving the project purpose does not automatically materialize the overall goal saying that effectiveness and efficiency of PIP planned and implemented by the Lao Government improve. How to utilize the results of assessment, monitoring and evaluation is the next key for achieving the overall goal. Also, the evaluation team found that the Project has started producing three positive unintended impacts until now:

First, some provinces are voluntarily extending the new assessment, monitoring and evaluation system to the district level in some provinces.

Second, neighbouring provinces around the three monitor provinces requested CPI or the monitor provinces to provide training of assessment, monitoring and evaluation methods to them.

Third, the CPI is voluntarily extending the new assessment, monitoring and evaluation system to other offices within the CPI than intended offices.

(5) Sustainability

Basically, policy, technical, organizational and personnel sustainability has made substantial progress until now, while a strategy for improving financial sustainability should be discussed and prepared for the future. The Government of Lao PDR has demonstrated a strong policy commitment to introducing a new assessment, monitoring and evaluation system to PIP (Prime Minister Decree 58 and a new PIP management law to be formulated). Also, DIME and DGP has now sufficient human resources and organizational capacity of continuing to train staffs of line ministries, provincial and even district governments as well as conduct the new assessment, monitoring and evaluation methods, while DPI

staffs of the monitor provinces have developed their technical competency of conducting the new methods, although they still need training in order to reach the capacity level of training other provincial and district officials. The evaluation team found that many officials of the Government of Lao PDR pointed out financial difficulties when they provide training to provincial or district staffs. The evaluation team would like to emphasize that the terminal evaluation gives a valuable opportunity of developing a strategy for financial sustainability of the new system for the future.

3. Factors promoted realization of effects

(1) Factors concerning to Planning

The Project was well planned mobilizing the unique features and strength of Japanese technical cooperation projects. Unlike other donor projects, this Project adopted an extremely practical and application-oriented approach. The trainings, especially the On-the-Job training, were the best example, which were planned to be conducted according to the actual process of budget planning of Lao government and were well combined On-the-Job Training as practice and Formal Training and Intensive Technical Training as theory.

(2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

High participation and ownership of Laotian counterparts and beneficiaries contributed to provide good result to the Project. The Department of Investment, Monitoring and Evaluation, the Department of General Planning and departments of Planning and Investment in provinces participated to create manual and trainings actively since the beginning of the Project.

4. Factors inhibited realization of effects

(1) Factors concerning to Planning

One of the possible reasons why this Project might not be able to achieve the Project purpose and output is thought of as the Project purpose has been set too ambitious to complete in the project period with planned input. Because capacity building is generally considered taking time to do, three years' project period is thought of as too short to make capacity building model and disseminate the technique and knowledge across the whole country.

(2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

Changing of appraisal schedule of next year's budget by National Assembly from October to June caused confusion and big changes of project implementation schedule because the project had been planned according to the budget planning process. This change reduced time of training, and it provided negative impact on the achievement of output and project purpose because the main component of the project for capacity building was training.

5. Conclusion

The Project purpose has been and is expected to be achieved partially or not completed by the end of the Project, but it does not mean that the project is failure. In fact, the direction and approach of the project are both reasonable. Therefore, it is important to expand project activities and output to all provinces and ministries in order to achieve the Project purpose. It is expected to achieve the Project purpose in the near future if CPI can continue those activities.

6 . Recommendations

(1) Use results of assessment, monitoring and evaluation more effectively and strategically. First, these documents should be finalized and signed by the President of the CPI, and distributed to all the governmental agencies concerned by the end of September, 2007.

(2) Note that the new system could provide a government body with a powerful tool and authority to take such strong measures as recommending, advising and enforcing the discontinuation and suspension of projects, review and change of project scope, based on results of the assessment, monitoring or evaluation of PIP projects. It is recommended to seize the forthcoming opportunity of formulating a PIP bill to design these legal procedures in details.

(3) Continue training along the budget formulation process in the next fiscal year of 2008/09

(4) Extend training to more ministries, provinces, and districts. Review and extend the use of training contents, manuals and handbook nationwide. Extend assessment, monitoring and evaluation to large-scale (Type 1) PIP projects.

(5) Assess, monitor and evaluate official development assistance (ODA) projects and attempt to conduct aid coordination

(6) Be prepared to make long-term efforts to develop the capacity of assessment, monitoring and evaluation.

- It is recommended that CPI prepare and formulate a financial sustainability strategy for post-project period by the end of this Project.

- Further develop the capacity of upgrading assessment, monitoring and assessment methods in the long run.

- Develop a plan on how to cooperate with the Ministry of Finance (MOF) for the future, because planning and preparing recurrent cost as well as capital expenditures for PIP projects concurrently is an effective way to improve the efficiency of the PIP.

7 . Lessons Learned

(1) Recognize and mobilize the strength of Japanese technical cooperation project. This Project adopts an extremely practical and application-oriented approach. The On-the-Job training is the best example, which many staffs interviewed highly appreciated and distinguished from other donor projects.

(2) Develop, manage and update PIP management system with a special attention to the Laotian needs and capacity. Although many donors have developed different kinds of manuals and handbooks, the number of manuals and handbooks that were actually utilized and institutionalized is in fact small. It is crucial to develop an assessment, monitoring and evaluation system, which Government of Lao PDR can understand, use and update by themselves after the completion of the Project.

(3) Implement a project in accordance with the Laotian style of governance. Conducting project activities in accordance with the Laotian style of governance is the most efficient. Generally, the Government of Lao PDR's management is top-down. Also, provincial governors have strong power to make decisions including those on PIP projects. Therefore, it is crucial to pay an attention to these general and regional governance features in order to prepare and implement project activities.

8 . Follow-up Situation
