

Summary of Evaluation Result

1. Outline of the Project	
Country: Socialist Republic of Vietnam	Project Title: Capacity Building of Master Trainers for Modernization of Customs Administration Project
Issue/ Sector: Economic Policy	Cooperation Scheme: Technical Cooperation Project
Division in Charge: JICA Vietnam Office	Total Cost: 2.8 hundred million yen
Cooperation Period	3 years from August 1, 2004 to July 31, 2007
	Partner Country's Implementation Organization: General Department of Customs, Ministry of Finance
	Supporting Organization in Japan: Customs and Tariff Bureau, Ministry of Finance
	Other Supporting Organization: None
1-1 Background of the Project	
<p>In Vietnam, the volume of trade has been increasing rapidly recently. However, customs administration is not in line with international standard, and such inefficient and ineffective procedure may affect trade facilitation, and may hamper improvement of investment environment. In this context, it is inevitable that General Department of Vietnam Customs (GDC) enhances its capacity of customs administration especially in the field of Customs Valuation, Post Clearance Audit and HS Classification, in line with international standards of World Trade Organization (WTO) and World Customs Organization (WCO.) With this background, the current three-year Project was launched in August 2004. Through preparatory discussions between the authorities concerned of Vietnam and JICA, as an implementing body of Japanese technical cooperation programs, the framework of the Project was elaborated by aiming at enhancing the capacity of master trainers in above three fields.</p> <p>(Note) 'HS', which stands for Harmonized Commodity Description and Coding System, is the global treaty for unifying the name and classification of trading goods upon setting tariff.</p>	
1-2 Project Overview	
(1) Overall Goal:	
Appropriate staff trainings on Customs Valuation, Post Clearance Audit and HS Classification (including Chemical Analysis) are periodically provided to the front line officers who work at selected regional customs offices.	
(2) Project Purpose:	
Master trainers are raised to provide practical training on Customs Valuation, Post Clearance Audit and HS Classification (including Chemical Analysis) based on the international standards, and act as instructors in the staff training courses.	
(3) Outputs:	
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Activity plan for developing the master trainers, who can teach customs officers at local staff training courses, is prepared. 2. Training materials and teaching guidelines are prepared, in order to introduce the international standards to the regional customs offices. 3. At selected regional customs offices, periodic on-the-spot trainings (OST/ OSTs) are conducted by the master trainers. 4. Sustainable training plan, which would be implemented after completing the Project, is prepared. 	
(4) Inputs (as of April 2007):	
(Japanese Side)	
Placement of Experts: 56 experts (64 M/M) Provision of Equipment: US\$1,250 thousand	

C/P training in Japan: 38 C/Ps		Local Cost Support: JPY10.8 million	
(Vietnamese Side)			
C/P allocation: 44 C/Ps		Buildings and Facilities	
Local Budget: VND2,609 million (equivalent to US\$163 thousand)			
2. Evaluation Team (Japanese side)			
Team Members	-Leader: Hiroaki Nakagawa, Resident Representative, JICA Vietnam Office -Evaluation Planning: Kensuke Tsuji, Deputy Resident Representative, JICA Office -Evaluation Analysis: Rie Kawahara, Consultant, Kaihatsu Management Consulting, Inc.		
Period	15 April – 28 April, 2007	Type of Evaluation: Final Evaluation	
3. Summary of Evaluation			
3-1 Result of Cooperation			
(1) Achievement of Project Purpose			
It was found that the following verifiable indicators of the Project Purpose are already achieved or highly expected to be achieved by the end of the Project. Therefore, the level of achievement of the Project Purpose is high enough.			
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. By the end of the Project, average score on the tests of working group improves at 80% of the full marks. 2. Contents concerning on-the-spot training are updated regularly, and corrected along the international standards by the Vietnamese side. 3. By the end of the Project, the number of the participants who received the local staff training reaches to 1,000. 4. Official documents of GDC gives Working Groups the status of instructors of on-the-spot training. 			
(2) Achievement of Output			
The achievement level of Output 1 is high enough with success in the development and revision of Activity plans.			
Regarding Output 2, draft training materials and teaching guidelines both in English and in Vietnamese have successfully been developed and revised jointly by each working group based on lessons learned through on the spot trainings. 400 sets of those training materials per each field have already been profiled and distributed to local customs offices. Draft teaching guidelines will be completed and be distributed to prospective master trainers before completion of the Project.			
The achievement level of Output 3 is high enough through periodic on the spot training activities. In total, 17 training activities as of April 27, 2007 (6 activities for each field were planned, and one activity remaining for HS classification will be held in May 2007) have been conducted in nine sites.			
The achievement level of Output 4 is fair to satisfactory. Through a series of discussion among Japanese experts and WG members, draft sustainable training plans have been developed. Those plans will be submitted to Project Management Unit (PMU) and GDC by the end of May, 2007.			
3-2 Summary of Evaluation Results			
(1) Relevance			
The Project was found to be relevant to the Vietnamese Socio-economic 5 Year Development Plans (2001-2005 and 2006-2010), Japan's ODA Policy for Vietnam (2004) and the strategic plan for customs modernization, titled "Customs Reform and Modernization Plan (2004-2006)." In addition, the Project is in line with activities of "the Japan-Vietnam Initiatives (both Phase I & II)" aiming at supporting improvement of investment environment to Vietnam.			
(2) Effectiveness			
All Outputs have contributed to realize the Project Purpose, and thus the Project has secured its effectiveness successfully. Through experiences of the Project such as OSTs, Working Group (WG) members, who are expected to provide training to local customs officers, were expected to be successfully trained. When conducting the Project, three fields of WGs have been formed. This methodology has effected on raising ownership and responsibility of WGs, and facilitated efficient			

monitoring for improving knowledge and capacity of WGs.

(3) Efficiency

Inputs from both Japanese and Vietnamese sides have been delivered as scheduled, and efficiently utilized to realize Outputs. The Japanese short-term experts were dispatched timely to design, plan, implement and monitor the Project activities. In particular, the short term experts, who were dispatched many times as shuttle basis, have successfully realized smooth implementation of the training, monitoring of the Project progress and developing capacity of WG members. The Vietnamese Government provided appropriate counterparts, counter budget, and necessary office facilities. However, more continuous involvement of PMU could have made for smoother and better quality of the Project. The equipments and materials provided by the Project had been utilized by GDC and beneficiaries utmost. The equipments appeared to be well maintained.

(4) Impact

The Project has successfully achieved to raise master trainers who have enough knowledge and capacity in line with international standards. GDC has already decided to assign WG members as master trainers of the Customs Training Center of GDC. Therefore, it is expected that those master trainers will continue to provide training to the rest of local customs officials in the three fields, and enhance the Outputs which have been achieved in the Project. However, it is necessary to note that the GDC needs to strengthen the capacity of the Customs Training Center, which will be in charge of managing and carrying out trainings to the GDC staff by delegating authority, allocating budget and human resources, so that the Center as a key institution of providing training can continue and improve training programs and materials.

(5) Sustainability

Sustainability can be judged fair to satisfactory by means of efforts of the GDC to enhance continuity of training courses in terms of authorization, budget and human resources. It is expected that Ministry of Finance and GDC will continue to place high priority on improvement of customs administration. As for continuity of training courses, GDC expressed its commitment to sustain the effects produced by the Project. However, in order to ensure sustainability, it is necessary for GDC to deliberate and adopt its concrete plans to strengthen capacity of the Customs Training Center for continuing and improving training programs including training of successors of master trainers, and updating of training materials and teaching guidelines periodically.

3-3 Promoting Factors

(1) Factors related to Planning

The Project was well designed with four outputs, which effectively lead to the achievement of the Project Purpose. Development of materials and teaching materials as one of outputs can be good factor for GDC to ensure sustainability of the Project by utilizing them.

(2) Factors related to Implementation Process

The short term experts, who were dispatched many times as shuttle basis, have successfully established good relationship between experts and WG members, and have realized smooth implementation of the training, monitoring of the Project progress and developing capacity of WG members.

3-4 Hampering Factors

(1) Factors related to planning

The Project has conducted a lot of activities in various sites (9 sites) in Vietnam as well as receiving dozens of the Japanese short term experts while only the one Japanese long term expert stationed in Vietnam with limited numbers of the Vietnamese officials at Secretariat in the Project. Therefore, both Japanese expert and Vietnamese Secretariat had a tendency to be occupied with such logistic work.

(2) Factors related to implementation process

Because of duties at original occupation, the involvement of PMU members was rather

unsatisfactory. There were cases that WG members could not have substantial comments timely from PMU on approaches and contents of trainings, and facilitation on improvement towards the difficulties which WG members were facing.

3-5 Conclusion

According to the result of assessment of the Project based on the 5 Evaluation Criteria, the progress of the Project was generally smooth. Project objectives including each Output were expected to be achieved by the end of July 2007, and the Project could be completed as planned.

In addition to the efforts by the Japanese experts, the success of the Project was attributed to strong self-initiatives and the sense of ownership over the Project by the Vietnamese side (including the WG members).

On the other hand, it is encouraged that GDC makes its further effort for ensuring sustainability of the Project achievement and effects. It is necessary for GDC to pay enough attention to establish appropriate mechanism for conducting and improving training courses in order to sustain the effect of the Project.

3-6 Recommendations

In order to ensure sustainability of the Project, it is recommended that GDC take the following measures:

- To strengthen the capacity of the Customs Training Center which will be a key player of planning, conducting and monitoring training courses in the near future, with a concrete plan fully endorsed by the leadership of GDC.
- To assign master trainers to spend appropriate length of time on training activities in the Customs Training Center.
- To assign enough numbers of full-time staff as organizers, who can establish a better cycle of training management, including carrying out monitoring and assessment, and updating of training materials and teaching guidelines in line with international standards.
- To develop and conduct appropriate plans for training of successors of master trainers reflecting the draft plans, which were already submitted by WGs of the Project.
- To allocate necessary budget for conducting training courses and activities, such as travel fee of trainers, and for maintenance of chemical analysis equipment provided by the Project.

3-7 Lessons Learned

- Creating three WGs and carrying the activities through the team works have worked very well. The Project was able to focus its resources on enhancing the capacity of WG members, and thus they were able to develop their knowledge and skills of teaching effectively.
- Dispatching the same Japanese short-term experts as shuttle-basis has contributed much for smooth and effective implementation of the Project. Especially, close relationships between the Japanese experts and WG members were well made, and the Japanese short term experts were able to monitor the progress and improvement of the quality and knowledge of WG members.
- It is desirable for both the Japanese and Vietnamese sides to deploy more human resources when conducting similar approaches taken in the Projects in future, so that Japanese experts and Vietnamese counterparts are able to concentrate more on substantial matters of training activities.
- For more effective and active involvement of the PMU, it was desirable to assign certain staff as a facilitator attached to the Project in order to liaise and coordinate between the PMU and WG members. It is also desirable that GDC should select appropriate PMU members and establish proper management mechanism for monitoring the projects.