

## Evaluation Summary

1. Outline of the Project	
Country: Afghanistan	Project title: Basic Vocational Training in Afghanistan (Former title: Basic Training for Reintegration of Ex-Combatants)
Issue/Sector: Technical and Vocational Education and Training	Cooperation scheme: Technical Assistance Project
Division in charge: Technical Education Team, Group II, Human Development Department	Total cost (as of the evaluation): Approx. 135 million yen (second stage: 18 months)
Period of Cooperation	May 2006 – 31 March, 2008 (second stage, based on the M/M signed on 2 May, 2006. The entire period of cooperation including the first stage is from 2004, with R/D signed on 31 May, 2005)
	Partner Country's Implementing Organization: Ministry of Labor, Social Affairs, Martyrs and Disabled (MoLSAMD)
	Supporting Organization in Japan: Ministry of Health, labor and Welfare
	Related Cooperation: Dispatch of individual experts (DDR* vocational training advisors) *DDR: disarmament, demobilization and reintegration of combatants
<p>1-1 Background of the Project</p> <p>In October 2003, the Afghan government established the Afghanistan New Beginnings Program (ANBP) assisted by the United Nations Development Plan (UNDP) and the United Nations Assistance Mission in Afghanistan (UNAMA), and started promoting the disarmament and reintegration of ex-combatants through the provision of counseling, education, vocational training, and employment opportunities.</p> <p>Based on the request from the Afghan government regarding assistance for the reintegration of ex-combatants, JICA dispatched individual experts (DDR vocational training advisors) in January 2004 to start providing assistance for the reintegration of ex-combatants. In May 2005, activities by the individual experts were organized under the framework of a project, and R/D had been signed between the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA) (now MoLSAMD).</p> <p>This technical assistance project is divided into two stages. During the First Stage (preliminary stage and period from May 2005 to May 2006), seven vocational training courses aimed at promoting the reintegration of ex-combatants were implemented (554 trainees in total had completed training), and a total of 68 vocational trainers had received development training.</p> <p>The general overview of the First Stage was carried out through the Mid-term Evaluation implemented from April to May 2006. Thereafter, in the Second Stage (from May 2006 to March 2008) that was restarted based on the results of the Mid-term Evaluation, the MoLSAMD implemented basic vocational training by expanding trainee targets to include socially vulnerable people, such as returnees, IDPs and jobless youths. Specifically, vocational training centers (VTCs) under the control of the MoLSAMD implement basic skills training for socially vulnerable people and have established a system for implementing and administrating vocational training programs at the MoLSAMD. At the same time, they aim to improve the standard of living and to</p>	

promote the reintegration of socially vulnerable groups through the provision of training opportunities.

This Terminal Evaluation was implemented mainly by focusing on the Second Stage.

## 1-2 Project Overview

### 1-2-1 Overall Goal

Vulnerable people acquire vocational skills to get a job opportunity for better livelihood.

### 1-2-2 Project Purpose

Center-based vocational training system is established for vulnerable people by the MoLSAMD.

### 1-2-3 Outputs

(1) The administrative system of VTC is established in MoLSAMD and its provincial offices.

(2) Necessary facilities and equipment for basic vocational training are appropriately maintained at the VTCs.

(3) Training courses are adequately implemented at the VTCs.

(4) Training courses are adequately monitored and evaluated in provincial VTCs.

\* Targeted VTCs are as follows:

(i) Training sites under the direct management of the MoLSAMD (three VTCs): Kabul, Bamyan and Mazari Sharif

(ii) Sites for monitoring and evaluation (nine VTCs): Three VTCs of (i) above, Jalalabad, Gardez, Kunduz, Herat, Jowzjan, and Kandahar

### 1-2-4 Inputs (as of evaluation, October 2007)

#### (1) Japanese side

Dispatch of long-term experts: 2 people

Provision of equipment: Approx. 13 million yen

Trainees accepted in Japan: 1 person

Local cost: Approx. 57 million yen

Lecturers invited from third countries: 2 people

#### (2) Afghan side

Assignment of counterparts: 15 people

Local cost: Approx. 13 million AFA

Land and facilities provision: VTC facilities (officially handed over from Japanese side to the MoLSAMD in May 2006)

PCIU Office (including offices for Japanese experts)

## 2. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team

Leader: Mr. Motoharu Watanabe, Team Leader, Technical and Higher Education Team, Group II, Human Development Department, JICA

	<p>Cooperation Planning: Ms. Sachiko Goto, Technical and Higher Education Team, Group II, Human Development Department, JICA</p> <p>Vocational Training: Mr. Yukio Utsumi, Technical Advisor, International Cooperation Department, Overseas Vocational Training Association</p> <p>Evaluation Analysis: Ms. Kyoko Kojima, Senior Consultant, Social Development Department, INTEM Consulting Inc.</p>	
Evaluation (On-site)	Period	<p>From October 20, 2007 to November 8, 2007</p> <p>Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation</p>
3. Results of Evaluation		
3-1 Project Performance		
3-1-1 Achievement of Major Outputs		
<p><u>(1) Output 1 (Establishment of VTC administrative system)</u></p> <p>Assignment of necessary personnel by the MoLSAMD to the Ministry, provincial offices and each VTC site was implemented as scheduled. Although much of the administrative work relating to directly-managed vocational training using the VTCs is a new experience for the MoLSAMD, the accumulation of knowledge and skills necessary for administrating training programs at the VTCs is attempted by implementing OJTs and holding regular VTC management workshops. Through interviews with experts and counterparts and VTC inspections, it was confirmed that the knowledge and abilities of allocated staff regarding the administration of training at the VTCs are steadily improving compared to before the start of the Second Stage of the project thanks to the project activities explained above.</p> <p>However, it has been pointed out that it may be difficult to guarantee sufficient implementation of some tasks at the current stage without external technical assistance. Specifically, these tasks include follow-ups for training course graduates, the development of training curriculums and materials, and financial management of the VTCs.</p> <p>In addition, although it is necessary to clarify the position of the VTCs within the organization of the MoLSAMD in order to continuously assign and allocate personnel and budgets for them, the VTC has yet to be approved as an official department in the present organizational framework of the MoLSAMD. Because during this Terminal Evaluation the MoLSAMD indicated its schedule for officially including the nine VTCs as a department under the General Directorate of Skills Development in its organization chart for FY2008 (scheduled to be revised as of January 2008), it is important to closely watch whether it is actually carried out.</p> <p>For the reasons mentioned above, it is judged that Output 1 is basically on course for being achieved according to the schedule, although there are some tasks that need reinforcement or a follow-up in the future.</p>		
<p><u>(2) Output 2 (Maintenance of VTC facilities and equipment)</u></p> <p>During the Second Stage of this cooperation period, the official handing over of the nine VTC facilities constructed using Grassroots Grant Aid from the Japanese government to the MoLSAMD (in May 2006) and the official handing over of all equipment procured including those for the First Stage (in May 2007) were completed. The facilities and equipment handed over were sufficiently and appropriately used to implement training courses as part of this project.</p>		

As for the maintenance of these facilities and equipment, it is intended to standardize the procedures through measures such as the preparation of maintenance formats by the PCIU (Project Central Implementation Unit), and instructions given to MoLSAMD staff assigned to the VTCs and trainers in charge. It was confirmed through the VTC inspections that there were no serious technical/safety problems for both classroom lectures and practical workshops, and that the equipment was generally appropriately stored.

It is also considered that there are no immediate concerns with regard to the maintenance of facilities/equipment in terms of the budgets that will be necessary for repairs and renovation on a certain scale, which had been one of the worries related to maintenance. Financial resources have now been secured through the cooperation with the RSPE (Reintegration Support Project for Ex-Combatants) which is implemented by the UNDP.

From above reasons, it is judged that the prospect for the achievement of Output 2 is favorable.

### (3) Output 3 (Implementation of basic training courses at the VTCs)

As for the training areas, based on the results of a labor market needs survey and a job opportunity survey, four trades (welding/plate work, electric wiring, computer, tailoring) for Kabul and Mazari Sharif, as well as five (welding/sheet metal, electric wiring, computer, tailoring, plumbing) for Bamyan were selected. Based on this selection, basic training courses are currently being implemented in three VTCs as scheduled. Trainees are selected mainly from returnees, IDPs and jobless youths, and the training is provided so as to benefit socially vulnerable people in accordance with the initial intention of the project.

As for the actual outcomes of the training, a total of 199 people for five trades in JFY2006 and a total of 306 people for six trades in the First Session of JFY2007 had finished training. Assuming that the completion rate of the Second Session of JFY2007 - currently being implemented - is 86% (which is a figure conforming to the past performance), it is expected that 236 people will complete training in the three VTCs, taking the total number of those who completed training during the Second Stage of the project to 744.

A total of 38 trainers - two for each trade - had been employed in the three VTCs (among them, 12 left the job or were replaced, and 26 are still employed as of this evaluation). Regarding the quality of trainers, it is suggested that their training ability is generally intermediate, judging from the fact that the majority of trainees evaluate themselves favorably in the questionnaire survey and from the technical evaluation by the short-term experts. However, the technical levels differ according to the trades, and there were some trainers who could not carry out lesson planning and class management effectively. Therefore, it is confirmed that training methods have not been standardized among trainers. It is obvious that the training abilities of these trainers have an impact on trainees acquiring level of technological skills, and consequently on the employment of trainees. Thus, in response to this problem, it is considered necessary to implement a short-term retraining session for trainers who do not have sufficient technical and pedagogical skills. When considering the retraining session, it is necessary to formulate a detailed training plan concerning training methods (particularly the utilization of teaching aids such as posters and models, which scored relatively low in the questionnaire survey to trainees) and standard skills required for trainers.

Curricula and teaching materials are being developed for all trades. Because more than 70-80% of the respondents to the trainee questionnaire answered that the quality of the curricula and teaching materials were

“favorable” or “highly favorable,” it can be judged that the quality is generally sufficient for basic training. However, it is necessary to continuously update them in accordance with changes in the conditions at worksites. As for the textbooks for tailoring prepared using materials made in Iran as a reference, there were requests from both trainers and trainees to revise the contents to make it more suited to the state of Afghanistan in terms of language and culture. This problem should be addressed in the future.

Support for the employment of trainees is being addressed by staff in charge of employment support assigned to each provincial office. However, as a result of the interview with the relevant parties of the project, it has been pointed out that they still depend largely on Japanese experts and PCIU staff, indicating the need for the further reinforcement of approaches related to the capacity building of personnel in charge in the future.

For reasons above, while Output 3 is basically on course for being achieved, the necessity of improving the quality of trainers, establishing a system to renew/revise curricula and teaching materials, and reinforcing activities to support employment after training remains to be addressed.

#### (4) Output 4 (Monitoring and evaluation of vocational training programs at targeted VTCs)

Exclusive format for monitoring has been developed, and monitoring activities including regular on-site reviews and interviews with relevant parties are being implemented. These activities are implemented mainly by the MoLSAMD officer assigned to the PCIU in charge of monitoring and evaluation. The report summarizing the results of such monitoring/evaluation is shared accordingly with relevant parties as well as being submitted to the PCIU and MoLSAMD. Thus, the monitoring system is in the process of being established. On the other hand, as for evaluation, questionnaire sheets for course evaluation and trainer evaluation have been prepared, and questionnaire surveys are being implemented at the time of the completion of the training course. By analyzing the results of these surveys, the appropriateness of the training curricula and the details of instructions given by trainers are checked on a regular basis, aiming to provide better training programs.

The results of such monitoring and evaluation are reviewed at VTC management workshops, while also being evaluated annually, to identify problems and consider countermeasures.

As explained above, activities related to monitoring and evaluation are implemented appropriately and effectively. It is judged that Output 4 is being achieved favorably.

### 3-1-2 Achievement of the Project Purpose and the Overall Goal

#### (1) Achievement of the Project Purpose

As mentioned in the preceding 3-1-1, the project is generally being implemented as planned. While there are some points that require improvement/reinforcement in terms of the achievement of the Outputs, it is judged that the project is being carried out smoothly on the whole. Up to now, the training has been provided to 508 people (with the average completion rate of about 85%), and the average employment rate within three months after (or later) the completion of training in the first year of training has been 63%. These are favorable figures considering the high unemployment rate of Afghanistan, and are also better than the cases of supporting projects by other donor organizations. Because tasks related to the administration of these training

courses are being implemented by MoLSAMD personnel assigned to the Ministry, provincial offices and the VTCs without significant delays, it is suggested that the Project Purpose of the establishment of center-based vocational training system for vulnerable people by the MoLSAMD utilizing the VTCs is on course for being achieved.

However, as mentioned in 3-1-1 above, there are some remaining issues for Outputs 1 and 3 that require follow-ups or improvements in the future. In order to ensure the achievement of the Project Purpose, it is necessary to reinforce approaches to address these issues. Specifically, the capacities and systems of MoLSAMD are still rather insufficient in areas such as the standardization of the quality of trainers, employment support, autonomous development/renewal of training curricula and teaching materials and the financial management of VTCs. Also, the official approval of the VTCs in the MoLSAMD organizational chart, which was expressed by the MoLSAMD during this evaluation, requires further close watch in the future so that the measure is taken as scheduled.

For reasons above, it is judged that necessary measures should be taken to address these issues and further accumulation of skills/know-how in the MoLSAMD be attempted in the future in order to ensure the achievement of the Project Purpose.

## (2) Achievement of the Overall Goal

As for the Overall Goal, all respondents of the interview survey to the training graduates gave “monthly income increased” or “standard of living improved” as the effect of the training. They also answered that they are “utilizing” the skills obtained through training at the VTCs. Therefore, even the provision of short-term and basic vocational training may contribute to securing a way to make an income for and improving the standard of living of trainees. If training at the VTCs by the MoLSAMD is being continuously provided, it can be evaluated that there is a possibility that the Overall Goal, namely “Vulnerable people acquire vocational skills to get a job opportunity for better livelihood,” is being achieved.

On the other hand, there are some points to consider in the future, such as the fact that many of those who completed training responded that “skills and knowledge that were not taught in the VTCs are also required [in the worksite],” that more than one member of staff in charge of implementing or administrating the training gave “the difference in the number of those who complete the training and the number of jobs” (number of positions is fewer than the number of job applicants) and “insufficient employment support services” as reasons for not being able to get a job. According to the results of these surveys, it is considered that it is important for the MoLSAMD to accurately understand the volatile needs of the labor market and reflect such needs to the selection of trades and curricula accordingly, as well as to implement active employment support activities including cultivating new employers, in order to increase the possibility of achieving the Overall Goal.

In addition, the securing of budget funds related to the continuous implementation of training programs should be an issue after the completion of this cooperative project. Because the budget allocated directly from the government to the MoLSAMD is limited, it is planned to participate in the NSDP (National Skills Development Program). In order to achieve this in a sustainable manner, it is essential to formulate training proposals meeting a certain level and to ensure the quality of training by implementing appropriate

monitoring/evaluation, and the MoLSAMD is required to upgrade its knowledge and experiences related to these issues in the future. Also, in order to continuously secure financial support not only from the NSDP but also from other supporting programs and organizations, the Ministry should clarify its skill development strategy. It is considered that ensuring the implementation of these measures should increase the possibility of achieving the Overall Goal.

### 3-2 Summary of Evaluation Results

#### 3-2-1 Relevance

In the “Interim Afghanistan National Development Strategy: I-ANDS, (2006-2010),” the Afghan government positioned socioeconomic development as one of the pillars of its development policy, and set capacity building and security through the economic empowerment of socially vulnerable groups as sector goals aimed at poverty reduction. This strategy identifies the mid- and long-term priority issue of supporting the reintegration of socially vulnerable people such as jobless youths, discharged soldiers and IDPs. In addition, Afghanistan established the NSDP (2006-2021) involving eleven ministries including the MoLSAMD and the Ministry of Education, under the objective of promoting socio-economic rehabilitation through the development of vocational education and training (VET). Through this, the country is promoting the prioritized national program of enhancing the standard of living of vulnerable people by providing opportunities for vocational training to help meet the demands of the labor and business market.

This project sets socially vulnerable people as its beneficiaries and aims to improve their standard of living by providing opportunities for vocational training. Therefore, it is consistent with the policies and needs of Afghanistan as explained above.

Furthermore, this project is positioned as corresponding to the development issue of “expanding the opportunities and enhancing the qualities of education and skills development” under the prioritized area of “capacity development for mid- and long-term development” set forth in the JICA Country Program for Afghanistan. Therefore, its priority in Japan’s aid policy is also high.

From the above reasons, it is evaluated that the relevance of this project is high.

#### 3-2-2 Effectiveness

As also explained in 3-1-1 above, the MoLSAMD assigns necessary personnel to the Ministry, its provincial offices and VTCs, and is implementing training administration tasks by exercising its autonomy at VTCs they own. It is judged that the Outputs are generally being achieved smoothly. The interviews to the relevant parties of the project show that the work experiences and know-how accumulated through such directly-managed programs are effective for steadily improving the capacity of the MoLSAMD to manage training programs. As a result, completion rates for training at the VTCs are currently favorable. 508 trainees completed the training, making the completion rate about 85%. The Project Purpose of the establishment of a center-based vocational training system for vulnerable people by the MoLSAMD is expected to be on course for being achieved within the scheduled period.

However, as already mentioned, there are also points considered to be strengthened in the future, such as the standardization of the quality of trainers, employment support activities, development of curriculum/teaching

materials and the financial management of VTCs. Particularly for the first two points, it should take a certain amount of time to implement approaches that bring sufficient results.

For the reasons above, although the project is found to be effective, some additional approaches are necessary in terms of the quality of trainers and employment support activities in order to ensure the achievement of the Project Purpose.

### 3-2-3 Efficiency

As for human input, dispatch and assignment from the Japanese side (Japanese experts, lecturers from third countries, VTC trainers, PCIU local staffs) and assignment by the MoLSAMD (staff in charge at the MoLSAMD, PCIU, provincial offices, VTCs) have all been implemented according to the schedule, and most of such personnel are actively participating in the project activities. Among them, people who received the TOT (training of trainers) in the First Stage of the project are employed as trainers for welding/sheet metal. There are also personnel invited from the vocational training institutes of Malaysia and Iran (Malaysia CIAST, Iran TVTO) to which JICA had provided assistance in the past as third-country lecturers. By effectively using the assets of past cooperative projects as such, the project realizes inputs suited to the conditions of Afghanistan with fewer logistical efforts and costs. In addition, as the utilization of the outputs and resources from the First Stage, there was also the reuse of curricula (for welding/sheet metal, with some parts updated in accordance with the project), as well as the use of information on employers in employment support activities.

As for facilities and equipment, VTC facilities constructed by the Grassroots Grant Aid of Japanese embassy and virtually all equipment procured in the First Stage are being utilized continuously, representing an effective input using the existing resources. Also in terms of project costs, costs borne by the Japanese side (training expenses, transportation fees of trainees and trainers, trainers' salaries, etc.) and by MoLSAMD side (salaries of personnel assigned to the Ministry, fixed assets tax and light, fuel and water expenses of facilities used, daily allowances and travel expenses paid to MoLSAMD staff when holding workshops, etc.) are all distributed without delay or excess/deficiency.

Furthermore, in this project, cooperation with the UNHCR, JICA-MRRD (Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development) joint project on supporting rural development (implemented at Bamyan), ESC (Employment Service Center) and NGOs involved in vocational training (provide project information to get trainees introduced, etc.) is also taking place, resulting in the effective/efficient identification of trainees who have a strong need for the training provided by this project.

As such, with inputs effectively utilizing existing resources available being implanted basically as planned, the desired Outputs are being achieved in general. It can be judged that the project has been implemented efficiently.

### 3-2-4 Impacts

Those who completed the training and started working in jobs consistent with the trade they were trained for account for about 70%. As mentioned above, according to the survey on the employment situation, the employment rate three months after starting work is also as high as 63%. Thus, the outcome of the training is favorable in general. Also, according to the results of on-site interviews with trainees, all the respondents



answered favorably to the questions about an increase in income and the improvement of standard of living following the training. From these facts, it can be judged that the provision of center-based basic vocational training over a short term by the MoLSAMD is effective in securing a way to make an income for and improving the standard of living of socially vulnerable people. It is expected that the Overall Goal will be achieved by continuing the management system of the training that had been established in the project.

In order to achieve the Overall Goal, it is important to update training contents and strengthen employment support activities to meet the needs of the labor market. Further establishment of the system and accumulation of know-how is desirable.

In addition, as a wider effect of the project, it is noteworthy that there were opinions such as “I gained confidence with myself” or “I was able to find my *raison d’etre* in the community” from those who completed training as a result of acquiring knowledge/skills, or consequently obtaining employment. These opinions show that the acquisition of skills may not only bring economic benefits but may also have positive social/mental effects, so this was a positive impact that was unexpected.

### 3-2-5 Sustainability

In terms of the policy/institutional aspect, the sustainability of the project is expected from the fact that supporting socially vulnerable people is one of highly prioritized important issues for the Afghan government, and that the future continuation of support to vulnerable people through vocational training projects by the MoLSAMD is expressed at the higher level of the Ministry.

In terms of the organizational aspect, while the MoLSAMD assigns necessary personnel to the Ministry, provincial offices and VTCs, there is a problem that the official position of nine VTCs within the MoLSAMD, which serves as a premise for sustainable/stable assignment of personnel and allocation of budgets in the future, is yet to be defined. Approval in the organizational chart for FY2008 mentioned in this evaluation is much awaited.

In terms of the financial aspect, securing financial resources for the implementation and management of training programs is an issue to be addressed by the MoLSAMD, which has large restrictions on budgets secured on its own. As for FY2007/2008, funding from the NSDP has virtually been decided (currently at the stage of negotiating the contract). In order to further ensure the continuous participation in this scheme, it is necessary to achieve steady results for the programs implemented in FY2008, and to formulate training proposals for the following term based on such results. In the future, it is necessary for the MoLSAMD to acquire/accumulate know-how related to monitoring/evaluation in consistency with the requirements of the NSDP and the formulation of training proposals. This may also be a technical issue to increase the sustainability of the project. In addition to this, in terms of technical aspects, issues such as improving the quality of trainers and accumulating experience/know-how related to the follow-up activities for those who completed training should be increasingly addressed.

For the above reasons, although a certain level of sustainability is expected, there are also some remaining financial and technical issues. It is desirable to take additional measures to address these issues.

### 3-3 Factors promoting the production of effects

### 3-3-1 Factors pertaining to planning

One of the characteristics of this project is that the MoLSAMD is directly involved in the administration of training programs instead of assigning it to others. Consequently, the MoLSAMD staff's knowledge/ability to implement related tasks has been improved, as well as the establishment of organizational structure be promoted, which contributed largely to the steady achievement of the Project Purpose.

### 3-3-2 Factors pertaining to the implementation process

#### (1) Factors resulting in the smooth administration of training

Under this project, VTC management workshops are regularly held for the purpose of sharing achievements of project activities, exchanging opinions on the progress of training or problems faced at each site, and providing technical guidance in terms of VTC administration. Through these measures, the promotion of common understanding and smooth decision-making among the relevant parties of the project is attempted. At the same time, the improvement of the autonomy and motivation of the MoLSAMD is being promoted.

#### (2) Factors resulting in more efficient implementation of activities

Under this project, active cooperation with other donor organizations and projects is taking place. For instance, trainee candidates were referred from the UNHCR, ESC, and JICA rural development support project (in Bamyan) at the selection stage. Such cooperation facilitates access to target people for the training of this project, such as returnees and IDPs, and contributes to increasing the efficiency of trainee selection.

### 3-4 Factors inhibiting the production of effects

#### 3-4-1 Factors pertaining to planning

No factors pertaining to planning that inhibited the production of effects were identified in particular.

#### 3-4-2 Factors pertaining to the implementation process

(1) While the training completion rate shows a high level of about 85% in average, there were some cases of trainees leaving without completing the course for the reasons below.

(i) There were cases particularly seen among returnees where the trainee had economic difficulties living in Afghanistan and returning to the countries they had been evacuated to before (Iran, Pakistan, etc.). There were also some trainees who found jobs and withdrew from the training course from the necessity of feeding their family.

(ii) Because the VTC is inside the city in Bamyan, it became increasingly difficult for some trainees who live in rural areas to continue commuting to the center, especially in the severe winter weather, resulting in withdrawal from the course. On the other hand, in the case of Mazari Sharif, the VTC was away from the center of the city and bus routes to the center were also limited. This forced trainees who live in villages far away to take a long walk to the center, and such a burden to commute affected the attendance rate of the training to a certain extent.

(2) In Bamyan, market demand dropped significantly due to the bad weather during the winter season from

2006 to 2007. Employment opportunities also showed a sharp decline accordingly, resulting in a downturn of the employment rate of those who completed training.

### 3-5 Conclusion

Under this project, training was held for five trades in total, providing basic skills training to 508 socially vulnerable people (who completed the courses). In the process, the MoLSAMD accumulated experience and know-how related to the implementation and administration of directly-managed training, and the system for center-based vocational training is in the process of being established. Those who completed training are keeping their jobs at a rate as high as 63% on average, even in the severe employment situation of Afghanistan, suggesting that the basic skills training provided by the project is providing a way to make an income and bringing actual effects in terms of improving their standard of living. Also, the implementation of training is not only bringing economic effects such as the improvement of standard of living, but is also having desirable social and mental effects in terms of the confidence of trainees and their ties with the community. For these reasons, it is evaluated that the project is achieving the desired effect and it is on course for achieving the Project Purpose.

However, as mentioned above, there are also problems, such as the standardization of the quality of trainers and support for employment. In order to ensure the achievement of the Project Purpose, additional support to address these problems is necessary. Also, participating in the NSDP scheme is assumed to be the main measure to secure funding for training after the cooperation period of this project. Formulation of a training plan and monitoring in compliance with the procedure/level required by the NSDP scheme will be necessary. In order to improve the sustainability of the project, it is considered important to aim for strengthening the ability of the MoLSAMD related to these issues.

### 3-6 Recommendations (Specific measures, suggestions and advice related to the project)

#### 3-6-1 Allocation of operation and maintenance cost

In order to sustain activities of VTCs, operation and maintenance cost of facilities and equipment should be secured by MoLSAMD.

#### 3-6-2 Assignment of staff

Necessary number of staff should be continued to be assigned for the sound management of VTCs.

#### 3-6-3 Official recognition of 9 VTCs

Since 9 VTCs were officially handed-over from the Government of Japan to MoLSAMD in 2006, these 9 VTCs should be recognized as official institutes in the year 2008 organization chart of the General Directorate of Skills Development, MoLSAMD.

#### 3-6-4 MoLSAMD's role in vocational training sector

As MoLSAMD has explained that the ministry plays a role as policy maker as well as training provider. Medium and long term strategy of MoLSAMD is expected to be created for the effective implementation of programs.

### 3-6-5 Coordination within the vocational education and training sector

There are several stakeholders in the sector of vocational education and training. Further coordination and collaboration within the sector is expected.

### 3-6-6 Collaboration with NSDP

The proposal for NSDP has been submitted and it is under contract negotiation at the moment. It is important to utilize such funding resources and to establish capacity to formulate such proposals for ensuring the sustainability of the activities of VTCs.

### 3-6-7 Training aids

Training aids should be developed such as posters, models and so on, for more efficient and effective training.

### 3-6-8 Sufficient Analysis of Causes of Lower Completion and Employment Rates

In terms of completion and employment rates, the gap among trades and sites are found. It is recommended for the project to analyze factors which have caused the lower completion and / or employment rates, so the project would take some countermeasures for more effective and efficient program.

### 3-6-9 Capacity Development of Job Placement Officers

Job placement service is one of the MoLSAMD's important tasks, and the capacity development of the officers in charge is strongly needed. It would be a good measure for the project to learn other projects which work in employment services.

### 3-6-10 Upgrading of Trainers

Technical and pedagogical skill of existing trainers is not enough at the moment. It affects the achievement and employment of trainees. It is, therefore, recommended to up-grade the knowledge and skills of existing trainers.

### 3-6-11 Extension of the project

In order to achieve the original project purpose and to ensure the sustainability of the project, one year extension of the project period should be considered.

## 3-7 Lessons Learned

Lessons learned that should be made use of when implementing similar projects in the future are as follows.

3-7-1 Center-based training is advantageous in providing intensive and organized training by using machinery and equipment. On the other hand, compared to community-based training, center-based training has disadvantage in approaching extremely vulnerable individuals in remote rural areas.

3-7-2 Setting low entry qualification of the course will lead to low possibility of employment. Therefore, it is necessary to balance the entry qualification, target group and labor market.

3-7-3 Third country experts from Malaysia and Iran worked as very important human resources to improve training courses. Both experts are relating to JICA's former cooperation in respective countries. Use of such resources which has advantage in language and appropriate skill is very effective.

3-7-4 Supplemental training program such as business skills and literacy learning were effective to promote employment and entrepreneurship.

3-8 Follow-up

Ex-post evaluation is scheduled to be held around three years after the completion of the project.