

評価調査結果要約表 (英文)

I. Outline of the Project

Country: Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia

Project title: Community-Based Basic Education Improvement Project (ManaBU Project)

Issue/Sector: Basic education

Cooperation scheme: Technology Cooperation Project

Division in charge: Basic Education Team II, Group I (Basic Education), Human Development Department

Total cost (as of the time of evaluation): 375,551,000 yen

Period of cooperation: (R/D): November 19, 2003

Four years (November 19, 2003 – November 18, 2007)

Partner country's implementing organization: Oromia Education Bureau (OEB)

Supporting organization in Japan: JICA

Related cooperation: Project on Increasing Access to Quality Basic Education through Developing School Mapping and Strengthening Microplanning in Oromia Region (SMAPP)

1. Background of the Project

The gross enrollment rate (GER) of primary education in the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia (hereinafter referred to as "Ethiopia") is 85.8% (FY 2006), with significant differences between boys and girls (boys: 92.9%, girls: 78.5%). The dropout rate also remains high, marking 20.6% for the 1st grade. After 1997, the Education Sector Development Programme (ESDP) was formulated in order to expand access to primary education as well as to improve the quality and internal efficiency, such as the correction of disparity of gender and regions, reduction of the dropout rate, improvement of the student-classroom ratio and student-textbook ratio. ESDP III (2005-2009) is currently being carried out. ESDP III is focusing on the improvement of educational quality as well as working to solve problems that could not achieve amelioration until ESDP II, such as improvement of the enrollment rate in remote rural areas, utilization and expansion of alternative basic education, and strengthening of educational planning and management capacities of Woreda Education Offices in accordance with the promotion of decentralization. Oromia Region is located in the center of the country (population: 65,340,000, area: 1.1 million square km). It is the largest region in the country both in terms of population (27,300,000 people) and area

(350,000 square km) and also has the largest school-aged population. However, the GER of the region remains at the national average rate and it is important to improve the GER of this region in order to raise the national average GER in the future.

Based on the aforementioned state, the Ethiopian government requested the government of Japan to develop a model for community-based school through the cooperation of the local educational administration and the community, as well as support to strengthen the planning/implementing capacities of involved local educational administrative officials. In response to the request, the Community-Based Basic Education Improvement Project (ManaBU Project) is being implemented from November 2003 in nine targeted districts (woredas).

2. Project Overview

In the targeted three zones and nine woredas in remote rural areas, sustainable models for community-based school planning, construction and management will be formulated while improving the capabilities of the Oromia Education Bureau (OEB) and the Woreda Education Office (WEO), by way of actually planning/constructing/managing the 20 primary schools (lower primary education, G1-4) as an experiment.

(1) Overall Goal

- The school-aged population of the selected woredas has better access to basic education.
- The ManaBU model is applied in the selected woredas.

(2) Project Purpose

The ManaBU model is developed in the selected woredas.

(3) Outputs

1. The capacity of the WEO personnel in planning and management related to the construction and operation of the ManaBU schools is strengthened.
2. The ManaBU schools are constructed and an educational environment is established in the selected woredas.
3. The constructed ManaBU schools are managed and maintained in partnership with the WEO and communities.
4. The trained teaching staff provide quality-ensured basic education to the students enrolled in the ManaBU schools.

(4) Inputs (as of the time of evaluation, including some that are already defined)

Japanese side:

Long-term expert: 5 people

Equipment: 26,712,000 yen

Short-term expert: 4 people

Trainees received: 12 people

Ethiopian side:

Counterpart: 11 people (regions)

Local cost: salaries to counterparts,

9 people (zones)

per-diem allowances for business trips,

19 people (woredas)

provision of offices for the Project

39 people in total

II. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team	Leader	Atsushi MATACHI	Senior Advisor, Institute for International Cooperation, JICA
	Education evaluation	Hikomichi MORISHITA	Basic Education Team II, Group I, Human Development Department, JICA
	Evaluation planning	Yumiko YAMAKAWA	Project Formulation Advisor, JICA Ethiopia Office
	Evaluation analysis	Satoru TAKAHASHI	Senior Researcher, IMG Corporation
Period of Evaluation	of	June 24, 2007 – July 13, 2007	Type of Evaluation: Terminal Evaluation

III. Results of Evaluation

1. Confirmation of Performances (Current Status of Achievement of the Project)

(1) Achievements

(i) The capacity of the WEO personnel in planning and management related to the construction and operation of the ManaBU schools is strengthened.

- The WEO personnel are increasing their knowledge, skills and experiences through Project activities, and are obtaining planning and management methods through cooperation with the community. The same can be said of the OEB personnel.

- The planning guideline (third draft) was prepared and is currently revised. Additional information is necessary in order to make it even easier to use, so it will take more time for the completion of work. Before completion of the Project, it is necessary to formulate a practical and easy-to-use guideline conducive for further dissemination, which is officially approved by the OEB.

(ii) The ManaBU schools are constructed and an educational environment is established in the selected woredas.

- The ManaBU Project built a school fulfilling the lower cost version of building standards stipulated by the Ministry of Education, spending 140,000 – 170,000 birr (90,000 – 130,000 birr are borne by the government and 40,000 – 60,000 birr are borne by the community). The community provided unskilled labors and materials that are locally available.

2005	Financial aid through the Project (90,000 – 110,000 birr)	Cost borne (contributions made) by the community (60,000 birr)
2006	Financial aid through the Project (100,000 – 130,000 birr)	Cost borne (contributions made) by the community (40,000 birr)

Note: The financial aid through the Project does not include the cost for purchasing furniture (mainly desks and chairs) (35,000 – 55,000 birr).

- As of July 2007, 18 schools were opened in the selected woredas (including schools for which the construction work is unfinished). There are also two schools under construction by the OEB using the ManaBU model, and the construction work was scheduled to be finished by September 2007.

- The construction guideline (third draft) was prepared and is currently revised. Additional information is necessary in order to make it even easier to use, so it will take more time for the completion of work. Before completion of the Project, it is necessary to formulate a practical and easy-to-use guideline conducive for further dissemination, which is officially approved by the OEB.

(iii) The ManaBU schools constructed are managed and maintained in partnership with the WEO and communities.

- The community members learned how to keep books and raise funds through the planning and construction process. The Project also implemented training workshops on site selection and prior admission registration.

- The ManaBU schools are maintained in generally favorable conditions.

- The management guideline is incomplete. Because the OEB had already formulated the school management guideline in the Oromia Region (Green Book), it was decided to change the policy for formulating the management guideline in this project and to prepare a Reference Book supplementing the Green Book.

(iv) The trained teaching staff provide quality-ensured basic education to the students enrolled in the ManaBU schools.

- The ManaBU schools implement induction training, in-service teacher training and head teacher training. Textbooks are purchased by and distributed to five schools (2005) through the Project and thirteen schools (2006) through the OEB.
- The dropout rate at ManaBU schools is favorable in many cases, around 2-8% compared to more than 20% in average schools in the Oromia Region.

(2) Project Purpose (The ManaBU model is developed in the selected woredas.)

- The ManaBU model is one of the effective measures helping the WEO to plan, construct and manage schools in cooperation with the community. The development of the model is mostly finished in the selected woredas, and its effectiveness is also being verified. However, while the planning/construction part is nearly finished, the management part has still to be developed.

- There are two important factors for the construction part of the ManaBU model as shown in the table below. One is a community-based approach (method) supported by the government. Another is the building standards of schools, which are the same as the low cost standard building stipulated by the Ministry of Education (MOE).

	ManaBU Model Characteristics	Application of the ManaBU model (Actual utilization pattern)
Approach (method)	Cooperation between the government and the community	While there is a close partnership between the government and the community, the ratio of cost sharing between the two parties may be different according to the cases.
Building standards	Low cost standard by the Ministry of Education (MOE)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - The quality of schools constructed based on the lower cost version standards of the MOE is good. - Modification is necessary for further durability. - Because the construction is too expensive and unaffordable for the WEO and the community, it seems to be difficult for them to handle the construction costs all by themselves.

<Characteristics of the ManaBU model>

(1) Cooperation between the government and the community

The ManaBU model is a government-supported and community-based approach through the stages of planning, construction and management. It is necessary for both

the government and the community to be actively involved in all stages and to work jointly. Although the degree of involvement by the administration and the community changes according to the actual status, cooperation between the two is the premise of this model and it does not work without the participation of both.

(2) High-quality and cost-effective school construction fulfilling the building standards stipulated by the MOE

Building construction of the ManaBU schools conforms to the lower cost version of the building standards stipulated by the MOE. As long as the ManaBU building guideline is applied, the minimum level for the facility is ensured. Compared to other low-quality schools constructed only by communities, the ManaBU schools are carefully designed so as to hold down long-term maintenance costs as much as possible.

<Comparison of ManaBU schools and other schools>

	School constructed by the government	ManaBU school	School constructed by the community
Stakeholder	Government only	The government and the community	Community only
School building quality	High-quality and durable (MOE standards)	Good quality and durable (MOE standards)	Low-quality in general
Cost	High	Reasonable	Low

(3) Overall Goal

(1) The school-aged population of the selected woredas has better access to basic education.

The school-aged population's access is being improved. However, it is considered that the improvement is not only attributable to the implementation of this Project but is also based on other various factors.

(2) The ManaBU model is applied in the selected woredas.

There are cases where the government and the community expanded classrooms of three existing ManaBU schools using the ManaBU approach (without the support of this Project). In addition, at least two new primary schools in the Chiro Woreda are being constructed using the ManaBU approach (without the support of this Project).

(Super Goal)

(1) The school-aged population of the Oromia Region has better access to basic education.

Access to basic education is being improved. However, the improvement is not only attributable to the implementation of this Project but is also based on various other factors.

(2) The ManaBU model is applied in other woredas in the Oromia Region.

The Japanese Embassy is supporting the construction of four primary schools using the ManaBU model in four woredas in the Arsi Zone (that are not covered by this Project), based on the Human Security/Grassroots Grant Aid. With lessons learned from the existing ManaBU schools, the planning and construction activities are being implemented smoothly.

2. Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance: Very high

- The National ESDP II and III and the Oromia Region's ESDP III repeatedly emphasize the importance of the construction/expansion of classrooms through the promotion of community involvement. They also point out the necessity to develop a new method wherein the communities bear some part of the costs for the construction and management of the schools. The community is longing for access to education.
- As stated in the Basic Education for Growth Initiative (BEGIN), the Japanese government intends to support the improvement of access to education in developing countries. It is also stated that the government will support upgrading the learning environment such as the improvement of primary education in rural areas.

(2) Effectiveness: High

- The ManaBU model, characterized by 1) cooperation between the government and the community, and 2) high-quality and cost-effective school construction conforming to the building standards stipulated by the MOE, is developed and verified at the woredas selected as project sites.
- The ManaBU model is effective for the following parties.
 - > The OEB, ZEO and WEO personnel obtained planning, construction and management methods based on close cooperation with the community through a process-oriented approach.
 - > Similarly, the community became voluntarily involved in the construction, planning and management of schools through close cooperation with the WEO, and at the same time obtained significant knowledge and know-how through this cooperative approach.
- On the other hand, there are limitations to this model. Considering the financial restrictions of the WEO and community, it seems to be difficult to construct a school

that meets the lower cost version of school building standards stipulated by the MOE.

(3) Efficiency: Medium (efficiency was lowered due to the following factors)

- High turnover rate among Ethiopian counterparts
- Late dispatch of Japanese short-term experts
- Duplicated assignments of counterparts to two projects (ManaBU and SMAPP) that had been simultaneously carried out by JICA
- Low interest toward the management guideline
- Insufficient and untimely monitoring and supervision of works
- Delay in the contributions (materials and labor) made by the community
- Partition of the woredas covered by the Project (increase from six woredas to nine woredas)
- Prolonged rainy season

(4) Impact: Very high (giving favorable influences to various involved parties)

<Children> Currently, 5,109 children are going to the ManaBU schools to study there. In the ManaBU schools, the number of boys and girls are about the same, and the dropout rate is lower than the average of the Oromia Region.

<Community> The communities are exerting strong ownership and are trying to improve the school environment by constructing fences and housings for teachers, and preparing school grounds, flowerbeds and school vegetable gardens. The communities have the feeling that their capacity was strengthened through the implementation process of the project, and are now aware of their strong potential. They strengthened their sense of unity and grew more confident.

<WEO and ZEO> Some WEOs are adding new classrooms in the ManaBU schools in cooperation with the community or are constructing a new school in another village (Kebele).

<OEB> The OEB gained understanding of the effectiveness of the ManaBU Project. It is emphasizing the importance of the community-based construction of schools under the Oromia Region Education Sector Development Program.

<Donor> The Japanese Embassy is supporting, in the Arsi Zone, the construction of four schools in woredas not covered by this Project, based on the Human Security/Grassroots Grant Aid.

(5) Sustainability: Medium

- Regarding institutional factors, the official approval of the ManaBU guideline is

important for its wide application.

- From an organizational perspective, it is necessary to strengthen the capacity of the related institutions (OEB, ZEOs and WEOs). In order to cope with problems such as high turnover rate, it is necessary to continuously implement training so as to share knowledge and experience.
- Regarding institutional factors, from a technical perspective, the implementation of monitoring and supervision of works is insufficient due to the lack of engineering officials at the woreda offices and the low interest among them.
- From a financial perspective, it is considered difficult to apply the ManaBU model without fund infusion from outside because of the limited resources of the WEO and communities.
- Regarding culture and society, the communities are highly appreciating the ManaBU schools and are exerting strong ownership in terms of maintenance of existing classrooms and new construction and expansion. Some communities are voluntarily trying to improve the school environment by constructing fences and housings for teachers, and preparing school grounds, flowerbeds and school vegetable gardens.

3. Factors that Promoted the Realization of Effects

(1) Factors Concerning Planning

- Technical cooperation meeting the needs of the government was one of the factors for achieving effective results. The government wished to improve the access to education by constructing a durable school at an appropriate cost in cooperation with the community.
- Technical cooperation meeting the needs of the community was also one of the factors. The community was strongly demanding access to education, but did not have schools in neighboring areas and was also lacking funds.
- It was also effective to involve the government and communities in the planning, construction and management of the schools from the initial stage, to develop a new approach clarifying the scope of responsibility and to connect the government and communities to achieve cooperation.

(2) Factors Concerning the Implementation Process

- (i) This project fully utilized local personnel. All three field coordinators allocated to each zone were Ethiopian personnel. They played an important role in promoting activities at actual worksites.
- (ii) Communication, briefings and reports were implemented on a daily basis.

Management meetings were also held on a regular basis. Thus, the OEB and WEO personnel were able to always understand the progress of the Project.

4. Factors that Impeded the Realization of Effects

(1) Factors Concerning Planning

Refer to the items to be considered in designing the project mentioned in the “Lessons Learned” hereafter.

(2) Factors Concerning the Implementation Process

Refer to the factors that lowered the efficiency in (3) Efficiency above. Also refer to the parts mentioning the change in policies from the non-formal education center to the construction/management of formal education in the “Lessons Learned” hereafter.

IV. Recommendations and Lessons Learned

1. Recommendations

(1) Activities to be Implemented before the End of the Project

- The remaining activities should be completed by the end of the project. In particular, it is necessary to complete the six school buildings that are under construction, and to conclude the guideline which should be officially approved by the Oromia Region.
- A “ManaBU Handbook,” that easily explains the outline of the Project and the entire flow of activities and which can be read without difficulty by those who are involved in Project activities for the first time, should be prepared.
- The results obtained from past Project activities should be summarized and transmitted to other institutions (MOE, donors, NGOs, etc.). A “final workshop” should also be held in order to promote the utilization of results.
- The cost borne by each stakeholder for the construction of the schools using the effective ManaBU model through the diffusion activities should be analyzed and clarified.

(2) Activities to be Implemented for Short Term After the Project

- Because the Reference Book, guidelines and handbooks are intended to be used mainly by woreda officials and communities, they should be translated into Oromo language (local language), be printed and distributed.
- In order to upgrade the ManaBU model into an even more useful one, it must be considered to diffuse and verify the ManaBU model, while utilizing external funds such as the Counter Part Fund.

(3) Activities to be Implemented for Mid and Long Term After the Project

- The guidelines will become even more matched with the actual needs if more schools which use the ManaBU model are constructed in the future and if case examples on the management of these schools are included. Therefore, it is desirable to revise the guideline on a regular basis - in intervals of two to three years - to include new case examples, experiences and knowledge based on them.
- The guidelines should be revised in order to be used for the construction of primary schools based on funding provided only by the community.
- Intend to improve the enrollment rate in remote rural areas by trying to disseminate the ManaBU model throughout the country.

2. Lessons Learned

(1) Project-Specific issues

- It can be highly evaluated that the target of cooperation was flexibly changed from a non-formal education center to the construction/management of formal schools after the Project had started in order to meet the local needs. However, it was necessary at this point to thoroughly consider (i) activities for teachers, (ii) editorial policy of guidelines and (iii) impact of changes such as building standards of schools from various viewpoints, and to officially discuss changes in the activity plan and PDM.
- It was necessary to consider the possibility to seek models regarding the cooperation between the government and the community based on the analysis of actual conditions in terms of finance and capacity at the designing (planning) stage of the Project or at the early stage of its implementation.

(2) Future Project Designing and Management by JICA

- To implement a "community-based" technical cooperation project, it is important to efficiently consider the favorable features and limitations (advantages and disadvantages) of the project in advance, and to try to minimize the risk of the community-based approach.
- Synergy effect is expected for simultaneously implementing different schemes (such as technical cooperation-type projects and development study) and to share counterparts among them. However, there were cases where the interest and investment of the counterpart institution side dispersed, or the differences in the payment of per diem and accommodation fees and in the process of using consultants caused confusion. When implementing more than one JICA project to the same counterpart institutions at the same time, it is necessary to thoroughly consider the advantages and disadvantages of

implementing the projects simultaneously.