

Summary of Evaluation

1. Outline of the Project	
Country: Malaysia	Project Name: The Project for the Capacity Building of the National Institute of Occupational Safety and Health (NIOSH) in the Field of Occupational Safety and Health (OSH)
Sector : Social Security	Type of project: Technical Cooperation Project
Section in charge: Human Development Department	Total Cost: (not mentioned in the terminal evaluation report)
Period of Cooperation	15 November 2000~ 14 November 2005 (5years)
	Partner Country's Related Organization: Department of Occupational Safety and Health (DOSH), Ministry of Human Resource Supporting Organizations in Japan: Ministry of Health, labor, and Welfare, Japan Industrial Safety and Health Association (JISHA)
Related cooperation: Project for Improving OSH Administration (2007 - 2010)	
1-1 Background of the Project	
<p>Malaysia has been achieving rapid economic development since the 1980s. On the other hand, there has been a concern on the increase in the occupational accident and disease. In the 7th National Plan (1996-2000), expansion of occupational safety and health program and strengthening of the function of NIOSH are mentioned. The strengthening of NIOSH are continuously focused in the 8th National Plan (2001-2005).</p> <p>Under this situation, the Government of Malaysia requested the implementation of a technical cooperation project to the Government of Japan on enhancing training and research functions of NIOSH to improve the occupational safety and health in the government organizations, private companies and factories. Based on the request, the technical cooperation "The Project for the Capacity Building of the National Institute of Occupational Safety and Health (NIOSH) in the Field of Occupational Safety and Health (OSH)" was launched in November 2005 with the project period of 5 years.</p>	
1-2 Overview of the Project	
(1) Overall Goal	
Trend of occupational accidents and diseases in industries is decreased	
(2) Project Purpose	
Capacity (technical support, human resource development, collection and dissemination of information) of NIOSH is upgraded	
(3) Output	
<Capacity of technical support>	
1. Methods on working environment control are acquired	
2. Preventive measures on occupational and work related diseases are developed	
3. The system for work control from ergonomic viewpoint is improved	
<Capacity of human resource>	
4. OSH training program and research and development activities are improved	
<Capacity of public information>	
5. Function of collection and dissemination of information for raising of awareness on safety and health are improved	
6. Function for providing necessary information for policy development is strengthened	
(4) Input	
<u>Japanese Side:</u>	
Long-term experts	9 persons Equipment: Appr. 160 million yen (FY2000 - 2005)
Short-term experts	37 persons Local Cost : Appr. 34 million yen (FY 2000 - 2005)
Training in Japan	30 persons
<u>Malaysian Side:</u>	
Counterpart:	60 persons Local Cost: Appr. 350,000 Ringit
Land and Facilities:	Office space in NIOSH

2. Evaluation Team

Evaluator	Takehiro Iwaki, IC Net Asia Co., Ltd	
Period of Field Study	9 February 2009 – 30 June 2009	Type of Evaluation: Ex-Post Evaluation

3. Achievement after the Completion of the Project

3-1 Achievement of Project Purpose

- Indicator 1: Number of handbooks and guideline on OSH management prepared directly or in cooperation with other organizations
- Indicator 2: Number of health check and measurement on working environment conducted by NIOSH
- Indicator 3: Results and contents of technical advice about the improvement of working environment and etc.
- Indicator 4: Number of NIOSH training courses and guidelines on proper use of respirators
- Indicator 5: Number of employers and employees received educational training, and contents of educational training
- Indicator 6: Improvement on quality of information on the occupational accidents and diseases, and number of access
- Indicator 7: Evaluation of employers and employees for NIOSH
- Indicator 8: Number of research and development projects conducted by JICA-NIOSH project

The terminal evaluation confirmed the achievement of the project purpose with the achievements of each indicator mentioned above. In the ex-post evaluation study, it was found that activities related to the indicators of the project purpose have been continued. It is fair to say that the enhanced function of NIOSH supported by the project has been maintained.

3-2 Achievement of Overall Goal

- Indicator 1: Decrease of occupational accident rates
- Indicator 2: Decrease of occupational disease rates

As can be seen in the table below, number of occupational accidents has been decreasing in Malaysia. On the other hand, number of occupational disease has been increasing. However, this increase is considered as the result of increase in the reporting of the occupational disease due to the strengthening of the regulations by the government. The result of interviews with concerned personnel during the study indicates that actual condition of the occupational disease has been in the improving trend.

<Trend of occupational accidents >

	02	03	04	05	06	07	08
Number of active employees* ¹	4068757	4426569	4567365	4882953	5454797	5450943	6034756
Number of industrial accidents* ²	63423	57589	52304	43885	40617	38657	36405
Number of accidents per 10,000 active employee	156	126	115	90	74	71	60

*1: not including foreign employees *2: not including the commuting accidents

Data: SOCSO

<Trend of occupational disease>

	02	03	04	05	06	07	08
SOCSO data	216	189	185	194	263	339	N/A
DOSH data	-	147	303	451	362	546	563

SOCSO data: number of cases of the compensation payment

DOSH data: number of cases reported by occupational doctors

3-3 Utilization of recommendations from the terminal evaluation study

At the terminal evaluation, following recommendations to NIOSH were made. The progress on each recommendation is summarized below.

Recommendation 1: Capacity building of NIOSH in terms of research and development

Although research activities by NIOSH have been continued, the necessity for further strengthening of research activity has been recognized by the staff of NIOSH and related organizations. NIOSH reorganized its structure after the project to strengthen research and consulting services.

Recommendation 2: Capacity building on data collection

Although information is shared well between NIOSH and other related organizations in the field of OSH, information management system in the field of OSH has not been established. As more close coordination among DOSH, NIOSH, and SOCSO is planned in the "OSH Master Plan 2010-2015," future progress on the information management system is expected.

Recommendation 3: Completion of preparing Standard Operation Procedure for the equipment

Standard Operation Procedure for the testing equipment has been completed. Industrial hygiene laboratory of NIOSH was certified for ISO 17025 after the project, which is an international standard for the laboratory management.

Recommendation 4: Follow-up to the participants of the NIOSH training

OSH Forum on the NIOSH website has been updated and used. Besides the OSH Forum, although not systematically done, NIOSH has been conducting follow-up activities to the clients.

The terminal evaluation also pointed out importance of strengthening OSH administration in order to respond to the problems remained in the field of OSH, such as reporting system for industrial accidents, and approach to the small and medium enterprises. Accordingly, JICA's technical cooperation project "Project for Improving OSH Administration (2007-2010)" has been designed and implemented by DOSH. NIOSH has been involved in the project as a member of Joint Coordinating Committee (JCC) of the project.

4. Result of the Evaluation

4-1 Summary of the Evaluation Result

(1) Confirmation of Relevance

Relevance of the project implementation is considered high as assessed at the time of the terminal evaluation. With the increase in the awareness on OSH in the industries, needs to the services provided by NIOSH have been expanding. It is fair to say that the contents and timing of the project were appropriate.

(2) Confirmation of Effectiveness

The result of the terminal evaluation on the effectiveness was considered appropriate with the confirmation of the progress of each output and achievement of the indicators of the project purpose. The project purpose was achieved and NIOSH has been sustaining the functions strengthened during the project. It is judged that the effectiveness of the project was high.

(3) Confirmation of Efficiency

The efficiency of the project implementation is considered high as assessed at the time of the terminal evaluation.

(4) Impact

<Achievement of the Overall Goal>

The number of occupational accidents has been decreasing year by year. Regarding the occupational disease, although the number of reported occupational disease has been increasing, the information provided by concerned personnel indicates that actual situation on the occupational disease has been rather improving. It is hard to show concrete evidence of the direct contribution of the project to the decrease in the occupational accidents and disease. Although the results of the evaluation study give some clues on the contribution of the NIOSH to the decrease in occupational accidents and diseases in Malaysia, concrete evidences, which show the direct contribution of the project to the Overall Goal were not confirmed during this ex-post evaluation study.

Numbers of training, seminar, and other activities conducted by NIOSH have been increasing steadily. Among the activities, increase in the number of training conducted under the Safety Passport System is noteworthy. NIOSH has been contributing to the promotion of OSH in the small and medium enterprises, which have more difficulties to promote OSH at the workplace due to limited manpower and financial capability.

<Other Impacts>

NIOSH continues to conduct training courses for occupational health personnel and competency courses, which were identified as the impacts of the project at the time of the terminal evaluation, to contribute to fostering the human resource in the field of OSH. The contribution of NIOSH on promotion of OSH, expansion of human resource through the establishment of graduate courses in cooperation with the university, and policy formation in the field of OSH are also recognized as other positive impacts of the project.

From the different viewpoint, many of the ex-counterparts of the project who joined petrochemical companies and consulting firms are still working in the field of OSH. This has brought a negative impact to NIOSH as brain-drain and more competition, however, it can also be said that these persons have been contributing to the field of OSH. This issue can be recognized as another impact of the project. Negative impact of the project was not identified during the ex-post evaluation study.

(5) Sustainability

The sustainability of the project effect is considered high. As the role and importance of NIOSH in the field of OSH is described in the "OSH Master Plan 2010-2015," NIOSH, as a national institute, is expected to lead the training, research and promotion activities. It is fair to say that NIOSH has sufficient organizational capacity to provide variety of services in the field of OSH with increasing number of staff and branches. It is also noted that NIOSH has expanded the field of activities to the training for overseas countries.

It can be said that activities on R&D in the field OSH has not been sufficiently conducted by NIOSH. Although the necessity of R&D to provide quality and needs-based services in the long run has been recognized, heavy burden on conducting training programs and shortage of middle and senior staff have constrained NIOSH to strengthen R&D activities.

With the expansion of services, income of NIOSH has been increasing steadily. The financial status of NIOSH is also considered stable. As the competition with private companies has been getting severe, further efforts are necessary to enhance the competitiveness through the analysis of cost structure, comparison of quality and price of services with private companies and other measures.

4-2 Promoting Factors

With the increase in the awareness on OSH by the industries, needs on OSH services have been enhanced. This has been the foundation of the expansion and sustenance of the services provided by NIOSH.

NIOSH has the organizational strengths as a national institute, such as credibility and financial foundation. These strengths were well combined with knowledge, skill, and equipment brought by the project to create and provide services based on the needs of the industry.

NIOSH is an independent organization and does not have direct financial support from the government. However, NIOSH has advantages to conduct training and to sell the training material with the authorization of the government through DOSH. This kind of support from the government is considered effective to support the operation of NIOSH indirectly.

4-3 Disturbing Factors

Many ex-counterparts of the project left the NIOSH during and after the project. Although the NIOSH's functions strengthened by the project have been sustained with the commitment of remained staff and proper use of the equipment and material provided by the project, departure of ex-counterparts might have constrained further expansion of activities, particularly activities which needs highly skilled work.

4-4 Conclusion

NIOSH has been expanding its services with the utilization of functions strengthened during the project. The level of social impact of the project is considered high. NIOSH is

expected to continue to take its leading role in the training and R&D in the field of OSH in Malaysia in cooperation with other concerned organizations.

NIOSH is the sole organization which can provide technical services comprehensively from the training to R&D in the field of OSH. Therefore, it is fair to say that technical cooperation to NIOSH has been highly effective for the improvement and expansion of services in the field of OSH.

On the other hand, environment in the field of OSH in Malaysia has been changing. It is considered necessary for the government administration to further examine the framework of OSH and position of NIOSH to conduct necessary activities, including activities which need public aspects rather than profitability, such as promotion of OSH in the small and medium enterprises and R&D activities.

4-5 Recommendations

(1) Clarification of the role of NIOSH

As NIOSH is expected to take more roles and types of services provided by NIOSH are more diversified, it is considered necessary to set the direction of NIOSH more clearly and to share the idea among concerned organizations and within NIOSH. This is considered as an important agenda for the OSH administration in Malaysia. It is required for the OSH administration to maintain NIOSH as a leading organization in training and R&D in the field of OSH by providing necessary supports and cooperation. On the other hand, it is also required for the OSH administration to consider that the supports to NIOSH will not distort the appropriate market mechanism and efficient provision of services in the field of OSH.

(2) Strengthening of services utilizing the advantage of NIOSH

It is recommended for NIOSH to put more focus on the development of hi-end services, such as R&D and development of new services, based on the long-term vision, by using its advantages as a national institute, such as credibility and quality equipment.

(3) Strengthening of human resource development and career development

It is considered important to further examine the approaches to strengthen the human resource development system and improve the employment condition to sustain and enhance the technical level of NIOSH staff.

(4) Exploring opportunities of the training programs for participants from other countries

It may be worthwhile for JICA to consider supporting NIOSH to organize training programs for participants from other countries. NIOSH's advantages, such as rich training experience, availability of quality technical equipment and training facilities, and ICT capacity can be useful for development of a Third Country Training programme (TCTP).

4-6 Lessons learnt

(1) Importance of human resource development and establishment of career path at the project implementing agency

It is preferable to give consideration to the personnel system, including human resource development and career path system, within the scope of the project to enable project counterparts to contribute to the implementing agency even after the completion of the project.

(2) Technical cooperation project to a public corporation

This project can be recognized as a successful case to improve the service of a public corporation, which pursues public aspect and profitability, with the support from a technical cooperation based on the advantage of the public corporation. It is important for the donor to consider proper balance between the two sides of the support that maintaining of the profitability and pursue of the public interest.