

Summary	
I. Outline of the Project	
Country : Republic of Philippines	Project title : the enhancement of Community-Based Forest Management Program
Issue/Sector : Nature Conservation-Sustainable Natural Resources Use	Cooperation scheme : Technical cooperation project
Division in charge : Dept. Division Forestry and Nature Conservation Division I, Forestry and Nature Conservation Group, Global Environment Department	Total cost : 549,917 (thousand)_yen Cost per participant: 約 85,000 (thousand)_yen
Period of Cooperation	(R/D): June 15, 2004 – June 14, 2009
	(Extension): (F/U) :
Partner Country's Implementing Organization :	Department of Environment and Natural Resources (DENR)
Supporting Organization in Japan :	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries
Related Cooperation Project :	
<p>1 Background of the Project</p> <p>In the Philippines, it is estimated that in 1990, about 8.7 million people or roughly 13 percent of its population lived in public forestland covering 14.63 million hectares or 50 percent of its total land area. In mountain villages, the number of poor families is increasing due to low farm productivity and poor accessibility to market. Moreover, over-logging, forest fires and the inappropriate conversion of forestland for other uses have contributed to the rapid denudation of the forest resources. The rapid loss of the forest has resulted in the occurrence of flash floods and other natural calamities that hampers social and economic development in the rural areas.</p> <p>To address the rapid denudation of the forest resources, the government has undertaken reforestation and afforestation activities has implemented people oriented forestry programs such as the Integrated Social Forestry, Upland Development Programs and Community Forestry Programs either through government funds or with support from financial institutions both foreign and local. From 1988 to 1998, the total area reforested was only 490,000 hectares or 30 percent of its targets.</p> <p>In 1995, the government launched the CBFM program to intensify its effort in addressing the social and economic problems of the upland communities while at the same time contributing to the rehabilitation of the forest areas. The CBFM is declared as the national strategy by virtue of Executive Order (EO) No. 263 and later by EO 318. The government intends to cover about 9 million hectares of forestland under the CBFM (including PACBRM) program. The program aims to ensure the sustainable management of the forest resources, promote social justice, and improve the socioeconomic condition of the upland communities. Through the CBFM agreement, local communities are given the authority and the responsibilities to manage a given forest area for a 25 years renewable for another 25 years. The development and management activities of a CBFM area by the PO (People Organization) is embodied in the Community Resources Management Framework (CRMF) and operationalized in the 5 year work plan.</p> <p>Lessons and experiences generated and the initial successes and best practices demonstrated by the program have promoted the Philippine government to further intensify its implementation. Thus, in 2004, the Philippine government requested for a technical assistance from the Japanese government for a technical cooperation on Enhancement of the CBFM program in the Republic of Philippines.</p> <p>2 Project Overview</p> <p>The project has been carried out since June 2004 for the period of five years. The expected overall goal, project purpose and outputs indicated in PDM are as follows:</p> <p>(1) Overall goal</p> <p>Conservation, rehabilitation and sustainable utilization of forest and land resources within Community- Based Forest</p>	

(2) Project purpose

Conservation, rehabilitation, and sustainable utilization of forest and land resources within CBFM areas are done by the capacitated POs on their own initiatives with support from the capacitated DENR, LGUs and other relevant institutions.

(3) Output

Output 1: Policy recommendations for the improvement of CBFMP are submitted to the proper authorities.

Output 2: CBFM planning and implementation in the pilot sites in Region 3 are developed/improved through the enhancement of the implementation scheme and collaboration model.

Output 3: Knowledge, skills and attitude of POs, DENR employees, LGUs and other relevant institutions involved in CBFM implementation in Region 3 are improved through training.

Output 4: Existing practical Information on CBFM reached and appreciated by the POs in Region 3.

(4) Scope of the Project

Profile of CBFM and the scope of the Project in Region 3

Total CBFM area	Approximately 70,000 ha
Total number of CBFM areas in Region 3	128
Project's interventions	Targets and achievements
Pilot sites	5 CBFM sites (4 POs and 1 federation)
Follow-Up Scheme Activities (FUSA)	Conducted for 12 CBFM sites in non-pilot sites
Farmers Field School (FFS)	Conducted for 1 CBFM site in pilot site (2 nd batch is scheduled in February 2009.)
Farmers Information Resources Management Method (FIRM)	Conducted three times for 2 POs in non-pilot sites. (2 - 3 more batches are scheduled before the end of the Project.)
IEC materials	Packaged and Distributed copies to 38 POs in non-pilot sites
Pro-poor Private Sector Partnership	Being tested with one PO in pilot site

II. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team

< Japanese side >

No	Name	Assignment	Position	Organization
1	Kenichi TAKANO	Leader	Executive Technical Advisor to the Director General, Global Environment Department	Global Environment Department, JICA
2	Kazuhiro GOSEKI	Forest Management	Protection Forest System Coordinator	Forest Conservation Division, Forestry Agency
3	Kaneyasu IDA	Evaluation Analysis	Senior Consultant, Human and Social Development Partnership	Inter-works Co., Ltd.
4	Kazunobu SUZUKI	Evaluation Planning	Staff	Forestry and Nature Conservation Division, Global Environment Department, JICA

< Philippine side >

No	Name	Assignment	Position	Organization
1	Ma. Lourdes G. Ferrer	Leader	Director	Project Operations and Management Services, Foreign Assisted and Special Projects Office, DENR
2	Gloria S. Arce	Alternate Member	Chief	Project Monitoring and Evaluation Division, Foreign Assisted and Special Projects Office, DENR

	3	Juliet U. Texon	Member	Chief	Project Development and Evaluation Division, Planning and Policy Office, DENR
	4	Nonito M. Tamayo	Member	Officer-in-Charge	Natural Forest Management Division, Forest Management Bureau, DENR
Period of Evaluation	12 January — 29 January, 2009			Type of Evaluation : Terminal	
III. Results of Evaluation					
1. Summary of evaluation results					
1.1 Relevance					
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Poverty alleviation is the priority policy in the Republic of the Philippines and CBFM is an instrument to uplift the economic conditions of the poor. The Project aims at reducing poverty through CBFM activities. ■ The Government of the Philippines has promoted CBFM as a means of involving the people in uplands in forest management in a sustainable manner and providing opportunities to improve their livelihood. The Project's objective of enhancing CBFM is clearly in line with the Government policy. ■ The overall strategy of the Project is to capacitate such implementing agencies as DENR and LGUs and people's organizations while the Project would help DENR improve institutional development of the existing CBFM framework and facilitate the implementation of CBFMP. This strategy per se is logical and valid. Yet, the implementation strategy or scenario was not elaborated at the planning stage of the Project. This made the Project difficult to set clear goals and prioritize components in view of expected, final outcomes in the course of project implementation. ■ Activities in the pilot sites were selected and conducted based on the 5YWP that had been developed in a participatory manner by respective POs. Topics of training and IEC materials were identified based on training needs survey, and communication survey to POs. Therefore, all the field activities of the Project properly reflected the needs of the PO members. ■ The Project selected 5 CBFM sites as its target Pilot sites, accounting for nearly 5% of the CBFM sites in Region 3. The number of the CBFM sites is adequate for pilot activities. The Project also organized training and disseminated information on livelihood improvement activities to active 55 POs (43% of all POs) in Region 3. The size of the targets is also sufficient to quantify the effects of these activities. 					
1.2 Effectiveness					
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Effectiveness in accordance with the PDM 					
(1) Output 1					
<p>Policy recommendations for the improvement of CBFMP are submitted to the proper authorities.</p> <p>The Project has already submitted three recommendation papers. The recommendation paper on land tenure conflicts has been drafted. The recommendation paper on the CBFM implementation framework will be completed by the end of the Project. This component is expected to produce all the outputs indicated in the PDM before the end of the Project.</p>					
(2) Output 2					
<p>CBFM planning and implementation in the pilot sites in Region 3 are developed/improved through the enhancement of the implementation scheme and collaboration model.</p> <p>As indicated in the PDM, 4 of 5 the POs in the pilot sites have already developed or revised their CRMP and 5 Year plan through participatory planning processes. 4 of 5 pilot sites formed and institutionalized TWG. (One PO did not form TWG, but has collaboration partnership with LGU and a university.) As for agroforestry and conservation activities, 4 PO sites implemented agroforestry plantation covering more than 10% of their CBFM area. (1 PO opted for forest fire management for the conservation and protection of their CBFM area.) In addition, each PO conducted their prioritized activities such as mushroom production, construction of upland water system, agrosilvopastoral project and re-organization and activation of PO. The case study report has been drafted. Therefore, almost all the</p>					

goals indicated in the PDM have been achieved.

(3) Output 3

Knowledge, skills and attitude of POs, DENR employees, LGUs and other relevant institutions involved in CBFM implementation in Region 3 are improved through training.

The Project conducted a series of training activities. The total number of participants exceeded 1000. According to the results of pre-and post-tests, 97.5% (544 participants) out of 558 participants from POs, DENR employees, LGUs and other relevant institutions improved their knowledge levels. After FUSA program, 93% of the PO members, 77% of DENR staffs and 76% of LGU staffs actually carried out their individual action plans. On the organizational level, 20 PO proposed FUSA activities after training and 12 of them have been implementing their respective activities. The draft training curriculum is to be prepared by the end of the project. Therefore, all the goals indicated in the PDM have been achieved for output 3.

(4) Output 4

Existing practical Information on CBFM reached and appreciated by the POs in Region 3.

The Project conducted communication survey in 2007 for 12 POs in region 3 (5 pilot sites and 7 non-pilot sites) covering a total of 395 respondents. Based on the survey results, the Project produced 12 types of practical information materials on livelihood improvement activities and distributed 38 active POs in Region 3. According to the FOC survey, 43% of the respondents received copies of the materials and showed good interest. Therefore, all the goals indicated in the PDM have been achieved for output 4.

(5) Project Purpose

Conservation, rehabilitation, and sustainable utilization of forest and land resources within CBFM areas are done by the capacitated POs on their own initiatives with support from the capacitated DENR, LGUs and other relevant institutions.

- All of the five E-CBFMP Pilot sites have adopted appropriate technologies through training and field activities. 42 POs (34%) out of 128 POs have adopted and/or implemented the appropriate technologies introduced by the project. Also, 72% or 43 POs of the 60 POs involved in E-CBFMP recognized membership participation in the CBFMP and PO planning activities. 82% or 9 LGU staff of the 11 staff who have changed their performance and behavior after attending E-CBFMP trainings. 92% or 26 DENR PENRO/CENRO staff of the 28 staff who have changed their performances and behaviors after attending E-CBFMP trainings. The level of participation and activity in Region 3 has been increased as per the indicators set in the PDM.
- One important effect of the Project is that the Project has devised and introduced several measures and instruments to enhance CBFM PO activities. FUSA proves to be a good method to ensure that participants would implement their plans developed during training. TWG is helpful to prepare a formal framework and environment where LGUs and other stakeholders can work closely. FIRM is a cost effective and quick extension tool that can be used to expose PO members to different types of livelihood improvement activities at planning stage, as well as motivate and mobilize PO members. Agroforestry FFS is a forestry version of FFS. It has good potential to be an extension method that can be implemented in collaboration with DA and LGUs. Pro-poor Private Sector Partnership also has potential to develop business relationships between POs and agro-businesses. DENR can utilize these measures and instruments to enhance CBFM at different stages of implementation.
- Policy support in the form of policy recommendation proves to be effective in preparing a better environment where CBFM can be further facilitated in the field. In so doing, results of pilot activities served as the basis for policy recommendations by the Forest Management Bureau.

1.3 Efficiency

(Implementation process)

As described in 4.1 Relevance, weaknesses in the formulation of implementation strategy and workflow, as well as coordination among the project components resulted in the repetition of some activities conducted under different components. The conducts of baseline survey, training needs assessment and communication survey are the case in point. In addition, unclear demarcation of tasks allocated for each team in the first half period of the Project caused miscommunication and misunderstandings among the players on some occasions. After mid-term evaluation, efforts had been made by both sides to address these problems. However, all units had to meet specific targets as set in modified PDM. Therefore, the synergy effects among the components were not totally achieved.

- The project design matrix was revised three times in the course of the Project due to the change of the scope of the Project and making indicators more measurable and achievable. However, The Project had to spend a great amount

of time and energy for the revisions of PDM and subsequent changes, adjustments and coordination necessary to cope with the revisions.

- Initially the Project listed potential Pilot Sites based on the recommendations from the Regional office and existing data and geographical information. Then, the Project selected 8 sites after site visits and consultations with the POs and other stakeholders. Screening and selection of pilot sites were done in an appropriate manner. Although screening and selection were done properly, in the process of screening, a number of active sites were unlisted due to security reasons. Also, the Project was compelled to de-list 4 sites due to land tenure issues, which actually surfaced during the confirmation of CBFM area boundaries. These factors hindered a smooth implementation of pilot site activities.

(Input/output)

- For the first half period of the Project, the efficiency of the dispatch of experts is judged as relatively low mainly for the following two reasons. Firstly, at an earlier stage of the Project, two experts in community development and agroforestry were stationed in Region 3. Because activities in the pilot sites were mostly focused on preparations and planning, it was difficult for the agroforestry expert to implement activities. The term of the agroforestry expert was terminated when field activities started. Secondly, after the mid-term evaluation, it was decided that field operations needed to be paid more attention and the experts in training and information management were transferred to Region 3 to enhance field operations. Yet, for the latter period of the Project, the expert team and counterparts made best effort to reach the set goals indicated in the PDM. The use of local consultants was effective to produce good outputs. Therefore, the efficiency for the latter period of the Project is judged as high.
- The equipment procured for the Project was effectively used to facilitate project activities, particularly for field operations and it is judged as appropriate.
- 32 counterparts were sent for training in Japan. The counterpart training was effective for the participants, particularly participants from LGUs to gain the understanding and knowledge of the concepts and methodologies of sustainable forest management,
- DENR has assigned the appropriate number and competent counterparts for the project. Their participation was ensured with the issuance of special order coming from FMB Director and Regional Executive Director. The counterparts made their best effort to undertake their designated tasks. Yet, in some cases, it was difficult for them to fully participate in project activities because they were not able to exclusively work for the Project.
- DENR has made good effort to allocate a budget for project activities. One important contribution was the establishment of agroforestry plantation in the pilot sites despite its budgetary constraints.
- As discussed in 4.2 Effectiveness, the Project has worked hard and met the targets specified in the PDM despite the said difficulties. This manifests itself the effective transformation of input into good output.
- Communication and cross visits with the GTZ project helped the Project in terms of sharing experience and lesson learned.

(Others)

- Japan Overseas Cooperation Volunteers (JOCV) assisted the Project in the fields of livestock project (Goat raising) and software development of the Project's information system.

1.4 Impact

- The overall goal of the Project is "Conservation, rehabilitation and sustainable utilization of forest and land resources within CBFM areas are promoted to contribute to the overall sustainable forest management of the Government of the Philippines". It is too early to have tangible impact on the overall goal level; however, the Project has contributed to the overall goal to some extent. The project has made policy recommendations on such issues as "logging ban", "land tenure conflict" and "complicated CBFM Implementation Framework". One of these policy recommendations somehow, contributed in the lifting of the logging moratorium imposed in 2004 which will certainly contribute to the smooth implementation of CBFM activities. The situation brought in by the lifting of logging ban together with the techniques and systems developed or tried by the project will contribute to achieving the targets of the Overall Goal.
- Although the Project is still ongoing, some positive impacts have been recognized. Some indirect impacts were

made on the CBFM policy through policy recommendations as follows:

Recommendation papers on:	Outcomes
Logging ban	The project has made policy recommendations on the issue of logging moratorium (Memorandum from the Secretary dated July 12, 2007 on “Lifting the Suspension of Harvesting and Transporting of Planted Trees/Timber Cut in Plantation Forest covered by Forestry Tenure Instruments). It has somehow contributed to the successful lifting of the logging ban, which is expected to create a better circumstance for an easy and smooth implementation of CBFM activity.
Land tenure conflicts	Based on the real case study of the de-listed PO, the Project made recommendations, resulting in the DENR-NCIP (National Commission on Indigenous Peoples) Joint Administrative Order No. 2008-01 “Guidelines and Procedures for the Recognition, Documentation, Registration and Confirmation of all Sustainable Traditional and Indigenous Forest Resources Management Systems and Practices (STIFRMSP) of Indigenous Cultural Communities or Indigenous Peoples in Ancestral Domain/Land”
Modification of the CBFM implementation framework	<p>Although the actual recommendation paper is under preparation, the Project tried to reduce administrative costs and simplify administrative procedures. As a result, the Memorandum was issued from OIC (Office-in-Charge) Director of Environmental Management Bureau (EMB) to all EMB Regional Directors regarding “Exemption for Administrative and Other Processing Fees for CBFM Projects”</p> <p>Policy Dialogue for the realization of an effective CBFM implementation policy is under way. It is expected that DENR will modify the CBFM implementation framework, utilizing lessons and experiences obtained from the GTZ, JICA and other donors- supported projects in due course.</p>

■ Field operations have also had some positive impacts as follows:

Impacts recognized:	Description
Spill-over effects to outside Pilot sites	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ The mushroom production techniques practiced by Ayala pilot site members have been extended to non-PO members residing near Ayala pilot site with support from LGU. ■ Water system is used by even non-PO members. ■ TWG which was formed in Nueva-ecija continues to support 7 POs based on the experience obtained in the pilot sites even after being de-listed by E-CBFMP. ■ Padlana Upland Farmers Association members trained in forest fire management echoed their learnings to other members and adjoining Barangay.
Initiatives taken by LGU	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ The Municipalities of Magalang and Sta. Cruz conducted re-echoing training on mushroom production after mushroom training was provided by E-CBFMP. ■ Some Municipal LGUs have allocated budget for PO activities (e.g. water system construction at Loob Bunga site and sweet tamarind plantation at Sta. Cruz site) as an extending support on CBFM after they participated and realized the importance of the project activities. ■ The Municipality of Sta. Cruz had realized the necessity of MENRO (Municipal Environment and Natural Resources Office) during the action planning with PO in Paralegal Training by the Project and has started the preparation for the establishment of MENRO. ■ The weekly sessions of Farmers Field School (FFS) has brought the close relationship between CENRO and LGU (MAO) staff, thus deepened understanding on CBFM of MAO staff who have little interest in it. ■ Through FUSA activities, the heads of LGUs have widened and deepened understanding of CBFM and committed financial support and assistance to PO's activities.

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ The first session of the FIRM (Bamboo Handicraft Making) in Alangan CBFMP in Limay, Bataan, made the LGU conducted series of follow up session of FIRM using the budget of Barangay. The resource speaker on Bamboo Handicraft Making has been employed by the Barangay LGU.
Initiatives taken by PO	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ Construction of water system improved production and productivity of the CBFM area. Therefore, members were more motivated and participated in the pilot activities. PO members in Ayala and Cacupangan have developed the mechanisms to maintain water system by using their own resources. ■ In Limay Bataan, PO instituted mechanism to secure funds for maintain ace of fire-fighting equipment provided them by the FUSA under the Project.
Initiatives taken by TWG and DENR-Regional Office	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ■ TWG supporting Loob Bunga has conducted market survey voluntarily after the training on marketing by E-CBFMP. ■ Communication survey method is going to be used by DENR for a coastal resource management project as an instrument to identify information needs. ■ After the Training conducted by the project, re-echoing-Trainings for POs have been conducted by CENROs. ■ TWG in Tarlac has expressed its intension to form MTWG (Municipal TWG) in other municipalities with CBFM site.

1.5 Prospects for Sustainability

1.5.1 Institutional and organizational aspects

- CBFM is the national strategy in the forest sector aimed at the poverty alleviation and sustainable forest management. Furthermore, “CBFM Strategic Plan (2008-2017)” was formulated and issued last year. Therefore, the Government’s support for CBFM will be consistent.
- Currently, the counterparts for the policy component closely work together and monitor progress on a monthly basis. Even after the Project, they would likely continue policy formation and CBFM related policy support if feedback from field operations is made available on regular basis. In this context, the availability of policy research fund is critical to maintain the current activity level of the policy component.
- In the current organizational set-up, support for CBFM is the responsibility of the Division, FMB. Therefore, organizationally sustainability can be ensured. Yet, organizational restructuring is planned for the entire DENR structure under the rationalization plan. The Project needs to closely monitor on how the plan would affect CBFM.
- The Project formed Technical Working Group (TWG) to support POs in the pilot sites in collaboration with LGUs. TWG has been formalized through MOA. Therefore, institutionally, the sustainability of TWG is ensured. At the field level, the TWG members expressed their willing to continue their support to the PO. The factors that would affect the sustainability of TWG are changes in local executives and their level of understanding and willingness to support TWG activities.
- CBFM coordinator is the frontline facilitator of CBFM and their role is vitally important to strengthen POs. All the CBFM coordinators in Region 3 have been capacitated through field operation and training activities. Yet, the number of CBFM coordinators is very much limited – each CBFM coordinator supports more than 7 POs. This would limit further support to POs.

1.5.2 Financial aspects

- Financial constraints continue to be a major factor, limiting CBFM activities. However, efforts have been made by the Government to make funds available for the livelihood improvements for CBFM POs. As announced by the President during her State of the Nation Address (SONA) , 2 billion Pesos have been allocated for the establishment and rehabilitation of the forest as the budget for 2009.
- Financial constraints would be a major threat to the sustainability of support functions of DENR-Regional Office to CBFM POs. Yet, as described in 4.4 Impact, collaborative relationships with such stakeholders as LGUs have helped DENR mobilize resources and inputs from such stakeholders.
- Financial sustainability of the POs in the Pilot sites is still low. Three POs in the five pilot sites have their own funds, yet only one PO in Bangkal has a profit sharing scheme for income generating activity (mushroom production). The other POs have not developed a mechanism to generate revenue to sustain their activities. Livelihood improvement activities in the pilot sites are still at a rudimentary stage, the DENR Regional office needs to continuously help the POs generate benefits from their activities and strengthen their financial capacity.

1.5.3 Technical aspects

(Pilot site)

- The capacities of the stakeholders in Region 3 have been enhanced through the project activities in planning, implementing and problem solving of CBFM activities at pilot sites. It is therefore expected that the technologies and systems developed by the Project will be maintained and further developed.
- The technologies on Agroforestry have been extended to the POs with support from TWGs. It is therefore expected that the technologies will be disseminated to other DENR/LGU staff as well as POs including other regions.
- Agroforestry FFS that has been conducted as a trial in Region 3 seems to have a potential to be extension tool for PO. The Agroforestry-FFS curriculum developed by the Project will be applicable for upland conditions after the curriculum is revised.

(Training)

- Through the Project, trainers have gained experience and teaching materials have been developed. The training strategy including curriculum will be also developed by the end of the Project. It is expected that the training strategy will be continuously implemented when the strategy is institutionalized.

(Information)

- The capacities of the CPs in Region 3 have been enhanced through the implementations of surveys, development and packaging of IEC materials and trials of FIRM. It is therefore expected that DENR can maintain the systems developed by the project.
- FIRM utilizes local knowledge and resources; therefore, it is cost effective and quick to implement. Therefore, it is expected that DENR will be able to utilize FIRM as an extension tool after the project duration. Once CBFM coordinators learn on how to conduct FIRM, they would be able to utilize it on their own initiatives.

2. Factors promoting sustainability and impact

The following is identified as important contributing factors:

- The Project's decision to mobilize its all resources and inputs to achieve goals specified in the PDM after the mid-term evaluation
- Close consultations with stakeholders and other agencies as well as case study reports based on the experiences from field operations helped the Project produce recommendation papers.
- The Project's efforts to make indicators more measurable and practical

3. Factors inhibiting sustainability and impact

The following is identified as important inhibiting factors:

- Weaknesses in the original project design and implementation strategy resulted in repetitive activities and frequent revisions of PDM and lowered efficiency.
- Incomplete delineation and data gathering before screening of CBFM areas resulted in the de-listing of some of the pilot sites.
- Exhaustive emphasis on planning process in the first half of the project period limited the implementation duration in the pilot sites.

4. Conclusion

The relevance of the Project is high in that the enhancement of CBFM is the main strategy of DENR and needs of the people residing in and adjacent to CBFM areas. Yet, weaknesses in the implementation strategy caused issues and problems that lowered efficiency. Despite this, the Project has made good efforts to achieve targets and produce outputs indicated in the PDM. Therefore, it is judged that the project purpose has been almost achieved. On impact, some of the policy recommendations have been already translated into policy. On the field level, although the scope is limited, such impacts as spillover effects of pilot sites to non-pilot sites and increased initiatives taken by LGUs to support POs in their jurisdictions. Organizational and technical sustainability is positive as institutional framework to support POs has been formalized and the counterparts have been capacitated through the Project, yet financial sustainability continues to be a challenge to DENR to support CBFM POs in the field. Livelihood improvement activities and conservation activities in the pilot sites are still at a rudimental stage, close monitoring and further support are necessary to strengthen their organizational capacity.

5. Recommendations

- The Project has introduced several instruments and modalities of field operations to enhance CBFM activities. It is recommended that the Project analyze and verify their effectiveness and incorporate them into the policy

recommendation for modification of the CBFM Implementation Framework by the end of the project duration.

- In order to sustain the current activity level of the policy component after the project period, it is recommended that DENR seek collaboration with appropriate organizations, such as research institutions, to conduct policy studies that can serve as basis for policy recommendation.
- In order to further develop cooperation with and seek financial and technical supports from LGUs, it is recommended that the regional office organize a seminar or orientation to invite decision makers and planners of LGUs, present the Project's outputs and encourage them to appropriate a budget for the conduct of interventions introduced by the Project. It would be effective to invite them to pilot sites as part of the seminar/orientation. For this purpose, the Project needs to produce documents to show the effects and outcomes of such activities as FUSA, FFS, IEC and FIRM, and other activities implemented in the pilot sites.
- It is recommended that the regional office continue to monitor progress in the pilot sites and provide assistance in the field of organizational development (e.g. management skills, accounting and financial capacity development) in the expectation that the pilot sites would be further developed to become model POs in the future.
- The role of CBFM coordinators is a key to a successful implementation of CBFM activities. It is recommended that the number of CBFM coordinators in Region 3 should be maintained or increased under the rationalization scheme and their capacity enhanced for better CBFM implementation.
- Through various training and extension activities, the Project has obtained information and reference materials (e.g. list of resource persons and trainers, field guides for the conduct of various training programs and their procedures and processes) that would be useful for CBFM coordinators, LGUs and other stakeholders to organize CBFM support activities. Such information should be compiled and distributed to CBFM coordinators.

6. Lessons learned

- A good scenario or detailed implementation strategy and carefully designed plan of operations (PoO) are indispensable for successful project implementation as well as efficient project implementation. The project planner should increasingly focus on developing a specific scenario and PoO in view of overall goals, looking into their viability, and sharing the developed scenario with counterparts and other stakeholders concerned at the project designing and planning stages.
- E-CBFMP involved a number of players and stakeholders at the national, regional, provincial, communal and field level. It was sometimes difficult for both Japanese expert team and counterparts to maintain good communication and coordination among them, particularly when changes were made in the project design. Use of a focal person who is knowledgeable about and familiar with both local situations and donor projects could be a good measure to facilitate mutual communication and understandings.