添付資料

添付資料 2-1 評価結果要約表（英語およびベトナム語）

(1)英語

Summary

Evaluation conducted by : Takayuki KOJIMA INTEM Consulting, Inc.

１． Outline of the Project	
Country：Socialist Republic of Vietnam	Project title：Project for Strengthening Training Capability for Technical Workers in Hanoi Industrial College
Issue/Sector：Vocational Training	Cooperation Scheme：Technical Cooperation Project
Division in charge： Human Development Department	Total cost：9.87 billion Yen+42.4 million USD+7.44 billion VND
	Partner Country's Implementing Organization：Hanoi University of Industry/Vietnam Japan Centre、Ministry of Industry and Trade、Ministry of Labour, Invalids and Social Affair/General Department of Vocational Training、Ministry of Education and Training、Ministry of Planning and Investment
Period of Cooperation： 01/04/2000-31/03/2005	Supporting Organization in Japan：Ministry of Health, Labour, Welfare、Employment and Human Resource Development Organization of Japan
	Related Cooperation：

1-1. Background of the Project

In Socialist Republic of Vietnam (hereinafter referred to as "Vietnam"), improvement of skill level for worker is recognized as an important issue in line with the advance of foreign affiliated firms and establishment of joint ventures. Government of Vietnam try to achieve this challenge through improvement of instructor's skill, training curriculum and facilities.

Request for technical cooperation aimed to improve instructor's management skill, and to strengthen understanding of new technology, and to develop capacity for preparing curriculum which is correspondence with new technology by means of improvement of training environment and skill, and promotion of trainer's training in Hanoi Industrial College (hereinafter referred to as "HIC"). For this request, Preliminary Study Team was dispatched in December 1997, and Government of Japan judged HIC was proper implementing organization fro the Project as a result of the Study. In November 1999, second Preliminary Study Team was dispatched and signed on Record of Discussion (R/D). The Project got started from April 2000 for 5 years periods and aimed to improve training capability for technical workers in HIC by developing and running necessary training courses. In August 2002, Mid-term Evaluation Study Team was dispatched to review progress of the Project activities and management and to discuss the policy of project operation. As a result of this Study, original plan was revised, and implementation of short-term training course which was not included into Project Design Matrix (hereinafter referred to as "PDM") was added into project activities. In August 2004, Terminal Evaluation Study was conducted and the Project was evaluated in terms of 5 evaluation criteria, and recommendations and lessons learned were pick out. In February 2009, instruction for equipment maintenance to HIC staff and study for graduates and enterprise were conducted as follow-up activities.

At present, HIC was promoted to "Hanoi University of Industry" (hereinafter referred to as "HaUI") in December 2005, and the project activities continued at "Vietnam Japan Centre" (hereinafter referred to as "VJC") which is one of training centres of HaUI.

1-2. Project Overview

(1) Overall Goal

To improve the skills of technical workers in the field of mechanical industries in Vietnam.

(2) Project Purpose

The training capability for technical workers of Hanoi Industrial College is efficiently enhanced.

(3) Outputs

1) Vocational training program adapted to mechanical industrial needs is designed at the HIC.
2) Recruitment and selection system for the Trainees of the HIC is established.
3) The skills of necessary number of qualified instructors in the above fields are improved.
4) The appropriate training in the fields of machinery processing, metal processing, electric control are established as both short-term and long-term training courses.
5) Adequate facilities, machinery and equipment for training are prepared and effectively utilised.
6) The HIC is well managed in terms of organization, personnel and finance.

(4) Inputs（as of the Project's termination）：

Japanese Side：

Expert ：Long-term 10 persons／Short-term 17 persons（494,967 thousand Yen）
Equipment ：463,222 thousand Yen　　Trainees received：23 persons (16,837 thousand Yen)
Others ：13,843 thousand Yen　　Total 987 million Yen (Yen portion)
Local cost ：42.4 million USD+7.44 billion VND

Vietnamese Side：

Counterpart ：39 persons　　Land and Facilities
Local cost ：37.4 billion VND

2. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team	Evaluation Analysis：　Takayuki KOJIMA, INTEM Consulting, Inc.	
Period of Evaluation	10/05/2009-06/06/2009	Type of Evaluation：Ex-post

3. Project Performance

3-1 Performance of Project Purpose

(1)Indicator 1：The number of short-term courses conducted, the number of participants

In the past 4 years from 2005 to 2008, short-term training course was held 179 times and number of participant was totally 2,467.

(2) Indicator 2：Evaluation of short-term training program by participants (thru interview, etc)

Number of participant for short course is stable so that it is considered that short-term training course is fairly evaluated. Ministry of Industry and Trade (MOIT) evaluates VJC highly because VJC makes a point of skill training, and corresponds to new technology, and its training program meets demand of enterprises. Also relationship between VJC and enterprises has enhanced since the Project termination. Reasons of this enhancement are considered to be VJC training program based on enterprises' demand, and VJC students acquired necessary skills for on-site training. Therefore enterprises are likely to hold good opinions of VJC.

(3) Indicator 3：The number of graduates of HIC qualified as skilled workers (at least 120)

In the past 4 years from 2005 to 2008, number of graduate for long-term training course is 676 persons for machinery processing course, 482 persons for metal processing course and 561 persons for electric control course, so totally it was 1,719 persons.

(4) Indicator 4：The number of hours lessons conducted in the long-term training course

Lesson hours for machinery processing, metal processing and electric control course are 2,550 hours in 2008.

Ratio of practice in total lesson hour is 80% for machinery processing, 74% for metal processing and 69% for electric control.

(5) Indicator 5：The number of CP personnel remains at the HIC

Among 23 persons who were dispatched Japan to attend training courses, 17 persons continue to work for VJC, 1 person works for Ministry of Labour, Invalid and Social Affairs (MOLISA), 2 persons study abroad and 3 persons retired. 2 overseas students are dispatched by HaUI, so that they will continue work for VJC after come back to Vietnam.

(6) Indicator 6：Evaluation of long-term training program by those concerned

The evaluation team conducted questionnaire survey to students (2^{nd} grade, 104 persons) about vocational training in VJC. As results of that, more than 70% of them evaluated “Practice-oriented training program and curriculum”, “Acquisition of special knowledge and skills” and “Acquisition of working attitude such as 5 S” for advantages of VJC training.

3-2　Achievement related to Overall Goal

(1) Indicator 1：Increase of skilled workers who completed the vocational training

VJC produces about 300 graduates for long-term training courses and about 600 graduates for short-term training courses for every year. Also 24 affiliated vocational schools under MOIT produce about 24,000 graduates annually. Therefore affiliated schools including VJC contribute to increase of skilled worker in the field of machinery industries.

(2) Indicator 2：Increase of skilled workers who are employed by machinery industries

According to MOIT and General Department of Vocational Training (GDVT), number of skilled workers who got a job with machinery industries sector is not available as a statistical data. So it was impossible to obtain data which measure the achievement of this indicator. As for employment statistic which published by Vietnam Statistic Office concerned, number of employee who works for metal processing and machinery industries is increasing from about 200 thousand persons in 2004 to about 250 thousand in 2006.

3-3　Follow-up of the Recommendations by Terminal Evaluation Study

(1)Sharing the outcomes of the Project internally and externally

At present, VJC receives school visit from other schools’ instructors for training program and method, and receives students from other school in training courses. However sharing measures such as training of instructors for other schools are not organized yet.

(2)Improvement of equipment management and maintenance

VJC is necessary to strengthen continuously organizing equipment maintenance structure, introducing equipment operation standards and ensuring inspection record keeping.

(3)Introduction of a proper evaluation system for skilled worker

As for qualification system of skilled worker, GDVT and related organization are developing “National Skills Standards” and target to apply it to all occupations by 2020.

(4)Importance of Practice-oriented training policy after promotion to University

VJC continues Practice-oriented training. Percentage of practice in the total lesson hour is 80% (machinery processing), 74% (metal processing) and 69% (electric control).

4.　Results of Evaluation

4-1 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1)Relevance

Project purpose and Overall goal of the Project were consistent with the policies of the Government of Vietnam “The Five Year Socio-Economic Development Plan (2001-2005)” which described that “to improve quality and

quantity of vocational training to secure qualified labour force". Also they have consistency with the assistance policies "Human resource development for growth" of Government of Japan. Relevant of the Project is high.

(2)Effectiveness

The Project implemented short-term training courses, long-term training courses (2 years) and production activities based on contract with company. Most of counterparts achieved practical skills, knowledge, instruction ability and management skill for training courses. Related persons noted that almost counterparts could implement courses independently without Japanese experts. Moreover production activities provided students with opportunity of further skill improvement. University had good management skill to assign proper counterparts and to disburse necessary budget. Therefore human resource development capacity for machinery processing, metal processing and electric control course was improved. Project purpose was generally achieved.

(3)Efficiency

Inputs from Japanese side and Vietnamese side were appropriate in terms of quantity, quality and timing. Instructors who trained in Japan transfered training outcomes to other counterparts, and developed text based on provided training materials in Japan. There is a comment that training in Japan may become more effective with concentrating a few subjects deeply than many subjects widely.

(4)Impact

1) Effect on other centres in HaUI

There are Driving Training Centre, Welding Technology Centre and Language and Information Technology Centre other than VJC in HaUI. These centres also adopted 5S (Seiri, Seiton, Seisou, Seiketsu, Shitsuke) safety measure and training management which VJC implemented.

2)Promotion of relationship with other donors

Relationship with other donors (Taiwan, India, etc) was promoted by the project experience with JICA.

3)Promotion of collaboration with enterprises

Before the project execution, VJC rarely conducted on-site training at companies. Now VJC adopted on-site training as an official subject of the training curriculum. Through work experience at companies, students can improve their skill more, and become skilful worker who can immediately work for the company after graduate. These improvements of students' skill generate number of job offer and increase of employment rate.

4)Promotion to University

As indirect impact, implementation of the Project is one of factors promoting Hanoi Industrial College to University.

(5)Sustainability

1)Organizational aspect

①Application and capacity of VJC training

VJC is one of centres under HaUI and belongs to vocational training scheme of the University. HaUI manages personnel and budget of VJC, so organization of VJC is stable. Although VJC increased capacity from 120 students to 360 students, number of entrance application to VJC is twice as many as its capacity every year. At present VJC receives about 400 students and VJC is likely to secure enough number of students for its capacity in the future.

②Job support to graduate

Job offers directly come to VJC, but VJC does not manage such data. While there is organization which is in charge of job support to graduate (LETCO), there is no linkage between job offers of VJC and that of LETCO. It is considered that integrated job support will be more effective. Incidentally about 30% of VJC students have intention to continue to study after graduation according to answers of questionnaire.

③Number of student of HaUI

At the time of promotion to university, number of student was about 270,000 in HaUI. In 2008 it is about 450,000. MOET also evaluates HaUI highly in providing both academic education and vocational training, and MOET expects HaUI to continue to offer education and training which are correspondent to social needs. However MOET pointed that rapid expansion of HaUI should be accompanied with improvement of educational environment and quality of teachers/instructors.

2)Technical aspect

Among 23 instructors who were trained in Japan during the project implementation, 17 instructors continue to work for VJC. So technical sustainability is high. Also training curriculum designed as practice-oriented. As VJC is expected to continue to improve curriculum based on needs, VJC is required to conduct needs survey. Also VJC should improve equipment maintenance.

3)Financial aspect

Budget of VJC is included into whole University budget, so that VJC does not apply budget by itself. Among total income of the University, subsidiary is about 20%, and tuition and others are about 80%. Thus it seems no serious problem about recurrent cost. Therefore, financial sustainability is high.

4-2　Factors that have promoted project

(1)Impact

Cooperation for soft component and hard component of training and curriculum based on social needs

The Project targeted machinery processing, metal processing and electric control courses. Also training and curriculum which focused on practical training were developed. Moreover updated equipment and facility for the training were procured. Consequently VJC was supported in terms of both soft component and hard component. To strengthen practice in the curriculum including on-site practice was attractive to students and had positive impacts on employment of graduates. Equipment procurement for target courses made their curriculum implementation into effective and contributed to enhance relationship with enterprises such as contract base production activities.

(2)Sustainability

Promotion to University

There are 3 categories; university education, college education and secondary vocational training in HaUI. According to enrolment in 2008, about 70% of new student entered to university education. Promotion to University was a large factor of further development of the school. Hereafter it is prospected that university education will lead development of HaUI. VJC is one of centres in HaUI and in charge of secondary vocational training. VJC is considered to have organizational and financial stability in virtue of belonging to the University.

(3)Others

In 2009, follow up activities were implemented in the field of equipment repair, instruction on equipment management and evaluation for graduates.

4-3　Factors that have inhibited project

(1)Impact

Revision of qualification system

In accordance with amendment of Law on Vocational Training (2006), qualification for skilled worker was also revised. Now new qualification system is under developing. In this reason, “skilled worker” which mentioned in PDM is needed to be redefined. Currently definition is not determined yet, so it was difficult to confirm achievement of overall goal by PDM indicators in the Study.

(2)Sustainability

Nothing special.

4-4　Conclusions

As results of the Study, positive impacts from the Project were found. As for sustainability concerned, organizational and financial aspect of sustainability was high, while strengthening of equipment maintenance was required for technical aspect.

4-5　Recommendations

(1)Necessity of instructors recruitment

Ratio between isntructor and student is 1:40 in VJC, while GDVT regulated 1:20. It is necessary to increase number of instructor.

(2)Implementation of trace study

At present, VJC does not implement trace study for graduate. Through trace study, VJC can gather information on graduates' problems and issues at the company and worker's ability and skill company required. It will be able to contribute to further vocational training development.

(3)Implementation of need survey

Enterprises conduct seminars and fairs of job finding for students at HaUI campus. However VJC does not implement needs survey. It is necessary for VJC to conduct needs survey through periodical dialogue with enterprises and to continue to improve training according to companies' demand.

(4)Enhancement of instruction to other vocational training schools

VJC training method, curriculum, course management and relationship with company are models for other schools. VJC is required to extend its good practice to other schools and to contribute to development of vocational training sector in more active manner.

(5)Integrated job support

Companies offer job opportunities to VJC directly. However VJC does not manage such kinds of job information. HaUI has a specific school-owned company (LETCO) which provides students of job finding service. If job offers which directly come to VJC were managed by LETCO in integrated manner, job opportunity is expected to be extended to graduates of other centres in HaUI.

(6)Study on transfer system from vocational training to university education

Student of VJC can continue to study at Vocational Post Secondary Education in HaUI for 6 months. But they cannot transfer to university education. Depending on diversified students demand, it is important to provide various educational opportunities for further university development.

(7)Continuous revision of curriculum

Training curriculum of VJC is highly evaluated by students, however, it is required to continue to improve curriculum according to social needs.

(8)Equipment maintenance

As for improvement for equipment maintenance concerned, selection of person in charge of equipment maintenance organization, introduction of access permission standard and record keeping for operation and inspection are necessary to be strengthened.

4-6　Lessons Learned

(1)Assistance for a model school with prospect of nation wide expansion

Activities which related to nation wide expansion of curriculum and materials produced by the Project seems necessary for technical cooperation project which focused on one prioritized school. It is considered to be effective measures to adopt nationwide expansion scheme to spread project outcomes which produced at target

schools.

(2)Selection of target school

HaUI is under direction of MOIT, and it is developing rapidly. In line with whole university development, VJC became stable organization organizationally and technically. In case of VJC, development of university and assistance from Japan grew together and produced positive impacts and sustainability.

(3)Remarks of procurement of imported equipment

Procurement of equipment from foreign country may have advantages to the project in terms of equipment specification. In case of VJC, some equipment was procured from Japan. However, not all Japanese companies have local office in Vietnam, so VJC has to contact overseas company offices for procurement of parts and consumables. Under this situation, VJC could not always procure and repair equipment smoothly and timely. It is necessary to identify after-sales service points for each equipment.