

Evaluation Final Summary

1. Outline of the Project		
Country : Vietnam		Project title : The Project on the Improvement of the Port Management System in the Socialist republic of Vietnam
Issue/Sector : Transportation		Cooperation scheme : Technical Cooperation
Division in charge : Transportation and ICT Division I , Transportation and ICT Group Economic Infrastructure Dept.		Total cost : 6.3 hundred million yen
Period of Cooperation	(R/D): 2004/12/16	Partner Country's Implementing Organization : VINAMARINE (Vietnam Maritime Administration)
	2004/12/16 - 2008/11/22	
Related Cooperation :		
1. Background of the Project		
<p>Throughput of the Vietnamese ports has increased more than twice in the past 5years well over the forecast by VITRANSS. To cope with this situation, Japan has given assistance to the Socialist Republic of Vietnam to develop ports in Hai Phong, Cai Lan, Da Nang with Yen loan. Also Cai Mep –Thi Vai port (hereinafter referred to as “CM-TV”), which is one of the biggest deep water ports in Vietnam, was proposed in the JICA study and its detailed design study was implemented by JICA from August 2004 to March 2006.</p> <p>As a result, port facilities are steadily progressing, while improvement of port management system is rather behind. However, the past Japanese cooperation had been focused on the construction of infrastructure, and it has been realized that an effective administration and management of port including introduction of non-state sector to operation is crucial for the strategic use of the port.</p> <p>At the request of the government of the Socialist Republic of Vietnam to support improving port administration and management system, this project was decided to be implemented.</p>		
2. Project Overview		
(1) Overall Goal		
Port administration and management system is improved.		
(2) Project Purpose		
Project Purpose-1: Capacity of VINAMARINE on port administration and port management is strengthened.		
Project Purpose-2: Terminal operating system for gateway ports is established.		
(3) Outputs		
1. VINAMARINE prepares the draft policy on non state sectors' participation in the operation of gateway ports & the draft plan on promotion of the gateway ports taking CM-TV Ports as a		

model case.

2. VINAMARINE drafts and proposes the redefinition of the roles (authorities, powers, etc) on port management and operation among governmental agencies, other public sectors and private sector to promote the non state sectors' participation to the operation of gateway ports.
3. VINAMARINE prepares the draft regulatory framework to promote the non state sectors' participation to port operation.
4. VINAMARINE prepares the draft plan for port administration and management with the assistance and cooperation of JICA expert team.
5. VINAMARINE prepares the draft documents necessary for the selection of port operator and the concession plan of CM-TV Port as a model case.

(4) Inputs

Japanese side :

- Expert 20 person, 137.8 M/M (July 30 2008)
- Counterpart Training in Japan 12 person
- Counterpart Training outside Vietnam and Japan 4 person
- Equipment 1 million yen
- Local Cost 77 million yen
- Others 15 million yen (dispatch of Study Team)

Vietnamese Side :

- Counterpart 27 person

II. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team	Mr. Hozumi KATSUTA	Leader Senior Adviser, JICA Vietnam
	Ms. Yoko HARAGUCHI	Port Planning Ports and Harbors Bureau Ministry of Land, Infrastructure, Transport and Tourism
	Dr. Takeshi DAIMON	Evaluation Analysis Chief Researcher, Waseda Institute of International Strategy
	Ms. Kyoko OKAMURA	Evaluation Planning Staff, transportation & ICT Division1, Transportation & ICT Group, Economic Infrastructure Development, JICA
Period of Evaluation	14/September/ 2008 ~ 29/September/ 2008	Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation

III. Results of Evaluation

1. Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

Relevance is evaluated very high.

Consistency with the Vietnam policies

The Project assists Vietnam's continued efforts in improving the seaport management system, in

consistent with the 1999 Master Plan on the Development of Vietnamese Seaport System. The Project also supports Vietnam's efforts in public administration reform and export-oriented growth strategy under the SEDP (Socio Economic Development Plan) 2006-10.

Consistency with Japan's aid policies

The Project is consistent with the "Japan Aid's Policy for Vietnam" which aims at promoting bilateral cooperation in the priority areas of infrastructure development and its maintenance as well as human resource development and institutional building. Hence, the relevance of cooperation is evident.

(2) Effectiveness

Effectiveness is evaluated high.

Achievement of Two Project Purposes

As for Project Purpose-1 (Capacity of VINAMARINE on port administration and port management is strengthened), through workshops held in this project, VINAMARINE staff, acquired those necessary skills. Hence Project Purpose-1 has been mostly achieved,

As for Project Purpose-2 (Terminal operating system for gateway ports is established.), the VINAMARINE staff has now gained necessary skill to manage task for the selection of operator using standard bidding and contract documents as well as the concession plan for CM-TV ODA terminals after necessary revisions will be made. This will contribute to the achievement of Project Purpose-2 once the CM-TV Port becomes operational.

(3) Efficiency

The input is evaluated as almost appropriate.

Quality, quantity and timing of inputs to achieve Project Outputs

The amount and quality of the inputs (human resources, budget, workshops, and trainings) are reported as almost appropriate, according to the interview results from JICA Experts and counterpart staff at VINAMARINE.

Project period is considered to be almost appropriate to achieve project purposes, despite the fact that some VINAMARINE officers have commented that they need more time to reform the port administration and management system, which is understandable because it takes time to improve the port administration and management. However, some parts of the Project might have been implemented at slightly different timing caused by the delay of the JBIC Project.

(4) Impact

It takes some time to attain the super goal

The Project has certainly increased the awareness within VINAMARINE about the needs to improve the efficiency in seaport administration and management. Some concrete achievements have been obtained in terms of promulgation of laws and decrees. VINAMARINE has also drafted a decree on management of seaport infrastructure operation, in which a Port Management Body has been proposed. This shows that VINAMARINE staff has enhanced their skills and knowledge in drafting legal documents, which will contribute to the improvement in port management and administration in future.

However, the overall goal of "improvement of port administration and management" has not been

achieved yet, since the port administration and management system as planned and prepared by the Project has not been implemented yet. Further, it takes some time to attain the “super goal” of “the enhancement of the efficiency of maritime transport system so as to contribute to the economic growth of Vietnam”.

(5) Sustainability

Budgetary allocation for additional staff will be necessary for sustainability

Institutional Sustainability

The Vietnam’s continued efforts to improve the maritime administrative and managerial system cannot be reversed and VINAMARINE continues to play a key role in this area. Some staff trained in respective areas may move to other positions, but institutionally acquired skills will remain. For that matter, the joint work of all related departments has turned out to be beneficial for the institutional learning and information sharing.

Financial Sustainability

There are not redundant staffs for any specific project, because of understaffed situation of the Government and staffs are filled with their regular work. Therefore, to sustain this project independently, budgetary allocation for additional staff will be necessary.

Technical Sustainability

As cargo volume increases, the needs for an improved seaport managerial and administrative capacity will increase. VINAMARINE staff will be required to cope with increasing demand and the chance for using the acquired skills through this Project will be increased in years to come.

2. Factors that promoted realization of effects

• WBS(Work Breakdown Structure)

In order to supervise the achievement of taskforce, JICA expert team and Executive Committee create the WBS. By using WBS, progress of the project was successfully managed.

• Merit of taskforce system

This project handles various fields which relate to port administration and management. Technical transfer and collaboration work for preparation of documents has been carried out through the taskforce composed of members from various internal departments and local offices of VINAMARINE. This method was fully functioned for capacity development especially for institutional affairs covering various fields.

3. Factors that impeded realization of effects

(1) Factors concerning to Planning

Although this project was planned to implement in partnership with CM-TV Port Project (JBIC Loan Project), several external conditions are not ready for the partnership. Those conditions are mainly a delay of CM-TV Port construction project, un-clarified perspective for the establishment of PMB, delay of selecting process for CM-TV Port operator. There are difficulties beyond the VINAMARINE’s function in some of these external conditions.

(2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

The Project aimed at improvement of port administration and management through capacity

development for institutional arrangement. In order to achieve this objective, deeper involvement of upper level organizations is indispensable because institutional arrangement can be handled by upper organizations. Therefore, this idea is shared by many persons concerned with the Project.

4. Conclusion

Two purposes of the Project will be almost attained. The 1st purpose “Strengthening of capacity of VINAMARINE on the port management” will be mostly attained. Achieved level of each activity for this purpose was first evaluated by JICA expert team and then the result of it was submitted to Executive Committee and JCC for final evaluation. According to these evaluations, most of achieved levels are shown relatively high. For remaining activities, necessary evaluation will be carried out through the same process for remaining period.

For the 2nd purpose, expected outputs have been produced, thus acceptable level of achievement could be recognized. However, several external conditions are not ready for realizing some parts of outputs. Those conditions are mainly a delay of CM-TV Port construction project financed by JBIC loan, un-clarified perspective for the establishment of PMB, delay of selecting process for CM-TV Port operator. There are difficulties beyond the VINAMARINE’s function in some of these external conditions. Therefore, it is necessary to wait for some time in which some progress may be observed. Since CM-TV Port construction work will be inaugurated soon, it is expected that selection of port operator will be carried out in consecutive manner.

5. Recommendations

(1) Short term Recommendation

Necessary effort should be made as follows:

- 1) After finishing remaining works below, a seminar for showing main contents of the Project with attendance from upper level organizations such as MOT and MPI should be held at the end of the Project.
 - Finalization of several activities for draft plan preparation for port administration and management remains to be done
 - Collaboration work with VINAMARINE staff through technology transfer by JICA experts for preparation of Master Plan for seaport system has to be continued until the end of the Project.
- 2) One part of the Project was implemented to improve terminal operating system for gateway port exemplifying CM-TV Port as a model case. In this regard, necessary step should be taken to proceed selection of port operator as soon as possible now that construction work for CM-TV Port has been commenced.

(2) Long term Recommendation

Continuous effort toward improvement of port administration and management:

Port system in Vietnam is under the control of various agencies, therefore, strengthening of VINAMARINE in this field would cause some influences on many organizations concerned. In order to realize PMB, for instance, many varieties of coordination should be conducted. Currently VINAMARINE has two kinds of idea for realizing PMB as follows;

- 1) Establishing PMB covering limited area for JBIC loan assisted CM-TV Port as a first step and extend this example to other areas.

2) Expanding the function of existing Maritime Administrations (hereinafter referred to as “MAs”) gradually and upgrading MAs in the future.

These two approaches written above may not be all. Anyhow necessity of coordination for planning or utilization to be caused by expansion of port activities in the future will probably raise challenges to port administration and management. Various efforts are strongly requested to continue toward improvement of port administration and management based on knowledge and skills acquired through the Project.

6. Lessons Learned

(1) Merit of taskforce system

This project handles various fields which relate to port administration and management. Technical transfer and collaboration work for preparation of documents has been carried out through the taskforce composed of members from various internal departments and local offices of VINAMARINE. This method was fully functioned for capacity development especially for institutional affairs covering various fields.

(2) Necessity of deeper involvement of upper level organization

The Project aimed at improvement of port administration and management through capacity development for institutional arrangement. In order to achieve this objective, deeper involvement of upper level organizations is indispensable because institutional arrangement can be handled by upper organizations. Therefore, this idea is shared by many persons concerned with the Project.

(3) Impact and difficulty of partnership with other project

Delay of implementation schedule for port construction of CM-TV Port could not be anticipated beforehand and could be recognized as an unavoidable incident. This shows difficulty of partnership between different two projects. However, partnership with JBIC loan could provide a concrete example for technical cooperation project as a pilot case. On the other hand, many important and useful documents for operation and maintenance of CM-TV Port are prepared. In this sense, partnership between two projects could produce valuable results.

7. Follow-up Situation

Follow-up is not planned at the present moment.