

Summary of Terminal Evaluation

I. Outline of the Project	
Country : Socialist Republic of Vietnam	Project title : The Project for Traffic Safety Human Resource Development in Hanoi
Issue/Sector : Transport	Cooperation scheme : Technical Cooperation Project
Division in charge : JICA Vietnam Office	Total cost : 450 million Japanese yen
Period of Cooperation	(R/D): July, 2006-March, 2009 Partner Country's Implementing Organization : Hanoi People's Committee (Hanoi Department of Transport, Hanoi Traffic Police Division, and Hanoi Traffic Safety Committee), People's Police Academy, and Institute of Training, Enhancing Cadres & State Officials of Transport Sector
	Supporting Organization in Japan : National Police Agency, Japan
I-1 Background of the Project <p>Since the late 1980S, Vietnam has been experiencing a rapid economic growth and increased motorization. In parallel, the improvement of infrastructure has enabled high mobility and velocity. As a consequence, the number of traffic accidents and fatalities has constantly increased over the last years. Recognizing that traffic safety is one of critical social issues facing the country, the Government of Vietnam (GOV) established in 1997 the National Traffic Safety Committee (NTSC) and local traffic safety committees in each province to implement traffic safety measures. In Hanoi, the capital city of Vietnam, the Hanoi Traffic Safety Committee (HTSC) was established and various traffic safety measures have been conducted. Despite the decrease in the number of traffic accidents, there still are a constant number of fatalities of more or less 500 persons per year. In response to this situation, the number of flyovers and traffic signals were introduced through the infrastructure development projects finance by JBIC (then) and the World Bank. JICA also conducted a number of technical studies and model projects in Hanoi.</p> <p>It is within this context that GOV requested the Government of Japan to conduct a technical cooperation project on traffic safety human resource development for Hanoi based on the results of the technical studies and model projects. In June 2006, the Record of Discussion and the Minutes of Meeting were concluded for "the Project for Traffic Safety Human Resource Development in Hanoi (TRAHUD, hereinafter referred to as the Project)." JICA and Hanoi People's Committee (HPC) started the Project in July 2006.</p>	
I-2 Project Overview (1) Overall Goal The road traffic conditions are improved.	

(2) Project Purpose

Traffic safety measures in Hanoi are improved.

(3) Outputs

Output 1: To establish a system for planning, implementation and evaluation of comprehensive traffic safety measures in Hanoi;

Output 2: To improve abilities of traffic policemen of the Hanoi Traffic Police Division (hereinafter referred to as “HTPD”) for traffic enforcement;

Output 3: To improve abilities of traffic inspectors of the Hanoi Transport & Urban Public Works Service (hereinafter referred to as “HDOT”) for traffic enforcement;

Output 4: To improve abilities of officers of HDOT for traffic management and road facilities;

Output 5: To improve abilities of officers of the Hanoi Traffic Safety Committee (hereinafter referred to as “HTSC”) for traffic safety education.

I-3 Inputs (as of December 2008)

Japanese side

Short-term Experts: 14

Provision of machinery/equipment: 25,409,209 Japanese yen (220,635USD)

Trainees received: 20 (excluding 9 co-funded by the Vietnamese government)

Operational expenses support: 97,530,000 Japanese yen (846,879 USD)

Pilot Project Construction Cost: 71,731,740 Japanese yen (622,866 USD)

Vietnamese side

Counterpart: 37

Operational cost: 13,907,550 Japanese yen (120,763 USD)

Pilot Project Construction Cost: 28,791,000 Japanese yen (250,000 USD)

Facilities: 2 Project offices at the Traffic Control Center of Public Security and the Building of Inspectorate Division, HDOT.

II. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team	Mr. Hozumi KATSU TA (Leader) Senior Program Formulation Officer, JICA Vietnam Office Mr. Kenichi KOBAYASHI (Evaluation and Planning) Officer, JICA Vietnam Office Ms. Kazumi SHIMAOKA (Evaluation and Analysis) Researcher, Global Link Management, Inc. Ms. Hoang Thi Tuat Program Officer, JICA Vietnam	
Period of Evaluation	20/Nov/2008~ 3/ Dec/ 2008	Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation

III. Results of Evaluation

III-1 Project Performance

-Project Purpose: Traffic safety measures in Hanoi are improved.

[Indicator]

Degree of improvement of traffic safety measures conducted by HTPD and HDOT

The project purpose is mostly achieved because the traffic measures conducted by HTPD and HDOT have been improving steadily. The actual ability of human resources

in counterpart agencies has been enhanced. It is therefore required that new knowledge is to be regularly updated and provided to concerned officers to enable them to implement comprehensive traffic safety measures in a sustainable manner. In order to achieve project purpose and ensure project sustainability, the remaining issue is to improve rational planning, implementation and evaluation of comprehensive traffic safety measures in Hanoi.

- Outputs

Output 1: To establish a system for planning, implementation and evaluation of comprehensive Traffic safety measures in Hanoi.

Output 1 has been achieved partially and will be achieved further toward the end of the Project period. Mainly Output 1 under TRAHUD aims at the improvements of planning capacity of counterpart agencies in development of comprehensive traffic safety measures in Hanoi. Hanoi People's Committee has established annual traffic safety plan which includes traffic safety and congestion alleviation measures. Nonetheless, in order to address such a current rapid motorization, it is necessary to improve rational planning and promote the development of traffic safety 5 year action plan. In addition to supports in sectors like engineering, education and enforcement, TRAHUD also helps to improve planning capacity.

- The establishment of the PMU, instead of PMC, of the Project had taken more than 4 months after the dispatchment of Japanese Experts in July 2006 resulting in the delay of the allocation of the Vietnamese counterparts, although the Vietnamese government took action immediately after the establishment of PMU by making quick decisions on budget for the Project activities.
- The development of comprehensive traffic safety plans (including Traffic Safety Plan and Human Resource Development Plan) is undertaken in the context that traffic safety situation is getting complicated in expanded Hanoi while the City Traffic Safety Committee has been re-structured under Decision 1189/QĐ-UBND ngày 09/10/2008. Therefore, completion of development of traffic safety measures in Hanoi requires more efforts and enhanced cooperation between JICA Experts and HTSC and other counterpart agencies.
- The Project planned to incorporate proposals on institutional and regulatory improvement into on-going JICA Study for National Road Safety Master Plan.

Output 2: To improve abilities of traffic policemen of Hanoi Traffic Police Division for traffic enforcement.

The achievement level of Output 2 is high. The ability of traffic policemen of HTPD and others taking part in training activities for traffic enforcement has been improved very much.

- The training curriculum and materials on traffic enforcement have been developed and utilized in training programs, which have been prepared and organized in collaboration with training institutes. The numbers of traffic policemen who attended the short-term training amounts already 359 including 130 traffic policemen and 229 social order policemen. The result of the examination at the end of the course marked high score.
- On-the-job training (OJT) through 2 Comprehensive Traffic Safety Pilot Projects and 3 CDP Projects were highly considered as an access to new knowledge and technology in a practical manner and they improved traffic enforcement and traffic accident data collection practice.
- However, it was observed by most Japanese experts that the planning ability of traffic police should be further improved in terms of fundamental knowledge on traffic engineering and experience in rational planning.

Output 3: To improve abilities of traffic inspectors of Hanoi Transport & Urban Public Works Service (hereinafter referred to as “HDOT”) for traffic enforcement

The achievement level of Output 3 is high. The ability of traffic inspectors of HDOT for traffic enforcement has been gradually improving.

- The training curriculum and materials on traffic enforcement have been developed and utilized in training programs, which have been prepared and organized in collaboration with training institutes. The numbers of traffic inspectors who attended the short-term training amounts to more than 90. The result of the examination at the end of the course marked high score.
- OJT through 2 Comprehensive Traffic Safety Pilot Projects and “Traffic Safety Inspector CDP Project” dealing with parking and noise & gas emission control was considered as an access to new knowledge, equipment and know-how in a practical manner and they improved traffic enforcement practice. Part of the CDP Project implemented in Hoan Kiem District had been developed to form a new parking management pilot activity.
- Most Japanese experts observed that the planning ability should be further improved in terms of fundamental knowledge on traffic engineering and experience in rational planning.

Output 4: To improve abilities of officers of HDOT for traffic management and road facilities

The achievement of Output 4 was considered to be moderate. The improvement degree of the ability of HDOT officers, engineers and staff including those from some companies for traffic management and road facilities, the improvement of ability had not been highly recognized.

- The training curriculum and materials on traffic management have been developed and utilized in training programs, which have been prepared and organized in collaboration with training institutes. The numbers of HDOT officers who attended the short-term training amounts to more than 86. The result of the examination at the end marked satisfactory score.
- OJT through 2 Comprehensive Pilot Projects and “Traffic Safety Standing Group CDP Project” were considered as a practical access to new knowledge and technology.
- HDOT officers had been highly involved in the Comprehensive Pilot Projects, while their participation in the CDP Project had not been very active due to the workload of other duties, and therefore technology transfer from the Japanese experts was limited.
- Most Japanese experts observed that the planning ability of HDOT’ s officers also should be further improved “Traffic Safety Standing Group CDP Project” was intended to develop the capacity of HDOT in planning, coordinating and implementing traffic safety measures. However, the further involvement of HDOT had been expected.

Output 5: To improve abilities of officers of Hanoi Traffic Safety Committee (hereinafter referred to as “HTSC”) for traffic safety education

Output 5 has been highly achieved. Ability of HTSC officers for traffic safety education has improved very much.

- The Project conducted various publicity activities as part of Comprehensive Pilot Projects by organizing campaigns and utilizing TV, radio and newspapers covering the whole country. Most stakeholders stressed that their message on traffic safety

clearly reached to the public and raised the people's awareness and changed their behaviour to follow traffic rules. Furthermore some stakeholders even pointed out that publicity activities of Comprehensive Pilot Projects caused large impact on political leaders' and decision makers' minds.

- HTSC for traffic safety education dispatched one full time officer for the Project for about one year to produce core staff dealing with traffic safety education. OJT through 2 Comprehensive Pilot Projects along with training programs in Japan were considered as an access to new knowledge and technology, improving capacity to organize publicity activities.
- The Project activities in traffic safety education also had been successful in expanding the network of stakeholders through organizing journalists into "Hanoi Road Safety Press Club" and working with communities and local groups at the grassroots level.

III-2 Implementation Process

- The Project dealing with traffic safety covers a variety of areas and activities with many stakeholders. The indicators which were previously set jointly by the Japanese and Vietnamese sides were not well objectively verifiable; therefore, they made it difficult for the stakeholders to share the overall picture and to monitor the progress and performance of the Project in a harmonized manner.
- The Project had been facing many challenges and had to manage by trial and error. Externally, it encountered an unexpected municipal merger in August 2008 and the following institutional restructuring of HDOT and HTSC against the rapidly growing social and political needs for traffic safety measures caused by heavy motorization and congestion. Major internal challenges among others were the delay of establishment of PMU and the allocation of counterparts at the beginning of the Project, and the necessity to change strategy after finding it difficult to produce lecturers for training courses from within HTPD and HDOT. Quickness and flexibility were must to cope with them and go ahead.
- In its new direction of human resource development, the establishment of training courses to provide fundamental knowledge was channelled for mobilizing external lecturers to produce sustainable training programs by enhancing collaboration with other institutions, and the Project also focused on OJT to transfer new knowledge and technology through practical exercise on the ground. There is no doubt that this change have contributed greatly to the achievement of Project Purpose.

III-3 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

The relevance of the Project is very high.

The overall goal and project purpose are highly relevant to the Vietnamese policy. The Project was appreciated by the Vietnamese side with its responsiveness to the acute need for traffic safety measurements in Hanoi and the country. Also, it is consistent with the needs of the target group, "traffic policemen," "traffic inspectors," "traffic engineers" and other related officers to traffic safety in Hanoi. In addition, it is positioned as part of "promotion of economic growth and strengthening of international competitiveness" approach in Country Assistance Program for Vietnam. Thus the objective of the Project is consistent with the Japanese ODA policy.

(2) Effectiveness

At the time of terminal evaluation, the project purpose is mostly achieved. The actual ability of human resources in counterpart agencies, the key factors attributing to

such improvement, has been enhanced. Nonetheless, Output 1: “To establish a system for planning, implementation and evaluation of comprehensive traffic safety measures in Hanoi” should continue to be improved.

All 5 outputs are essential for the Project Purpose to be realized and they have been contributing to the achievement of the Project Purpose. Stakeholders have observed that capacity development of personnel engaged in 3E of traffic safety, i.e., enforcement, engineering and education (Output 2, 3, 4 and 5) had shown immediate effects in improving traffic safety practice on the ground even on a pilot basis. The establishment of traffic safety measures in the form of “Traffic Safety Plan” and “Human Resource Development Plan” (Output 1) was considered to construct the enabling machinery, within which traffic safety stakeholders would play their roles in a harmonized and effective manner so that traffic safety measures as an integrated system could produce maximum benefit to the public.

The necessity to change strategy on human resource development was identified after finding it difficult to produce lecturers for training courses from within HTPD and HDOT. The new direction was agreed and the establishment of training courses to provide fundamental knowledge was channelled for mobilizing external lecturers to produce sustainable training programs, by enhancing collaboration with other institutions such as Police Academy and Construction University. In addition, the Project also added on-the-job training components for technology transfer by introducing Capacity Development Pilot Projects for each counterpart organization. This modification of PDM based on the lessons learnt from the first year’s performance was appropriate and has contributed greatly to the achievement of Project Purpose.

(3) Efficiency

The efficiency of the Project is high. Input by both Japanese and Vietnamese sides were mostly necessary and sufficient to produce the intended output for the following reasons.

[Input from Japanese Side]

- Short-term experts were dispatched in various fields and played the role in each designated area of the Project. The quality and quantity of the dispatch of Japanese experts were mostly appropriate. However, most Japanese experts pointed that the duration of total assignment was rather short to conduct technology transfer activities for human resource development.
- To cover the absence of Japanese experts and to provide local insights to the Japanese experts, the local experts have been mobilized during the implementation of the Project.
- The Japanese side provided necessary equipment for technology transfer. Some Japanese experts and Vietnamese counterparts, however, pointed that some equipment were not enough in quantity and/or in quality.

[Input from Vietnamese Side]

- Delay of the allocation of counterparts affected the smooth implementation of the Project at its early stage, although the Vietnamese government took immediate action to cover the delay by making quick decisions on budget to implement the Project activities.

(4) Impact

The effects of the projects reached much broader beyond the group of stakeholders in Hanoi by the transmission of mass media like TV, radio and newspaper organized by publicity activities of the Project. The message on traffic safety clearly reached to the public and raised the people’s awareness and changed their behaviour to follow traffic rules. Furthermore the publicity activities of the projects caused large impact on political leaders and decision makers, leading to new plans to utilize new technology such as left-turn signals, lane separation and pedestrian signals which contributed to the improvement of road users’ awareness in Hanoi. The projects have also strengthened

the coordination with other educational and training institutions, and organizations in traffic management and road facilities.

No negative impacts have been observed.

(5) Sustainability

The sustainability of the Project effects remains still uncertain although there are a couple of prospective indicators as follows:

GOV's commitment to traffic safety is very decisive. The Government and Hanoi City issued a couple of Decrees and Decisions on traffic safety measures, and led to the recent restructuring of HTSC with its executive office responsible for policy making and implementation of traffic safety measures by organizing and coordinating its umbrella organizations. This improvement indicates the sustainability of the Project's effects.

In terms of financial sustainability, human resource development is essential to development of comprehensive traffic safety measures in a sustainable manner. A post project challenge is how to deliver training programs including budget availability. Under Decision 1189 to establish HTSC, HTSC is given its own budget to perform traffic safety measures in the city. Therefore, the budget can be utilized for traffic safety measures as a whole with the timely development of a rational plan. In doing so, TRAHUD achievement would have a good prospect for being sustained. Although the CP agencies do have regular budget for operation, they are in need for budget from HTSC so as to continue training programs that they had carried out in cooperation with Police Academy, the Construction University.

As for technical sustainability, the significant challenge of the Project for technology transfer was the introduction of CDP Project which was designed as on-the-job training with Japanese Experts to improve the essential ability to conduct normal duties. Therefore, once skills were acquired through the CDP Projects, then they should be shared and transferred from one to another by working together in a team and updated within as institutional capacity. This is the concept of CDP Project to ensure technical sustainability on an individual basis, and it was somehow successful. To promote technical sustainability at an organizational level, JICA experts and TRAHUD counterpart agencies should jointly work on Human Resource Development Plan, i.e., the Output 1 of the Project, to ensure technical sustainability.

III-4 Factors promoting sustainability and impact

(1) Promoting factors

- It is commonly agreed that the Government pay strong attention to traffic safety issues and is eager to respond to the public demand as the traffic congestion in Hanoi has become more and more chronic and damaging. The restructuring of HTSC is the best example to show the Government's commitment to the traffic safety of new Hanoi.

(2) Factors inhibiting sustainability and impact

- 4 months' delay of the establishment of implementing machinery of the Project, i.e., Project Management Committee, in practice Project Management Unit, together with the delay of Vietnamese counterparts' deployment had affected the smooth implementation of the Project at its early stage although the City government immediately responded after the establishment of PMU by making quick decisions on budget for the Project activities.
- After Hanoi – HaTay merger, many agencies which were involved in comprehensive traffic safety, have their functions & organizations enhanced. However under TRAHUD, replacement of some counterpart personnel due to the municipal merger had affected the smooth technical transfer from Japanese experts to some extent.
- Most Japanese experts felt that the rational planning and practice of comprehensive traffic safety measures need to be improved to cope with current complicated traffic safety situation in Hanoi.

III-5 Conclusion

Project purpose is mostly achieved by the end of the Project period as follows:

Capacity development, which is the most essential portion of the Project, has been almost achieved due to the application of practical approach considering actual situation of counterparts. Acquiring of basic knowledge through short term training has been successfully implemented. Result of the test conducted at the end of training showed relatively high score. Capacity to practice normal duties was upgraded through the OJT (Comprehensive Pilot Projects and Capacity Development Pilot Projects). Though the level of improvement attained by the OJT is not shown in a quantitative manner unlike short term training, the evaluation by Japanese experts showed high achievement in most of the fields.

On the other hand, Project purpose “improvement of traffic safety measures” will be more completely achieved with the establishment of traffic safety 5 year action plan, establishment of a system for planning, implementation and evaluation of comprehensive traffic safety measures in Hanoi through ensure project sustainability will be ensured.

III-6 Recommendations

(1) Measures to be implemented before the termination by the Project

- Review of objectively verifiable indicators;
- Sustainable training programs for traffic policemen, inspectors and traffic engineers
- Institutionalization of Capacity Development Pilot Projects
- Comprehensive Traffic Safety Pilot Projects
- “Traffic Safety Plan” and “Human Resource Development Plan”

(2) Extension of project period

Both the Japanese and Vietnamese sides confirmed that it was strongly recommended to extend the project’s cooperation term for another one year until 31st March, 2010. In addition, both confirmed that recommended activities during the said extension period of the Project should be implemented with sufficient coordination from the HTSC leadership.

III-7 Lessons Learned

- Role of educational institutions for teaching basic knowledge on traffic safety
- Effectiveness of pilot project as OJT
- Necessity of intensified baseline survey and close monitoring of complicated project

END