

## Summary on the Result of Terminal Evaluation Study

1.Outline of the Project		
Country : People's Republic of China ("China" hereafter)		Project title : HIV/AIDS Prevention Project in Gansu Province
Issue/Sector : Health and medical care		Cooperation scheme : Technical cooperation project
Division in charge : JICA China Office		Total cost (as of the evaluation) : 470 million yen
Period of Cooperation	15 June 2006 – 14 June 2009	Partner Country's Implementing Bodies : Ministry of Health, Gansu Provincial Health Department and Provincial CDC (Center for Disease Control and Prevention), Health Department and CDC of prefecture and county level at 13 project sites*
		Project Sites : Project cities: Lanzhou, Tianshui, Jiuquan, Baiyin Model sites: Lanzhou city: Chengguan district and Qilihe district Tianshui city: Qinzhou district and Qingshui county Jiuquan city: Suzhou district and Dunhuang city Baiyin city: Baiyin district and Pingchuan district Other area assisted by the project: Gangu county, Tianshui city
1.1. Background of the Project		
<p>In China the number of HIV carriers and AIDS patients has increased and the affected area has increased. In some areas, the HIV infection route has spread from particular groups to the general public and the spread of HIV/AIDS is becoming worse year by year. The Chinese government has actively taken measures towards HIV/AIDS prevention such as by formulating preventative policies and strategies, preparing and strengthening relevant mechanisms, implementing national projects and increasing budgets for HIV/AIDS prevention. However, the prevention and treatment activities for HIV/AIDS cannot really be said to have been sufficient, partially due to the social discrimination surrounding HIV/AIDS.</p> <p>In these circumstances, the Chinese government requested assistance from the Japanese Government to strengthen HIV/AIDS prevention measures. Initially assistance for comprehensive HIV/AIDS prevention targeting several provinces and autonomous regions was requested, but finally Gansu Province was chosen as the target area and a technical assistance project was set up for the duration of three years from June 2006 in order to strengthen preventative measures against HIV/AIDS in the province. Gansu was the second poorest province in China and had a highly mobile population, suggesting a high potential risk of HIV/AIDS spreading in the future although at the time infection levels were rather low. Moreover, measures against HIV/AIDS had not yet been successfully implemented</p>		
1.2. Project Overview		
(1) Overall Goal		
HIV/AIDS prevention measures which were carried out through the project in Gansu Province to be referred to by other provinces.		
(2) Project Purpose		
HIV/AIDS prevention measures to be improved in Gansu Province.		

(3) Outputs	
1) Health education and preventative intervention activities for target groups at the project sites to be promoted.	
2) Standardized and accessible VCT (Voluntary Counseling and Testing) services at the project sites to be provided.	
3) Capacity and partnership with relevant bodies to implement HIV/AIDS prevention activities at the project sites to be strengthened.	
4) Experience in HIV/AIDS prevention activities to be reflected in the AIDS-prevention related policies of Gansu Province.	
(4) Inputs (as of March 2009. Local cost burden by the Chinese side is up to the end of December 2008)	
Japanese side:	
Dispatch of experts:	Long-term experts: 3 in total, short-term experts: 25 in total
Acceptance of trainees in Japan:	37
Equipment provision:	105,066 thousand JPY (7,054 thousand RMB)
Local operational cost:	216,150 thousand JPY (14,047 thousand RMB)
Chinese side:	
Allocation of counterparts:	116 approx.
Space and facilities provided:	project office in Gansu Province CDC, vehicle, office facilities
Local cost burden:	10,987 thousand RMB

2. Evaluation Team		
Members of Evaluation Team	Team leader	Mitsuhiro Ushio Executive Technical Advisor to Director General, Human Development Department, JICA
	Evaluation planning	Michiko Kuwauchi Assistant Resident Representative, JICA China Office
	Evaluation analysis	Masako Tanaka TAC International Inc.
Period of Evaluation	2 – 25 March 2009	Type of Evaluation : Terminal evaluation

3. Results of Evaluation	
3.1. Achievement Level	
(1) Project purpose: HIV/AIDS prevention measures to be improved in Gansu Province	
The achievement of the project outputs helped to bring about the following effects:	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Promotion of VCT, enabling HIV carriers at the project sites to be identified</li> <li>▪ The capacity of the Department of Health and CDC in Gansu Province on planning, implementing and managing HIV/AIDS prevention measures has been strengthened</li> <li>▪ The possibility of reflecting the experiences and suggestions from the project in the HIV/AIDS prevention policies of Gansu Province is being considered</li> </ul>	
Therefore, it is expected that the project purpose will be achieved by the end of the project.	
(2) Achievement of the Outputs	
Expected outputs have been generated according to the plan as follows (output 4 is anticipated):	

1) Output 1: Health education and preventative intervention activities for target groups at the project sites to be promoted

A wide variety of health education and preventative intervention activities were carried out targeting political and community leaders, the general public and high-risk groups as well as priority groups according to the needs and circumstances of the project sites. Total target numbers (indicator 1) have increased (the total number of health education recipients increased from 1,125,154 in the first year (Jul.2006-Jun.2007) to 7,340,779 in the second year (Jul.2006-Jun.2008) and to 9,433,866 by December of the third year (Jul.2006-Dec.2008); the total number of the preventative intervention activity recipients increased from 8,650 in the first year to 18,467 in the second year and to 34,292 by December of the third year) and it is recognized that the dissemination rate of AIDS-related knowledge (indicator 2) has been improved by up to approximately 75 points. These facts show that output 1 has been generated according to the plan.

2) Output 2: Standardized and accessible VCT (Voluntary Counseling and Testing) services at the project sites to be provided

By providing VCT services by outreach methods (providing health education/preventative intervention activities at the site and by mobile VCT vehicles) and strengthening the PR activities of VCT room services, the number of VCT service recipients (Indicator 1) has increased (the total number increased from 11,218 in the first year to 31,126 in the second year and to 44,902 by December of the third year). VCT services as a whole are increasing. These facts show that output 2 has been generated according to the plan.

3) Output 3: Capacity and partnership with relevant bodies to implement HIV/AIDS prevention activities at the project sites to be strengthened

The project management capacity of CDCs at the project sites and linkage with relevant bodies were strengthened. This was achieved through a cycle of theoretical management training using IEC followed by theory-based practicing activities (activity planning – activity implementation – evaluation) and experience exchanges.

This output can be clearly confirmed by the fact that a variety of activities based on the circumstances and needs of these areas have been carried out in cooperation with other departments, and several models have been created from these activities. These facts show that output 3 has been generated according to the plan.

4) Output 4: Experience in HIV/AIDS prevention activities to be reflected in the AIDS-prevention related policies of Gansu Province

Regarding the dissemination of the project outputs and strategy on sustainability, issue-based HIV/AIDS prevention measures are being summarized according to suggestions from the project experts. These dissemination efforts according to the suggestions are either planned or have been carried out, such as introducing the project activities and model cases in the province, management theory training, and utilizing the project counterparts in preventive intervention activities (indicator 1). The HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control Activity Guidelines of Gansu Province (provisional title/draft), which incorporate the advice of the project expert, are under consideration and it is also being investigated whether or not it is necessary for them to be legally enforced by Gansu Provincial Health Department (Indicator 2).

Through the above-mentioned activities, the project outputs have been planned or carried out to spread out and the project experience is soon to be reflected in the AIDS-prevention related policies of Gansu Province. Output 4 can therefore be said to have been being generated according to the plan.

### 3.2. Summary of Evaluation Results

#### (1) Relevance

It is considered that the project has high relevance for the following reasons:

- The overall goal and the project purpose are in accordance with the public health and AIDS prevention and treatment policies of China as well as the HIV/AIDS prevention and treatment policies of Gansu Province.
- The overall goal and the project purpose are in accordance with the Japanese government's economic cooperation policies towards China, which focus on infectious disease control.
- In terms of the project design, the PDM (Project Design Matrix) was changed according to changes in the HIV/AIDS infection situation in Gansu Province during the mid-term evaluation. Thereafter, the project has been implemented smoothly according to the revised PDM.
- The selected project area is considered appropriate as Gansu Province is a poor area and although infection rates are still low, an analysis of the transmission route suggests that we will see HIV/AIDS spreading from high-risk groups to the general public.

#### (2) Effectiveness

Although the PDM gradually strayed from the existing situation at the beginning of the project, it was revised in response to the changing situation during the mid-term evaluation. Thereafter, as a result of smoothly implementing activities based on the revised PDM, the project outputs were achieved. After the mid-term evaluation, the project focused on modeling many kinds of activities that had previously been implemented, and several models were accomplished by the time of the terminal evaluation.

It is considered that the project was highly effective for the following reasons:

- It is expected that the project purpose will be accomplished by the end of the project, with the relevant outputs close to those planned. Gansu province is considered an area with low HIV/AIDS infection rates; however, the number of HIV carriers has been gradually increasing. It is also predicted that HIV infection will spread from high-risk groups to the general public as transmission through sexual contact has increased. Under these circumstances, the project has been strengthening health education and preventative intervention activities for target groups including the general public, and improving VCT services, which facilitate the identification of infected individuals. Through these activities, the capacity of planning, implementing and managing of provincial CDC, CDCs at any level at the project sites have been strengthened with regard to HIV/AIDS prevention measures (health education and preventive intervention activities, and supply of VCT services). Therefore, it is considered that each project output generated a synergetic effect that eventually led to the accomplishment of the project purpose.
- Several models(\*) of HIV/AIDS prevention measures in low prevalence areas have been suggested through the various activities carried out at each project site, which can be good reference for other low prevalence areas.

\*Community-based HIV/AIDS-related health education in the Qinzhou district of Tianshui city, health service activities in the agricultural area of the Qinzhou county of Tianshui city, VCT service PR activities using public buses in Lanzhou city, TV programs on AIDS in the Baiyin district of Baiyin city, AIDS health education activities and PR targeting the general public and leaders making use of big events in Jiuquan city and so on.

#### (3) Efficiency

Comparing the level of output generated and level of input from both the Japanese and Chinese sides as well as the following facts, it is considered that relevant input was made in terms of efficiency.

- The numbers, areas of expertise and technical knowledge of JICA experts and counterparts were appropriate.
- Training in Japan helped to renew the concept of health education message in HIV/AIDS prevention measures, to improve on-site activities and to broaden the views of the people concerned, as well as to enhance the project activities.
- Appropriate equipment has generally been provided and made use of.
- Appropriate amount of the project operational management budget has been allocated from both the Japanese and Chinese sides.

On the other hand, elements which had a minor negative impact on efficiency are as follows:

- Dispatches of JICA experts (project coordinator and chief advisor) were delayed, slightly delaying the launch of the project. If a long-term chief advisor had been dispatched until the end of the project, the experience gained through the model activities could be reflected better in the HIV/AIDS prevention measures of Gansu Province.
- The biochemical autoanalyzer was not used for outreach test services in the mobile VCT vehicle but rather installed in the CDC laboratory. The reason for this was that the reagent cost is so high that its rate of loss is too high when recipients of tests are small in number. It was expected that Mobile VCT vehicles would be introduced in two more cities; however, since they had not been provided by the time of the terminal evaluation, these activities are to be verified by the Chinese side after the termination of the project.

#### (4) Impact

It is understood that the overall goal of HIV/AIDS prevention measures that were carried out through the project in Gansu Province being referred to by other provinces is highly likely to be achieved as information on the project outputs has been circulated to the Ministry of Health, China CDC and various provinces throughout the country, and this will continue.

The following positive impacts (ripple effect) have also been confirmed:

- Through the project activities, the personnel in charge of the project at prefecture and county levels were able to identify public health needs, and a project on primary health care has been designed (including PDM).
- Members of staff that were trained during the project have been responsible for training sessions on project management, VCT and so on as provincial instructors.
- CDCs in the project target cities have started the dissemination of the project activities and training at non-project target sites within cities.
- Application documents for activities of the global funds project (Round 6) have been prepared using problem analysis and purpose analysis methods in the project target cities.
- A health service activity model in agricultural areas of Qinshui county of Tianshui city reminded people who are involved in public health at several levels in Gansu Province of the importance of, and demand for, health promotion.

No negative impacts of the project had been found at the time of the terminal evaluation.

#### (5) Sustainability

It can be judged that the sustainability of the project is high from the political, organizational and financial point of view:

- Policy: the project policy is in line with the Chinese public health policy and China's Action Plan (2006-2010) for Reducing and Preventing the Spread of HIV/AIDS. The HIV/AIDS Prevention and

Control Activity Guidelines of Gansu Province (provisional title/draft), which incorporate the advice of the project experts, are under consideration and it is also being investigated whether or not it is necessary for them to be legally enforced by Gansu Provincial Health Department (Indicator 2).

- Organization: A department of AIDS and STD (Sexually Transmitted Diseases) was established at CDC at every level throughout the province and a certain number of staff was allocated. Human resources development through training sessions in the province carried out by instructors trained during the project and exchange sessions with the project activity staff is planned.
- Finance: The number of national and provincial budgets that include HIV/AIDS prevention measures is on the increase. The Gansu Provincial Health Department and provincial CDC have clearly expressed their intention to disseminate and develop the outputs gained from the project activities in the province. Despite the limited budget, there are several approaches would support financial sustainability to a certain extent, such as inventive activities by trained staff, cooperation between departments, utilizing community resources, cooperation with NGOs, utilizing the resources of international NGOs and donors.

### 3.3.Factors Contributing to Production of Effect

It was confirmed that the following factors helped to accelerate the project.

- The project management method that was chosen, which used a short cycle (quarter) comprising the application, screening, authorization and evaluation of project activities at each project site as well as sharing experiences throughout the target area.
- Practice and repetition of activities supported by theoretical training on operational management utilizing IEC.
- On-site expert guidance
- Introduction of participatory on-site monitoring by staff in charge at the provincial level.

### 3.4.Problems and Factors that Raised Problems

Although the project management method using a short cycle (quarter) was largely effective as mentioned above, the following minor issues were raised with regard to management of the project:

- Short cycle (quarterly) planning and implementation method caused a certain influence that it was difficult to grasp the whole activity plan of the project.
- The short cycle (quarterly) planning and implementation method caused a temporary budget crunch, which was solved with the efforts of the concerned parties.

### 3.5.Conclusion

The project can end as scheduled since the project has almost accomplished its purpose and has made considerable achievements in each of the 5 evaluation areas. It is also considered that its sustainability is high.

Large outputs that have never been seen before in any HIV/AIDS prevention measures are:

- (1) the dissemination of health education and preventive intervention activities accelerated the identification of infected individuals
- (2) HIV/AIDS prevention measure activities were carried out through the project, based on the idea that health education is for healthy living, emphasizing the value of life. This resulted in changing the concept of HIV/AIDS prevention measures from a dreadful disease to a preventable disease and also emphasized valuing one's life at all levels, from the government administration to the community.

The project strategies were not only to simply conduct routine HIV/AIDS prevention activities, but also to carry out operational management training alongside the prevention activities and to put the theory into practice in order to develop and strengthen the abilities of the project staff. As a result, multiple different models were suggested at each project site according to the actual conditions and needs.

It is expected that human resources development at provincial, prefectural and county level will be carried out and HIV/AIDS prevention measure activities implemented by trained staff will continue in Gansu Province. Gansu Provincial Health Department and provincial CDC have expressed their intentions to continue and to make an effort to disseminate them.

A substantial amount of information has been provided to the Ministry of Health, China CDC and provinces all over the country. It is expected that these HIV/AIDS prevention measure models and capacity development methods for practical activities will be extended to other provinces through the continual provision of information and opportunities for exchange.

### 3.6.Recommendations

(1) The project should continue to document the project outputs so that the information can be shared with the other parties concerned in the province, the Ministry of Health, China CDC and other provinces. The document should be presented in such a way as to indicate how models were established, how they became successful and clarify the process of implementation including improvements.

(2) It is important that Gansu Provincial Health Department and provincial CDC should make full use of the experience of HIV/AIDS prevention measures in a low prevalence area that they gained through the project, and strengthen and promote relevant HIV/AIDS prevention measures.

For that purpose, it is expected that Gansu Provincial Health Department will consider HIV/AIDS Prevention and Control Activity Guidelines of Gansu Province (provisional title/draft), and initiate and support the provincial CDC's dissemination, development and implementation of the project outputs within the province.

The provincial CDC has started activities introducing and disseminating the project outputs and further effort should be made in this respect. The introduction and dissemination of the project outputs should be carried out in such a way that participants can learn and understand the whole process of achieving the outputs. This should be done not through one-sided explanations, but rather through exchange sessions or workshops that involve the project staff.

(3) It is expected that the Ministry of Health and China CDC will continue to provide support by providing information with materials made by the project for other provinces to refer to and to utilize the project outputs.

### 3.7.Lessons learned

(1) This project significantly generated outputs in terms of improving the capacity and incentives of the counterparts as follows. The following method can not be applied to all developing countries; however, it is considered an effective method of technical transfer and capacity development.

- project management training sessions regarding problem analysis, planning, implementation, evaluation and feedback were carried out throughout the project targeting activity operation staff at the project sites
- these theories are then put into practice in the actual activities with a quarterly cycle\*. (\* repetition of activities including a quarterly application of an activity plan and budget by staff in charge; examination

and authorization of the plan by the provincial CDC and Japanese experts based on the previous quarter's performance; implementation; and evaluation, reporting and information sharing.)

- (2) This quarterly project management method clearly shows the outputs and its high flexibility creates incentives for the counterparts. On the other hand, the rather short cycle management has had a certain effect on how the project activities as a whole are understood, and may make the project management difficult.
- (3) Japanese experts always reside at the project sites and give technical advice to strengthen not only technical aspects but also management capacity. This is unique to Japanese on-site technical assistance and is not seen among other donors. The Chinese side highly appreciates this.
- (4) A chief advisor and project coordinator familiar with the present situation in China have been dispatched. Consequently, the activities could be started rapidly and be carried out smoothly from the beginning of their assignment, which resulted in good outputs over a short period. It is desirable to dispatch experts who are familiar with China in order to achieve good outputs over a rather short period - such as the three years of this project.