

Summary of the Evaluation

I. Outline of the Project		
Country: Yemen		Project Title: Broadening Regional Initiative for Developing Girls' Education (BRIDGE) Program in Taiz Governorate
Sector: Basic Education		Cooperation Scheme: Technology Cooperation Project
Division in Charge:	Basic Education Team I, Group I (Basic Education), Human Development Department	Total cost (as of the time of evaluation): 4.5 billion Japanese yen
		Implementing organization in Yemen: Taiz Governorate Education Office
Cooperation Period	(R/D) 23 March 2005	Organization in Japan: JICA
	Three years and five months (2005.6.22–2008.11.30)	Related Cooperation: School Construction in Taiz, Ibb and Sanaa (Grant Aid), Classroom renovation in Taiz (Grassroots Grant Aid)
<p>1-1 Background of the Project</p> <p>The Government of Yemen has considered that education is fundamental to its development. In 2003, the Ministry of Education (MOE) developed its Basic Education Development Strategy (BEDS) for 2003-2015, and has been carrying out the promotion of girls' education as one of vital policies of education in Yemen. Along this line, the Government of Yemen and the Government of Japan agreed to implement the BRIDGE Project on 23 March 2005. The Project started in June 2005 and will be completed in the end of November 2008.</p>		
<p>1-2 Project Overview</p> <p>(1) Overall Goal Girls' access to basic education in Taiz Governorate is increased.</p> <p>(2) Project Purpose The effective model of regional educational administration based on community participating and school initiatives is developed for improving girls' access to educational opportunities in the targeted districts in Taiz Governorate.</p> <p>(3) Outputs of the Project</p> <p><u>Output 1</u> Taiz Governorate's capacity on regional educational administration is enhanced.</p> <p><u>Output 2</u> Community participation in basic education is activated in the targeted areas.</p> <p><u>Output 3</u> School management capacity is enhanced in the targeted areas.</p> <p><u>Output 4</u> Steps for disseminating the BRIDGE model beyond the pilot schools and the target districts are initiated.</p>		

(4) Inputs (As of the time of evaluation, including some fixed plans)			
Japanese side:			
Short-term experts	9 experts	78 M/M	Equipment provided
Accepted trainees	3 trainees	2 M/M	Operation cost
			2 cars, 6 motorbikes, and office equipment
			5.4 million yen in total for 59 schools (2005-2008)
Yemeni Side:			
C/P staff	5 members (Taiz GEO)	21 members (District Education Officers: DEOs)	Local cost
			Provision of project office, School grant for School Improvement Plan and Monitoring fee for GEO and DEOs (2007/2008)

II. Evaluation Team

Members of the evaluation team	Leader:	Senior Advisor(Education), JICA
	Dr. Keiko Mizuno	
	Cooperation Planning:	Program Officer, Basic Education Team I, Human Development Dep., JICA
	Ms. Yumi Tokuda	
	Evaluation and Analysis:	Consultant, O.P.C. Corporation
	Ms. Etsuko Ikeda	
Evaluation Period	8.1- 8. 22, 2008	Evaluation type: Terminal evaluation

III. Overview of Evaluation Results

1. Current achievements of the Project

(1) Outputs

(a) Taiz Governorate's capacity on regional educational administration is enhanced. (Target GEO and DEOs)

The Project team has been intensively developed capacity of 5 GEO members and 21 DEO members as a BRIDGE team. Both GEO and DEO team members clearly understood their roles and responsibilities written in the Guidelines and implemented their duty according to the BRIDGE cycle. The self confidence was observed among DEOs as two members from Mokha and Mawiyah district were selected as trainers for BEDP-WSI Program and already conducted sharing workshops to introduce BRIDGE model to other donors and Governorates.

(b) Community participation in basic education is activated in the target areas. (Tartget SC, FC and MC)

Most DEOs noticed improvement of community participation, activation of SCs and leadership of HTs in target schools. Both HTs and parents realized the importance of community participation for school improvement and collaborate together to enhance girls' education and women's participation. According to the Endline survey, 88.1% of HTs agreed that they understand the importance of community

participation and 78.5% of parents who are willing to help school activities. Parents and community people contributed their labor to construct new classrooms, fences and toilets. The material for construction such as stones, sand and wood was purchased or donated by them. In some schools, parents planted trees in the school yard and continued to water them to make good environment. The school environment was much improved by community contribution.

According to the Endline survey, parents want daughters to continue studying even to university. Parents who fully agreed on equal rights to receive education is 92.0%. The female contracted teachers had a positive impact to send girls to the school as they acted as role models in the community. Besides female contracted teachers, following activities were noticed as effective measures to promote girls' education in common; construction of female toilets, making separate class rooms for girls and boys, construction of fence of the school, distribution of the cassette tape included drama story and message from famous religious leaders, setting school radio to announce information and activities of the school to community, and visiting houses in the community to persuade conservative parents.

Each target school has an obligation to start at least one activity to encourage women's participation to school. Literacy classes and sewing classes are the most popular to involve women. By 2008, 36 literacy classes and 19 sewing classes are established. The number of the class is increased and gave positive impact on women's participation to school activities. For example, women who attended to the class want to involve in school management and even want to be a student of G4-5 after they finished literacy course. They can also generate income by the skill obtained and contribute to upraise living condition.

(c) School management capacity is enhanced in the targeted areas. (Target HTs)

HTs learned and understood the definition of quality of education in SIP and have been tried to improve their schools by organizing daily administrative tasks, basic teaching skills and student and teachers discipline. HTs became confident to plan SIP to enhance their quality of education. Their needs became much specific and planning procedure is advanced by the guidance of DEO and JICA experts. In the Endline survey, most HTs appreciated to be able to share information with other HTs in the project activities. According to the End line survey, 96.6% of HTs (baseline 9.4%) think girls should have equal opportunity to basic education to boys. 64.4% of HTs (baseline 17.0%) agree that females have professional careers in a society.

(d) Steps for disseminating the BRIDGE model beyond the pilot schools and the target districts are initiated.

In June 2008, the celebration workshop to share BRIDGE experience among GEO, DEOs, SCs, Taiz authority, donors, media and other district members was held by inviting 450 people in total. On July 12, 2008, the sharing workshop was held by inviting 47 participants such as GEO members, senior officers from Governor office, people from target districts, and new target districts. These workshops were held under supervision of the GEO team. The version 5 of newsletter was edited only by GEO team and included articles on girl's education and community participation in Taiz Governorate. The editorial meeting of version 6 is held in August 2008 led by the GEO team. In 200/2008, Open Day was held in

all 6 districts. DEO in each district planned all the activities and the method of school improvement and girl's education was presented by students, parents, SCs, HTs, and teachers. The participants were able to share good practices which were applicable to their own community.

(2) Project Purpose

The effective model of regional educational administration based on community participating and school initiatives is developed for improving girl's access to educational opportunities in the target districts in Taiz Governorate.

(a) Guideline is in place and understood by stakeholders

The Draft Guidelines was developed in August 2007 and modified by utilizing in planning SIP workshop by DEOs and SCs in 6 target districts. The system and process of BRIDGE model was explained in details and good practices of school improvement and promotion of girls' education were included in the Guidelines. In 2008, the GEO team held several workshops to upgrade the contents of the Guidelines and asked feed-back from DEOs, SCs, HTs, MoE, donors, and other related department. In the end October 2008, finalized Guidelines will be presented among those related agencies.

b) GEO's capability to implement BRIDGE model

Since new GEO team was formed in April 2007, all five members of the team attended to the annual SIP workshop in the community to supervise planning and budgeting activities for target 59 schools. Through these OJTs, the GEO team has understood the whole process of SIP and community participatory approach. In the DEO monthly meetings organized by GEO and JICA experts, GEO and DEOs share their progress and problems and exchange ideas.

c) Female student ratio against male students

The average ratio of target 59 school in 2007/2008 is 0.79. The target indicator (0.78) is achieved. However, there is a gap among districts. For example, the ratio of Dhuhab marks 1.04, while the ratio of Maqbana still remains 0.50.

d) Total number of students

The total number of girls and boys at 59 target schools is increasing year by year. Comparing 2004 and 2007, the number of male students has increased from 9,312 to 12,003, while, the number of female student has increased from 6,281 to 9,433.

(3) Overall Goal

Girl's access to basic education in Taiz Governorate is increased.

The comparison of female students' ratio against male students of 2003/2004 and 2007/2008 in Taiz Governorate is 0.79 and 0.82. The ratio has been increased in the last 4 years. Regarding the progress observed, the ratio is expected to be increased in coming 5 years.

The Local Council and GEO committed to disseminate BRIDGE model to other districts by allocating

budget for School improvement, training, monitoring and other events. The estimate total budget for 2009/2010 to conduct BRIDGE model in ongoing and new target schools (119 schools in total) was already prepared. As GEO is now planning to add each 60 schools every year in Taiz Governorate, 300 schools in disadvantage areas will be covered in 5 years. In addition, among 700 schools in Taiz Governorate has already formed SCs to be ready for SIP.

2. Evaluation by Five Criteria

(1) Relevance:

- Relevance is quite high because the promotion of girl's access to basic education has been addressed in policy documents of both the Yemen government and the Japanese government.
- The needs of the target groups were filled by a bottom-up approach.
- BRIDGE project is the first one which verifies the effectiveness of community-based school improvement in Yemen. The approach is relevant to the concept of whole school improvement of the National Program on school-based management.

(2) Effectiveness:

- Effectiveness is high as promotion of girls' education with community participation has been effectively introduced in the SIP. Project purpose is almost achieved.
- The Guidelines includes all the requirements to implement BRIDGE system and it has already been utilized by other programs such as BEDP-WSI program and Child-friendly school program in Taiz Governorate.
- There is a gap of female student's ratio against male students among target schools. The reason of low ratio under 0.50 should be further analyzed to verify effectiveness of the model.

(3) Efficiency:

- Outputs are mostly achieved: Capacity of GEO and DEO was almost developed; community participation is activated; school management capacity is enhanced in target areas; and steps for disseminating the BRIDGE model are initiated.
- Considering that the project has been built the model of whole school improvement which can be disseminated to all Taiz Governorate and other Governorates in Yemen, the inputs are quite reasonable.
- In 2007/2008, Yemen side already contributed the school grant for SIP and monitoring fee to 59 target schools.
- Efficiency is relatively high because the Project incredibly activated community participation and enhanced school management capacity of SCs and HTs in the remote areas through intensive training and monitoring by BRIDGE-GEO and DEO team.

(4) Impact:

- Girl's access to basic education in Taiz Governorate is increasing.
- The positive impact on both the national policy of Yemen and other donors to present the model of whole school improvement is high. The National Program on school-based management adopted the BRIDGE model for school improvement.
- The Guidelines of the Project has already been linked with the manuals produced by BEDP-WSI and

UNICEF. The direct money transfer to schools also made remarkable influence to MOE and other donors.

- The positive impact on social, cultural and environmental has been observed in the community such as change of women's perception and attitude, recovery of community unity and harmony, and change of girl's stereotype.
- The impact is very high considering the positive influences of the BRIDGE model to all the level such as communities, districts, governorate and the nation.

(5) Sustainability:

- Sustainability of school improvement in 59 target schools is high as the local authority has strongly committed to continue to support the schools in 2009/2010 as well as 2008/2009.
- Considering the dissemination of the BRIDGE model to other districts in all over Taiz Governorate, though GEO is planning to add 60 schools as target schools every year, prospects to cover all the remaining potential target schools has not been prepared yet. The limitation of usage of Governorate budget should be modified to meet the needs of whole school improvement. GEO and DEO's skill on budget management needs to be strengthened.
- Although the BRIDGE-GEO and DEO members were intensively trained by JICA experts to be core strategic members of the Project, transfer of the skills and knowledge to other staff in GEO and DEOs is a remaining issue to strengthen existing institutional development for dissemination.
- The permanent status of BRIDGE contract teachers is under consideration of MOE. Mechanism of hiring local teachers in remote areas should be taken account to sustain school activation and improve quality of education.
-

3. Factors Contributing in the Production of Effect

(1) Planning

- The bottom-up approach has contributed to effective planning and school's ownership with community participation and direct money transfer to the schools. DEO's monitoring skill of SIP was improved.

(2) Implementation Process

- BRIDGE – GEO and DEO team intensively managed the BRIDGE cycle and share their experiences and information in the regular meetings with JICA experts. These processed have developed their ownership.
- SCs, HTs, teachers and community members are confident and dedicated to improve their school by using School Improvement Manual which has been modified several times by reflecting their lesson and learnt. The manual has been utilized by other districts and donors as it was the first effort of school improvement at the community level.
- The project process has been shared among MoE, Ministry of Finance, Ministry of Civil Service, donors, media and other related agencies such as GFO and Governor Office in Taiz Governorate.

4. Problems and Factors that Raised Problems

(1) Planning

None.

(2) Implementation Process

- The hierarchical attitude of GEO to DEO caused problems as many DEO had developed their participatory management skill in the field. Guidance by the JICA experts needed to set mission and make their division of labor clearly.
- Though the BRIDGE- GEO and DEO team has been intensively working for project management supported by JICA experts, other staff at GEO and DEO needed to strengthen their capacity to manage school improvement with community initiatives.

IV. Conclusions, Recommendations and Lessons Learned

1. Conclusions

The results of a series of interviews to key stakeholders confirmed that the approach introduced by the Project had contributed to gender parity in enrollment in target areas by strengthening collaboration and partnership among key stakeholders at different levels (community/school, district and governorate education administration) for improving access of girls to basic education and that the interventions by the project had successfully mobilized and strengthened the capacity of the key stakeholders thus the BRIDGE team members acquired their technical and managerial capacities necessary for implementing the BRIDGE model. Furthermore, the political support and financial commitment of Taiz Governorate showed that ownership and initiatives of the Yemeni counterpart for the BRIDGE implementation had been strengthened. Outputs achieved by BRIDGE implementation has brought positive impact to Taiz governorate as well as National Ministry of Education and donor community.

The BRIDGE target schools, which identified “lack of teachers” as a problem to be solved for girls’ education, have employed and administered contract teachers of the same or nearby localities under the School Improvement Plan (SIP). Through the implementation, the Project has demonstrated the effectiveness of a bottom-up approach to address the issue of shortage of teachers in remote and marginalized communities.

However, ensuring a means of filling the gap of teacher shortage on a continuous basis is a major issue to be considered from the aspect of “sustainability” after the project cooperation period. As for the issues relating to teachers hired by schools under the BRIDGE model, a comprehensive review and analysis on strengths and weaknesses identified in the process of BRIDGE implementation shall be required prior to further dissemination so that feasible and sustainable system shall be developed.

The following are some issues which require due attention by the respective stakeholders (MOE, GEO, DEOs, Taiz Governorate and the JICA Expert) so that the BRIDGE model shall be effectively integrated into the existing mechanism of regional education administration thus disseminated to other schools and districts in Taiz Governorate for improving girls’ access to basic education.

2. Recommendations

(1) Issues concerning successful continuation of the BRIDGE in Taiz Governorate

- **Provision of Training and Monitoring budget**

Since the training and monitoring activities are essential components of the BRIDGE model, the school operation funds (230,000 YER per school) have been prepared by Taiz governorate for the current target schools for 2008/2009 school year. It is suggested that MOE should take an immediate action in this regard to ensure the successful implementation beyond the Japanese cooperation period.

For the future operation, it is desirable that the training and monitoring activities should be fully integrated into the regular training programs and working assignments under the GEO work plan.

- Advocacy on the effectiveness of BRIDGE model to political leaders in Taiz governorate

It is important to maintain advocacy to political leaders on the effectiveness of BRIDGE model to attract the political interest to secure and increase financial commitment of Taiz governorate.

- Establishing an effective mechanism of transferring school operational funds

While Taiz governorate has started the financial support to the target schools, additional transaction costs and paperwork have been significant since the funding transfer mechanism based on the BRIDGE experiments was not adopted. The BRIDGE approach should be referred as evidence based workable mechanism which should be taken consideration in national and governorate policy making in education sector. In doing so, any amendment or approval of the law and regulations to facilitate effective financial management under decentralization shall be pursued if necessary, while strengthening local capacity to manage financial resources effectively.

- Analysis and monitoring on schools which achievement levels are low

The project purpose is judged to be achieved by reviewing the set indicator, which is the girls against boys ratio in the aggregate (G1-G9) in target schools. However, it should be noted that there are significantly wide variations in the achievement level across “schools” and “districts”.

Since the results are mixed, it is suggested that an in-depth analysis be conducted to identify inhibiting factors for promoting girls’ enrollment compared to boys’ particularly in schools with low achievement level so that the special attention by DEO shall be given to such schools to tackle the inhibiting factors.

- Building Institutional Capacity at DEO level by integrating the BRIDGE approaches into its regular operations

In order to facilitate further dissemination, the BRIDGE implementation needs to be effectively integrated into DEO’s routine operations, such as school supervision.

In this regard, it is recommended that the expanded human resources including various types of inspectors (finance, school environment, pedagogy) should be trained by the BRIDGE team members to facilitate the integration of BRIDGE approaches into regular tasks of DEO.

(2) Issues concerning effective dissemination of the BRIDGE (for maximizing the effectiveness of the model)

- Reviewing for an appropriate mechanism of hiring and sustaining “Contract teachers”

The mechanism being implemented by the BRIDGE for hiring contract teachers by school needs to be reviewed from the aspects of “sustainability” and “quality assurance”. Based on the review, it is suggested that the BRIDGE and JICA Expert Team should propose common rules and standard procedures for hiring contract teachers under the BRIDGE implementation, for the agreement with DEO, GEO and MOE and Taiz Governorate. In such a process, roles and responsibilities of the School Committee, DEO, GEO, MOE, and Taiz Governorate for hiring and sustaining local teachers should be

discussed and defined from technical, managerial and financial aspects including decision making authority over contract teacher recruitment.

The approved rules and standard procedures for hiring “contract teachers” under “SIP” should be included in the final Guidelines.

- **Ensuring measures for quality assurance of contract teachers**

In the future operation, it is strongly suggested that MOE shall provide appropriately organized training for all the contract teachers so that the acceptable quality of contract teachers can be ensured.

- **Examination of an appropriate level of school funding**

The necessary school funds can be varied according to different school conditions such as human and financial resources available, size of students, physical conditions, geographic remoteness etc.. While maintaining the core approaches of the BRIDGE model (community participation, transparency in financial management, accountability with full cycle of plan to evaluation), an appropriate level of school funding should be proposed to meet the minimum quality standard according to the diversified school conditions.

In addition, appropriate means and costs for governance and administrative capacity building at different levels (school, DEO, GEO, MOE) should be accompanied to ensure that the allocated budget shall be effectively utilized for the intended purpose.

(3) Others

- **Harmonization in operational procedures among similar programs**

Different donors and MOE with similar programs to promote school based management need to make much effort to harmonize operational procedures among such programs to avoid any duplication.

In addition, it is necessary to promote effective harmonization of policy, legal framework, implementation, and funding framework based on good practices and lessons learned on the ground.

3. Lessons Learned

The following three points are identified as “Lessons Learned” in the process of implementation, which need to be considered when formulating or implementing similar programs.

- **Selection criteria of target districts in line with the project purpose**

In selecting some target districts, the gender gap in enrolment in basic education was not prioritized as a selection criterion; therefore, the impact of the Project towards reducing gender gap could not be measured in some cases. Target groups should be carefully selected in line with the project purpose.

- **Setting additional indicators to measure the girls’ access to basic education**

There was no “quality” indicators included in the Project Design Matrix. Since the access to schooling and improving quality should be addressed equally for promoting girls’ education, indicators to measure “quality” aspects should be considered in the framework of similar projects.

- Understanding and analyzing “diversity” of target group (Identifying factors creating disparities among target group)

In case of aiming at proposing a model to minimize gender disparities in education, it is indispensable to pay attention to and analyze the diversity within the target group and its tendency by following up on individual cases. In this respect, indicators to be used for monitoring and evaluation in implementation or after-cooperation period should be carefully selected based on the understanding that the mean value of the data collected from target group can not depict disparities within the group.

End