

Summary of Terminal Evaluation Results

1. Outline of the Project :			
Country : The Republic of Ghana		Project Title : The Tourism Development Project Through Strengthening Public-Private Partnership	
Field of Specialty : Tourism promotion		Cooperation Scheme : Technical Cooperation Project	
Division in Charge : JICA Ghana Office		Amount of Budget : 255,652,000 Yen (estimation as of May 2008)	
Period of Cooperation	21 February 2006 to 20 February 2009 (R/D : 01 February 2006)	Partner Country's Implementing Organization : MOTDR (Ministry of Tourism and Diasporan Relations)	
		Other Related Organizations : GTB (Ghana Tourist Board),GHATOF (Ghana Tourism Federation)	
1-1 Background and Outline			
(1) Background			
In recent years, Ghana has made large strides in the area of economic development. Tourism is recognized as an important non-traditional export sector that can play a vital role in achieving economic growth and poverty reduction by generating foreign exchange and creating job opportunities. Therefore, Ministry of Tourism and Diasporan Relations (hereinafter referred to as "MOTDR") requested JICA to support its effort on the establishment of successful public-private partnership (hereinafter referred to as "PPP") for tourism promotion in the scheme of Technical Cooperation Project.			
(2) Outline of the Project			
The Project is expected to establish an action-oriented forum, namely the Public-Private-Partnership Forum (hereinafter referred to as "Forum"), which involves all relevant stakeholders in the tourism sector in Ghana. The Project envisages the Forum to deal with and offer solutions to the issues in strategic PPP, action and business plans as well as monitoring and evaluation, in addition to reflecting and demonstrating such functions in pilot activities. The Project ensures that the public sector takes into consideration the needs of the private sector in the forum. These needs are then included in the forum strategies and are also reflected in the policy-making process in Ghana. The Forum spearheads the use of public resources to assist the private sector, and contributes to overcoming the weaknesses in the tourism sector.			
1-2 Contents of Cooperation			
(1) Overall Goal			
Tourism industries along with hospitality services are well developed to attract more tourist arrivals and increase receipts.			
(2) Project Purpose			
Successful Public-Private Partnership (PPP) is established.			
(3) Outputs			
1. Functioning PPP Forum is in place.			
2. Capacity of the Forum is well-developed			
3. Activity plans and strategies for the future PPP Forum are formulated.			
4. Capacities for monitoring and evaluation are enhanced.			
(4) Inputs at the Time of the Evaluation			
<Japan Side>			
Dispatch of Long Term Experts		0 person	
		Equipment & Machinery	344 Thousand Yen

Dispatch of Short Term Experts 8 persons Receiving Counterpart Trainees 8 persons		Local Costs 1st F.Year 808 Thousand Yen 2nd F.Year 12,917 Thousand Yen 3rd F. Year 21,484 Thousand Yen
<Ghana Side> Counterparts Allocation : 7 persons One office room with telephone, internet, furniture, etc		
2 Outline of the Evaluation Team		
Team	Leader /Mr. Masato KUMAGAI Deputy Resident Representative /JICA Ghana Office	
Member	Cooperation Planning 1 /Mr. Hideaki HARA /Project Formulation Advisor /JICA Ghana Office Cooperation Planning 2 /Mr. Yuji WAKASUGI /Assistant Resident Representative /JICA Ghana Office Evaluation Analysis /Mr. Kanji HOSHINO /Senior Consultant /TREA Co., Ltd	
Evaluation Period in Ghana : May 28, 2008 to June 9, 2008		Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation
Methods of Survey: Document Review, Questionnaire Survey, Direct Interview and Observation of PPP Forum		
3 Summary of Evaluation Results		
3-1 Achievement of the Project (1) Achievement of inputs According to the result of the interview survey, the inputs of Japanese experts were appropriate in terms of the timing, technical aspect, and specialised field. Also, the training in Japan can contribute to the improvement of effectiveness and appropriate judgement for participants' daily work. In addition, the provided office machineries (e.g. PC, printer) are effectively utilised for their work. From the view of the Ghanaian inputs, the activities of the project director and the manager have contributed to the Project. The private sector Working Group (WG) is also assisting the project in light of funds and human resources. (2) Achievement of activities The activities were implemented as planned. (3) Achievement of Outputs (a) Output 1: -The secretariat of the Forum was established in MOTDR in the first year of the project. -Constitution and organisation of the Forum were defined through the Memorandum of Understanding (replaced by PPP Concept Paper), which was prepared by the Forum secretariat in March, 2008. -PPP concept paper was approved by the Forum meeting in the second year. -As of June 2008, eight Forum meetings have been held in total as scheduled and each meeting was attended by approximately 80-100 participants. (b) Output 2: The interviews with the Forum secretariat members confirmed that they were capable of preparing and holding Forum meetings by themselves.		

(c) Output 3:

Activity plans and strategies for the future Forum have been formulated to a certain degree. For instance, WG3 produced a marketing plan, including development of visitor centre, is in progress.

(d) Output 4:

Capacities for monitoring and evaluation have been enhanced to some extent. The specific monitoring and evaluation training for the Forum will be held in near future.

(4) Achievement of Project Purpose and Overall Goal

According to the interviews with the Forum members, establishment of the Forum is appreciated by both public and private sectors. The dialogue between the public and private sectors has improved relationship among the stakeholders. The wall of suspicion is gradually disappearing. Then, the Forum has become a platform for candid discussion of views towards the tourism business.

The meeting of the Forum is attracting many participants. The results of interviews with the participants confirmed that the Forum is an appropriate place to meet the people from various sectors. The discussions among members of the Forum are very enthusiastic, and are working seriously to promote the tourism in Ghana.

Due to the above analysis and understanding, it could be considered that the initial purpose of the project has been achieved.

3-2 Summary of the Results

(1) Relevance: Relevance of the Project is high in view of the following four dimensions.

(a) Consistency with the Ghanaian National Tourism Policy, such as National Tourism Development Plan (1996 – 2010), The Five Year Tourism Action Plan (2003–2007) and National Tourism Development Policy (2007, Draft), Private Sector Development Strategy (PSDS) Three Year Work Plan 2008–2010 and poverty issues as in the Growth and Poverty Reduction Strategy (GPRS, 2006–2009).

(b) Consistency with Directions of Japanese Cooperation

“Private Sector Development” is one of the main pillars of Japan’s “Country Assistance Program (CAP) for Ghana”. The direction of the Project is relevant to the one of CAP’s strategic objectives.

(c) Confirmation of Needs

According to the interview survey, there are high appreciation for the Project activities from both public and private sectors. In addition, the PPP Forum is recognized by the Ghanaian mass media.

(d) Japanese Comparative Advantages

Japan is experienced in public-private collaboration at various levels, such as summer festivals in local towns and tourism exhibition of the Japan Association of Tour Agencies (JATA).

(2) Effectiveness: Effectiveness of the Project is high in view of the following four dimensions.

(a) Due to the consistency between the evaluation from the PPP Forum and the Ghanaian policies, the project purpose could be foreseen as achievable.

(b) There are logical linkages between the Output and the Project Purpose, and it cannot be observed any negative

influence from the Important Assumption and the inhibition factors between them. These are because the Outputs from the project contribute to establish the PPP Forum and strengthen its capacity.

(3) Efficiency: Efficiency is considered high.

(a) Dispatch of Experts

Eight (8) experts were dispatched to Ghana between 2006 and 2008. Their dispatch timings, expertises, performances were commented as appropriate for conducting the Project.

(b) Training Courses

Two (2) training courses were provided for the eight (8) selected Forum members in Japan. It was confirmed by interviews that the courses were regarded as useful and the strengthened their daily functions.

(c) Equipment

Equipment are mainly installed for daily logistics work and fully utilized.

(d) Assignment of Counterpart Personnel

Seven (7) counterpart personnel have been assigned. However, some staff's involvement in Forum secretariat is not active so much, while Project director and manager are fully involved and active in the Project activities.

(4) Impacts: Although the Project is yet to be completed, several positive impacts are expected to achieve the Overall Goal if some conditions are fulfilled. No negative impacts were observed.

(a) Achievability of the Overall Goal

There is a high possibility that the Overall Goal is achieved within some years after the end of the Project, if WGs' activities for tourist attractions, infrastructure, human resources, marketing and international standard investment continue to be upgrade.

(b) Incorporation of OJT Programme into the formal Vocational Training Curriculum.

The On-the-Job Training (OJT) of hotel services has begun at the Golden Tulip Hotel in line with the programs of WG II. They have already proposed this curriculum to the Ministry of Education to introduce it to universities and vocational training institutions.

(c) Establishment of the Ghana Tourism Fund (GTF)

WG I and IV have proposed establishing GTF with a view to addressing tourism sector's financial needs for training and marketing. As of June 2008, the draft has been submitted to the MOTDR and it is expected to be approved in 2009.

(d) Transformation of GTB into GTA

GTB will incorporate private sector members and is transformed into GTA. The purpose of this organizational transformation is to facilitate tourism promotion.

(e) Awareness of Necessity of Tourism utilizing National Uniqueness

The training in Japan and study tour in South Africa greatly helped participants enhance their skills and knowledge about marketing, tourism services and community-level tourism promotion. The participants also became more confident in differentiating destination between Ghana and neighbouring countries in the region.

(5) Sustainability: Sustainability is considered moderate.

(a) Policy Aspect

The Project is consistent with the national tourism development policies and PSDS. The PPP Forum is recognized by both public and private sectors.

(b) Technical Aspects

The necessary technical skills and knowledge about management and operation of the Forum have been fairly transferred to the Ghanaian staff of the secretariat, and operation of the Forum will be considered sustainable.

(c) Financial Aspects

If the Ghana Tourism Fund (GTF) is established in 2009 as anticipated, the GTF may become a financial source for Forum's activities. In 2007, MOTDR listed Forum's activities in the annual budget and provided some budget, even though it is not a huge amount.

(d) Organizational Aspects

The Forum is expected to be more mainstreamed widely in MOTDR in order to secure the organizational sustainability. It is necessary to increase the number of the secretariat staff in order to reinforce the institutional capacity from the changes and transfer of the leading staff and secure organizational sustainability. The proper replacement of personnel and skill transfer are also needed for the retirement and transfer of key leaders expected to occur in the immediate future

3-3 The Factors contributed

In the Project planning

- (a) The project approach by utilising the PPP Forum has contributed to retain the fairness which can avoid concentrating benefits on the specific group. Also, the collaboration between private and public sector have engaged them to act independently. Then, both the Forum and WG activities contribute to the Project implementation.
- (b) The pilot activities (WG activities) by the PPP Forum have effectively utilised the leadership of the public sector and the flexibility of the private sector and created various ripple effects.

3-4 The Factors inhibited

Factors which caused the problems were not found in the planning and implementation processes.

3-5 Conclusion

The Project was conducted with high consistency with Ghanaian and Japanese policies as well as vital needs of both private and public. The activities are initiated actively and efficiently by the PPP Forum and its WGs in the action-oriented approach. Some positive impacts have already been observed which is expected to make big influences on the ground. The Forum is expected to be successfully administered by the Ghanaian partners, although there are some challenges about financial and organizational sustainability.

3-6 Recommendations

- (1) PPP Forum has so far contributed to the development of the tourism sector. PPP Forum should continue and the secretariat of the Forum should play a central role the related activities.
- (2) The secretariat should also have a central role in facilitating the PPP at a regional level.
- (3) In order to secure organizational sustainability, it is important that the work should be properly handed over to the successor by Project director and manager before they retire.
- (4) In order to secure financial sustainability, it is important to ensure financial resources such as GTF.
- (5) There is a need for a donor to do a follow-up to this Project in order to secure the sustainability of Project.

3-7 Lessons Learnt

- (1) Participation of many stakeholders from different sectors is favourable to promote the Forum.

One of the key success factors of this Project is that the Forum consists of multi-sectoral and private stakeholders of various levels who engage in frank discussions and prevent a domination of benefits.

- (2) Good use of advantages of public and private sectors

Another factor is that the advantages of both public and private sectors are fully utilized for Project implementation. The public sector plays a leading role in the implementation and the private sector provided flexibility and necessary managerial (especially financial) resources to vitalize Forum's activities.

It is also crucial to nurture mutual trust between public and private sectors. Third party's participation/cooperation is also important to build up trust between the two sectors.

- (3) Importance of the timing of Project implementation

In the past few years, many tourists have visited Ghana in order to celebrate the 50th anniversary of Ghana's independence in 2007 and to enjoy football games of the African Cup of Nations held in 2008. These two events took place during the Project period and thus there was a strong need for tourism promotion initiated nationally and collaboration between private and public in Ghana. The timing of Project implementation is very important and should be appropriate.