

Summary Sheet for Terminal Evaluation

1. Outline of the Project						
Country: United Republic of Tanzania		Project title: Project for the Capacity Development in Road Maintenance Management				
Issue/Sector: Transport Sector (Road)		Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation				
Division in charge: JICA Tanzania Office		Total cost: 290 million Japanese Yen				
Period of Cooperation	R/D: Feb. 2005 to Feb. 2008 Extension: Feb. 2008 to Feb. 2009	Partner Country's Implementing Organization: Tanzania National Roads Agency (TANROADS) and other two agencies				
	(F/U): (E/N) (Grant Aid):	Supporting Organization in Japan: None				
Related Cooperation: Project for Capacity Strengthening on Labor Based Technology Training, Project for Widening of Kilwa Road, and Project for Upgrading Masasi-Mangaka Road						
<p>1-1. Background of the Project</p> <p>The Government of Tanzania has prioritized development of the economic infrastructures that include roads. In the road sector, the effort has been made especially for development and maintenance of existing road networks. After introduced "Road Management Initiative" that is targeted at 17 sub-Saharan countries and assisted by the World Bank since beginning of 1990's, the Government began reform of the road sector and established a semi-autonomous executive agency, the Tanzania National Road Agency (TANROADS), responsible for the management of trunk and regional roads construction, rehabilitation and maintenance. However, management and operation capacity of TANROADS, coupled with general insufficient experience of its staff, had not been enough for fully meeting the required role. This resulted in inadequate level of performance in the road projects.</p> <p>Thus the Government of Tanzania requested the Japanese Government to carry out a technical cooperation project to strengthen the capacity of TANROADS to contract, supervise and monitor the maintenance work for the road networks. In response to this request, JICA conducted the preliminary study in October 2004. Followed this study, JICA began three years technical cooperation project for TANROADS in March 2005. After two years, taking account the necessity of comprehensive approach to the road maintenance management, it was agreed in February 2007 to extend the project until February 2009 and to add project activities for assisting two other agencies; Contractors Registration Board (CRB) that is responsible for registration, regulation and development of construction contractors and Road Fund Board (RFB) that manages public fund for road maintenance.</p> <p>Accompanied with termination of the cooperation period in the end of February 2009, this terminal evaluation was conducted with aims to review implementation process and achievements and to assess outcomes, as well as to study on lessons for other similar projects.</p> <p>1-2. Project Overview</p> <p>(1) Overall Goal: Good road condition (Goal: Appropriate maintenance is implemented.)</p> <p>(2) Project Purpose:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To improve TANROADS' capacity for road maintenance management - To improve CRB's capacity for training of contractors - To improve RFB's capacity for monitoring and evaluating usage of Roads Fund as well as capacity to promote increase of Roads Fund - <p>(3) Outputs</p> <p>TANROADS:</p> <table style="margin-left: 20px;"> <tr> <td>Output 1</td> <td>Improved work procedure</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Output 2</td> <td>Training program drawn and training conducted</td> </tr> </table>			Output 1	Improved work procedure	Output 2	Training program drawn and training conducted
Output 1	Improved work procedure					
Output 2	Training program drawn and training conducted					

Output 3.1	Training Programs and Activities of JICA Team are Evaluated and Necessary Modifications are made
Output 3.2	Seminar for Contractors Implemented and Contractors Capacity on Procurement is Improved
CRB:	
Output 1	Improved training framework, training program, training methods and training material
Output 2	Increased number of participants who attends the training courses offered by CRB
Output 3	Increased number of qualified trainers
RFB:	
Output 1	Improvement in technical auditing
Output 2	Improved performance indicators
Output 3	Improved quality of management of Roads Fund
(4) Inputs	
Japanese side:	
Expert: 5 persons, 65 person-months in total	
Trainees received: 5 persons	
Equipment: Personal computers 6 units, AV equipment and others	
Tanzania side:	
Project counterparts: 8 persons	
Office for the expert and energy costs	
Local Cost: Travel expenses for training participants	

2. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team	Mr. Kiyoshi Masumoto (Team Leader), Chief Representative, Tanzania Office, JICA	
	Ms. Asuka Tsuboike (Evaluation Planning), Representative, Tanzania Office, JICA	
	Mr. Toyomitsu Terao (Evaluation Analysis), Consultant, Fisheries Engineering Co., Ltd	
Period of Evaluation	28 February 2009 to 11 March 2009	Type of Evaluation: Terminal evaluation

3. Results of Evaluation

3-1. Achievements

(1) Activities

All the planned activities, excepting those that were omitted from the project due to imperative reasons, have been completed by the end of the project. Through a series of the activities, various documents have been drafted and presented to the implementation agencies, which include Road Maintenance Handbook, Human Resources Development Plan, Guideline for Workflow, Action Plan and others for TANROADS; TOT Plan and Review Report for SSTP for CRB; Technical Audit Manual and Report for Review and Recommendation on Performance Indicators for RFB. These documents total 33 study reports, 21 evaluation reports on training courses for TANROADS, and 33 working papers.

(2) Outputs

Among four outputs planned for TANROADS, three outputs have been achieved. The activities under Output 3.2 "Seminar for Contractor" were omitted from the project activities for TANROADS as CRB participated in the project. Among three planned outputs, Output1 and Output2 have been achieved as planned. The Output 3 has achieved partially since the project covered training for trainers only for two courses among seven training courses in CRB. It is judged that Output 1 and 2 for RFB have been achieved. Activities under Output 3 were omitted from the project as RFB's needs had been mostly fulfilled with the recent increase of revenue to the Road Fund in FY2007/08.

(3) Project purpose

TANROADS: The project has developed Road Maintenance Handbook, Human Resources Development Plan, Guideline for Workflow and others. Formulation of all these deliverables had also accompanied full participation of the Tanzanian project counterpart personnel, together with training, seminars and workshop to ensure that they could be well disseminated to the 21 regional offices. It can be concluded that the project purpose for TANROADS is achieved.

CRB: The review for CRB's training program (SSTP) was finalized almost at the end of the project period. Assessment of contribution will come later beyond the project cooperation period. The project could cover training for trainers only for two courses among the seven training courses in the SSTP.

RFB: All the planned tasks for formulating Technical Audit Manual and for reviewing Performance Indicators were completed and the manual and report were delivered to RFB. The project purpose for RFB has been achieved.

3-2. Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

The relevance of the project is high. The project has assisted the Ten Years Road Sector Development Plan (TRDP: 2001-2010), which emphasizes the importance of maintenance in the road sector development. The Ten Years Transport Sector Development Program Phase 1 (2007-2012) covers the entire transport sector comprised of road, railways, aviation, and maritime transportation. Of the four sub sectors, the road sub sector is recognized as a key sub-sector which carries out 64% of the cargo traffic and 80% of the passenger trip.

(2) Effectiveness

The effectiveness of the project is moderate. The project purpose for TANROADS and RFB has been substantially achieved. However, it should be noted that the project purpose for CRB has been done partially. This was resulted in mainly by a partial achievement of the training of trainers for CRB – Output 3.

(3) Efficiency

The efficiency of the project is high. Inputs of the Project were made mostly in accordance with the planned time schedule. There was no significant delay of the inputs. A total input of the experts was 65 person months. One of the features of this project is that many and quality deliverables have been presented to the implementation agencies. The high efficiency of this project is shown in performance of these outcomes that have been enabled to attain in limited inputs.

(4) Impacts

While the outcome of this project is expected to surely contribute to the achievement of the overall goal, it is still premature to assess its probability at this stage. There exist still many unknown factors to affect the Overall Goal. Among them, development of the small and medium scale contractors may present a key factor for the road sector reform in Tanzania

(5) Sustainability

The sustainability of the project is expected to be high. The national policy of Tanzania for reforming the road sector has been firmly and continuously maintained. All the three agencies are statutory body. Because of such institutional and financial backbone of them, organized and continued actions are expected to be rendered for utilizing and renewing various outcomes that the project has presented.

3-3. Conclusion

The project purposes were substantially achieved. While there were some difficulties to asses along with the prepared Project Design Matrix, the project activities were mostly implemented as planned. Through the outcomes accumulated by such activities, considerable contributions could be done to the implementation agencies.

3-4. Recommendations

(1) To implement the Action Plan: Sustainable Training Program of TANROADS

It is recognized that TANROADS is now capable of planning and implementing various training by its own resources. The Action Plan and its supplement recommendation made by the project team serve as the basis of implementing the sustainable training program in TANROADS.

(2) To prepare implementation Strategy of SSTP Evaluation

The project supported to review the SSTP through utilizing local consultant resources. It is recommended for CRB positively to realize the recommendation made by the SSTP review.

(3) To enhancement of Technical Audit by RFB

The project supported to prepare Technical Audit Manual, and enhancing the technical audit conducted by RFB is desirable in order to strengthen the management of road maintenance works implemented by the executing agencies. The project and the evaluation team expect that the Technical Audit Manual prepared through the Project will serve as a key document for the appropriate Technical Audit.

(4) To maintain the appropriate fund level for the Road Maintenance

The project implementation period was a time of sector reform and many development and progress was observed in a road maintenance environment. One of the key developments was an increase of Road Maintenance Fund with the increase of Fuel Levy. It is recommended both by the Project team and the evaluation team that the appropriate funding level for the Road Maintenance will be maintained for the better management of the road maintenance works.

3-5. Lessons Learned

Not applicable.

3-6. Follow-up Situation

Not applicable.