

## Summary

<b>1. Outline of the Project</b>		
<b>Country</b> : Republic of Uzbekistan		<b>Project title</b> : Nursing Education Improvement Project
<b>Issue/Sector</b> : Health / Medical care		<b>Issue/Sector</b> : Technical Cooperation
<b>Division in charge</b> : Uzbekistan Office		<b>Total cost</b> : 640 million yen
<b>Period of Cooperation</b>	1/ July/ 2004 - 30/ June/ 2009 (5 years)	<b>Partner Country's Implementing Organization</b> : Ministry of Health (MOH) Ministry of Higher and Secondary Specialized Education (MOHSSE)
		<b>Supporting Organization in Japan</b> : Oita University of Nursing and Health Sciences
<b>1-1. Background of the Project</b>		
<p>In the Republic of Uzbekistan (hereinafter referred to as “Uzbekistan”), higher education for medical personnel was one of the important issues in improvement of health system by decree of the President at November 1998. Through the analysis of health system in developed countries, the Government of Uzbekistan recognized that technical trained nurses have important roles for national health and improvement of nursing education system is necessary to enhance the medical services through the innovation of international standard nursing. The Ministry of Health of Uzbekistan (hereinafter referred to as “MOH”) has been introducing an improvement of nursing education system. As a part of the improvement, all medical institutions changed into three-year medical colleges by 2005 and also a faculty of nursing (three years) was established as an annex of a faculty of medicine of an university as advanced training after medical college.</p> <p>In these circumstances, Uzbekistan requested technical cooperation on nursing education and nursing management to the Government of Japan, which had conducted technical assistance by dispatching short-term experts in the nursing fields. The Government of Japan commenced “Nursing Education Improvement Project” (hereinafter referred to as “the Project”) for five years from July 2004 with MOH and Ministry of Higher and Secondary Specialized Education in Uzbekistan (hereinafter referred to as “MOHSSE”) as counterpart organizations.</p>		
<b>1-2. Project Overview</b>		
<b>(1) Overall Goal</b>		
Nursing education, based on “Client-Oriented Nursing (hereinafter referred to as CON)”, is innovated in medical colleges throughout the country.		
<b>(2) Project Purpose</b>		
An educational model based on “Client-Oriented Nursing” is established.		

### (3) Outputs

- Output 1 Concept of “Client-Oriented Nursing” is introduced into in-school education at First Republic Medical College (hereinafter referred to as FRMC).
- Output 1-1 Teaching Plan and Teaching Program based on “Client-Oriented Nursing” for FRMC are approved by ministries of health and higher and secondary specialized education.
- Output 1-2 Teaching guidelines for seven subjects are prepared based on “Client-Oriented Nursing”.
- Output 1-3 Teaching method of “Client-Oriented Nursing” is understood by the nursing teachers.
- Output 2 CON practice teaching is introduced in the model hospital.
- Output 3 Standard of nursing education (Teaching Plan and Teaching Program) is proposed.

### (4) Inputs (At the timing of Terminal Evaluation)

#### Japanese Side

Long-term Expert: 5 persons, Short-term Expert: 103 persons, Training in Japan: 39 persons, Equipment: US\$305,541 (27.5 million yen, Local Cost: US\$641,803 (57.8 million yen)

#### Uzbekistan Side

Counterpart: 6 persons, Land and Facility, Local Cost (Renovation of NEC) : 40,000US\$ (3.6 million yen) , Operation Cost of NEC: US\$14,836 (20,213,000 sum)

(According to the JICA official rate, December 2008: US\$=90.02 yen=1,362.43sum)

## 2. Evaluation Team

<b>Members of Evaluation Team</b>	<b>Japanese Side</b> Mr. Keiichi TAKEMOTO, Leader, Director, Health Human Resources Division, Health Human Resources and Infectious Disease Control Group, Human Development Department, JICA Dr. Tomoko KUSAMA, Special Advisor, President, Oita University of Nursing and Health Sciences Dr. Yayoi TAMURA, Nursing Education, President, National College of Nursing, Japan Ms. Haruka SHINDO, Cooperation Planning, Health Human Resources Division, Health Human Resources and Infectious Disease Control Group, Human Development Department, JICA Mr. Jun YAMAZAKI, Operation Management, Representative, JICA Uzbekistan Office Mr. Shuichi SUZUKI, Evaluation, Fujita Planning Co.,Ltd Ms. Yurika KURODA, Interpreter, Japan International Cooperation Center	
	<b>Uzbekistan Side</b> Ms. Alimova Matlyuba, Head of education department, MOH Ms. Nazarova Salima, Department of Human Resource, Medical Educational Facilities and Science, MOH Ms. Salikhodjaeva Rikhsi, Chief Specialist on Nursing Education, MOH	
<b>Period of Evaluation</b>	3/ Dec./ 2008 – 24/ Dec. 2008	Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation

### 3. RESULTS OF EVALUATION7

#### 3-1. Achievements

##### (1) Outputs

###### Output 1 Concept of “Client-Oriented Nursing” is introduced into in-school education at FRMC.

- Objective Verifiable Indicators: 1-1-1. Authorized persons of MOH and MOHSSE sign to approve the draft Teaching Plan by September 2006. 1-1-2. Authorized persons of MOH sign to approve the draft Teaching Program based on “client-oriented nursing” for the FRMC by September 2008. 1-2. Teaching guidelines are accredited through the third party by March 2009. 1-3. 80% of C/P staff, teachers of nursing practice teaching and re-training members of FRMC pass the comprehension test on client-oriented nursing based on the teaching guideline by March 2009.
- Achievements: Teaching Plan was approved by MOHSSE in July 2006. Teaching Programs of the all seven subjects were approved by December 2007. Teaching Guidelines of “Fundamental Nursing” was completed at same time with Teaching Program, and the one of “Adult Health Nursing” was completed in February 2008, and the other 5 subjects (Gerontological Nursing, Child Health Nursing, Maternal Health Nursing, Community Health Nursing, Psychiatric Nursing) were completed in October 2008. The guidelines are going to be evaluated by the Center of Medical Education Development under MOH. According the questionnaire survey to the teachers which was carried out in December 2008, over the half of the teachers reached expected level of CON knowledge and the indicator of the output 1-3 will be attained as planned.

###### Output 2 CON practice teaching is introduced in the model hospital.

- Objective Verifiable Indicators: The following minimum requirements of CON practice are fulfilled in the clinical practices at model hospital and FRMC’s practice hospitals by June 2009. (1)The health facilities assign suitable nurses for 80% of students in clinical practice by beginning of practicing. (2)To prepare patients who will be attached to 80% of students by beginning of practicing. (3)80% of students can obtain information from patient’s record and also during nursing process within first 2 days of practice period. (4)80% of conference with head nurse is conducted.
- Achievements: Practice Programs of the all 7 subjects were approved before the terminal evaluation. After the guidelines were completed, seminars for person in-charge of clinical practice at the hospital were conducted. Then, the clinical practice of “Fundamental Nursing” and “Adult Health Nursing” have been implemented in 2008. The readiness of the hospitals for clinical practice was confirmed appropriate based on four view points such as assignment of suitable nurses, preparation of Attending Nursing System, information from patient’s record and conference with head nurse through review of clinical practice record of students, interviews to clinical practice teachers and monitoring by the Project. The result of the survey described that all hospitals were almost appropriate.

###### Output 3 Standard of nursing education (Teaching Plan and Teaching Program) is proposed.

- Objective Verifiable Indicators: MOH accepts the proposal prepared by the project by June 2009.
- Achievements: It has not been started yet at the timing of terminal evaluation but it will be submitted to MOH by the Project before June 2009. The contents of the proposal will be compiled to reflect the

feedback from the lecture, nursing practice in school and clinical practice in FRMC and Model Hospitals.

## **(2) Project Purpose**

An educational model based on “Client-Oriented Nursing” is established.

- Objective Verifiable Indicators: 70 % of graduates of FRMC in 2009 pass a comprehension test on client-oriented nursing.
- Achievements: The comprehension test about CON for the students will be implemented in June 2009 as planned. Since the progress of each output such as the comprehension of the teachers and establishment of the facilities for clinical practices is on the schedule, project purpose will be attained successfully.

## **(3) Overall Goal**

Nursing education, based on “Client-Oriented Nursing (hereinafter referred to as CON)”, is innovated in medical colleges throughout the country.

- Objective Verifiable Indicators: 100 % of medical colleges starts the education based on “client-oriented nursing” by 2012.
- Achievements: It was confirmed that MOH intends to disseminate CON education step by step from 2009 to 2012. Since there are not enough skilled trainers for the upgrading of nursing teachers, MOH has to take a lot of effort to secure the number of skilled trainers to attain the substantial dissemination of CON education.

### **3-2. Summary of Evaluation Results**

#### **(1) Relevance**

The Project started as a part of “nursing education reform” under “Presidential Decree about National Program of Reforming the Health Care System of the Republic of Uzbekistan”. Afterwards, the continuation of health sector reform was confirmed by a new decree issued in 2007.

In the Country Strategy of JICA, since health sector is one of the most important sectors in the important supporting field of “Social Sector Restructuring” that the Project and health reform program are implemented under the same strategy as of the commencement of the Project.

As issues of nursing in Uzbekistan, to have the patients in mind is not considered as priority for nurses in the conventional nursing education.. Therefore, nursing education, which is oriented to totality of a patient, is required. Medical colleges, hospitals and students show great interest on CON. Therefore, the relevance of the Project is high.

#### **(2) Effectiveness**

The Project is progressing as scheduled and the nursing education based on CON has been implemented appropriately. Therefore, project purpose of which the comprehension of the students in the indicator is expected to be attained. It can be said that the effectiveness is high. It was mentioned as an important assumption at the mid-term evaluation that the number of students in FRMC was unexpectedly increased as secondary education has become compulsory and that its increment might be one of the causes to worsen the quality of education. MOH ,FRMC and the Project took much effort to minimize the influence from the

issue.

### **(3) Efficiency**

Since the Project introduces new concept such as CON, the Project required the involvement of a large number of personnel, both Uzbekistan side and Japanese side (e.g. 5 long-term and 103 short-term experts) and enormous inputs for interpretation and translation. Through fostering interpreters and translators in the Project itself, effective technical transfer became possible by more accurate translation and interpretation. On the other hands, the Japanese experts dispatched for several months at one time (Mid-term experts), have made possible smooth implementation of the Project, especially by reducing the burden of long-term experts and doing follow-up of the work of short-term experts.

### **(4) Impact**

#### 1) Prospect of achievement of the Overall Goal

MOH intends to disseminate CON education step by step from 2009 to 2012. Since there are not enough skilled trainers for the upgrading of nursing teachers, MOH has to take a lot of effort to secure the number of skilled trainers to attain the substantial dissemination of CON education.

One month after the improved Teaching Plan developed by the Project was approved (August 2006), MOH submitted the adopted Teaching Plan, which might have been developed based on the improved Teaching Plan. The adopted Teaching Plan was developed by MOH to facilitate smooth installation of the improved Teaching Plan.

#### 2) Positive impacts

Nurses in hospitals and teachers in medical colleges through out the country have become interested in the concept of CON through the seminars and the other Project activities. Even though nursing education in Uzbekistan is directed to install CON concept, practice of CON in the hospitals and medical colleges nationwide will be implemented from now on.

#### 3) Negative impacts

Because of the increasing number of students of the FRMC, MOH ordered that clinical practice of the students of FRMC should be prioritized. Therefore, coordination between students from FRMC and other medical colleges was burden of the hospitals for clinical practice.

### **(5) Sustainability**

It was recommended at the mid-term evaluation that in order to develop the Project achievements after the termination of the Project, necessary measures to sustain the function of Nursing Education Center (hereinafter referred to as NEC) should be taken. At the timing of terminal evaluation, MOH intends to maintain NEC in FRMC as an independent organization named “Nursing Teachers Upgrading (Re-training) Center”.

However, the equipment for CON education in newly established medical colleges is not sufficient to implement the improved Teaching Plan.

### **3-3. Factors that have promoted project**

#### **(1) Regarding Planning**

- 1) As the participants were exposed to CON concept, the seminars in early stage of the Project had one of the important roles, although huge number of participants joined the seminar and even those who were not supposed to be among the target group also participated.

#### **(2) Regarding Implementation process**

- 1) The Project C/Ps maintained high motivation to improve nursing education in Uzbekistan even though the salary for their work in NEC is less than the salary they received when working in FRMC. Japanese experts are also working hard also on weekends to develop C/P and teachers' capacity.
- 2) Video conference promoted involvement of the numerous participants makes communication easier for people concerned who are in remote areas.

### **3-4. Factors that have inhibited project**

#### **(1) Regarding Planning**

- 1) Though in preparatory study, it was considered that three long-term experts were enough inputs to revise the curriculum, a huge amount of work for WG members to revise the curriculum was necessary in fact. And absence of Chief Advisor at early stage is one of the causes of the delays of various activities. Moreover, burden of the interpretations and translation to Russian and Uzbek Languages became heavier than planned because participation of Japanese side has been increased comparing to planned participation.
- 2) It was confirmed in the mid-term evaluation that some technical terms were understood differently between both sides. Since there was no interpreter or translator between Japanese and Russian Languages in Uzbekistan, who well understand technical terms in medical and nursing fields, the Project itself had to train the interpreters and translators.

#### **(2) Regarding Implementation process**

- 1) Involvement of numerous participants complicated the process of decision-makings, reporting, communication and consulting.
- 2) Unexpected increase of students in the FRMC required the Project to prepare additional hospitals for clinical practice other than planned model hospital.

### **3-5. Conclusions**

The Project intended to attain the dissemination of CON concept through improvement of Teaching Plan, Teaching Program, Teaching Guideline and Practice Program of nursing education course in medical college. Since the workload of the Project was underestimated in the initial plan and the input for the Project has been increased gradually. By the absence of Chief Advisor at early stage, the Project needed to increase assistances from the supporting organization in Japan for the Project implementation. After the mid-term evaluation, and especially by dispatching "mid-term experts" the Project strengthened the process of technical cooperation with more direct and continuous cooperation in the field by the expert; This is a

characteristic of JICA's technical cooperation. Then Uzbekistan side deepened the understanding, of the CON and Project implementation process.

Since the roadmap to disseminate improved curriculum through the activities of Uzbekistan side have been clarified and continuation of NEC is already decided, the benefits and outcome produced by the Project will be utilized and developed continuously even after the completion of the Project.

### **3-6. Recommendations**

It is recommended that the Project will be completed in June 2009 as planned. The reason of the recommendation is followings; Project Purpose will be attained as planned, the roadmap to attain overall goal was shown clearly and sustainability of NEC has been also clarified.

- (1) The Project is recommended to continue comprehensive questionnaire of CON to teachers, students, and in-charge of clinical practice in the medical facilities. It is also recommended that the Project shall implement technical transfers to Uzbekistan side to strengthen the function of NEC for the nationwide dissemination with the reinforcement of relationship with Uzbekistan side.
- (2) It is recommended that NEC shall promote technical transfer from the Project for the continuous self-enhancement of its function with good collaboration with other nursing teacher upgrading centers. The present capacity of NEC is not so strong as MOH and MOHSSE could implement the dissemination of the integrated curriculum autonomously. Therefore, the human resource management and financial capacity of NEC should be enhanced.
- (3) It is preferable that JICA Uzbekistan Office shall monitor the administration of NEC continuously in collaboration with MOH after the completion of the Project. Moreover, it is also preferable to consider a possibility of the cooperation regarding the upgrading or re-training of nursing teachers, and the higher nursing education.

### **3-7. Lessons Learned**

#### **(1) Planning at preparatory study**

The project objective is to innovate of the concept of CON. Though there is no measure to innovate except language and language interpretation should be accurate, it is not concerned how to transfer and importance of the interpreters and translators. And the plan to renovate the national policy for nursing education by three long-term experts has been too difficult. Therefore, in the preparatory stage, appropriate inputs and action plan shall be estimated based on the detail analysis of the present situations and share of the road map to the goal.

#### **(2) Role of chief advisor**

Chief advisor is a responsible person in the field of technical cooperation by JICA and has important roles to coordinate between Jana side and recipient side such as promoting the technical cooperation scheme by JICA into people concerned of recipient side, building good relationship with them and so on. Therefore, the chief advisor shall dispatch before the commencement of the project.