

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Shiro Otomo Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Construction of Primary Schools and Junior High Schools	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	The Democratic Republic of Timor-Leste	
Project Period	May 2004-February 2006	
Executing Agency	Ministry of Education, Culture, Youth and Sports	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 550 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 528 million yen
Main Contractors	Tobishima Corporation	
Main Consultants	Mohri Architect & Associates, Inc.	
Basic Design	The Basic Design Study on the Project for Construction of Primary Schools in the Democratic Republic of Timor-Leste, JICA, August, 2003	
Related Projects (if any)	Fundamental School Quality Project (World Bank), 100 School Project (UNICEF),	
Project Background	<p>In Timor-Leste, after most of the school facilities were destroyed during the conflict in 1999, the construction and the rehabilitation of many classrooms was required at primary education institutions. Emergency repairs of classrooms were carried out mainly with the aid of the World Bank provided through the Timor-Leste Trust Fund (TFET). From May 2002, Fundamental School Quality Project (FSQP) got started in securing the quality of school facilities. As part of the project, plans were formed for setting up integrated primary and junior secondary schools, which were expected to serve as model schools in the districts, and for constructing and repairing primary schools. Under the plans, the construction and rehabilitation of classrooms was carried out. In FSQP, however, it turned out that for financial reasons it would be difficult to construct all the integrated primary and junior secondary schools. There were doubts as to whether the system of integrated primary and junior secondary schools could get started in all the districts. In addition, classrooms that had not been included in the project for aid were left neglected with no plan prepared for their rehabilitation. Throughout the country, there was therefore still a great need for the construction and rehabilitation of school facilities.</p>	
Project Objective	<p>The objective of the project is to construct and repair facilities for primary and junior secondary schools in Timor-Leste for the purpose of setting up integrated primary and junior secondary schools (Escola Basica: EB) and improving the educational environment of the schools covered by this project.</p>	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	<p><Construction> Construction of 63 classrooms, and teacher's rooms in 6 EB and 6 PS (Primary School) Construction of special classrooms in 6 EB Procurement of educational furniture for the above constructed classrooms Construction of students toilets in 6 EB and 6 PS <Software Component Program> Technical assistance for the school facility maintenance</p>	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>In this project, facilities were constructed for and repaired at primary and junior secondary schools in East Timor. This construction and rehabilitation was carried out generally as planned, with the software components also provided generally as planned. It is acknowledged that EB schools constructed or repaired have served to a certain degree to allow for the operation of the EB system, and the primary schools have also enabled the cluster system to become prevalent.</p> <p>The schools included in this project continue to operate. However, in terms of operation and maintenance, since the present state of arrangements for operation and maintenance could not be obtained from the implementing agency during the survey, an evaluation cannot be made in terms of the sustainability of the project.</p> <p>In light of the evaluation result on its effectiveness and impact, this project can be evaluated to produce the fairly sufficient outcomes.</p> <p><Constraints of this evaluation study> Since neither the present state of the facilities constructed in this project nor the state of their operation or maintenance was known, the evaluation cannot be made in terms of sustainability of this project.</p>

1 Relevance
<p>(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Timor-Leste This project is related to “primary and secondary education,” a priority area in Timor-Leste’s National Development Plan (2000-2003) and also in a draft of the current Strategic Development Plan (2011-2030). It is also related to “Human Resources Development,” which the country has ranked third among its seven National Priorities for 2010. Therefore, the project is relevant to its development plan.</p> <p>(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Timor-Leste The country continues to carry out policies for the construction and rehabilitation of school facilities in order to develop its educational infrastructure. The construction and repair of facilities at primary and junior secondary schools in this project are relevant to its development needs.</p> <p>(3) Relevance with Japan’s ODA Policy According to Japan’s principles on ODA for Timor-Leste stated in the Japan ODA Data Book (2003), “human resources development” and “infrastructure development” are regarded as priority areas for the country. This project is related to both these targets, so it is relevant to Japan’s ODA policy.</p> <p>This project has been highly relevant with the country’s development plan, development needs, as well as Japan’s ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.</p>
2 Efficiency
<p>(1) Project Outputs Outputs on the Japan side were as planned.</p> <p>(2) Project Period (Project Inputs) The project, designed to be completed in 21 months according to the plan, was actually completed in 25 months, slightly longer than planned by four months (119% of the planned period). However, the actual period includes the period from conclusion of a contract to inception of the detailed study and the period for issuance of the certification on the completion of the study by the implementing agency, those were excluded in the planned period. Since substantive works of the detailed design and construction were conducted within the planned duration without any delay, it can be said that the project period was as planned.</p> <p>(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs) While the planned cost was 590 million yen, the actual project cost was 568 million yen, within the plan and 22 million yen lower than planned (96% of planned cost).</p> <p>The project cost was lower than planned. Although the project period was slightly longer than planned, the project period of the substantive works were completed within the planned duration. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is high.</p>
3 Effectiveness / Impact
<p>(1) Quantitative Effects At schools constructed or repaired in this project, the “number of students per classroom” improved, falling from 51.2 (2003) to 39.3 (2009). While the target had been set at 30.6 students in 2006, the actual figure in 2006 could not be obtained. The actual figure in 2009 was missed mainly because alterations in the shift system at the schools involved resulted in a decline in the total number of classrooms based on the shifts. In this connection, if there were no change in the shift system at the schools, the actual result can be estimated to achieve the target number.</p> <p>(2) Qualitative Effects According to a response from the implementing agency, EB schools constructed in this project are being effectively used, a fact that suggests their contribution to development of the EB system to a certain degree.</p> <p>(3) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact) According to responses from the implementing agency, the facilities provided in this project are also effectively used for social education activities in the communities. The primary schools are also effectively used for promoting cluster activities. These facts suggest that this project contributes to such activities to a certain degree. A reduction in the operation and maintenance expenses was also reported in a response from the agency.</p> <p>There was no impact on the natural environment. Neither was there any negative impact from the relocation of residents or land acquisition.</p> <p>This project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair.</p>
4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

The facilities at each school are operated and maintained by the school itself. According to responses from the Ministry of Education, Culture, Youth and Sports (MECYS), schools do not seem to have any staff specifically designated for the operation or maintenance of their facilities, and no information is available concerning the operation and maintenance systems in the schools, with the current state of such systems left unknown. An evaluation is therefore not possible.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

No information is available concerning the technical aspects of operation and maintenance of the implementing agency and the schools, an evaluation is therefore not possible.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Sufficient information is not available concerning the financial aspects, an evaluation is therefore not possible.

In this connection, the budget for MECYS is on an upward trend. The 2010 budget for MECYS mentions the provision and maintenance of school facilities as a target in the annual action plan, although the breakdown of the appropriations is unknown and school construction and rehabilitation programs have been established for the plan.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

Sufficient information is not available concerning the current status of the operation and maintenance of the schools, an evaluation is therefore not possible. However, the schools included in this project are still in operation.

As stated above, since sufficient information could not be obtained from the implementing agency, the current condition of the facilities at the schools and the status of the operation maintenance by the implementing agency and the schools are unknown. An evaluation in terms of the sustainability is therefore not possible.