

## Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Miho Kawahatsu Waseda Research Institute Corporation (WRI)	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Construction of Primary Schools in Phnom Penh in the Kingdom of Cambodia	January 2010 – December 2010

### I Project Outline

Country Name	The Kingdom of Cambodia	
Project Period	June 2004-October 2005	
Executing Agency	The Education Youth and Sport and Sport Service of Phnom Penh Municipality	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 509 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 493 million yen
Main Contractors	Taisei Corporation	
Main Consultants	System Science Consultants Inc.	
Basic Design	July 2004	
Related Projects (if any)	N.A	
Project Background	The Government of Cambodia adopted the Education Strategic Plan (ESP) and the Education Sector Support Program (ESSP) to assure equitable access to education services by reducing classroom shortages. However, due to rapid population growth as well as a shortage of budgetary funds allocated to the education sector, the construction of school facilities was lagging, especially in Phnom Penh. Most primary schools with excessive number of students have had to conduct either double-shift or triple-shift classes. Also, many of those schools have been obliged to use either temporary or badly damaged classrooms, hampering efforts to provide equitable access. In light of the above, the Government of Cambodia requested grant-aid assistance from the Government of Japan for the construction of primary school buildings in Phnom Penh.	
Project Objective	To reconstruct and expand school buildings of existing schools, in order to improve the educational environment of primary education in Phnom Penh.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Reconstruction and/or expansion of school facilities at 5 elementary schools located in Phnom Penh: Bak Touk, San Thor Mok, Tour Kok, Anu Wat Reach Theany, Boeung Salang</li> <li>2. Provision of school furniture (tables, chairs, benches, whiteboards, etc.) for classrooms, libraries, meeting rooms, workshops for the above mentioned schools.</li> </ol>	

### II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>To the extent that can be judged from data values for indicators related to the effectiveness of this project, in addition to there being strong project effects in the improvement of the education environment, wide-ranging spillover effects can be seen such as cluster activities by teachers and social activities featuring participation by community residents. From the viewpoint of sustainability, however, because each school has had a financial structure which made it necessary for the school itself to undertake operation and maintenance management, there is a degree of concern over ensuring a source of funds for stable covering of costs of operation over time.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p> <p>&lt;Recommendations&gt;</p> <p>As recommendations to the executing agency, mention was made of matters related to the financial sustainability of the project. Because it is indispensable for each school to acquire its own source of funds so as to improve the financial foundation of the school, what is needed is a strengthening of school management capacity through training in the subject by specialists and for schoolmasters and managers, and through each school's acquiring effective methods of both activity planning and fundraising.</p> <p>&lt;Constraints of this evaluation study&gt;</p> <p>Some uncertainty regarding details for this evaluation review exist, because the target schools are five in number and there are some deficiencies in the financial balance information obtained by use of the questionnaire for the executing agency, meaning that evaluation results are susceptible to the level of information available. Note that because of this the evaluation has had to be by means of identifying the overall situation at the schools as a whole.</p>

## 1 Relevance

### (1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Cambodia

At the time of the project planning this project, the high level national planning for the education sector was embodied in the Education Strategic Plan (ESP) and the Education Sector Support Program (ESSP) that had the objective of providing "Education for All." In particular, regarding the fair expansion of access to education, the goal had been adopted to completely eliminate by 2005 the severe overcrowding of the present and future primary schools by building additional classrooms. Since then, and after completion of this project, an action program titled Education for All (EFA) was adopted to accelerate efforts toward the above-mentioned goal. In addition, the ESP for 2006-2010 was prepared with the medium-term targets of improvement of education quality and internal efficiency, assuring fair access to educational opportunities, and capacity building for the sake of promoting regional autonomy.

Also, the Education Sector Support Program (ESSP ; 2006-2010) was revised in order to make it easier to shift to implementation of ESP and this is an ongoing activity today. In January 2009, there was a Mid-Term Review of ESSP and ESP at which time the extent of progress was assessed and some revisions were made. In addition, it was reported that there had been progress in terms of the number of six-year-olds entering school and reduction of the cost of education, there had been improvement of the laws regarding the age for starting education, as well as drafting of guidelines for elimination of informal payments to impoverished families. Strong efforts continue to be made at ensuring fair educational opportunities, so the project is deemed to be consistent with development plans.

### (2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Cambodia

Education facilities were in very short supply at the time of planning this project, in particular because of a large-scale inflow of Cambodians from rural villages to Phnom Penh. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, importance had been assigned to fair supply of opportunities to obtain education throughout the nation, including rural villages and ethnic minority communities, this from the viewpoint of improving basic education for the entire nation, in keeping with the Mid-Term Review of the education sector support program and ESP. Therefore, considering the continued high importance of meeting development requirements for education as is evident at the time of the ex-post evaluation, the project is judged to have relevance to the nation's development needs.

### (3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

In Japan's development cooperation program for Cambodia at the time of project planning, improvement of basic education and of the medical care fields were assigned high importance as being fundamental to achieving a sustained growth of the economy. From the viewpoint of medium- and long-term development of human resources, expanding access to basic education is of extreme importance.

Thus, this project has been highly relevant with Cambodia's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its overall relevance is high.

## 2 Efficiency

### (1) Project Outputs

The following changes were made concerning output from the Japanese side.

The location of toilet and other facilities was changed at the AnuWat Reach Teany primary school site. This was done because of installation of water drainage lines by the city of Phnom Penh. Strengthening of joists for the foundation and footings at BakTouk and AnuWat Reach Teany was done and the dimensions of columns were changed. This was done because of in driving piles change within the allowable margin of the design had to be made in the location of the piles.

### (2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

Both the original plan and actual project period were 16 months, from June 2004 (E/N) to October 2005. The project was accomplished as planned (100%).

### (3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

Total project cost was 493 million yen; the amount in the E/N was 509 million yen, so the accomplishment was within planned budget (97%).

Both project period and project cost was mostly as planned, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

## 3 Effectiveness / Impact

### (1) Quantitative Effects

The number of pupils per classroom for the five schools covered by this project was obtained as 58.6 pupils, and compared to the target figures for 2004. The target was 39.2 pupils/classroom in 2006. In that year, the number was 25 pupils/classroom and thus the objective was achieved. In terms of the effect of the project, the degree of overcrowding was reduced by half.

According to the response from the executing agency at the time of the ex-post evaluation, the number of pupils per classroom has now risen to about 40. Even with this setback, overcrowding is less than it was before the project. Specifically, whereas before the project, the rooms were used by three shifts of pupils daily but this has been reduced to two shifts at most, and the mobile class that at the time of the project planning, it might have affected school attendance adversely, is no longer in existence, and it was said that the improvement in the conditions for learning is continuing.

### (2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, land acquisition and resettlement, unintended positive/negative impact)

The project sought to improve the girls' enrollment and graduation rates by the indirect means of eliminating a constraint to the increase in their enrollment, by improving the girls' toilets. We could not confirm with quantitative data a significant cause-and-effect relationship in this matter but we did receive in the response from the executing agency that having sanitary toilets for girls has

improved the attendance rate, promoted greater awareness of hygiene and health, and aided hygiene education by the teachers. Thus, at the present time although there is a limit to what can be done by way of quantifying impact of the project, it is believed that the potential spillover effects are substantial.

The indirect impact of use of the classrooms that were planned to function also as meeting rooms includes their use for various cluster activities by teachers as well as voluntary work by community members. In this connection, the executing agency reported that from 30 to about 100 persons a time engage in this sort of activity with a frequency of once or twice a month.

Also, there were no reports of problems associated with the natural environment, land acquisition, and resettlement nor were there any reports of major negative impact.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

#### 4 Sustainability

##### (1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

According to the executing agency, community residents have continued to increase their participation of activities related to the target schools. Regarding operation of the schools, we were informed that operation and maintenance is done by school supporting committees. When asked about any changes in the institutional arrangements after the project was implemented we were told that the number of persons participated had been increased.

##### (2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Response to the questionnaire shows that there has not been any occurrence of a major problem at the technical level in connection with operation and maintenance of the schools. The O&M requirements created by the project consist of maintaining functionality and hygiene of the toilets through cleaning work and maintenance, repair of school furniture and repainting of exteriors and interiors. This is similar to the situation at other schools and can be done by the school-support organization. The executing agency has also reported that there are no problems from a technical viewpoint in operating and maintaining the facilities.

##### (3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

According to the response from the executing agency, O&M expenses for each school are paid on a school by school basis (with exception of personnel costs) and the source of funds are (1) government program budgets, (2) contributions from the community, and (3) fees for use of the land or facilities of the school. Power and water utilities are paid for by each school.

It was not expected at the time the project was planned that there would be a large increase in the cost of operating and maintaining the facilities and equipment, power and water utility charges were assumed to be borne by each school. However, the added costs of O&M caused by the project come to from 9.4% to 38.2% of annual income of the schools, and was planned that fund subsidies would be provided by Phnom Penh municipality to cover these increases.

It was not possible at the time of the ex-post evaluation to determine in detail the situation regarding school budgets and income including any subsidies from Phnom Penh municipality, or expenditures for personnel, utilities etc. The income for any given school is quite limited from tuition alone, while necessary expenses may rise with increases in enrollment over time. Thus, it is thought to be essential to secure stable funding for the schools. Nevertheless the response indicated that collections were not being made of contributions from community members for use of facilities so it is not clear how these activities are being funded. Moreover, it was not possible to confirm the situation regarding methodology and budgets for obtaining suitable funds for operation at each school.

##### (4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

The response from the executing agency indicated that the facilities and equipment obtained through this project were being fully utilized.

Some problems have been observed in terms of financial aspects, therefore sustainability of the project effects is fair.