

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Hideyuki Takagi Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Enhancement of the Civilian Police	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Indonesia	
Project Period	September 2004-January 2006	
Executing Agency	The Indonesian National Police : INP	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 518 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 512 million yen
Main Contractors	(Procurement) Sumitomo Corporation	
Main Consultants	Yachiyo Engineering Co., Ltd.	
Basic Design	July 2004	
Related Projects (if any)	Program for Supporting Reform of the Indonesian National Police (2001) Civil Police Activities Promotion Project (Phase I: 2002-2007, Phase 2: 2007-2012)	
Project Background	The Indonesian armed forces had taken responsibility for public order in Indonesia over the past 30 years. But amidst the country's trend toward democratization, the Indonesian National Police (INP) were officially detached and made independent from the Indonesian armed forces by a resolution of the People's Consultative Assembly in August 2000, and was entrusted with the responsibility for public order. Since then police reforms have been promoted, but there are still demands for constitutional reform of the INP for promoting democratization and the transition to the civilian police in consideration of the actual police activities and the awareness of the police officers. For meeting such needs, Japan was requested to provide targeted police stations with the equipment and materials required for police activities.	
Project Objective	The objective of this project is to contribute to the promotion of civilian police activities by providing related police stations in Indonesia with radio communication equipment, criminal identification equipment, and simple drug identification equipment.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> (1) Provision of equipment for a radio communication system (construction of a radio communication system within the Bekasi Resort Police station, equipment needed to install a radio relay station in order to build a communications command system between the Jakarta Metropolitan Police and the Bekasi Resort Police Station) (2) Provision of onsite criminal identification equipment (photo developing and printing machines to the Jakarta Metropolitan Police and onsite criminal identification sets to the three copying pilot stations (Chimahi, Kendal, and Sidoarjo)) (3) Provision of simple drug identification equipment (simple drug identification kits, sample drug testing sets, and small radio systems for searches for INP Headquarters, the Jakarta Metropolitan Police, and provincial police headquarters in eight provinces with jurisdiction over nine priority drug enforcement sites) 	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>This project has been consistent with the Indonesian National Development Plan (PROPENAS), which advocated for the promotion of democratic police administration services and the continuation of police reforms, as well as with Indonesia's development needs and Japan's ODA policy; therefore the relevance of the project is high. Since the provision of equipment and materials was carried out as planned, the expected outputs of installing a radio communication network and deploying identification equipment were largely achieved. Although after the completion of the project there were reports of problems with dead zones with radio communication, this was properly handled through a survey conducted by consultants dispatched from Japan and a technical cooperation project implemented afterward by JICA. On the other hand, according to the results of surveys of the citizens in the target area, improvements such as elevating police performance and improving public order in the area since the project completion were not recognized. Therefore, the effectiveness of the project can be thought to be fair. In terms of sustainability, it was impossible to evaluate in the ex-post evaluation study since information related to the current operation and maintenance status of the furnished equipment could not be acquired.</p> <p>In light of the evaluation result on its effectiveness and impact, this project can be evaluated to produce fairly sufficient outcomes.</p> <p><Constraints of this evaluation study> Since no response was received from the questionnaire to the executing agency, analysis was based on information from JICA and the results of interviews with the contractors as the primary sources of information.</p>
1 Relevance
<p>(1) Relevance with the Development Policy of the Republic of Indonesia In order to establish a country governed by the rule of law, policies related to police reform were implemented. A new police law was</p>

promulgated in PROPENAS (2000-2004) at the time of project commencement. At the time of the ex-post evaluation, PROPENAS (2004-2009) was aiming to realize just and democratic Indonesia, while in PROPENAS (2000-2004) it was deemed that reinforcement of the democratic police administration was necessary.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of the Republic of Indonesia

As police reforms were promoted, there were demands that democratic police administration services be provided by the national police. Moreover, they have been required to assure domestic stability and security as the public order situation was still marked by a high incidence of crime. Therefore, this project is relevant with Indonesia's development needs.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

Japan's Country Assistance Program for Indonesia (2004) upheld "the creation of a democratic and fair society" as one of its three priority areas. The Program also specified providing more proactive support for "police reform," which was indicated therein under governance reforms.

This project has been highly relevant with Indonesia's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

The outputs on the Japanese side are listed in "Project Outline." The equipment was provided as planned.

(2) Project Period

The actual project period came to 17 months, while 14 months were planned period. It was slightly longer than planned (121% of the plan).

(3) Project Cost

The actual project cost came to 512 million yen, while 518 million yen was planned cost. It was lower than planned (99% of the plan).

Although the project cost was lower than planned, the project period was slightly longer than planned. Therefore, the efficiency of the project is fair.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

Goals and their target value were: for the creation of the radio communication network, the number of police officers who are able to be contacted at any time is increased from 161 to 664; and the number of patrol cars of which their locations are identifiable is increased from 23 to 109. For the deployment of identification sets, the following were set as goals: the Jakarta Metropolitan Police becomes able to develop and print color photographs; the number of police stations where onsite criminal identification equipment is distributed is increased from 2 to 5; and the number of provincial/regional police headquarters and police stations where simple drug identification sets are used is increased from 27 to 207. Since the provision of equipment and materials was carried out as planned, it was surmised that these goals have been largely achieved though indicators such as the number of police officers were unverified in the ex-post evaluation study. What is more, after the completion of the project there were reports of problems with dead zones with the radio communication, but this was properly handled through a survey conducted by Japanese consultants, as well as the installation of antennas in police boxes through the implementation of the Civil Police Activities Promotion Project, a JICA's technical cooperation project.

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

At the time of the ex-ante evaluation it was expected that the project would enable the police to rapidly response to reports from citizens by utilizing the radio communication system in the Bekasi Resort Police Station. But according to the results of interview surveys regarding police reform with the citizen in targeted area where the Bekasi Resort Police Station covered, they did not recognize any significant improvements with regard to elevating the performance of this police station or any accompanying improvements in public order in the region around the time of the installation of the radio communication system in said police station.

Due to the limitations in the evaluation study methodology, there was insufficient information for evaluating effectiveness and impact of this project. Since the provision of equipment and materials was carried out as planned, it was surmised that to a certain degree effects have been generated.

Therefore, the effectiveness of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Since no response was received to the questionnaire from the implementing agency, the structural aspects of operation maintenance could not be verified.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Since no response was received to the questionnaire from the implementing agency, the technical aspects of operation maintenance could not be verified.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Since no response was received to the questionnaire from the implementing agency, the financial aspects of operation maintenance could not be verified.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

Since no response was received to the questionnaire from the implementing agency, the current status of operation maintenance could not be verified.

Due to the limitations of information, sustainability of this project cannot be evaluated.