

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Grant Aid Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Hideyuki Takagi Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Developing Jordan Civil Defence Appliances in the South and North Regions in the Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan	
Project Period	December, 2004-March, 2006	
Executing Agency	Ministry of Interior, General Directorate of Civil Defence (CD)	
Project Cost	Grant Limit: 973 million yen	Actual Grant Amount: 838 million yen
Main Contractors	(Procurement) Marubeni Corporation	
Main Consultants	Fire Equipment and Safety of Japan	
Basic Design	July 2004 - January 2005	
Related Projects (if any)	<Grant Aid> Jordan Fire-Fighting Equipment Development Project (1997)	
Project Background	To respond to substantial increases in numbers of times fire brigades were dispatched due to concentration of population in urban areas, increasing numbers of disasters and accidents in refugee camps, and so on, Jordan formulated socioeconomic development planning, developed laws and regulations concerning fire fighting and disaster countermeasure, and aimed to enhance fire-fighting capacities. However, since under severe fiscal circumstances the nation has been unable to secure sufficient funding for renovation of its stock of emergency vehicles, including fire engines and ambulances, it was difficult to respond to disasters due to the aged conditions of its fleet. Under such circumstances, Japan had been requested to cooperate in developing the nation's fire-fighting and emergency equipment in southern and northern Jordan, as a follow-up to the grant aid Fire-Fighting Equipment Development Project that had targeted the vicinity of the capital city Amman.	
Project Objective	The objective of the project is to enable appropriate fire-fighting and emergency activities, by providing fire-fighting and emergency equipment and training the fire-fighting force in the southern and northern regions of Jordan.	
Output[s] (Japanese Side)	1. Fire-fighting and emergency equipment 1) Pump fire engines: 14 units 2) Lead fire engines: 15 units 3) Rescue vehicles: 2 units 4) Hook and ladder truck: 1 unit 5) Ambulances: 13 units	2. Soft Component (Technical Assistance) 1) Training on hook and ladder truck operation skills 2) Training on fire-fighting tactics and strategies 3) Preparation of hook and ladder truck operation manuals (Arabic)

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high. Regarding efficiency of the project, both project period and project cost were mostly as planned/ within the plan. Thus, efficiency is high. This project has been implemented as planned and expected effectiveness has been observed. The percentage of fire and emergency vehicles that can be mobilized has reached the target of 100%, and this level is maintained at present as well. In addition, the rate of utilization of fire and emergency vehicles in the event of emergencies also is high, and swift fire-fighting and rescue activities have contributed to reducing damage in the 8 target governorates. As impacts of this project, the residents of the 8 target governorates have recognized improvements in safety and decreased uncertainty has prevent outflow of residents from the regions. While budgeting shortfalls at the implementing agency were pointed out, at present no problem has not observed with the state of maintenance of fire-fighting and emergency equipment; thus, no major problems are apparent regarding sustainability.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p> <p><Recommendation to the Executing Agency> At the beginning of the project, no hook and ladder trucks had been assigned to or used in the 8 target governorates. Besides the governorates lacked human resources highly familiar with operation and fire-fighting strategies. Therefore, as part of technical assistance in the project, training was conducted to transfer skills. To respond to increasing building heights in the future, it would be desirable to develop within the CD systems for education and training on matters such as fire-fighting tactics and strategies using equipment such as the hook and ladder truck, pump fire engines, and rescue vehicles, transferred as part of the project's Software Component.</p>

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Jordan

Jordan's National Social & Economic Action Plan (2004-2006) and the National Agenda (2006-2015) points our improvements in administrative services including fire fighting as subject areas. In addition, the Government Development Program (2011-2013) calls for improvements in public infrastructure and administrative services.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Jordan

Currently, both population and the number of fires in 8 targeted governorates in the project have increased by approximately 9% since before implementation of the project and the rate of occurrence of disasters remains high.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

Based on the Japan/Jordan general survey on economic cooperation conducted in 1996 and later policy dialogue, Japan had an intention to stabilize the lives of the Jordanian population through aid in the nation's fire-fighting sector.

This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Efficiency

(1) Project Outputs

Outputs on the Japan side were as planned. While some fire-fighting and emergency equipment have been stolen or damaged, delivery and repairs have been completed appropriately.

(2) Project Period (Project Inputs)

The actual project period was 12 months, while the planned period was 12 months. Thus, the project period was as planned (100% of the planned period).

(3) Project Cost (Project Inputs)

The actual project cost was 838 million yen, while the planned cost was 973 million yen. Thus, the project cost was within the plan (86% of planned cost).

Both project period and project cost were mostly as planned/ within the plan, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

3 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Quantitative Effects

The percentage of fire and emergency vehicles that can be mobilized has reached the target, rising from an initial level of 89% to the target of 100%, and this level is maintained at present as well. The rate of utilization of fire and emergency vehicles in emergencies also is high, with fire engines mobilized 2,883 times and ambulances 21,409 times during FY2009 in the 8 target governorates.

(2) Impacts (Impacts on the natural environment, Land Acquisition and Resettlement, Unintended Positive/Negative Impact)

Placement of vehicles supplied to newly established fire stations and increased speed of fire-fighting and emergency activities have led to reductions in damage in the 8 target governorates and to decreasing residents' senses of safety. Furthermore, reduction in residents' senses of uncertainty regarding fire and emergency services can be considered to have contributed to preventing the outflow of residents due to such uncertainty.

This project has largely achieved its objectives; therefore its effectiveness is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Structural Aspects of Operation Maintenance

The CD's civil defense department has been assigned as the section responsible for operation of fire-fighting and emergency equipment, while its vehicles department has been assigned responsibility for maintenance. The maintenance system has been changed by establishing a regional office of the vehicles department covering the 4 southern governorates. Establishment of a regional office covering the four northern governorates is planned as well. Assignment of fire-fighting personnel at each fire station has also increased considerably in almost all locations. According to responses to questionnaires from the implementing agency, necessary personnel has been secured.

(2) Technical Aspects of Operation Maintenance

Regarding skills for operation and handling of fire-fighting equipment and inspection and maintenance, related organizations, systems, and curricula for development of skills have been developed. At present the handling of equipment and the level of skill in management of fire-fighting equipment are maintained at a certain level. Periodic inspection and important maintenance of fire engines are conducted at a garage at the CD's vehicles department, and there are no problems with its skills level.

(3) Financial Aspects of Operation Maintenance

While budgeting shortfalls at the implementing agency are pointed out, funding is secured for operation and maintenance of fire-fighting and emergency equipment at each fire station.

(4) Current Status of Operation Maintenance

Currently, one ambulance is not in use due to an accident. Other fire-fighting and emergency equipment is well maintained.

No major problems have been observed in the operation and maintenance system; therefore sustainability of the project effects is high.