

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Akemi Shimura Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	Human Resource Development for Local Governance Phase II	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Indonesia		
Project Period	April 2005-March 2007		
Executing Agency	Education and Training Agency of Ministry of Home Affairs (B.Diklat of MoHA), Directorate General of Regional Autonomy of Ministry of Home Affairs (OTDA), Education and Training Board of North Sumatra Province (B.Diklat of Sumut)		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications, Local Autonomy College, Hyogo Prefecture		
Total Cost	236 million yen		
Related Projects (if any)	<Technical Cooperation> Human Resource Development for Local Governance (Phase I)		
Overall Goal	Human resources for local governance in administrative management and regional development are developed through the training.		
Project Objective(s) ¹	1. Capacity of training management for human resources development of local governmental officials is improved in B.Diklat of MoHA and B.Diklat of Sumut. 2. Public administration methods and techniques based on new policies and guidelines related to decentralization and regional autonomy in Indonesia are widely disseminated and understood by local governments.		
Output[s]	1. Training curriculum and modules are improved to be more practical based on the needs of local governments (in B.Diklat of MoHA and B.Diklat of Sumut). 2. Collaboration between B.Diklat of MoHA and B.Diklat of Sumut to conduct training courses is enforced. 3. Training curriculum aiming at improvement of public service is improved and its training is implemented (in North Sumatra). 4. Partnership among the training institutions (between province and provinces or between province and district / municipality) is established (in North Sumatra). 5. Guidelines for the inter-regional partnership and its implementation methods are understood by the local governmental officials. 6. Guidelines for the new role of sub-district heads (Camat) responding to the new Decentralization and Regional Autonomy Law and its implementation methods are understood by the sub-district heads.		
Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Indonesian Side)	
Experts	3 for Long term, 8 for Short term	Staff allocated	124
Equipments	-	Equipments	-
Local Cost	137 million yen	Local Cost	30 million yen + Project activity cost
Trainees Received	30	Land etc provided	Office buildings
Others	Provision of equipment	Others	-

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>The project has been highly relevant with Indonesian Development Plan and Japanese ODA's policy. Furthermore, there was a need to improve public administrative services of local governments due to the rapid progress in decentralization and regional autonomy since 1999; thus, the relevance of the project is high. Through the project, many seminars were held for relevant personnel including Camats (sub-district heads) and the Manual for Planning, Implementation and Evaluation of Effective Training and the Standard of Training Management were developed using the know-how obtained. Therefore, it was determined that the capacity of training institutions which conduct human resource development for local public administration has been improved. Through training, public administration methods and techniques based on the policies and guidelines of the Ministry of Home Affairs were widely disseminated and understood by local governments. Therefore, the effectiveness and impact of the project was high. Regarding efficiency, the project was efficient in terms of its outputs and the project period, but efficiency from the aspect of the project cost could not be evaluated because the necessary information could not be obtained. Regarding sustainability, the sustainability concerning the policies and systems as well as the project effects have been ensured. However, technical and financial sustainability could not be analyzed because answers to the questionnaire could not be obtained from counterparts; therefore the project efficiency and sustainability could not be evaluated.</p> <p>In light of the evaluation result on its effectiveness and impact, this project can be evaluated to produce the sufficient outcomes.</p>

¹ Prior to the present project, the Human Resource Development for Local Governance Phase I was conducted with the objective that "training courses which meet local needs are conducted mainly in the fields of regional development and public administrative management," for three years from April 2002. According to the documents at completion for the present project, the two objectives that could not be achieved in Phase I were set as the objectives for Phase II, in order to improve the capacity of training institutions which conduct human resource development for local governments, which was an issue for local governance in Indonesia, and to disseminate policies on decentralization and regional autonomy.

<Constraints of this evaluation study>

- The evaluation was conducted based on the terminal evaluation report and the results of interviews with long-term experts at the time of the project implementation (hereinafter called ex-JICA experts) because the project completion report and answers to the questionnaire from the executing agencies could not be obtained.
- In the project design matrix (PDM) for the project, target values which provide benchmarks for evaluating the achievement of the outputs were not set for many indicators.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Indonesia

In Indonesia, Law 22 Year 1999 and Law 32 Year 2004 on Local Autonomy were issued and it was stipulated that local governments would promote their regional autonomy and provide public services that meet their residents' needs. The 2005-2009 National Medium-Term Development Plan also included the "improvement of social services through the implementation of regional autonomy" as one of the goals that aimed to build a fair and democratic nation. For this purpose, the plan also mentioned the need for the quality improvement of local governments.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Indonesia

Decentralization in Indonesia was fully launched in 1999. When the project was implemented, the decentralization policies were still at an early stage of implementation and were evolving through trial and error as can be seen in the revision of the Law on Local Government in 2004. Therefore, there was a significant need for the dissemination of regional autonomy policies and guidance for their implementation methods.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

The Japanese ODA's country assistance policy for Indonesia stipulated assistance for governance including decentralization as one of the priority issues under the priority area "Assistance to Create a Democratic and Fair Society." The JICA Country Program (FY 2002) also set forth support for regional development and decentralization as priority issues.

The project has been highly relevant with Indonesia's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objectives

Many of the indicators for determining the outputs were unclear. Nonetheless, all the different types of training courses that had been planned were held multiple times. According to JICA's internal documents and reports from ex-JICA experts, all the training courses enjoyed a good reputation among the training participants. Therefore, it was determined that the project outputs were achieved.

Regarding Project Objective (1), one of the indicators the "implementation of training based on the Manual for Planning, Implementation and Evaluation of Effective Training" could not be achieved because approval by the Minister of Home Affairs was delayed although the manual had been completed. Other indicators were achieved. Regarding Project Objective (2), the number of participants on training courses exceeded the planned number and the results of the survey for participants showed that their levels of satisfaction about the training content were high, according to JICA's internal documents. This suggests that the indicators were achieved. Therefore, it was determined that the project objectives were largely achieved.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

Based on the available information about the achievement level of the project outputs and the objectives, the overall goal was fulfilled in North Sumatra Province where the project was conducted.

With regard to indirect impacts, there were some reports of cases where the action plans produced by the training participants during training were used to improve public administrative services after the project ended (in Medan City 1st Junior High School, the Joint Office for Vehicle Registration at the Revenue Bureau of the provincial government, etc.), according to JICA's internal documents. It was also reported that efforts to improve the function of the sub-district office has been made based on a proposal made by the sub-district head who attended a training course conducted in Aceh Province.

There were no particular reports of negative impacts caused by the project.

This project has largely achieved its objectives; therefore its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As mentioned in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact," the project brought about the expected outputs.

Inputs to the project are as described in the "Project Outline." According to the long-term experts, no problems which would hinder the achievement of the outputs were identified with regard to the inputs. The terminal evaluation concluded that the "inputs were efficiently converted (into outputs) in terms of their quality, quantity and timing." Therefore, it can be concluded that there was no problem which affected the final outputs.

(2) Project Period of Cooperation

The planned project period was 24 months and the actual project period was 24 months. Therefore, the project was conducted as planned (100% of the planned period).

(3) Project Cost of Cooperation

The actual project cost was 236 million yen. The actual project cost could not be compared with the planned cost because the ex-ante estimation could not be obtained.

Since the planned value for the project cost was not available, financial efficiency was unclear. Therefore, efficiency of the project could not be evaluated.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

The Law on Local Government was revised (Law Number 12 Year 2008) after the project completion, but its policy to promote decentralization was not changed. According to the information obtained by ex-JICA experts, it is thought that the Decree of the Minister of Home Affairs established as a result of the project is still valid.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

According to information given by ex-JICA experts, the North Sumatra provincial training center has renewed the ISO 9001:2000 certification obtained during the project implementation. Therefore, it is thought that the organizational structure of the training center is still in place. However, the organizational structures of the other counterparts at the time of ex-post evaluation are unknown because answers to the questionnaire could not be obtained. Therefore, it is not possible to evaluate institutional sustainability.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

According to information obtained by ex-JICA experts, the North Sumatra provincial training center has renewed the ISO 9001:2000 certification which stipulates the use of Standard of Training Management. However, the technical levels of the counterparts at the time of ex-post evaluation are unknown because answers to the questionnaire could not be obtained from the training center or the other counterparts. Therefore, it is not possible to evaluate technical sustainability.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

The financial situation at the time of the ex-post evaluation is unknown because answers to the questionnaire could not be obtained from the counterparts. Therefore, it is not possible to evaluate financial sustainability.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

The methodology and the manual for the training developed through the project were handed over to the Sulawesi Capacity Development Project (implemented from September 2007 to September 2010) and are being used mainly in Sulawesi 6 provinces (North Sulawesi, Gorontalo, Central Sulawesi, West Sulawesi, Southeast Sulawesi and South Sulawesi).

As has been explained above, the counterparts' current institutional, technical and financial situations are unknown since the counterparts' answers to the questionnaire are not available. Therefore, it is not possible to evaluate sustainability.