

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Hideyuki Takagi Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Training of Agricultural Extension Officers on Improvement of Farm Management	February 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Indonesia		
Project Period	January 2004-January 2007		
Executing Agency	BDA-Kayuambon of the Agency for Agricultural Human Resources Development, Ministry of Agriculture		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries		
Total Cost	240 million yen		
Related Projects (if any)	<Technical Cooperation> Project for Improvement of Agricultural Extension and Training System (September 1999-March 2002); and <Training Course> Training of Trainers for Participatory Training Program on Agricultural Extension Methodology (three years from FY2008)		
Overall Goal	Farm management in selected districts is improved through the Participatory Agricultural Extension Method (MP3) training. “Selected districts: Seven provinces where national agriculture education and training centers (BBDAs/BDAs) are located.”		
Project Objective(s)	Agricultural extension officers in the selected districts acquire skills in the extension methodology through the improved MP3 training program.		
Output[s]	1. MP3 training program is improved in BDA-Kayuambon. 2. Training of trainers (TOT) program for MP3 training is established in BDA-Kayuambon. 3. MP3 training program is applied to selected districts.		
Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Indonesian Side)	
Experts	3 for Long term, 2 for Short term	Staff allocated	10
Equipments	12 million yen	Equipments	-
Local Cost	25 million yen	Local Cost	2,470 million rupiahs
Trainees Received	7	Land etc provided	Project offices (Jakarta and Kayuambon), and official cars
Others	-	Others	-

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>The project conforms to Indonesia's national development plan and development needs, as well as Japan's aid policy. Therefore, the relevance of the project is high. Although the information about planned cost was not obtained, actual cost can be adequate amount compared to other similar projects. Moreover, the actual project period was within the plan; therefore, efficiency of the project is high. The activities of the project were implemented as planned. As for outputs, the MP3 training program was improved in BDA-Kayuambo and the improved programs were carried out at BBDAs/BDAs in 7 districts. As a result, by the end of project, agricultural extension officers in the selected districts had learned to apply good practices to their activities more effectively. Therefore, the project had probably a certain effect on the agricultural extension among farmers. According to the counterpart, the overall goal was achieved as the majority of farmers who had taken the MP3 training course has improved farming management. However, the actual status has not been clearly verified because it needs much more time to take and verify effects, and no survey on the farmers has been carried out. The MP3 training program is still being conducted as part of Indonesia's development policy and sector policy, and the central government has secured the budget for the project. At the training centers to which the skills were transferred in this project, the counterparts continue to carry out the training programs, and they also work to improve the training methods on their own. The sustainability of the project, therefore, is judged to be high.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p>

1 Relevance
<p>(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Indonesia The Indonesian Five-Year National Development Plan (2000-2004), a plan that was in force when the project got started, aimed at a shift from an “increase of food production” to an “improvement of farm income.” The 2005-2009 Five-Year Plan, in force when the program was completed, also pointed out the further development of the agricultural sector. It was encouraged that agricultural extension officers would expand good practices among advanced farmers and they would make effective use of such practices.</p> <p>(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Indonesia In the agriculture sector in Indonesia, along with changes in its agriculture policy, a further need arose to introduce new types of agricultural extension methodology designed to discover and spread the skills and techniques suited to the characteristics of the district in order to respond appropriately to the challenges farmers face and the need they have for improving the competitiveness in productivity and profitability of agriculture. According to responses from the executing agency to questionnaires, 60% of the farmers had had a need for an agricultural extension officer system before the implementation of the project, and 90% of them had this need at the time of project completion, representing a high percentage at both points in time.</p> <p>(3) Relevance with Japan’s ODA Policy Japan’s aid plan for Indonesia refers to the “construction of a democratic and fair society” as one of its priority areas. It states clearly that in order to “reduce poverty” through the development of agriculture and fishery communities, aid should be provided mainly for strengthening the management of farmers’ and fishers’ organizations, developing and managing the related infrastructure, improving their productivity, and establishing systems for processing and distribution.</p> <p>This project has been highly relevant with the Indonesia’s development plan, development needs, as well as Japan’s ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.</p>
2 Effectiveness / Impact
<p>(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s) This project served to improve the MP3 training program at BDA-Kayuambon and provide training for trainers at BBDAs/BDAs in the 7 selected districts. After receiving the training, the trainers at each BBDA/BDA trained the agricultural extension officers in their district. During the project period, at least 200 officers attended training courses, finishing with a high level of understanding of what they had been taught there. The executing agency responded that the agricultural extension officers in the selected districts utilize the skills regarding good practices that they learned in the training courses in their activities for agricultural extension. On the other hand, in terms of the introduction of good practices at the individual-farmer level, one of the indicators for the project objectives, the ex-post evaluation refrained from making any judgment about its level of achievement as no numerical target had been set for the percentage of farmers adopting good practices. Furthermore, no survey on farmers that would be required in order to verify the achievement of the objectives had been carried out. Ex-experts say that as it takes a long time for individual farmers to introduce good practices and probably only a certain level of achievement has been made by the time of the ex-post evaluation. In light of the above, although most of the project outputs have been achieved, the level of achievement of the project objectives is presumed to be fair.</p> <p>(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts In terms of the improvement of farm management in selected districts, which was set as an overall goal, the present status has not yet been verified enough as a survey of the farmers has not been carried out, though, according to the counterpart, the majority of the farmers who had taken MP3 training course has improved their farm management.. However, it will presumably take more time for farmers to adopt the good practices introduced in this project and improve their farm management. For the improvement of farm management what is required is: to spread good practices, enhance the services of the agricultural extension officers such as the provision of market price information and guidance for improving the management of farmers’ organizations. It is also necessary to resolve external factors, such as the high cost of agricultural chemicals and chemical fertilizers, which are major challenge in farm management.</p> <p>This project has somewhat achieved its objectives; therefore its effectiveness is fair.</p>
3 Efficiency
<p>(1) Outputs As stated above in (1) of “Effectiveness / Impact,” this project has produced the outputs generally as planned. With a time lag between the beginning of Indonesian fiscal year and the commencement of the project, there was a delay in the funds for the project activities on Indonesian side in the first year. It caused delay in formulating training implementation plans and affected the progress of the project. However, after these problems had been solved, the project was carried out smoothly.</p> <p>(2) Project Period of Cooperation The project period, designed to be completed in 36 months in the plan, actually finished in 36 months. It is just as planned (100% of the plan).</p> <p>(3) Project Cost of Cooperation With no information available, the planned project cost is yet to be confirmed. The project actually cost 240 million yen. Compared with other projects that had similar contents and were conducted in similar districts, no specific problem was found in the project.</p> <p>While there was a delay in providing some of the inputs, the delay was later made up for; therefore, the efficiency of the project is high.</p>
4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

In the current Five-Year Plan for National Development of Indonesia (2004-2009), agricultural policies such as “the one agricultural extension officer per village program” are put up. The targeted provinces in this program also have a policy of continuing to carry out MP3 training programs. “The competency system,” a scheme designed to improve the abilities of agricultural extension officers, is being operated, and a research and development center manages information about the research findings of agriculture promotion activities; thus, the agricultural extension officers system is still being maintained. In light of the above, the priority of the policies related to the project is still high.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

According to the responses from the executing agency, BDA-Kayuambon and the BBDA/BDA in the selected districts maintain a sufficient number of trainers to continue providing MP3 training. At present, BBDA/BDA in the 7 provinces have 50 trainers, and the “Agricultural Academy for Extension,” an academic institution established by the Ministry of Agriculture as part of a new policy for spreading good practices, has 20 trainers for MP3 method programs. These facts demonstrate that the counterparts’ system is being maintained.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

The counterparts, the trainers of the MP3 training programs, maintain the knowledge and skills that were required to provide the training, and each BDA continues to offer an annual MP3 training course to agricultural extension officers. Responses from the executing agency indicate that the trainers themselves work to improve training methods, which demonstrates that the sustainability of the technical aspects is being maintained.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

The actual amount of the central government’s budget for training at BDA-Kayuambon was unavailable in the ex-post evaluation survey. The executing agency responded that the budgets have been secured for FY2010, the year of the ex-post evaluation, and FY2011, the following year.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

The executing agency responded that a large percentage of the agricultural extension officers who took part in the training program still utilize the good practices in their activities for agricultural extension, and that the number of farmers who have adopted the good practices is on an upward trend.

Due to restrictions on the survey methods for the evaluation, some of the financial information necessary to evaluate the sustainability of the executing agency was unavailable. But no major problems have been observed in the policy background and the structural, technical, financial aspects of the executing agency; therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is high.