

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Sawa Hasegawa, Japan Development Service Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project on the Development of the Method of Urban Development	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	The Kingdom of Thailand			
Project Period	June 1999-May 2005			
Executing Agency	Department of Public Works and Town & Country Planning (DPT), Ministry of Interior			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Land, Infrastructure, Transport and Tourism			
Total Cost	708 million yen			
Related Projects (if any)	N.A			
Overall Goal	Officials at the local authorities, government organizations and others that are in charge of urban development, particularly urban land readjustment are trained. These entities include Bangkok Metropolitan Administration, Tambol Administrative Organizations, municipalities, DPT and National Housing Authority. (Super Goal: Implementation of urban planning and urban development is improved at central and local level so that the urban problems in Thailand are eased.)			
Project Objective	The method of urban development adapted to the socio-economic context of Thailand is developed, and the training system for those who deal with the above method is developed.			
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The regular training courses for urban planning and urban development are settled. 2. Instructors for the training courses (urban planning and urban development) are trained. 3. Land readjustment pilot projects are promoted. 4. Supporting systems for land readjustment projects are prepared. 			
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Thai Side)	
Experts	10 for Long term, 58 for Short term (at the time of terminal evaluation)		Staff allocated	49
Equipments	81.3 million yen (at the time of terminal evaluation)		Equipments	Provided (the amount is unknown)
Local Cost	51.3 million yen (at the time of terminal evaluation)		Local Cost	29.8 million baht (at the time of terminal evaluation)
Trainees Received	38		Land etc provided	Project office, etc.
Others			Others	

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>The relevance of the project is high, and Project Outputs, Objective and Overall Goal set by the project have been largely achieved. The project period was extended for 2 years, significantly longer than the original plan. Thus the project got the good results in terms of the relevance and effectiveness/impact, its efficiency was somewhat low, due to the project period which substantially overran the original schedule. On the other hand, with the extension of the cooperation period for 2 years, the project got the high achievement level of its Objective and Overall Goal, and generated highly positive impacts. Such impacts were represented particularly by the project's support which contributed to the formulation and issuance of the "Land Readjustment Act" in December 2004.</p> <p>In terms of sustainability of the project, while the implementation of the training on urban planning and development is recording a steady progress and the land readjustment project unfolding nationwide, several challenges have also been pointed out including the lack of both personnel and of field experiences of the implementing organization.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.</p>

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Thailand

At the time of planning the project, Thailand's "8th National Economic and Social Development Plan (1996~2001)" recognized 'improvement in the quality of life through regional, rural and human development' as one of its development goals, and 'creation of enabling environment to support human development' and 'strengthening of economic competitiveness to promote human development and the improvement in the quality of life' as its development strategies. The "9th National Economic and Social Development Plan (2001~2006) formulated and implemented during the project period likewise referred to 'community empowerment' and identified 'development of cities and communities comfortable to live in' as one of the poles of its development strategies. Furthermore, DPT's "5-Year Plan (2003~2008)" also proposed the development of comfortable cities, requesting the governors of all provinces to commence at least one land readjustment project in each province. Such actions were further followed by the issuance of the "Land Readjustment Act" in December 2004. The above plans had no change till the end of the project and were supported throughout the project period. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have been relevant with the development plan of Thailand.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Thailand

The formulation of the project took place amid the trend of decentralization, which increased the tasks under the responsibility of the Bangkok Metropolitan Administration and other local authorities. They were facing the necessity to foster the staff specialized in urban planning and development, in order to realize a comfortable urban environment. They were also being urged to develop urban areas and road networks with the limited budget, and therefore were willing to introduce the land readjustment project. The development needs in principle remained unchanged till the end of the project, and the demand existed for urban planning and development throughout the project implementation. From the situations above, the project can be evaluated to have met the development needs of Thailand.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

At the time of planning the project, Japan's "Country Assistance Program for Thailand" identified as the priority areas of assistance 'environmental conservation' including the development of urban environment, 'development of economic infrastructure' including the regional towns and cities, and 'rural and agricultural development' including the human resource development to improve local administrative capacities. The program above had no change till the end of the project and was supported throughout the project period. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have been relevant with Japan's ODA policy.

This project has been highly relevant with Thailand's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective

During the project implementation, a training course in the area of urban planning had to be developed by the project for the staff of the local authorities, following the Thai government's promotion of its decentralization policy. PDM, however, was not made to reflect the addition or revision of this new activity and was therefore in short of appropriate indicators. Accordingly, PDM was reviewed at the mid-term evaluation in August to September 2001 to revise Project Outputs and these activities, indicators set under Project Objective and Outputs, and important assumptions affecting Project Objective. The revision made PDM to better reflect the real situation and to increase consistency.

The achievement level of each Project Output is as follows.

As for Output 1, a training system including the training equipment was established, and training courses were offered to wide variety of stakeholders including those from local staff of DPT and of local authorities. The regular courses on urban planning were commenced in September 2004, where the trainees from local authorities acquired knowledge foundation and increased understanding on the integrity of urban planning, academic approaches, and the necessity of teamwork. The regular courses on urban development, too, were appreciated highly by the trainees, in terms of its content, practical exercises, materials, and its applicability.

As for Output 2, both urban planning and urban development courses were highly appreciated by participants, and resulted in producing 63 instructors and 74 associate instructors. It was further observed that the staff, utilizing the knowledge acquired from the training, contributed to the promotion of the land readjustment project. Nevertheless, in the actual urban development and land readjustment, the continued direct supervision from the staff of DPT headquarters was still necessary.

As for Output 3, DPT promoted 10 land readjustment pilot projects, and further 12 candidate projects were being considered for implementation at the time of terminal evaluation of the project. In addition, another 54 projects were being formulated, in accordance with the guidance stipulated in one land readjustment project in each province. The Bangkok Metropolitan Administration was also promoting 10 projects including 2 pilots, and the experiences gained from the initial project activities (including the selection of communities, land owner meetings, and methods of land swap) were already integrated in the training.

As for Output 4, 5 draft reports of technical standards and 1 draft report of guidelines were formulated by Japanese experts. These reports served as a base for the counterparts to produce ordinances and rules by themselves, with support from the Japanese experts and with careful consideration to both the newly issued Land Readjustment Act and to the current situation in Thailand.

The project can be evaluated to have almost achieved Project Outputs since the indicator set under each Output was basically achieved.

In terms of the achievement level of Project Objective, it was noted that the methods of urban planning and development appropriate to the context of Thailand was developed, training materials and programs formulated, and the system of training and dissemination established through fostering of instructors. The project can be evaluated to have almost achieved Project Objective since most indicators set under the Objective were basically achieved.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

In terms of the achievement level of Overall Goal, it was noted that 122 trainers and 42 assistant trainers were produced through the urban planning training courses, as well as 30 trainers through the urban development training courses. These courses provided training to approximately 3,700 people working in urban planning and development, and the training continues to be implemented

steadily even after the project completion. The satisfaction level by training participants was also high, justifying that Overall Goal has mostly been achieved.

The following indirect effects of the project have been reported. Meanwhile, no negative impact on natural environment through the project has been reported so far.

- An indirect impact on the central government was observed when the Land Readjustment Act was formulated with supports from this project and was issued in December 2004.
- An indirect impact on local authorities was observed in their move towards the introduction of the development of urban areas and road networks, as a result of the land readjustment project implemented in Bangkok. Likewise, requests were made to DPT from 26 provinces for a survey and advice on land readjustment, leading to the promotion for implementing one land readjustment project in each province.
- Impacts were observed also on the general public, who enhanced their recognition on land readjustment both through the dissemination seminars on the land readjustment project and through the reports by the media on the legislation process of the land readjustment system. In particular, the inhabitants of the areas selected for the pilot projects deepened their understanding to the readjustment work.
- The project also had influences to some stakeholder organizations. The Land Readjustment Office of DPT, for example, was upgraded to a Bureau, leading to the institutional strengthening of the relevant units in charge of land readjustment.
- As part of its rehabilitation plan for the areas affected by Tsunami in the Indian Ocean on 26th December 2004, the Thai government instructed DPT to conduct a field survey. DPT then undertook an on-site survey jointly with Japanese experts and formulated the first draft rehabilitation plan, taking into account the application of the method used for land readjustment.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As mentioned in (1) of “Effectiveness / Impact,” the project achieved the expected Project Outputs.

(2) Elements of Inputs

The inputs of the project are shown in “Project Outline.” The terminal evaluation of the project conducted in March 2003 decided the extension of the project for 2 years. The second terminal evaluation carried out in February 2005 analyses that “the outputs were achieved in the end, and the inputs made after the project extension were efficiently converted to the outputs in terms of quality, quantity and timing.”

(3) Period of Cooperation, Project Cost

The actual period of cooperation was 6 years against planned 4 years, significantly longer than planned (150% of planned period). The actual project cost was 708 million yen, which could not be compared to the planned budget, due to the lack of information on the planned amount.

Some of the inputs are appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective, therefore efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

The Thai government’s policies on urban planning and development remain unchanged, and the current national development plan of “10th 5-Year National Economic and Social Development Plan (2006~2011)” recognizes ‘development of stable and sustainable economic infrastructure’ and ‘proactive social development’ as its primary development strategies. The “Land Readjustment Act” formulated in 2004 also remains valid.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executing Agency

In the executing agency of DPT, the implementation structure of urban planning and development has been maintained and the skills transferred by the project have been inherited to the successor staff. On the other hand, there were responses which stated that the number of staff was insufficient and the decision-making process unclear.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executing Agency

While the training on urban planning and development is recording a good progress, some respondents pointed out the need to further improve the skills for negotiation, planning, and coordination in order to compensate the staff’s lack of hands-on experiences in the implementation of actual land readjustment work, and to lead the land readjustment project to a success.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executing Agency

According to the responses to the provided questionnaire, DPT itself receives sufficient budget from the Government to continue with the land readjustment project. On the other hand, other reports state that the budget for land readjustment project is separate from usual government budget, and that the coordination with the government budget raises a challenge upon the implementation of land readjustment project when DPT wishes to immediately start the work as soon as it obtains the consent from the land owners of target areas. The reports also say that the possibility is being explored to establish a fund through a type of special business tax accrued from land sales.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

The manuals and materials for training made by the project are still used after the project completion. The legal framework such as ministerial regulations, local regulations/ordinances committee regulations and others relating to the Land Readjustment Act, and of the rules relating to unions (including statutes) is also in progress. The implementation scale of the training courses on urban planning and development, and of land readjustment pilot projects, are both in progress and expanding nationwide. There were responses that

mentioned training's contribution to the implementation of land readjustment project. The reports recognized no negative issue on the use and management of the provided equipment.

Some problems have been observed in the structural and technical aspects of the executing agency, therefore sustainability of the project effects is fair.