

## Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Sawa Hasegawa Japan Development Service Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project on the Assistance of Public Health Insurance Information System Development	January 2010 – December 2010

### I Project Outline

Country Name	The Kingdom of Thailand		
Project Period	July 2003-July 2006		
Executing Agency	Ministry of Public Health (MOPH), National Health Security Office (NHSO)		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Health, Labor and Welfare		
Total Cost	272 million yen		
Related Projects (if any)	N.A		
Overall Goal	The number of organizations responsible for health insurance services which have adopted or scheduled to adopt new health insurance information system is increased at other provinces.		
Project Objective	The capability of NHSO in administration and system development management is improved and new health insurance information system is disseminated nationally.		
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Knowledge and information necessary to establish health insurance information system is accumulated within the organization responsible for health insurance.</li> <li>2. Capability of management in procedural operations is improved at NHSO through establishment of pilot system.</li> <li>3. Improvement of health insurance information system for nationwide dissemination is proposed based on the result from the pilot system.</li> </ol>		
	Inputs (Japanese Side)	Inputs (Thai Side)	
Experts	5 for Long term, 20 for Short term (at the time of terminal evaluation)	Staff allocated	68
Equipments	55.2 million yen (at the time of terminal evaluation)	Equipments	Provided (the amount is unknown)
Local Cost	13.1 million yen (at the time of terminal evaluation)	Local Cost	6.4 million yen (at the time of terminal evaluation)
Trainees Received	47	Land etc provided	Project office, warehouse, etc.
Others	Expenses for document translation: 4 million yen (at the time of terminal evaluation)	Others	

### II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>The relevance of the project is high, and Project Outputs, Objective and Overall Goal set by the project have been largely achieved. The project operation was also implemented largely on schedule. Thus the project got the good results in terms of the relevance, effectiveness/impact and efficiency during its implementation as well as the sustainability after its completion, due to the fact that its activities are generally well-sustained.</p> <p>The sustainability of this project was found as better ensured than other projects. A factor that contributed to this good result of sustainability was the institutional and policy support by the Thai government, who recognized the establishment of health insurance information system supported by the project as an urgent issue and high priority in Thailand.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p>

## 1 Relevance

### (1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Thailand

At the time of planning the project, both the “4-Year Strategic Plan” of the regime of that time and the “9th 5-Year Plan for National Health Care Development (2002~2006)” of the Ministry of Public Health recognized the promotion of the reform of its national health insurance system as a preferable policy. The Strategic Plan in particular promoted a so-called “30 Baht Health Care System,” a policy to ensure access to health insurance by all Thai nations. The new health insurance information system supported by the project was the foremost priority of health care policies promoted by the Government of that time. Another support to the project was the establishment of NHSO by the “National Health Security Act (2002),” to serve as the executing agency of this project and to administer both the system of national health insurance for all and the health insurance fund. The above plans had no change till the end of the project and were supported throughout the project period. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have been highly relevant with the development plan of Thailand.

### (2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Thailand

At the time of planning the project, the implementation of health insurance policy under the aforementioned Strategic Plan was entrusted to the Ministry of Public Health, NHSO and Provincial Health Offices. The strengthening of administrative and system development capacity of those organizations, and of the newly-established NHSO in particular, was recognized as an issue of extreme importance. The ex-ante evaluation of the project likewise identified, as a priority issue of health insurance system, speedier registration and improved administration and management of health insurance. Those development needs persisted till the end of the project and the demand for health insurance information system was recognized throughout the project implementation. From the situations above, the project can be evaluated to have met the development needs of Thailand.

### (3) Relevance with Japan’s ODA Policy

At the time of planning the project, Japan’s “Country Assistance Program for Thailand” recognized ‘social sector assistance’ as one of the priority areas of assistance. JICA’s project execution policy for Thailand placed importance both to the cooperation catering to different stages of the Thailand’s economic and social development, and to the response to the challenges that emerge as a mature society. Assistance to the development of social security system was also described as another priority. The program and policy above had no change till the end of the project and were supported throughout the project period. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have been relevant with Japan’s ODA policy.

This project has been highly relevant with Thailand’s development plan, development needs, as well as Japan’s ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

## 2 Effectiveness / Impact

### (1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective

During the project implementation, PDM was revised based on the mid-term evaluation of the project that was held in 2005 to clarify and quantify the indicators for Overall Goal, Project Objective and respective Outputs.

The achievement level of each Project Output is as follows.

As for Output 1, 51 workshops were held to examine the establishment of new health insurance information system, with about 655 participants and over 30 resumes. 3 study reports were also created on the same insurance system.

As for Output 2, “Registration Application Development Completion Report” was compiled on the development of the new health insurance information system. Both the manuals on the administrative management and on the system operation procedure were followed by the NHSO staff in their own operation of the system. Besides, an evaluation was implemented, based on the criteria to manage a software vender used for the establishment of the new health insurance information system. The software was utilized in accordance with the operational procedure shown in the manual. Having ensured the implementation of all operations as above, the new system was tested in the pilot site of Phrae province, to demonstrate that the health insurance registration process that required 45 days under the old system was now shortened to 7 days with the introduction of the new system.

As for Output 3, planning and coordination activities were undertaken to prepare both a dissemination plan to promote the new health insurance information system nationwide and different manuals used for the dissemination. In the pilot site of Phrae province, the administrative management manual was revised for all provincial health offices in the country, in addition to the revision of the manual on system operation procedure.

The project can be evaluated to have almost achieved Project Outputs since the indicator set under each Output was basically achieved.

In terms of the achievement level of Project Objective: 1) the procedure for the development of the new health insurance information system established by the project was compiled as a “System Development Manual.” The Manual also included guidelines for drafting specifications on the system development for software vender; 2) According to the questionnaire survey undertaken with the relevant NHSO staff, 80% of the respondents felt that their capacity for system development management was improved, the acquired knowledge and skills were applied to their work and transferred to other staff, that their administrative management capacity improved and they were now well-informed of the management. The project can be evaluated to have almost achieved Project Objective since most indicators set under the Objective were basically achieved.

### (2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

In terms of the achievement level of Overall Goal, it is fair to evaluate that the Goal was achieved, considering the fact that new health insurance information system was institutionally adopted in the country’s 76 provinces, at the authorities engaged in the administration of health insurance.

In terms of the indirect impacts, the skills and knowledge fostered in the project were fully utilized by the NHSO’s IT department,

resulting in its acquisition of certification by ISO9001<sup>1</sup> for the new system in December 2005. The project's contribution to the certification can be confirmed in the similarity between the procedure that was followed in the system development during the project, and the procedure to acquire certification from ISO9001. Meanwhile, no negative impact on environment and other social consideration through the project has been reported so far.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

### 3 Efficiency

#### (1) Outputs

As mentioned in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact," the project achieved the expected Project Outputs.

#### (2) Elements of Inputs

The inputs of the project are shown in "Project Outline." The terminal evaluation of the project stated that "several issues were observed under each activity such as delays in the implementation. These issues, however, were kept to minimum through the dialogue between Japanese experts and Thai counterparts at the Steering Committee, through the formulation of a roadmap, and through the formation of a taskforce group to deal with respective challenges. As a result, the inputs were efficiently converted to the outputs in terms of quality, quantity and timing." Assessing from the statement, it is unlikely that the delays affected the final compilation of outputs and achievements.

#### (3) Period of Cooperation, Project Cost

The actual period of cooperation was 3 years against planned 3 years, exactly as planned (100% of planned period). The actual project cost was 272 million yen against planned 300 million yen, slightly lower than planned (91% of planned budget).

The inputs are appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

### 4 Sustainability

#### (1) Related Policy towards the Project

The Thailand's social security policies, as before, continue to support the establishment of health insurance system. The current national development plan of "10th 5-Year National Economic and Social Development Plan 2006-2011" also recognizes as its strategy 'the establishment of social security and education system for the improvement of quality of life.'

#### (2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executing Agency

No negative issues have been reported on the institutional sustainability of NHSO as the executing agency. The department within NHSO responsible for the new health insurance information system currently has sufficient staff for the implementation of the system. Rather, the team is found as further strengthened than during the project.

#### (3) Technical Aspects of the Executing Agency

The transfer to new staff of the skills and knowhow of the project are ensured by the NHSO staffs who continues to serve in the same department since the project implementation period. The understanding of the staff on the new health insurance information system was found sufficient, although more skills and methodologies need to be developed to manage the large volume of accumulated data stored in a database.

#### (4) Financial Aspects of the Executing Agency

NHSO is an independent public entity under the supervision of Ministry of Public Health, whose receipt of national budget is ensured with ability to flexibly execute its budget and autonomously manage its organization, as well as with discretion to decide the level of staff salary and adopt its own criteria for human resource management and employment. No major financial difficulty of the organization is reported in disseminating and sustaining the new health insurance information system established by the project.

#### (5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

The manuals and guidelines made by the project are fully utilized after the project completion, and so are the documents on Japan's health care system translated and provided by the project. For the online registration for the new health insurance information system, the measures have been taken for increasing the registration rate and reducing redundant registration, and ensuring coordination with the Thai government on the development of a registration system independently implemented by the Government (the Data Center Project). No concerns have been raised on the use and management of the equipment provided by the project, except that some system applications have been replaced by new and larger devices when they were used exceeding their service lives of 5 years.

No major problems have been observed in the policy background, the structural, technical, financial aspects of the executing agency, therefore sustainability of the project effects is high.

<sup>1</sup> "ISO9001" of International Organization for Standardization (ISO) indicates the Quality Management System designated by ISO as a model of international standard. An organization with ISO9001 certification is credited as having an organizational management of international standard approved by ISO. The concept of process approach using Plan-Do-Check-Act (PDCA) cycle for project operation, for instance, is a model suggested by ISO 9001.