

## Summary of Terminal Evaluation

I. Outline of the Project	
Country : Kingdom of Cambodia	Project title : Project for Traffic Improvement in Phnom Penh Municipality in the Kingdom of Cambodia
Issue/Sector : Transportation and Traffic	Cooperation scheme : Technical Cooperation Project
Division in charge : Transportation & ICT Division 2, Transportation and ICT Group, Economic Infrastructure Department	Total cost : 398 Million JPY
Period of Cooperation	March 2007 to March 2010
	Partner Country's Implementing Organization : Municipality of Phnom Penh, Ministry of Public Works and Transport Supporting Organization in Japan : Mets Research & Planning Inc.,
1. Background of the Project	
<p>JICA conducted the study for "The Urban Transport Master Plan in the Phnom Penh Metropolitan Area" (2000-2001), to solve the transport problems and to maintain the sustainable urban development in the city.</p> <p>However, the traffic conditions in Phnom Penh have been worsening in recent years due to the rapid increase of vehicles caused by the concentration of population in the city. The traffic congestion and traffic accidents, especially those involving motorcycles, have been one of the most serious social issues in Phnom Penh.</p> <p>The causes of these traffic congestion and traffic accidents were represented as follows:</p> <p>(1) The installation of traffic control facilities such as traffic signals and signs was still at a low level.</p> <p>(2) The traffic safety education to the drivers and pedestrians was not in place.</p> <p>(3) Driver's license was not required to operate a motorcycle with capacity of less than 125 cc on roads under the old traffic law.</p> <p>(4) There were no regulations governing motorcycle taxi operations.</p> <p>Municipality of Phnom Penh requested the Japanese Government to support the implementation of the Project in order to tackle these city traffic problems.</p>	
2. Project Overview	
(1) Overall Goal	
To improve urban traffic condition by reducing traffic congestion and accidents through the implementation of appropriate traffic management in Phnom Penh Municipality.	
(2) Project Purpose	
1) To improve the capacity of DPWT, MPP to improve intersections	
2) To improve the capacity of DLT, MPWT to educate drivers	
3) To improve the capacity of PPMP, MPP to enforce traffic law	
(3) Outputs	
1) To Improve technology of traffic management (improvement of intersections etc.) by DPWT counterpart and officers in Phnom Penh Municipality [Engineering]	
2) To improve knowledge and techniques of the counterpart and officers of DLT, MPWT in drivers education to enhance traffic safety awareness of license holders in Phnom Penh Municipality and to contribute to improvement of safety through traffic safety campaign [Education]	
3) To improve the knowledge and techniques of the counterpart and other police officers in traffic enforcement by internal education to Municipal Traffic Police Officers [Enforcement]	
(4) Inputs	
Japanese side :	
Expert: 5 fields of experts	Trainees received: 3 trainees
Equipment: 10,283,300 Yen (as of Nov 2009)	

Local cost: 264,145 USD (for intersections improvement)		Total Cost	<u>398 Million Yen</u>
Cambodian Side :			
Counterpart: 16 officials			
Local Cost: Provision of facilities and equipments, and budget allocation for intersections improvement			
II. Evaluation Team			
Members of Evaluation Team	(1) Mr. Hozumi KATSUTA (Leader): Senior Project Formulation Advisor, JICA VIETNAM (2) Mr. Hideki ITO (Project Planning): Assistant Director, Transportation & ICT Division 2, Transportation and ICT Group, Economic Infrastructure Department, JICA (3) Mr. Rui HIWATASHI (Evaluation and Analysis): Researcher, IMG Inc.		
Period of Evaluation	9/ 11/ 2009~ 21/ 10/ 2009	Type of Evaluation : Terminal	
III. Results of Evaluation			
1. Summary of Evaluation Results			
( 1 ) Relevance			
The Project is highly relevant because: 1) the Project is consistent with Cambodian government's policy and institution (especially consistent with National Road Safety Action Plan developed by ADB assistance in 2005 as the traffic safety policy in Cambodia); 2) the Project addresses a major problem of Phnom Penh city (traffic accidents are the most serious urban issues in Phnom Penh); and 3) the Project is consistent with the Japanese aid policy.			
( 2 ) Effectiveness			
The effectiveness of the Project is satisfactory. The Project will mostly achieve the Project purpose and Outputs indicated in the PDM by the end of the Project.			
A satisfactory level of development of the capacities of counterpart organizations has been achieved, although continuous efforts to improve the capacities are required.			
The new Road Traffic Law was enacted during the Project, which has strongly promoted the smooth implementation of the Project. There was a delay in the implementation of Toul Kork intersection improvement due to the MPP's administrative decision.			
( 3 ) Efficiency			
The Project has been implemented in an efficient way. The implementation of the new land traffic law contributed to the efficiency of the Project.			
The inputs including the provision of equipment and dispatch of Japanese experts have been implemented as planned. The approach of the "Enforcement" component for Phnom Penh Municipal Police was changed from the classroom training for general police officers to the concentrated training of selected senior traffic police officers, which contributed to the increase of efficiency. The establishment of working groups has contributed to fostering effective exchange of views and information which lead to actions to solve issues. Almost all the officials involved in the Project understood the necessity and felt the effectiveness of the collaboration.			
( 4 ) Impact			
Although the Project has achieved and will continue producing a large impact, Phnom Penh Municipality requires more decisive and wider actions in order to overcome the challenges of the ever-changing traffic situation.			
Phnom Penh faces serious traffic problems that cannot be addressed only by the measures that the Project has targeted. Decisive measures would be necessary in the near future to tackle the problems that cannot be covered by the small-scale traffic management.			
( 5 ) Sustainability			
The sustainability of the Project is expected to be ensured, but there are several issues to be addressed in order to continue the smooth implementation of traffic management.			
1) Policy and Institutional Sustainability			
• The new land traffic law has played and will continue to play a significant role as an institutional			

framework that sustains the overall traffic management activities.

- The working group regarding intersection/road improvement will contribute to enhancing the sustainability of the Project achievement.
- DDLTS is a good example of organizational arrangement that sustains the continuation of improved implementation of license issuing and driver education that are delegated from DLT.

## 2) Technical Sustainability

- DPWT has developed a certain level of the capacity of planning and conducting intersection improvement. However, DPWT would need more trials and errors as well as occasional advice from experts in order to acquire higher capacity to perform more complex analysis in interchange/road improvement.
- The senior traffic police officers of PPMP trained by the Project are expected to play a key role in continuing the necessary traffic enforcement in a sustainable manner. The monitoring of the implementation of supervision and training by senior officers as well as occasional advice from experts would be desired.

## 3) Financial Sustainability

- Considering all the major activities that the Project has supported are now being performed as regular duties, the regular budget should be allocated based on priorities of the counterpart organizations.

## 2. Factors that promoted realization of effects

### (1) Factors concerning to Planning

- Project design which focused on three components among many challenges on the transport sector in Phnom Penh has made it easier to acknowledge the progress and outcome of the project and also made CP personnel to understand the project outline and to involve in the Project activities.

### (2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

- Through the revision of Road Traffic Law, traffic management activities which is one of the component of the Project has been included as normal duties, and this contributed to the smooth implementation of the project activities.

## 3. Factors that impeded realization of effects

### (1) Factors concerning to Planning

- Although focusing on three component contributed to efficient implementation of the project, on the other hands, other challenge is still remaining for improvement of transportation system in Phnom Penh, therefore, in order to enhance project outcome or impact to transport system in Phnom Penh, CP is required to continue effort to tackle other issues.

### (2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

- Priority among CP and JICA Project team sometimes conflicted since CP has other urgent issues than project activities, but through the smooth coordination and support by the project team, project activities has been proceeded as planned.

## 4. Conclusion

The Project will mostly attain the Project Purpose by its completion date of March 2010. The Project should be terminated as scheduled since it is successful and a sufficient level of sustainability will be ensured, on condition that the counterpart organizations continue the activities initiated by the Project and review them periodically.

## 5. Recommendations

### (1) Objectives to be implemented within the remaining Project period

- 1) Finishing the ongoing intersection improvements through self-help mechanisms;
- 2) Formulating a plan for the re-training of drivers upon license renewal; and
- 3) Formulating a roadmap for human resource development in PPMP and initiating activities based thereon.

(2) Objectives to be implemented Post-Project

- 1) Enhancing coordination capacity: With traffic issues becoming increasingly complex and wide-spread, the expansion of integrated actions will become critical to any future efforts. The continued organizing of venues for the purpose of improving coordination between relevant organizations would ensure a consistent level of dialogue and maintain a high level of cooperation; and .
- 2) Increasing planning capacity: In order to ensure the sustainability of capacity improvements realized through the Project, counterpart organizations and officials must also build their planning capacity.

6. Lessons Learned

- 1) In order to avoid delays in project implementation or other such problems due to discrepancies between counterpart organization priorities and the constraints of the JICA project, advance coordination with JICA is often necessary.
- 2) The assistance should be provided in correlation with changes in the relevant legal institutions.