

## Summary Table of the Result of Evaluation

<b>1. Outline of the Project</b>	
<b>Country :</b> Cambodia	<b>Project Title :</b> Project on Improvement of Local Administration in Cambodia
<b>Issue/Sector :</b> Governance	<b>Cooperation Scheme :</b> Technical Cooperation Project
<b>Division in charge :</b> JICA Cambodia Office	<b>Total Cost :</b>
<b>Period of Cooperation :</b> Feb. 2007 – Jan. 2010  (R/D : signed on Dec. 14, 2006)	<b>Implementing Organization :</b> GDLA, MOI
	<b>Supporting Organization in Japan :</b> Local Administration Bureau and Local Autonomy College of Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications, City of Higashi Hiroshima, Hiroshima University
	<b>Related Cooperation :</b>
<b>1-1. Background of the Project</b>	
<p>Cambodia suffers from the lack of mid-career public officers that are the core of public administration, caused by the prolonged civil war. Coupled with the insufficient comprehensive training system for public servants, human resources development of public servants is still backward. Also, as there are still many things to do in the reorganization of administration structures, public administration has many difficulties in functioning effectively and efficiently. With such background, the Royal Government of Cambodia developed Nation Program for Public Administration Reform 1998 to promote public administration reform. The first local election (direct election, proportional representation) was implemented in February 2002, and as a consequence, 1,621 Commune/Sangkat councils were established. In the national development policy “Rectangular Strategy”, announced in July 2004, the importance of promotion of decentralization for the improvement of public services was expressed. Following the Strategy, Decentralization and Deconcentration (D&amp;D) Reform Strategy Framework for the promotion of D&amp;D was approved by Council of Ministers in June 2005. In August 2006, National Committee for the Management of Decentralization and Deconcentration Reform (NCDD) for the implementation of decentralization policy was established. It is chaired by Minister of Interior.</p> <p>General of Local Administration (GDLA), as an implementing organization and a core of D&amp;D reform promotion, is planning to promote the development and implementation of laws and regulations and systems about local administration system, local finance and taxation system and the relation between the central government and local administration and so on. However, as GDLA faces the lack of human resources, it is difficult to implement without support from cooperating partners. In July 2004, the Royal Government of Cambodia requested a technical cooperation project “Project on Improvement of Local Administration in Cambodia” targeting human resources development for capacity development of local administration, especially for officials of GDLA and Provincial officials. The Government of Japan adopted the project, and on December 14<sup>th</sup>, 2006, Ministry of Interior of Cambodia and JICA both agreed to start the 3 year project from January 2007.</p>	

<b>1-2. Project Overview</b>			
<p>(1) Overall Goal Human Resources involved in local administration will be developed through training.</p> <p>(2) Project Purpose</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Officials of GLDA will improve the capacity of training management.</li> <li>2. Officials in charge of local administration at national level and provincial level will improve the knowledge of local administration.</li> </ol> <p>(3) Output</p> <p>1-1 GDLA has ability to conduct training management based on the progress of Decentralization and Deconcentration (D&amp;D) and needs.</p> <p>2-1 GDLA officials acquire the knowledge of the D&amp;D Policy and local administration.</p> <p>2-2 Provincial Governors and Vice Governors understand the D&amp;D Policy and the roles of local administration.</p> <p>2-3 Officials of provincial offices understand the D&amp;D Policy and the roles of local administration.</p> <p>2-4 Provincial councilors and senior council personnel in capital and all provinces understand organic law, related guidelines rules and regulations.</p> <p>(4) Input (As of June 2009)</p> <p>Japanese Side : Expert (under calculation), Trainings in Japan (Total 39 persons), Equipment (US\$ 124,816), Local Cost (under calculation)</p> <p>Cambodia Side : Office Space, Facilities and Equipment</p>			
<b>II. Evaluation Team</b>			
<b>Members of Evaluation Team</b>	<p>&lt;Cambodia Side&gt;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• H.E. Mr. Prum Sokha, Project Director, Secretary of State, Ministry of Interior (MoI)</li> <li>• H.E. Mr. Sak Setha, Project Manager, Secretary of State, Ministry of Interior (MoI)</li> <li>• H.E. Mr. Leng Vy, Director General, General Department of Local Administration (GDLA) (Counterpart)</li> </ul> <p>&lt;Japanese Side&gt;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Team Leader : Yukiharu Kobayashi, Senior Representative, JICA Cambodia Office</li> <li>• Local Administration : Hirofumi Kawakita, Senior Advisor on Local Administration, JICA Headquarter</li> <li>• Planning : Minori Terada, Project Formulation Advisor (Governance), JICA Cambodia Office</li> <li>• Evaluation Analysis : Chieko Matsubara, Consultant, C.D.C International Cooperation</li> </ul>		
<b>Period of Evaluation</b>	20-26, June, 2009	<b>Type of Evaluation</b>	Terminal Evaluation
<b>III. Results if Evaluation</b>			
<b>3-1. Achievements</b>			
<b>3-1-1 Achievements of Outputs</b>			

Except on indicator described below, outputs are steadily being achieved.

Improvement of understanding level through training of GDLA officials (Indicator: Average score between pre-test and post-test of GDLA officials improves by 30%) has not reached to the expected level. Analysis of reason and consideration of countermeasures which should be taken in the 4<sup>th</sup> training of GDLA officials are required.

**3-1-2 Achievements of Project Purposes**

Achievements of Project purposes are indicated in table 1.

Project purpose 1 “Officials of GDLA will improve the capacity of training management” is likely to be achieved without any impeding factors, judging from the following facts; the capacity of GDLA T/F have already almost reached the level that they can manage trainings by themselves without JICA experts’ support according to the self-evaluation sheet of GDLA T/F in the 3<sup>rd</sup> phase; Even after reducing JICA experts’ support, trainings are managed without trouble and participants’ satisfaction level remains high.

Project Purpose 2 “Officials in charge of local administration at national level and provincial level will improve the knowledge of local administration” is achieved in the light of relevant indicators.

Table 1 Achievement of Project Purposes

Project Purposes 1: Officials of GDLA will improve the capacity of training management.

2: Officials in charge of local administration at national level and provincial level will improve the knowledge of local administration.

Indicators	Achievements	Sources
1-1 GDLA T/F is able manage the training by themselves.	Self-evaluation : P.1 0.9→P.2 1.9→P.3 2.8 (out of 3) *3.0 (full grade) is the stage that “is able to do by himself/herself without support”. Most Achieved.	Self-evaluation by review sheet, experts
1-2 Training management by GDLA T/F is evaluated at more than 8 out of 10 (full grade) in the evaluation system.	Average score during 2008 is 8.7.	Questionnaire
2-1 The average grade of satisfaction of trainees is more than 8 out of 10 (full grade) in the evaluation system.	Average score during the 3 <sup>rd</sup> phase is 8.6.	Questionnaire
2-2 Knowledge on local administration of officials improves.	The average improvement level between pre-test and post-test during the 3 <sup>rd</sup> phase is 31.6%.	Pre-post test, Questionnaire

**3-1-3 Achievement of Overall Goal**

It is necessary to review the verifiable indicator considering the progress of D&D reform.

Table 2 Achievement of Overall Goal

Overall Goal: Human resources involved in local administration will be developed through training.

Indicator	Achievement	Source
The number of provincial and district officials trained under the newly developed training system for local administration		GDLA

## **3-2. Summary of Evaluation Results**

### **3-2-1 Evaluation by 5 Criteria**

#### **(1) Relevance**

Judging from the factor below, it is reasonable to conclude that the Project is relevant.

The Royal Government of Cambodia expressed the promotion of Decentralization and Deconcentration (D&D) in the Rectangular Strategy announced in July 2004, approved Strategic Framework for D&D in June 2005, and enacted the Organic Laws in May 2008, which defines the establishment of council within 1 year in the Capital/Province and Municipality/District. Based on the Organic Law, the 1<sup>st</sup> election of Capital/Provincial and Municipal/District councilors was conducted in May, 2009, and the preparation of the 10 year National Implementation Program is now ongoing. Human resources development is expected to be one of the key issues in the Program. Also, capacity development of local administration for the exercise of transferred functions is critical for the implementation of D&D reform. This project, targeting the capacity improvement of officials in training management for human resources development in local administration and the improvement of knowledge of officials in charge of local administration, is in line with the policies of the Government of Cambodia.

With regards to Japanese aid policy the importance of human resources development and the necessity of the enhancement of public administration to cope with serious lack of human resources caused by the prolonged civil war are expressed since the stage of preparation of the Project, targeting the capacity improvement of officials in training management for human resources development in local administration and the improvement of knowledge of officials in charge of local administration, is in line with JICA's mission 2 "reducing poverty through equitable growth" and mission 3 "improving governance".

With regards to the relevance to the needs of target group, satisfaction level of participants of the trainings in the Project has been always over 80%. Well elaborated training plans developed after training needs assessment have been contributed to this result. This indicates that the Project has been successful in providing trainings which match the needs of participants. Relevance is also supported by the following two facts; other development partners have not been supported the area of trainings of laws and regulations for local administration, which has been latent need; Trainings for councilors who have not had relevant experience nor opportunities of training on practical topics necessary for starting and steering councils after the firsts Provincial/District election in a timely manner.

With regards to the relevance of the Country-focused Training Course 1 on Local administration, it was crucial for the target group to have a future picture / road map of D&D policy through the observation of the other country's experience in local administration and decentralization because Cambodia unfortunately has lost their own experiences and knowledge due to the prolonged civil war.

From this point of view, the Japanese experiences in local administration and decentralization, which can provide a plenty of cases and lessons learned through many different experiences in local administration from Meiji era to the present, have been useful and suggestive. Also the history of Japanese rapid economic growth including Hiroshima rehabilitation from the war-torn country facilitated to understand the above experiences and lessons learned.

## **(2) Effectiveness**

It is reasonable to conclude that the effectiveness of the project is assured, based on the understanding about the achievements mentioned below:

Project Purpose 1 “Officials of GDLA will improve the capacity of training management “and Project Purpose 2” Officials in charge of local administration at national level and provincial level will improve the knowledge of local administration” is achieved or likely to be achieved without any impending factors.

Although some inputs from outside of the Project are observed, still it is reasonable to take that the achievements of the Project Purposes are mostly attributed to the activities of the Project.

## **(3) Efficiency**

It is reasonable to conclude that the efficiency is largely assured, considering all the points below:

Input are done largely according to the annual implementation plans and utilized for the achievements of outputs. Training of Sub-national level to councilors is conducted in quite a timely manner. Since training materials for Provincial Councilors are used for District Councilors as well, it is expected that the curriculum was used in very efficient manner.

Areas benefitted from the Project cover whole the nation and the number of beneficiaries reach to a certain level.

Achievements of the Project has broad utility, as human resources that are capable for reviewing training curriculum and materials are developed and also necessary manuals for the review are prepared.

With regards to the Country-focused Training Course 1 on Local administration, the Supporting organization in Japan smoothly implemented the course in Phase 1 to 3 based on the past similar experience of the training course implementation for the Cambodia civil servants. However, if all stakeholders made more consistent effort of the arrangement of the course, the implementation would have been more efficient.

## **(4) Impact**

The following several positive impacts have been observed.

First, it is pointed out as positive impact that the importance of development of system and organizations for the human resources development in local administration has been more recognized. Second, information collected and analyzed through situation analysis on local administration are utilized in the process of the formulation of the NP-SNDD and recommendations in the analysis reports are likely to be reflected to the National Program. Third, training materials developed and trainers trained through activities of PILAC are utilized in trainings of MoI and the other development partners. Thus it was possible to use a part of training materials for Provincial Councilors for District Councilors are well. Fourth, Japanese local administration system is referred to as one of the information sources in drafting laws and developing system through investigating and considering the Cambodia system in comparison with systems in other countries. In a process of D&D reform, Japanese system was referred to in many occasions. Lastly, GDLA T/F members have growth up to core staffs of GDLA, playing important roles not only in trainings but various tasks, including activities directly related to D&D reform process.

While, negative impact has not been observed.

Considering all the above mentioned factors, it is almost certain that activities are continued to achieve the overall goal of the Project “Human resources involved in local administration will be developed through training” in various occasions by various stakeholders. It is considered to be appropriate to set an adequate indicator of overall goal after the whole vision of National Program is made clear.

#### **(5) Sustainability**

At individual level, various efforts to make the transferred techniques and knowledge firmly grounded can be observed. As the consequence, human resources equipped with strong will to commitment have been developed which will be the core in the process of mid to long term human resources development. It is considered that these core persons will contribute to human resources development for local administration in their own offices.

While, turning to sustainability of institutional and system level, challenges are pointed out as mentioned below.

As GDLA T/F is composed of members from various departments under GDLA, activities of the Project are additional to their original tasks. GDLA T/F will be dissolved along with the completion of the Project and three organizations related to training will succeed some of the trainings of PILAC, as organizational setting is now in the transitional stage for the implementation of D&D reform in the direction of formulating one organization in charge of human resources development. It means that the systematic utilization of the achievement of the Project will be possible after the establishment of the system for human resources development for local administration. It is a positive sign that a consensus is being formed that the establishment of human resources development system is necessary for the promotion of D&D reform. Along with the progress of the National Program, GDLA T/F member will be supposed to play important roles for human resources development. This will indicate the possibility of expression of sustainability in the future.

#### **3-2-2 Factors that promoted realization of effects**

2 points are identified as factors contributing to the achievement of the project purpose and the outputs in the process of the implementation of the Project. One is continuous efforts of collecting information of changes of situation around the Project in order to check and change the direction of the Project strategically. The Change of PDM to add activities of providing trainings to newly elected Provincial Councilors is a good example to explain about this effort. The order point is efforts and ingenious attempts made in training activities of the Project for the improvement of the quality.

The contributing factor incorporated in the project design is conducting situation survey on local administration. This survey enabled the Project team to provide adequate training that better match the needs of the beneficiaries.

#### **3-2-3 Factors that impeded realization of effects**

A factor which was defined in the project planning stage and largely affected to the implementation of the Project is institutional system for implementation of the Project. GDLA T/F members, who are counterparts of the Project, are selected from the various departments under GDLA. This has contributed to having highly-talented members in GDLA T/F, bringing along experience from each department, and also building footholds in each department under GDLA for

the human resources development in the future. While, this also leads to the recognition of GDLA T/F members and each departments under GDLA that activities of the Project are additional to T/F member's original tasks. As the consequence, the Project has faced several difficulties including coordination of the schedule of T/F members with their original tasks, unclear command line, different level of contribution to the project activities by T/F members, and subsequent difficulty of team building. Even with these difficulties, the Project has been successful in achieving outputs and project purposes because of the will of senior officials of MoI, strong commitment of T/F members who provided much contribution to the Project and adequate support by JICA experts.

It is inferred that one of the backgrounds of this implementation system is fluid situation amid the D&D reform that creates uncertainty of full version and difficulty in establishing stable organization. The necessity of the establishment of an organization in charge of human resources development for local administration is clearly recognized. Based on the framework of the National Program, the best system for human resources development for local administration should be elaborated. It requires follow-up of the progress of D&D reform and the contents of the National Program.

### **3-2-4 Conclusion**

The Project has enough relevance and effectiveness and has been achieved considerably positive results in development of impact. Also, the Project continues to be efficient in general. With these reasons, the Project is well managed and has achieved its purposes. While, is assuring sustainability in terms of institution and system, the Project was implemented before the establishment of the organization that sustains the continuation of the achievement of the Project. As the consequence, the means to verify the achievement of the overall goal need to be reviewed.

### **3-3 Recommendations**

Recommendations to the project management system based on the above mentioned achievements and evaluation by five criteria are as stated below.

#### **3-3-1 Recommendation on what should be done during the remaining project period**

##### **(1) Review of the indicator of the overall goal**

Along with the change of external condition, the indicator of overall goal in current PDM has come to be inadequate to verify the achievement. It is required to review and discuss agreeable and verifiable indicators before the completion of the Project, considering the future direction. (e.g., adoption of impact survey that is already utilized as a part of the project activities, tracking the extent of utilization of the achievements of the Project by each counterpart.)

##### **(2) Provision of Support to each counterpart**

It will take some more time for the system to be developed in which the achievements of the Project is embedded and succeeded after the completion of the Project. For the time being, each counterpart is expected to keep and spread what he/she acquired through the activities of the Project. It is desirable to make further efforts to ensure the capacity and knowledge of each counterpart and to provide support for each counterpart to utilize and spread that he/she acquired through the Project in his/her office, if any and if needed.

### **(3) Follow-up of the progress of D&D**

It is desirable to check the progress and contents of the National Program and continue providing recommendation from the Project.

#### **3-3-2 Recommendation on what can be implemented during the three years after the completion of the Project**

##### **(1) Enhancement of Sustainability**

It is recommended that key members of the GDLA Task Force would be involved in training management at the office, department or institution with the function to manage training programs, including training of trainers, under the D&D reform. Which office, department or institution would hold the function to manage training programs will be decided under the review of functions and structure of the MoI which has been launched recently at the MoI in line with the D&D reform.

##### **(2) Crystallization of the overall goal**

The Project has treated topics which urgently needed to be taught suitable for the current situation in Cambodia, mainly focusing on the Organic Law, which were practical and indispensable topics for the operation of local administration and were appreciated by the trainees as important contents for local administration.

After the completion of the Project, there will be topics which should be taught to the targeted groups in timely manner as well, while the process to establish the human resources development system should be continued. The Royal Government of Cambodia is considering the 6 program areas below in the framework of the National Program so that it is recommendable to pay attention on training topics:

Program Area 1 : Institutionalize the Governance of Sub National Administration (SNAs) in Accordance with the Principle of Unified Administration;

Program Area 2 : Establishment and Operation of Human Resource Management and Development Systems Controlled by SNAs;

Program Area 3 : Comprehensive Program for the Transfer of Functions;

Program Area 4 : Establishment of Sub-National Budget, Financial, and Property Management System;

Program Area 5 : Strengthening of Democratic Principles through Clear Lines of Downward Accountability; and,

Program Area 6 : Establishment of Institutional Enabling Environment

(3) It is desirable that a long-term human strategy to enhance D&D reform in Cambodia is to be formulated with paying an attention on the progress of the above mentioned programme areas.

### **3-4 Lessons Learned**



Lessons learned from the Project are stated below.

#### **3-4-1 Consideration for assuring sustainability at the stage of Project planning**

The system for project implementation by formulation project implementation unit which is called task force was fixed before start of the Project. As the consequence, assurance of sustainability in terms of institution and system has remained to be a challenge. This also caused several difficulties in the implementing process of the project activities. It is necessary to consider the incorporation of mechanism to ensure the sustainability into project design at the preparation stage of project.

In general, in case of a project which makes inputs to formulation of institution or reorganization of existing organizations, implementation system of task force style might work very effectively. While, a project which need to be anchored to stable organization in making inputs or transferring techniques.

#### **3-4-2 Project design and Project implementation system under fluid condition**

From the stage of project preparation, the fluid external situation surrounding the Project has been recognized, and it was pointed out that flexible review and modification of PDM is required when it is necessary. In practice, the Project has been implemented according to the principle, ranging from a major change of PDM to slight adjustment of the contents of activities. It is notable that continuous to this flexible implementation of the Project.

In the future, supports in the transitional stage from reconstruction to development will be increased in many parts of the world. The fact that the Project has been successful in achieving outputs and project purpose by flexibly changing project design and putting emphasis on information collection will present a useful lesson to projects under the similar situation.

#### **3-4-3 Technical assistance project evaluation under aid coordination**

The Project was designed and implemented with the consideration to avoid overlapping with supports from other development partners and keep coordination.

Recently, aid coordination is common in most countries and synergy effect with the other development partners and the other projects is more pursued. Within this movement, it is getting difficult to extract and evaluate only the achievements of one project. Especially, in the case of projects that pursuit human resources development as a final goal, which take long time to be achieved and realized, it is very difficult to exclude the impact from outside in evaluation. Further, the effort to extract only the contribution from the Project and measure the share of contribution does not seem to have so significant meaning. It is worth considering reviewing that concept of project evaluation based on a point of view of seeking fundamental value in a long timeframe.