

Summary of Terminal Evaluation

1. Outline of the Project	
Country : Lao People's Democratic Republic	Project title : Project for Human Resources Development for Nursing/Midwifery
Issue/Sector : Health	Cooperation Scheme : Technical Cooperation Project
Division in Charge : JICA Laos Office	Total cost (As of December 2009) Total : about 360,408,000 JPY (4,158,872USD)
Period of Cooperation : May 2005 – May 2010	Partner Country's Implementing Organization : Ministry of Health (MOH), Department of Organization and Personnel, Department of Health Care (former Department of Curative Medicine)
	Supporting Organization in Japan : The Japanese Red Cross Kyushu International College of Nursing
	Related Cooperation : - (Grant Aid) “ The Project for Strengthening Regional Education and Training Institutions for Nurses and Primary Health Care Workers ” - JOCVs, SVs
1-1 Background of the Project	
<p>In the Lao People's Democratic Republic (the Lao PDR), nurses/midwives play an important role in providing health care services. The level of these services is low, and there was an urgent need to develop nurses/midwives with appropriate knowledge and techniques in order to improve the services. Under these circumstances, the Lao PDR requested the Government of Japan to provide a Technical Cooperation Project targeting improvement of the nursing/midwifery education system and development of nurses/midwives with adequate knowledge and techniques. In response to the request, the Project for Human Resources Development of Nursing/Midwifery was started in May 2005 for the period of five years. In November 2009, six months before the termination of the Project, JICA dispatched the Terminal Evaluation Study Team.</p>	
1-2 Project Overview	
(1) Overall Goal : The holistic system for development of nursing/midwifery personnel is established.	
(2) Project Purpose : The basis for development of nursing/midwifery personnel is improved, and nursing/midwifery education system is strengthened.	
(3) Output :	
Output 1	
Functions of governmental administration of nursing/midwifery for clinical service and human resources development are intensified.	
Output 2	
Nursing and Midwifery Regulations are established and implemented.	
Output 3	
Guidelines for the Scope of the Nursing Practice are established and implemented.	
Output 4	
School Management and Implementation Guidelines are established and implemented.	
Output 5	
Guidelines for the Scope of the Midwifery Practice are established and implemented.	
Output 6	
Project monitoring and evaluation are implemented for effective management.	
Output 7	

<p>The capability of nursing teachers of Public Health School (PHS) and clinical practice instructors of Provincial Hospital (PH) and nurses of the model provincial hospital regarding fundamental nursing is strengthened.</p> <p>Output 8 The clinical practice collaboration between the model PHS and the model provincial hospital is strengthened for student clinical practice.</p> <p>Output 9 Data management of personnel and equipment is improved at the model PHS.</p>		
<p>1-3 Inputs (As of December 2009) < Japanese side > Long-term expert 5 Short-term expert 1 1 Third-country short-term expert 12 Acceptance of trainees (in Japan) 16 Equipment supplied Office equipment (photocopier, computers, etc.) Local Cost US\$324,546 (as of March 2009), < Lao side > Counterparts (CP) 13 Local cost Personnel cost for CP, provision of office space for Project team, cost for materials and consumables, land for Project Office (to be used training center)</p>		
<p>2. Evaluation Team</p>		
Members of Evaluation Team	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Mr. Koichi Takei (Leader) Senior Representative, JICA Laos Office 2. Ms. Chiyoko Hashimoto (Nursing Education I) Assistant Director, Expert Service Division, Bureau of International Cooperation, International Medical Center of Japan, Ministry of Health, Labor & Welfare 3. Ms. Wilawan Senaratana (Nursing Education II) Staff, Health Systems Division, Human Development Department, JICA 4. Ms. Kaori Osonoe (Evaluation Planning I) Representative, JICA Laos Office 5. Ms. Maki Agawa (evaluation Planning II) Associate Expert, Health Human Resources Division, Health Human Resources and Infectious Disease Control Group, Human Development Department, JICA 6. Ms. Erika Tanaka (Evaluation and Analysis) Researcher, Social Development Department, Global Link Management 	
Period of Evaluation	15 November 2009 –5 December 2009	Type of Evaluation : Terminal evaluation
<p>3.Results of Evaluation</p>		
<p>3 - 1 Summary of Evaluation Results</p> <p>(1) Relevance</p> <p>Relevance is generally high in terms of health sector policy and needs in Lao PDR, Japanese policy of Official Development Assistance (ODA) toward Lao PDR, and project approach.</p> <p>Human resources development is one of the key issues in “Sixth Five-year Health Sector Plan”. “Health Strategy up to the Year 2020” also points out strengthening the ability of health service staff in one of six development areas. Those interviewed in Terminal Evaluation at MOH, including DOP, Department of Hygiene Prevention, and Department of Planning and Finance comment that nurses play an important role in health sector improvement.</p> <p>Nursing education is relevant in terms of Japanese ODA policy as well. Both Japanese ODA Country Data book and JICA’s assistant policy toward Lao PDR name improvement of health services as one of six priority areas. Human resources development and institutional development of health sector are pointed out as one important strategy to improve health services.</p> <p>The design of the Project, with two components, is relevant. The Project tries to lay foundations of nursing education by</p>		

developing regulations and guidelines. Although regulations and guidelines are essential to prescribe roles and functions of nursing/midwifery and serves as foundations of nursing education, they did not exist before the Project. Before the Project, there were many nursing teachers who had not received organized training on nursing education. The Project put focus on fundamental nursing, which is also relevant, as fundamental nursing is basis of nursing education and can be utilized for nursing in other areas and midwifery.

Establishment of Regulations and Guidelines is relevant in project design. Nursing and Midwifery Regulations is a national legal framework stipulating nursing and midwifery work at MOH for a long-term. It is expected that all the health facilities implement nursing/midwifery meet the standard of Regulations and implement duties based on the Regulations and Guidelines developed by the Project. Even though it may be difficult for some health facilities to follow all the articles in the Regulations at this moment, it is important to establish Regulations and Guidelines as norm and standard to reach. MOH officials and Project stakeholders interviewed stressed the importance to have legal framework of nursing/midwifery.

The technical transfer approach of the Project is appropriate. The Project put importance on respecting initiatives CPs and having meetings among related stakeholders to discuss and agree on issues in the Project, which is desirable to develop capacity of CPs and enhance sustainability. It is considered that the process of development of regulations, guidelines, and training materials served as opportunities and process of capacity development of involved stakeholders.

(2) Effectiveness

Effectiveness is high. Outputs are achieved and Project Purpose is being gradually achieved.

Nursing and Midwifery Regulations and three Guidelines related to it were developed under Curative Law. The Project aims to have Regulations and Guidelines well utilized by the stakeholders during the Project period. The booklets of Regulations and Guidelines and promotion posters were distributed to Provincial Health Office (PHO), PHs, District Hospitals, and Health Centers nation-wide. To inform the contents of Nursing and Midwifery Regulations and two Guidelines authorized in January 2008, the Project organized dissemination meeting at the three locations to explain the contents of Regulations and Guidelines to participants of all the provinces. In addition, taking opportunities of visit to health facilities, the Project check the distribution and utilization status of Regulations and Guidelines and explain the contents of them to those at health facilities. The Project is planning to have dissemination meeting for Guidelines for Scope of Midwifery Practice from December 2009 to February 2010. According to interview, Regulations and Guidelines are utilized by nurses as reference at PHS and PH and incorporated in curriculum at PHS at Champasak and Vientiane Province. Through enacting Regulations and Guidelines, nurses feel that roles and functions of nurses were made clear, nursing was organized, and nursing work is recognized better than before. Some interviewed mentioned that a part of other health workers including medical doctors understand the roles and functions of nurses better than before, while others commented doctors do not understand the Regulations and Guideline, which made it difficult for nurses to observe Regulations and Guidelines.

Capacity of nursing education is greatly enhanced though further strengthening is necessary. Technical Team (TT) members improved their knowledge and skills as nursing teachers, they are now capable of teaching fundamental nursing and authorized by MOH as fundamental nursing trainer. TT trained 109 nurses in seven provinces, and Regional trainers trained by TT trained 100 nurses in Champasak. A total of 209 nurses are trained and fundamental nursing is implemented in seven provinces. According to the results of pre- and post- test of training conducted at the Project, regional trainers and nurses improved their capacity. In knowledge test, the average scores of nurses are 51.3 in pre-test and 79.4 in post-test, and in skill test of vital sign, only 20 % of them achieved expected level. The Project requests those who failed in the test to study themselves and conducts additional test later. Interview at Champasak also made it clear that Regional Trainers improved their knowledge and skills on fundamental nursing education and they are now confident than before but many of them feel their capacity is not sufficient yet. Fundamental Nursing Training Guide Book was developed by TT and distributed to health institutes. The Guide Book is the first teaching manual developed by Laos in Lao PDR. The Evaluation Team confirmed that nurses are referring to Guide Book during their work at Champasak PH.

All nine Outputs are important aspects in nursing education and contributed to Project Purpose. In PDM2, distinction between some Objectively Verifiable Indicators of Project Purpose level and Output level is not clear, which makes it a little

difficult to understand expected achievement level and the logic from Activity, Output, and Project Purpose.

(3) Efficiency

Efficiency is high. Both Lao and Japanese sides implemented planned inputs and inputs are efficiently implemented and contributed to produce Outputs.

Japanese experts, long-term and short-term, were dispatched almost as planned, although dispatch of some experts was delayed than schedule. Along with Japanese experts, short-term Thai experts were dispatched. Thai experts provided very important support because their experience and environment of nursing are similar to those in Lao PDR. In addition, Lao stakeholders and Thai experts can understand each other without much language difficulties. One difficulty in regard to dispatch of Thai experts is that Japanese experts do not have enough information of resource persons in Thailand. Most of Thai experts were selected and invited among those that Lao stakeholders have individual contacts. Both Japanese and Thai experts were highly committed and provided necessary support to Lao CPs and stakeholders adequately. JOCV assigned at PHS and PH in Champasak facilitated the communication between Japanese experts and Champasak PHS and PH.

Lao side assigned CPs and other stakeholders to be involved in the Project based on PDM and PO. Assignment of two full-time CPs of both DOP and DHC contributed a lot to implement the Project smoothly. Lao CPs and stakeholders are highly motivated and improved their capacity during the Project.

Project Office constructed by Japanese financial support provided favorable working environment for the Project, especially for regular meetings. It also served as a training venue for fundamental nursing training. MOH issued an official letter to the current Project Office to be utilized as nursing training center. As the building was constructed before the Project launched activities in Component 2, the building may be a little small to accommodate many participants for certain contents of nursing training. The Project tries to prepare the building as training center, installing beds for practice, for example, however, the building is not sufficiently equipped with models and materials for practice yet.

Provision of equipment was limited, basically to equipment of Project Office. The Japanese side provided Champasak PH a small scale of practice kit comprised of simple instruments such as scissors, which was very useful for clinical practice. School building and education equipment for practice at Champasak PHS provided by Japanese Grant Aid are well utilized and enhanced the effectiveness of training conducted at PHS. All the equipment and instruments provided are well utilized and maintained.

A total of sixteen personnel at MOH and Champasak PHS and PH were dispatched to CP training in Japan. According to interview of three persons dispatched, CP training was useful as it provided opportunity to learn systematic nursing education. One of CPs dispatched to Japan left the position after training.

All the activities were implemented to produce Outputs and activities and Outputs are logically related.

(4) Impact

There is a prospect of achievement of Overall Goal in three to five years after the Project period, but not very certain at this moment.

Dissemination of Regulations and Guidelines are in steady progress. The Project is also planning to have a meeting for six provinces (Oudomxai, Luangphabang, Xiangkhouang, Khammouan, Savannakhet and Champasak) to expand the Guidance for Clinical Practice Collaboration in April 2010.

It is necessary to expand nursing training to PHS and PH in other provinces to achieve Overall Goal. TT has been formulated and trained, and Regional trainers have also been trained. Six provinces other than Champasak formulated training plan to the Project. In the plan, 422 nurses are planned to be trained, and in Vientiane Capital, 722 nurses at four central level hospitals are planned to be trained. The Project is planning to dispatch TT for the training. Each health institute is planning to bear the training cost and MOH has already secured budget for monitoring these training courses. Specific plan to establish nursing education program beyond fundamental nursing is expected to be discussed in near future.

One concern is Objectively Verifiable Indicators 1 of Overall Goal, employment rates of graduates from PHS and CHT (College of Health Technology), which related to adequate allocation of trained nurses. Several MOH officials interviewed

during evaluation pointed out that only less than 50% of graduates of PHS can obtain positions at MOH health institutes. According to data calculated by the Project, only about 10 % of graduates of nursing school can obtain a position as official employment within a year. Although some of graduates get position in private sector, including NGO, allocation of nurses in health institutes is precarious. Implementation of health manpower plan for nursing/midwifery is one of Important Assumptions in PDM2, which means implementation of health manpower plan is the responsibility of MOH. Therefore, it is desirable that MOH monitor the Indicator continuously after the Project period to enhance the expectation of achievement of Overall Goal.

One unexpected positive impact is pointed out. During development of Regulations and Guidelines, technical terms became standardized as well as legal terms. Also in Fundamental Nursing Training Guidebook, titles of each 19 subject are indicated in both Lao and English, which may help to disseminate common concept of nursing terminology. As some of medical and clinical terms in Lao do not have widely accepted clear concept, this can be said as a positive contribution. No negative impact can be observed so far.

(5) Sustainability

Sustainability can be expected to a certain extent.

Sustainability in the aspect of policy is high. In the framework of Health Strategy up to the Year of 2020, priority will be continuously placed on health human resources development, including nurses. Training of nurses is important as a part of human resources development of midwives as nursing is the basis of midwifery.

Organizational sustainability is relatively high. MOH has intention to continuously support nursing training. Authorization of TT will pave the way to implement activities continuously and interviewed TT members have a strong will to continue activities. The building of Project Office has also been authorized as Training Center. One concern is that the plan on how to continue activities of Nursing Technical Support Committee (NTSC) is not clear although NTSC has been playing an important role in establishing nursing education as a kind of advisory body.

Financial sustainability is expected to a certain extent. It is not very certain if MOH secures sufficient budget to continuously conduct training by TT. However, the Project developed the training program on fundamental nursing which does not require expensive inputs, considering financial sustainability. If US\$200 to US\$300 of training cost for one training course can be obtained, training course can be conducted. Currently apart from training planned in the Project, MOH is planning to organize regional training courses with TT in three provinces (Attapu, Xekong and Salavan) in southern part and necessary budget is requested to MOH.

Technical sustainability is medium. TT members are well trained and they will be able to conduct training without technical support. The capacity of Regional Trainers is improved but many of them still need further training to conduct training on their own with confidence.

3-2 Factors that promoted and impeded realization of effects

(1) Planning

One of contributing factors is that elements necessary to human resources development for nursing/midwifery were incorporated in the Project design. The Project was launched with activities concerning to Component 1 and proceeded to implement activities of Component 2, based on the results of Component 1. This implementation is appropriate in one sense that the project planning can be adjusted flexibly but the project implementation was not always smooth as all the activities of Component 2 had to be implemented in a limited time.

(2) Implementation

One contributing factor is high commitment of both Lao and Japanese sides. Careful dissemination of Regulations and Guidelines is another contributing factor. Vast difference in knowledge, skills, and education background among regional trainers and nurses is one of difficulties to effectively implement training courses. The Project repeated training and workshops and conduct monitoring to enhance the effect of training.

3-5 Conclusion

Outputs are expected to be achieved. Nursing and Midwifery Regulations and three related Guidelines are developed, authorized, and being disseminated on a nation-wide scale. Regulations are utilized as a basic norm of nursing/midwifery and Guidelines are also being used at PHS and health facilities as a reference of education and nursing. For fundamental nursing training program, activities of NTSC have been implemented effectively and TT has been trained and conducting training. Nursing education system is gradually being established through activities in model province.

As Project Purpose is likely to be achieved, the Project is going to be terminated as was initially planned. Some issues still can be pointed out. For example, revision plan of Guidelines is not clear, activity plan of NTSC after the Project is not fully discussed, and some of Regional trainers do not have enough capacity. To fully achieve Project Purpose and to enhance sustainability of the Project, it is necessary to address these remaining issues toward the end of the Project.

3-6 Recommendations

Recommendations toward the end of the Project

- MOH should develop a clear activity plan and implementation system of NTSC after the Project.
- MOH should also develop a clear activity plan of TT.
- To facilitate activities of NTSC and TT, MOH should take measures to have NTSC and TT recognized as organizations under Human Resources Health Technical Working Group (HRH-TWG).
- MOH and the Project should dispatch TT to provide technical support to Regional trainers who received training courses but do not have enough teaching capacity.
- MOH should conduct monitoring for training in provinces other than Champasak
- MOH and the Project should promote dissemination of Regulations and Guidelines developed by the Project to related institutes and health facilities under MOH. The Regulations and Guidelines are; Nursing and Midwifery Regulations, Guidelines for the Scope of the Nursing Practice, Nursing/Midwifery School Management and Implementation Guidelines, and Guidelines for Scope of Midwifery Practice.
- MOH should disseminate Regulations and Guidelines to health workers other than nurses, including medical doctors. Directors of hospital should provide explanation of Regulations and Guidelines to medical doctors.
- To have nursing education system and resources developed by the Project to be continuously utilized after the Project, MOH, with support of the Project, should continuously provide presentations in regard to the results of Project activities and nursing education system, including materials, developed by the Project to related departments of MOH and other Development Partners through sector-wide coordination mechanism such as HRH-TWG meeting. The Project should also present the achievements of the Project in other events to related departments and health institutes of MOH.
- JICA should consider provision of equipment for nursing training such as simulators and mannequins for the Project. In case the procurement of equipment is not enough, MOH should develop a procedure to allow the Project to borrow equipment from teaching hospitals of MOH to facilitate nursing training.
- Project should consider the possibility of conducting fundamental nursing training in northern provinces.

Recommendations after the Project period

- MOH should continuously support and utilize nursing education system developed by the Project for future human resources development plan. Nursing education system includes the organization and activities of NTSC and TT, training methods, school data management at PHS, collaboration system between PHS and PH so that school and hospital collaboration can be adapted to areas other than fundamental nursing.
- MOH should utilize materials developed by the Project for other human resources development plan at MOH, when applicable. The materials include Regulations and Guidelines, Guidance for Clinical Practice Collaboration, Fundamental Nursing Training Guide Book, DVD for nursing training. MOH should utilize know-how and experiences acquired in the process of developing those materials for future activities at MOH.
- MOH should revise Regulations, Guidelines, and Guide Book when necessary.
- MOH should implement the National Policy on Human Resources for Health and Strategic Plan (2009-2020), which

includes allocation plan of trained nurses to health facilities.

- Based on the Decree (No. 199/MOH 02 Feb. 2 009), MOH should utilize the current Project Office as nursing training center after the Project.

3-7 Lessons Learned

- Dispatch of competent Thai experts was effective as the experiences and environment of nursing are similar to those in Lao PDR. Besides Thai and Lao people can communicate without much language difficulties. It is effective to dispatch third-country expert with similar experiences and language. For smooth dispatch of third-country expert, it is desirable that JICA regional office and JICA headquarter prepare a list of resource persons in countries neighboring CP country based on the information from the Project.
- TT members were appointed by Decree to develop and conduct nursing education program during the Project. In September 2009, by another Decree (No. 1468/MOH, 8 Sep 09), TT members were authorized as fundamental nursing trainer (Central). As in TT in this Project, it is important that CP organization takes measures to authorize organization and members trained by project to enhance sustainability of activities after the Project period.
- In dissemination of materials such as regulations, guidelines, and teaching guidebooks, it is important to grasp the distribution and installation status at actual facilities and to inform the contents of materials, instead of just distributing them. Organizing meetings to confirm distribution and to inform the contents of the materials may be one solution for effective dissemination.