

## Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Sawa Hasegawa Japan Development Service Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project of Strengthening the National Institute of Veterinary Research	January 2010 – December 2010

### I Project Outline

Country Name	The Socialist Republic of Vietnam		
Project Period	March 2000-February 2005		
Executing Agency	National Institute of Veterinary Research (NIVR)		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries		
Total Cost	834 million yen		
Related Projects (if any)	N.A		
Overall Goal	The livestock production in Vietnam is increased by improved diagnostic technology of animal infectious diseases.		
Project Objective	Diagnostic techniques, especially immunological ones at NIVR are improved.		
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The project is properly managed by the Project Management Unit (PMU).</li> <li>2. Basic and applied techniques for immunological diagnosis of important infectious diseases are acquired by NIVR staff.</li> <li>3. Latest status of important infectious diseases in Vietnam is studied and epidemiological skills are acquired by NIVR staff.</li> <li>4. Local veterinarians are trained for appropriate diagnostic techniques for infectious diseases.</li> </ol>		
Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Vietnamese Side)	
Experts	6 for Long term, 30 for Short term (at the time of terminal evaluation)	Staff allocated	60
Equipments	122 million yen <sup>1</sup> (at the time of terminal evaluation)	Equipments	Provided (the amount is unknown)
Local Cost	445 million yen (at the time of terminal evaluation)	Local Cost	155,860 US dollars (at the time of terminal evaluation)
Trainees Received	26	Land etc provided	Project office, etc.
Others		Others	

### II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>The relevance of the project is high, and Project Outputs, Objective and Overall Goal set by the project have been largely achieved. Although such an unexpected incident as the serious outbreak of avian flu resulted in more activities to be added to the original project plan, the project operation was implemented largely on schedule.</p> <p>In terms of the sustainability of the project, however, several activities have been disrupted due to the lack of funding for the executing agency of NIVR. Unavailable was also the data on the status of the implementation of training by the counterpart, to widely disseminate the diagnostic techniques improved by the project to the fields in the provinces. This way, while the project has some challenges in its sustainability, it got the good results in terms of the relevance, effectiveness/impact and efficiency during its implementation.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p> <p>&lt;Recommendations&gt;</p> <p>As recommendations to NIVR include further promotion of the dissemination of diagnostic techniques improved by the project, given its importance to animal disease prevention and to the promotion of animal husbandry as well as for wider dissemination of the diagnostic techniques to provinces, NIVR is expected to increase its efforts to secure additional budget for training from Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development. Even if it is not NIVR itself to receive the budget and carry out training, ways should be sought to encourage training implementation through other relevant organizations, including through the Regional Animal Health Center. Given the fact that animal disease control is supported by policy initiatives provides a persuasive ground for NIVR in making budget request to the Ministry, parallel efforts for self-finances should also be dedicated, through revenues from the production and sales of sample medicines dealt by NIVR, as well as through commissions on diagnosis.</p>

<sup>1</sup> The Japanese yen figures shown here were converted from the US dollar amounts at the rate of 108.2 yen/dollar, which is a rough estimate of the annual average rate (Bank of Japan, 2004).

## 1 Relevance

### (1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Vietnam

At the time of planning the project, Vietnam's "6th 5-Year Socio-Economic Development Plan (1996~2000)" set as its objective growth in agricultural production, with emphasis on the development of animal husbandry. The next national development plan of "10-Year Socio-Economic Development Strategy (2001~2010)" then recognized 'improvement of agricultural technology for the modernization of agriculture' as its target. One of the 9 emphasis of the "5-Year Agricultural and Rural Development Plan (2001~2005)" was on 'development and dissemination of agricultural technology (with focus on the restructuring of agricultural research institutes, strengthening of partnership for research and its dissemination, increased investment for agricultural modernization, fostering of researchers, and the breeding of agricultural and forest products).' Besides, the "Master Plan for Agriculture Research in Vietnam (2001)" aimed at achieving the increase and steady supply of livestock by 2010, through promoting the programs for breeding agricultural products and livestock, based on the study results on major infectious diseases such as foot-and-mouth disease, pasturellosis, and classical swine fever. This way, the centrality of improving agricultural and animal husbandry technology to Vietnam's national development plans remained unchanged till the end of the project and was supported throughout the project period. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have been relevant with the development plan of Vietnam.

### (2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Vietnam

At the time of planning the project, NIVR had been undertaking research and study on animal diseases in Vietnam. Yet the level of its research technology was not adequate, and the facilities and equipment necessary for a research organization was particularly lacking. NIVR had been tasked to effectively promote research and study on animal diseases and improve the techniques to diagnose those diseases. While the increase and steady supply of livestock products was considered as Vietnam's national priority, small-scale farming communities were suffering from damages caused by diseases from livestock infections and parasites, given a hot and humid climate condition in Vietnam. These backgrounds urged the need for animal health control and for improved diagnostic techniques. Such development needs in principle remained unchanged till the end of the project, and the demand for diagnostic techniques for animal diseases existed throughout the project implementation. From the situations above, the project can be evaluated to have met the development needs of Vietnam.

### (3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

At the time of planning the project, Japan's "Country Assistance Program for Vietnam" recognized 'agricultural and rural development' as one of the priority areas of its assistance, referring to the need for assistance to ensure improved agricultural productivity, increased food production, and market access to agricultural products. JICA's project execution policy for Vietnam also included the focus on the improvement and dissemination of technology in agriculture, forestry and fisheries, as well as on the strengthening of focal academic institutions. The program and policy above remained unchanged till the end of the project and were supported throughout the project period. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have been relevant with Japan's ODA policy.

This project has been highly relevant with Vietnam's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

## 2 Effectiveness / Impact

### (1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective

The Overall Goal shown in PDM is that "the livestock production in Vietnam is increased by improved diagnostic technology of animal infectious diseases." The logic of this Overall Goal, however, is considered as a significant leap from Project Objective. This ex-post evaluation therefore assessed the achievement of this project against an alternate goal, rather than simply quoting the aforementioned Overall Goal. The alternative goal states that "practical diagnostic techniques will be disseminated to veterinarians and animal health workers."

The mid-term evaluation of the project in November 2002 proposed that the indicators in PDM be clarified, and the comments made at the mid-term evaluation and terminal evaluation also pointed out that the relationship was unclear between the experts' academic expertise and the areas of activities which the delegated experts were to supervise. Regardless of such advice, the revision of PDM was never undertaken during the project period.

The achievement level of each Project Output is as follows.

As for Output 1, a Project Management Unit (PMU) was established composed of the director, acting director, and chiefs of research offices of NIVR, as well as of representatives of relevant committees and Japanese experts. The PMU undertook the tasks of monitoring the project and calling for regular meetings. Other 4 committees (including a committee for selecting equipment to be provided, for the administration of joint experiments, among others) were also established in parallel to the commencement of the project, which were managed and supervised by the PMU. A joint coordination committee for all four committees was also organized annually.

As for Output 2, NIVR staff succeeded in acquiring skills in immunological diagnostic techniques including the technique to create monoclonal antibody, polyclonal antibody, and conjugation technique for immunological diagnosis. The diagnostic techniques manuals were formulated by the project, such as a diagnostic protocol "CSF Protocol for 4 methods" by the Virology department. The Parasitological laboratory created some procedure record and logs.

As for Output 3, studies were carried out in pilot sites of Ba Vi district of Hà Tây province, on dairy cattle prevalence of tuberculosis, brucella, leptospirosis and theileriosis. These studies, however, were implemented under the initiative of Japanese experts, leaving little room for NIVR staff to familiarize themselves with the research methodologies. For immunological test on livestock infections, diagnostic kits for immunological diagnosis were developed.

As for Output 4, NIVR staff carried out 6 training courses on diagnostic techniques in Ba Vi district of Hà Tây province, for 268 veterinarians and animal health workers. This training course was highly appreciated by the Provincial People's Committee. Besides, a workshop was organized for veterinarians and animal health workers working with the Regional Animal Health Center under the Division of Animal Health, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, on the diagnosis and prevention of parasitic infections, pasteurization, dairy cattle diseases and milk hygiene, and classical swine fever.

The project can be evaluated to have almost achieved Project Outputs since the indicator set under each Output was basically achieved.

In terms of the achievement level of Project Objective, following results were identified: 1) the diagnostic techniques for 5 major livestock infectious diseases were improved at each laboratory office of NIVR. These diseases are classical swine fever at the Virology laboratory, swine respiratory diseases at the Bacteriology laboratory, protozoology and hepatic fascioliasis at the Parasitological laboratory, mastitis at the Veterinary Hygiene laboratory, monoclonal antibody at the Immunity Pathology laboratory. 2) 41 NIVR staff implemented the training courses on diagnostic techniques animal diseases for veterinarians and animal health workers working with the Regional Animal Health Center. Almost half of the NIVR staff gained capacity to carry out both the lectures and practical exercises by themselves. Accordingly, the project can be evaluated to have almost achieved Project Objective since most indicators set under the Objective were basically achieved.

#### (2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

In terms of the achievement level of Overall Goal, it should be noted that continuous efforts are made to widely disseminate the diagnostic techniques to the fields, by the NIVR staff who provide training courses on diagnostic techniques in response to the requests from rural veterinarians and animal health workers. The actual extent of the prevalence of the techniques, however, could not be confirmed due to the lack of relevant data. Hence, the dissemination activities are undertaken, yet the level of their achievement cannot be verified.

Some other indirect effects of this project have also been reported as follows. Yet no negative impact on natural environment through the project has been reported so far.

- As a result of clinical epidemiology survey targeting small-scale dairy farmers in some parts of Ba Vi district of Hà Tây province where dairy farming is promoted, the seriousness of the problems in breeding dairy cattle was recognized. In addition, the level of infections of dairy cattle bred outside was clarified by a parasite test and through the tests by ELISA on the antibody for brucellosis, tuberculosis, leptospirosis, and theileria parasites, whose results had an impact on Vietnam's dairy farming promotion policy.
- An international workshop on "Diagnosis and Prevention of Swine Fever in Indochina Region" was organized in Hanoi in October 2003 by this project, jointly with a regional project on the prevention of livestock diseases implemented in Thailand and its neighboring countries. The workshop confirmed the importance of the control measure supported by this project.
- This project and the disease prevention system established in NIVR made a significant contribution when avian flu broke out in Vietnam in January 2004. Owing partly to this contribution, NIVR later was designated by the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development as a reference laboratory for avian flu.
- NIVR staff acquired skills to carry out the isolation of avian flu virus, as well as its monitoring and vaccination tests.

This project has largely achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is high.

### 3 Efficiency

#### (1) Outputs

As mentioned in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact," the project achieved the expected Project Outputs.

#### (2) Elements of Inputs

The inputs of the project are shown in "Project Outline." Although such an unexpected incident as the serious outbreak of avian flu resulted in more activities to be added to the original project plan, the administration of the project mostly followed a set schedule. As shown in the "Effectiveness/Impact (1)," some concerns were raised on PDM of this project. However, judging from the terminal evaluation which analyzes that inputs other than above had been "effectively converted to outputs in terms of quality, quantity and timing," it is unlikely that the above issue affected the process of assessing overall achievements.

#### (3) Period of Cooperation, Project Cost

The actual period of cooperation was 5 years against planned 5 years, exactly as planned (100% of planned period). The actual project cost was 834 million yen, which could not be compared to the planned budget, due to the lack of information on the planned amount.

The inputs are appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

### 4 Sustainability

#### (1) Related Policy towards the Project

No policy change was observed in the area of agricultural development and animal husbandry promotion in Vietnam, and Vietnam's policies continued to support agricultural development and related measures for animal health. The extension of Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development's "Master Plan for Agriculture Research in Vietnam (2001)" for the next 5 years also confirms the policy sustainability.

#### (2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executing Agency

Responses to the questionnaire state that the PMU established within NIVR still maintain the same function as it did during the project, confirming that sufficient human resources are secured for the current implementation structure. The same project counterparts continue to work with NIVR now, and so are the instructors who acquired the diagnostic techniques improved by the project, indicating that the institutional sustainability is existent. On the other hand, the closer collaboration between the laboratory offices recommended in the terminal evaluation seemingly has not been realized, even if the offices maintain the same level of collaboration.

#### (3) Technical Aspects of the Executing Agency

According to the responses to the questionnaire, the diagnostic techniques that NIVR staff acquired through the project have been maintained, and the training on the techniques is being provided to the local veterinarians and animal health workers. Hence, no difficulty is foreseen in sustaining counterparts' skills.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executing Agency

Judging from the filled questionnaires, the budget allocation from the Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development is insufficient. The responses to the same questionnaire also indicate that NIVR's animal operation facility reconstructed and expanded by the project has not been maintained in the same manner as during the project.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

The laboratory manuals and training textbooks made by the project continue to be utilized up to now. The terminal evaluation of the project recommended that "the results of the epidemiological studies on selected important infectious diseases be compiled," and that "the cooperation with the Division of Animal Health, Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development, and with the National Veterinary Diagnostic Center be promoted." Accordingly, the results were compiled, and the cooperation and partnership with the two organizations have been established. Noted also is that continuous efforts are made to widely disseminate the diagnostic techniques to the field, by the NIVR staff who provide training courses on diagnostic techniques in response to the requests from the local veterinarians and animal health workers. The actual extent of the prevalence of the techniques, however, is yet to be verified. While no major concern has been observed on the use and management of the provided equipment, comments have been raised that the supply ability of NIVR's transformer substation and electricity network is inadequate.

Some problems have been observed in the financial aspect of the executing agency, therefore sustainability of the project effects is fair.