

1 . 評価調査結果要約表 ( 英文 )

**Summary of the Terminal Evaluation**

<b>I. Outline of the Project</b>	
Country: Socialist Republic of Vietnam	Project: Vietnam-Japan Human Resources Cooperation Center Project (Phase 2)
Sector: Human resource development in general	Cooperation scheme: Technical cooperation project
Division in charge: Japan Center Program Division, Governance Group of the Public Policy Department	Cooperation amount (as of the end of FY2008): <u>910</u> million yen
Period of the cooperation	Sep. 1, 2005 to Aug. 31, 2010
	1) Partner country's implementing organization: Ministry of Education and Training
	2) Implementing organization: Foreign Trade University (FTU)
	Supporting organization in Japan: The Japan Foundation
Other related cooperation:	
1-1 Background to and outline of the cooperation	
<p>In the Socialist Republic of Vietnam (hereinafter referred to as "Vietnam"), the development of human resources necessary for the introduction of a market economy has been positioned as one of its most important challenges. At the same time, Japan planned the establishment of "Japan Centers" as a part of its human resource development support for Asian countries in the transition to a market economy. Against this background, both countries agreed to establish the "Vietnam-Japan Human Resources Cooperation Center (hereinafter referred to as the "VJCC") Project" in Hanoi and Ho Chi Min City as a technical cooperation project whose three main pillars are "business course," "Japanese language course," and "mutual understanding." The Foreign Trade University (hereinafter referred to as the "FTU") has been appointed as a counterpart organization of the Project. This five-year project started in September 2000. Based on the results, Phase 2 has been carried out since 2005.</p> <p>The purpose of Phase 2 is for the VJCC to enhance Vietnam's competitiveness in the international market economy and promote its function as a base for further strengthening of cooperative relations between Japan and Vietnam. To accomplish this purpose, the VJCC has been carrying out various activities that aim at the following: 1) the construction of a system for making sustainable management possible and for the utilization of local human resources (localization); 2) the enhancement of cooperation between the Vietnamese and Japanese organizations concerned in order to keep up with the expansion and diversification of local needs (diversification of support systems); and 3) the assumption of the role as the hub for promoting cooperation among the Japan Centers in other ASEAN member-countries (serving as the hub).</p> <p>In the mid-term evaluation conducted in September 2008, although it was confirmed from the activities so far that it is highly likely to achieve the project goals, it was pointed out that sustainability needed to be improved by the end of the Project. Responding to this recommendation, various efforts have been carried out under the Project to strengthen the management system and improve the financial conditions. In addition, a working group of persons concerned with the Project have held discussions about the future management system of the VJCC to foster a common understanding.</p>	
1-2 Contents of the cooperation	
<p>The purpose of this Project is for the VJCC to enhance Vietnam's competitiveness in the international market economy, promote mutual understanding between Japan and Vietnam, and establish the center's function as the hub for cooperation among the Japan Centers in ASEAN member-countries through its</p>	

activities: “business course,” “Japanese language course,” and “mutual understanding.”

(1) Overall goal

To enhance competitiveness of business and human resources development in Vietnam in the market economy and to promote for mutual understanding between the Socialist Republic of Vietnam and Japan.

(2) Project goals

1) The Project will strengthen the implementation structure of the VJCC as an institution which provides various high-quality courses and seminars that contribute to enhancement of the competitiveness of business and human resources development in Vietnam and deepen the mutual understanding between the two countries.

2) To promote VJCC as a hub that connects other Centers of this kind in the ASEAN member-countries.

(3) Outputs

1) The management system of VJCC will be strengthened and it will be managed effectively, efficiently and continuously.

2) Business courses will continuously offer practical knowledge and skills pertinent to the market economy. The implementation of the courses will be nationalized gradually.

3) Japanese language courses will continuously fulfill the needs of the general public, professionals in business and the public sectors and Japanese language teachers. The implementation of the course will be nationalized gradually.

4) VJCC will become a coordinating body for promoting human network between two countries.

5) VJCC will promote regional cooperation in coordination with the Centers. In addition, VJCC will utilize know-how of the Centers for effective and efficient implementation of the activities of VJCC.

(4) Inputs

Vietnamese side:

- 1) Allocation of C/P personnel
- 2) Allocation of staff
- 3) Land, buildings, equipment
- 4) Local costs
- 5) Provision of facilities

Japanese side (total input: 910 million yen):

- 1) Dispatch of experts
- 2) Provision of equipment
- 3) C/Ps training in Japan
- 4) Sharing of local costs
- 5) Employment of local staff

Revenues from the activities of the VJCC

## II. Outline of the evaluation team

Team members	Advisor:	Mr. Mitsuya ARAKI, Chairperson, Advisory board on Japan Center Program
	Team Leader:	Mr. Hiroaki NAKAGAWA, Director General, Public Policy Department, JICA HQ
	Deputy Team Leader:	Mr. Katsutoshi FUSHIMI, Director, Japan Center Program Div., Public Policy Department, JICA HQ
	Japanese Language Course Evaluation Analysis:	Mr. Junichi ARIMA, Japanese Language Education Advisor, The Japan Foundation
	Japanese Language Course Evaluation Planning:	Ms. Yuri TAKEDA, Sakura Network Team, The Japan Foundation
	Evaluation and Analysis:	Ms. Yoshiko TAKAHASHI, Y's Consulting Office Co., Ltd.
	Cooperation Planning:	Ms. Miho OKUBO, Japan Center Program Div., Public Policy Department, JICA HQ
Period of the evaluation	January 10 to 30, 2010	Type of evaluation: Terminal evaluation

## III. Outline of the evaluation results

### 3-1 Confirmation of the achievements

#### (1) Degree of achievement of the outputs

Output 1: “The management system of VJCC will be strengthened and it will be managed effectively, efficiently and continuously.”

Given that decision-making and information-sharing systems have been constructed through regular meetings of the Steering Committee, that rules on the management of the VJCC have been established, and that the balance of accounts related to the management of the VJCC has been improving year by year, it can be said that the criteria for this output have been almost fulfilled and the foundation for the management of the Project has been created to some extent. However, to improve the sustainability further after the end of the Project, it is necessary for the Vietnamese managers and staff members to participate in the management of the VJCC more actively than before.

Output 2: “Business courses will continuously offer practical knowledge and skills pertinent to the market economy. The implementation of the courses will be nationalized gradually.”

After Vietnam joined the World Trade Organization in 2007, private companies in Vietnam were faced with the urgent issue of how to gain international competitiveness. It was confirmed that to deal with this issue in the Vietnamese industrial and economic worlds, the VJCC should consistently provide practical knowledge and skills through its business courses (BC) concerning production management, marketing, human resources development, financial management, and management strategies. In fact, 82% of the BC participants in Hanoi and Ho Chi Minh City from 2005 to 2009 evaluated the VJCC's BC as “practical and effective.”

Most of the practical affairs concerning the management of BC have been conducted by the Vietnamese managers and staff members. However, the annual plans for the courses given by Japanese lecturers are prepared mainly by Japanese experts, while those for the courses given by Vietnamese lecturers are

prepared mainly by Vietnamese managers. With regard to the promotion of the use of local lecturers, local lecturers have been teaching “communication skills,” “administration management,” and other courses where it is more advantageous for them to be taught by local lecturers.

Output 3: “Japanese language courses will continuously fulfill the needs of the general public, professionals in business and the public sectors and Japanese language teachers. The implementation of the course will be nationalized gradually.”

In its Japanese language courses (JC), the VJCC has provided not only courses, but also seminars, study meetings, and newsletters to fulfill the needs of Japanese language learners and teachers. The number of Japanese language learners in Vietnam has increased almost threefold over the last decade, with the result that the number of private Japanese language schools and the number of Japanese teachers have also increased in Vietnam. However, the VJCC has contributed to improvements in the quality of the Japanese language education in Vietnam as the only institution that gives support to Japanese language teachers. Although intermediate and advanced courses were provided in Phase 1, the VJCC adopted a policy of increasing the number courses for Levels 1 and 2 of the Japanese Language Proficiency Test (JLPT) around 2007 and since then has been drawing many participants.

With regard to the promotion of the use of local lecturers, the VJCC can employ Vietnamese part-time lecturers for almost all the Japanese language courses, except for the courses that can be taught only by Japanese lecturers. However, it can be said that the sustainable use of high-quality Vietnamese lecturers is an issue that the VJCC must solve to become independent.

Output 4: “VJCC will become a coordinating body for promoting human network between two countries.

With regard to the mutual understanding activities, the Project has focused on activities that contribute to the development of human resources, such as support for exchanges between universities and the promotion of an understanding of the business culture in Japan. These activities (in collaboration with other organizations) have been carried out 546 times so far. The total number of participants since 2005 is 76,906. Because the libraries of the VJCC-Hanoi and VJCC-HCMC (Ho Chi Minh City) have a large number of books, teaching materials, DVDs, and magazines on the Japanese language and culture, they are highly valued, especially by Japanese language teachers and learners.

Output 5: “VJCC will promote regional cooperation in coordination with the Centers. In addition, VJCC will utilize know-how of the Centers for effective and efficient implementation of the activities of VJCC.”

The VJCC carried out collaborative activities seven times with the Cambodia-Japan Cooperation Center and the Lao-Japan Human Resource Cooperation Center. However, these collaborative activities were carried out not according to detailed plans, but at the request of the Japan Centers. It was difficult to achieve this output because the Japan Center Projects in the other countries did not include collaborative activities and because the needs and circumstances differed from country to country.

## (2) Status of the achievement of the project goals

Project Goal 1: “The Project will strengthen the implementation structure of the VJCC as an institution which provides various high-quality courses and seminars that contribute to enhancement of the competitiveness of business and human resources development in Vietnam and deepen the mutual understanding between the two countries.”

Project Goal 2: “To promote VJCC as a hub that connects other Centers of this kind in the ASEAN

member-countries.”

1) Implementation structure (management system) of the VJCC

As described in “Output 1” above, the Vietnamese side has made various improvements to ensure that the management of the VJCC is independent and has accumulated know-how and lessons concerning its management. Moreover, in the light of the VJCC’s financial condition, an indicator for the achievement of the project goals, the VJCC’s revenues from its activities have been increasing year by year as a proportion of the cost of managing the VJCC. It was confirmed from these facts that the foundation for the management of the VJCC has been established to some extent. However, with respect to the sustainability of the Project, it is essential for the Vietnamese staff to more actively participate in the management of the VJCC.

2) Provision of advanced and practical business courses

The VJCC have been providing a wide variety of business courses, ranging from general courses such as “production management” to a “cram course in management.” With regard to Indicator 1 for the project goals, the “level of satisfaction of participants in business courses and seminars,” the proportion participants who were satisfied with the courses accounted for 84.7% in 2007 and 83.5% in 2008 on average. According to the results of a questionnaire survey on the companies that received “on-site guidance,” the companies that answered that the “VJCC’s on-site guidance contributed to improvements in our company” accounted for 91% with regard to the VJCC-Hanoi and 100% for the VJCC-HCMC. As for the training of local lecturers, it is hard to say whether the training provided positive results, partly due to the concept of providing Japanese-style business know-how. Technical transfer from Japanese lecturers to candidates for local lecturers, including FTU lecturers, just started in 2009.

3) Provision of advanced Japanese language courses

As described in “Output 3” of “(1) Degree of achievement of the outputs” above, the VJCC has consistently focused on intermediate and advanced courses since Phase 1. In Phase 2 also, the VJCC has been providing preparatory courses for Levels 1 and 2 of the Japan Language Proficiency Test. Provision of these advanced courses was difficult for other private Japanese language schools and the Japanese language departments of universities. The test pass rate for the participants in these courses run by the VJCC-Hanoi increased by more than 300% for Level 1 and by 50% for Level 2 from 2006 to 2008. In addition, Vietnam has no institution other than the VJCC that provides any seminar or course for Japanese language lecturers. Therefore, it can be said that VJCC has played an important role in providing Japanese language education in Hanoi and Ho Chi Minh City.

4) Provision of activities and events for mutual understanding

As described in “Output 4” of “(1) Degree of achievement of the outputs” above, the VJCC held various events and cultural exchange activities, such as speech contests and the Hoi An Festival, under joint sponsorship with other organizations. Since the second half of Phase 2, the VJCC has been shifting the main purpose from mutual cultural understanding between Japan and Vietnam to the development of human resources that understand Japan’s business culture. Consequently, the dispatch of experts on mutual understanding, which had started during Phase 1, ended in December 2008. At present, activities for mutual understanding have been planned and managed by the local staff members of the VJCC, Japanese experts, and volunteers such as Vietnamese students.

5) Development of the VJCC’s function as the hub for cooperation among the Japan Centers in ASEAN

-member countries (Project Goal 2)

As described in “Output 5” of “(1) Degree of achievement of the outputs” above, activities were carried out seven times together with the Cambodia-Japan Cooperation Center and the Lao-Japan Human Resource Cooperation Center.

### 3-2 Summary of the evaluation results

#### (1) Relevance

The relevance of the Project is high.

The project goals and the overall goal are consistent in light of the promotion of economic growth and the enhancement of international competitiveness, areas on which the Japanese Official Development Assistance Policy to Vietnam places priority. Moreover, the Project is also highly relevant to Vietnam’s national policies as the “Ten-year Strategies of Socio-Economic Development in Vietnam (2001-2010)” and the “8th Five-year Plan for Socio-Economic Development in Vietnam (2006-2010)” underline the enhancement of human resources and technologies that promote a market economy.

#### (2) Effectiveness

The effectiveness of the Project is high.

Although the VJCC was in the process of strengthening the implementation system for Output 1 at the time of the terminal evaluation, routine work can be carried out by the managers and the staff members. As described in “(1) Degree of achievement of the outputs,” many achievements have already emerged in the business courses (Output 2), the Japanese language courses (Output 3), and mutual understanding (Output 4). It was confirmed that these three outputs are contributing significantly to the achievement of the project goals.

#### (3) Efficiency

The efficiency of the Project is fair.

Although it is clear that the Project produced visible outcomes, it cannot be said that the inputs were appropriate and the emergence of outputs was sufficient, partly because there was a period when no counterpart was allocated.

#### (4) Impact

Although at present it is difficult to judge whether the overall goal will be achieved, some positive impacts have been confirmed.

##### 1) Prospect to achieve the overall goal

Although many improvements were reported from the companies that received “on-site guidance” during the VJCC business courses, given that there are a huge number of companies throughout Vietnam, it is too early to evaluate the degree of the achievement of the overall goal. However, the Project is expected to achieve the overall goal by contributing to the enhancement the competitiveness of Vietnamese companies as a component of JICA’s Cooperation Program on the Development of Small and Medium Enterprises

and Supporting Industries.

2) Other unexpected positive impacts

a) BC's contribution to small Japanese companies

Because it is difficult for small Japanese companies to provide in-house training to their managers and staff members, the employment of high-quality local managers and staff members is a major issue for them. Because one-fourth of BC participants in the VJCC-HCMC are employees of Japanese companies, it can be said that the VJCC gives these Japanese companies opportunities for outside training.

b) Attempts to create additional business and Japanese language courses

When it was found that the Japanese language courses started by the VJCC were profitable, some private Japanese language schools began to give similar courses. With regard to the business courses as well, some universities and private consulting companies inaugurated business courses similar to those of the VJCC.

c) Base for the prompt implementation of Japan's assistance

When the Japanese Government decided to provide assistance to tackle the global financial crisis, the VJCC contributed to the timely dispatch of JICA experts. Concretely, when JICA dispatched experts for the "loan screening ability improvement seminar" and the "business plan preparation seminar," the VJCC made it possible to quickly dispatch experts by confirming the need for the seminars and making preparations for them.

(5) Sustainability

The sustainability of the Project is expected to be secured.

1) Institutional sustainability

Because FTC sometimes failed to assign its staff members as JC managers or BC managers in the VJCC-HCMC during the project period, the foundation for the management of the VJCC after the end of the Project has not necessarily stabilized. However, because the working group of Vietnamese and Japanese persons concerned held meetings eleven times from May 2008 to consider in earnest the future role and management system of the VJCC, with the result that a common understanding began to develop, its institutional sustainability is expected to increase by the end of the Project.

2) Technical sustainability

a) Business courses

The management of the BC is conducted mainly by the BC managers and staff members. Japanese experts provide support to them whenever needed. Because the VJCC mainly taught Japanese know-how, and the time was not ripe for the active promotion of the employment of local lecturers, it was not until 2009 that technical transfer from Japanese BC experts to FTU's candidates for lecturers began in earnest. After consideration was given to the utilization of local lecturers, a list of candidate lecturers was prepared and it is planned that the candidates will be used as local lecturers one after another according to the list.

#### b) Japanese language courses

Because most of the Japanese language courses can be conducted by local lecturers, it seems possible for the Vietnamese managers and staff members to continue the courses. In addition, because the popularity of Japanese language learning has been growing and the VJCC's revenues from tuition fees is expected to increase, the sustainability of the JC will be secured if high-quality regular JC managers are assigned to the VJCC-Hanoi and VJCC-HCMC.

#### c) Mutual understanding activities

The VJCC-Hanoi and VJCC-HCMC manage mutual understanding activities through the use of their staff members and volunteers, such as students of the Vietnam-Japan Student Club and cultural clubs (for example, the Ura-senke Tea Ceremony Foundation). However, support from Japanese experts is still necessary for planning events and making connections with Japanese companies, universities, and NGOs.

#### 3) Financial sustainability

The ratio of the revenues of the VJCC from its activities to the cost of managing the VJCC is on an upward trend, increasing from 24.7% in 2005 to 64.2% in September 2009. Although the financial condition of the VJCC has been improving year by year, securing its financial sustainability requires increasing its own revenues and reducing its expenditures.

### 3-3 Factors for the emergence of the effects

To give the business courses, from 2007 the Project attempted to combine the business courses, on-site guidance, and training in Japan, develop promising local companies strategically, and create companies that can serve as models in Vietnam. It can be said that this attempt heightened the effects of the business courses and contributed to the Project's production of the effects.

### 3-4 Problems and the factors causing them

The PDM prepared at the beginning of the Project contains some unclear parts in terms of descriptions and the setting of indicators. In addition, as the Project progressed, some parts of the original plan were revised. Therefore, the project plan (PDM) should have been reviewed according to changes in the circumstances in order to appropriately monitor the Project.

### 3-5 Conclusions

Judging from the achievements of the Project and the results of the evaluation according to the five criteria, it seems highly likely that the project goals will be accomplished by the end of the Project. What is worthy of special mention is that, although neither the Vietnamese side nor the Japanese side attempted to share a common understanding about the management of the VJCC until midway through this phase of the Project, a common understanding about the future direction of the VJCC was achieved between both sides as a result of discussions by the working group of Vietnamese and Japanese persons concerned since May 2008, and a "CEO training course" was offered as the FTU's own project in cooperation with the VJCC.

### 3-6 Recommendations

#### (1) Early appointment of Vietnamese directors-general after Phase 2



As discussed by the working group, it was decided that the VJCC-Hanoi and VJCC-HCMC should each be managed independently by a Vietnamese director-general after the end of Phase 2. For this purpose, it is necessary to establish a management system during Phase 2. To secure a sufficient preparatory period, the FTU is required to appoint the full-time Vietnamese directors-general by May at the latest.

(2) Preparation of a concrete management system plan

To shift smoothly to a new implementation system after Phase 2, it is necessary to establish a concrete management system plan for the VJCC (including the contents of the services, an operation plan, a budget plan, and the assignment of personnel) based on the results of the working group's discussions and discussions with the FTU, the Vietnamese directors-general, Japanese experts, and the JICA Office staff.

(3) Securing financial sustainability

Although the efforts to improve the financial condition of the VJCC were made during Phase 2, the following efforts are necessary to further increase sustainability: review of the contents of the services of the VJCC; review of the tuition fees for the BC and JC; diversification of revenue sources through the expansion of entrusted services; and review of the details of the expenditures. As a target, the VJCC should cover 60% of the management costs from its own revenues by the end of the Project.

### 3-7 Lessons learned

It was not until midway through Phase 2 that the Vietnamese and Japanese sides attempted to share a common understanding about the future management of the VJCC. From May 2008, however, communications were strengthened and a common understanding about the future direction of the VJCC was formed between both sides through a total of 11 meetings held continuously by the working group of Vietnamese and Japanese persons concerned. In addition, this resulted in an increase in the FTU's ownership of the Project, contributing to the smooth implementation of the Project. Although the establishment of the working group was not planned at the beginning of the Project, the working group can be said to have been effective in strengthening relations with the Vietnamese side and eliciting its initiatives.