

終了時評価調査結果要約表（英文）

I. Outline of the Project	
Country: Vietnam	
Project title: Enhancing Functions of Agricultural Cooperative	
Issue/Sector: Agricultural Development	
Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation	
Division in charge: Vietnam Office	
Total cost: 496 million Yen	
Period of Cooperation	(R/D): 27 March 2006 to 26 March 2010
	(Extension): 27 March 2010 to 27 September 2010
(F/U) :	Partner Country's Implementing Organization: Department of Cooperatives and Rural Development (DCRD), Ministry of Agriculture and Rural Development (MARD)
	Supporting Organization in Japan: Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries
Related Cooperation:	
<p>1. Background of the Project</p> <p>In Vietnam, agricultural cooperatives were transformed and founded in accordance with the 1996 Law on cooperatives. There are in total 9,069 agricultural cooperatives in Vietnam as of 2004. Agricultural cooperatives are considered to play a key role in rural development and poverty reduction in Vietnam. However, most of transformed and newly founded cooperatives do not yet fully function due to lack of understanding the role of agricultural cooperatives and a shortage of experiences in agricultural business activities as well as organizing its members. Therefore, the Vietnamese government requested Japanese government technical cooperation project for strengthening functions of agricultural cooperatives of Vietnam. In response to the request, JICA's four-year technical cooperation project has been launched since March, 2006 and now four JICA experts are being dispatched to DCRD-MARD.</p> <p>2. Project Overview</p> <p>(1) Overall Goal</p> <p>Agricultural Cooperative (AC) models made by the project are recognized as AC models for improving farmers' livelihood in Vietnam, and the models are utilized in not only in Northern Region but also in the other regions of Vietnam.</p> <p>(2) Project Purpose</p> <p>Good models for enhancing of functions of ACs that lead the members' livelihood improvement are established in Pilot Provinces (PPs).</p> <p>(3) Outputs</p> <p>Output 1: Activities of the PACs &amp; SACs are improved.</p> <p>Output 2: Organizational development of the PACs and the SACs is promoted.</p> <p>Output 3: Capacity of the related officials and staff of the PACs and the SACs is enhanced.</p> <p>Output 4: Capacity of public officials in the PPs to strengthen functions of agricultural cooperatives is enhanced.</p> <p>(4) Inputs</p> <p>Japanese side:</p> <p>Dispatch of Experts: four long-term experts (Chief Advisor, Project Coordinator/Training, Economic Activities, Credit Business).</p> <p>One short-term expert (Social and Economic Survey)</p> <p>Equipment: 6 vehicles, 13 computers, 5 printers, 3 projectors and 13 moisture checking machines</p> <p>Trainings: 23 trainees for training in Japan, 10 trainees for training in Thailand and 9 trainees for training in the Philippines.</p> <p>Local Cost: around 85 million Yen (as of Mar 2009)</p> <p>Facilities construction (3 PACs office) : around 46 million Yen</p> <p>Vietnamese side:</p> <p>Appointment of counterparts: 16 persons in total</p> <p>Provision of office space for the Project in MARD office</p> <p>Local cost : around 30 billion VND (as of Oct 2009)</p>	

II. Evaluation Team	
Members of Evaluation Team	Mr. Yasuhiro TOJO, Team Leader, Senior Representative, Japan International Cooperation Agency (JICA) Vietnam Office Mr. Shunichi NAKADA, Agriculture and Rural Development, Senior Advisor to the Director General, Rural Development Department, JICA Ms. Nobuko WADA, Evaluation Management, Representative, JICA Vietnam Office Mr. Yoshihiko FUJITA, Evaluation Analysis, Consultant, KRI International Corp.
Period of Evaluation	1 November to 14 November 2009 Type of Evaluation: terminal evaluation
III. Results of Evaluation	
<p>3-1. Summary of Achievements</p> <p>(1) Activities for achieving Output 1</p> <p>1) Needs survey of AC members/Formulation of midterm plan</p> <p>After the needs survey of AC members based on the standardized survey items in 3 PACs and 11 SACs in the pilot provinces, each AC formulated a midterm plan (3 to 5 years) based on the needs of AC members.</p> <p>2) Guidelines/Manuals</p> <p>Following guidelines and manuals were prepared, utilized at seminars/trainings, and distributed to MARD, DARD and agricultural cooperatives (ACs): i) Handbook of Farmer Members of Cooperatives (11,000 copies); ii) System of Legal Documents on Cooperatives (11,000 copies); iii) Joint Marketing Business of Advanced Cooperatives (Volume I) (2,000 copies); iv) Joint Marketing Business of Advanced Cooperatives (Volume II) (2,000 copies); v) Simple Software for Management of Loans and Savings (6 copies for MARD, 2 DARDs, 3 PACs); vi) Model Procedure for Credit Business (6 copies); vii) Guideline, How to Manage Loan Business (4,000 copies); viii) Guideline, For the Sound Management of Credit Business (6 copies). In addition, Manual for ix) Guideline for Joint Marketing Business/Joint Supply Business; x) Manual for questionnaire to producers; and xi) Manual for questionnaire to producers will be published shortly. Furthermore, the Vietnamese government plans to distribute these guidelines/manuals to all the provinces and cities in Vietnam by December 2009.</p> <p>3) Seminars/Trainings</p> <p>Series of seminars and trainings were undertaken for MARD, DARD and AC officials as follows: i) PAC-SAC joint seminar (1 batch, 70 trainees), ii) Seminars on Joint Marketing (8 batches, about 400 trainees in total), iii) Seminar on Midterm Plan (2 batches, about 100 trainees in total), iv) Seminar on Internal Credit Business (5 batches, about 250 trainees in total); v) Training Seminar on Joint Utilization of Agricultural Machinery (2 batches); vi) Training in Japan (2 batches, 23 trainees in total); vii) Training in Thailand (1 batch, 10 trainees); viii) Training in the Philippines (1 batch, 9 trainees); ix) Training Seminar on Irrigation (4 batches, about 40 trainees in total); x) Seminar on AC Accounting System (1 batch, 100 trainees) and xi) Seminar on Training manual for Agriculture Cooperative (1 batch).</p> <p>4) Gross turnover of PACs and SACs</p> <p>Since the commencement of the Project, the growth rate of gross turnover of PACs and SACs is as follows; 59.7% for PACs and 37.4% for SACs in Thai Binh province; 84% for PAC and 83.1% for SACs in Hoa Binh province (2008/2006). The growth rate of all the PACs and SACs exceeds the verifiable indicator (8%/yearly, 16.6% from 2006 to 2008) set by the Project.</p> <p>5) New business activities</p> <p>6 business activities in 3PACs and 19 business activities in 9SACs were newly started. In all PACs and SACs, at least one new business activity was started (4 activities in 3 PACs and 13 activities in 11 SACs), and the verifiable indicator of the Project was satisfied. The business activities are implemented following ACs' midterm plans based on the needs of AC members. In many cases, joint marketing and internal credit business was started. However, since these activities were just started, the accumulation of experience and the number of the AC members who participate in these activities are to be developed.</p> <p>(2) Activities for achieving Output 2</p> <p>1) Guidelines/Manuals</p>	

Following guidelines and manuals were prepared, utilized at seminars/trainings, and distributed to MARD, DARD and ACs: i) Manuals for Developing Midterm Plan (issued as a government instructions); ii) Procedures of Auditing of Internal Credit Business; iii) Rules and Rights of Members of Agricultural Cooperatives; iv) Manual on Organizing a General Meeting in Agricultural Cooperative (4,000 copies); v) Manual on Organization and Activities of Management Board and Auditing Board in Agricultural Cooperative (4,000 copies); vi) Total Analysis of Agricultural Cooperatives in Japan (4,000 copies). In addition, vii) Self-evaluation Format on the Management of Agricultural Cooperatives will be published shortly. Furthermore, the Vietnamese government plans to distribute these guidelines/manuals to all the provinces and cities in Vietnam by December 2009.

#### 2) Producers' groups

Through Japanese experts' visit and guidance at PACs, producers' groups are organized in all PACs. The groups are mainly focusing on producing rice and marketing. However, since these activities were just started, the accumulation of experience and the number of the AC members who participate in these activities are to be developed.

#### (3) Activities for achieving Output 3

##### 1) Seminars/Trainings for AC officials

The ratio of participation in seminars and trainings of AC officials is as follows; Regarding PACs, about 80% in 2006 and almost 100% in 2009; Regarding SACs, about 30-100% every year.

##### 2) Degree of Satisfaction

The trainees' degree of satisfaction towards the trainings and seminars is basically high. Most trainees answered 'very satisfied' or 'satisfied' in the questionnaire for the trainees. For example, in response to questionnaires, out of 14 PACs/SACs, the number of the ACs (as a whole) who answered 'very satisfied' is 6 (43%) and 'satisfied' is 5 (36%) in 2009.

##### 3) Self-evaluation on seminars/trainings

The percentage of the trainees who answered to the questionnaire that their capacity are developed by the participation in the trainings/seminars is about 60-90% for PACs and 30-100% for SACs. From the AC members' points of view, according to questionnaires (to 60 members from 3 PACs), the number of the respondents who recognize PAC officials improved their instruction skills after the commencement of the Project is 57 (95%). Regarding AC officials' instruction method for improving livelihood, the number of respondents who evaluated 'very good' is 25 (42%) and those of 'good' is 33 (55%).

#### (4) Activities for achieving Output 4

##### 1) Seminars/Trainings for government officials in pilot provinces

Local government officials attended the same seminars/trainings mentioned in (3) above. The ratio of participation in seminars and trainings of AC officials is as follows; 80-100% in Hoa Binh province (32 officials joined the seminars/trainings in total); 70-100% in Thai Binh province (46 officials joined the seminars/trainings in total). DARDs in Thai Binh and Hoa Binh provinces hold their own seminars/trainings for the ACs in their provinces, learning from the seminars/trainings by the Project. Also, in corporation with CMARD, standardized training programs are now under development.

##### 2) Degree of Satisfaction

The trainees' degree of satisfaction towards the trainings and seminars is basically high. Most trainees answered 'very satisfied' or 'satisfied' in the questionnaire for the trainees. For example, in response to questionnaires to DARDs (as a whole), DARD of Thai Binh answered 'satisfied' and that of Hoa Binh answered 'very satisfied' in 2009.

##### 3) Self-evaluation on seminars/trainings

Every trainee showed 100% satisfaction towards the trainings and seminars.

#### Achievement of the Project Purpose

PACs and SACs successfully introduced the scheme of planning and implementing plans based on actual needs of AC members. For example, most of PACs and SACs planned and implemented midterm plan and AC business activities for AC members were newly started or enhanced. Especially, internal credit was introduced to some of the PACs /SACs and it has been well operated. As a result,

gross turnover and profits of the most PACs and SACs have been increased. These services contribute to establishing a good AC model for improving the livelihood of AC members. Although monitoring and review on each business activity is needed for the time being, the project purpose could be highly achieved if these services are maintained.

### 3-2. Summary of Evaluation Results

#### (1) Relevance

The Project is relevant to Vietnamese policies, such as '10-year Strategy for Social Economic Development (2001-2010)' or 'Social Economic Development Program (SEDP) 2006-2010'. Moreover, 'New Rural Area Project', which is now under deliberation at the National Assembly, also aims at setting up a good AC model for modernization of rural area. Regarding Japanese ODA policies, for example, 'Country Program for Vietnam' (Jul. 2009) focuses on the cooperation on rural development and improvement of livelihood. Especially assistance in farmers' organization is clearly stated in the program. This means the Project is relevant to Japanese policies. In addition, considering the geographical and social conditions of the northern part of Vietnam, it is appropriate to select Hoa Binh and Thai Binh provinces as pilot provinces of the Project. Also, as PACs and SACs play leading roles in enhancing functions of ACs, their selection could be regarded as reasonable.

#### (2) Effectiveness

##### Achievement of the Outputs

**Output 1:** Several manuals/guidelines covering important issues on AC business were prepared and distributed. In all PACs and SACs, the gross turnover is increased. Furthermore, all PACs and SACs activated at least one new business activity. Therefore, verifiable indicators for this output have been achieved. However, some important issues are still to be resolved, such as monitoring and review on midterm plan and new business activities.

**Output 2:** Several manuals/guidelines on enhancing AC organization were prepared and distributed. In response to interviews, almost all AC officials evaluated that these manuals/guidelines are easy-to-use and helpful. Also, all PACs set up farmers' groups with Japanese experts' visits and advice. Thus, verifiable indicators for this output have been achieved. However, interviews with Japanese experts and AC officials revealed that farmers' groups were just organized, so some issues are to be reviewed, such as the linkage between production and marketing, and review on process, and enhancement of AC organization and AC capital by contributions from more AC members.

**Output 3:** Series of seminars/trainings were provided to AC officials. Towards questionnaire, trainees answered that most of them highly satisfied with the seminars/trainings and highly evaluated effectiveness of the seminars/trainings. In addition, almost all AC officials, who had an interview with the terminal evaluation team, recognize the importance of formulating midterm plan based on the needs of AC members, and the significance of the human resources development of AC officials. Furthermore, towards questionnaire, AC members, as recipients of AC services, answered that AC officials' capacities are improved. Therefore, this output has been achieved.

**Output 4:** The same seminars/trainings mentioned in 'output 3' above were provided to MARD and DARD officials. Towards questionnaire, trainees answered that most of them fully satisfied with the seminars/trainings and highly evaluated effectiveness of the seminars/trainings. In addition, almost all officials, who had an interview with the terminal evaluation team, share the ideal image of a 'good AC model.' Although some DARD officials pointed out that specialized seminars/trainings towards government officials are needed, this output has been achieved.

It is considered that achievement of the above Output resulted in the attainment of the Project Purpose.

#### (3) Efficiency

Inputs from Japanese side (e.g. Japanese experts, trainings/seminars, equipments and facilities) have generally been utilized for undertaking project activities for achieving the outputs. For instance, small equipments such as moisture checking machines and pumps are highly appreciated by AC officials and members. The amount of the inputs from Japanese side was huge but Vietnamese side also shared a considerable amount of money. Most of C/Ps highly understand the project purpose and

involve in the Project with passion. However, almost all C/Ps are also assigned to other jobs and couldn't always accompany with Japanese experts when experts visit PACs/SACs. If the Project had intended to train C/Ps to become experts who can give ACs practical guidance on AC activities, the Project would have been operated more efficiently. It was also pointed out that making midterm plan took much longer than expected and that affected project progress.

#### (4) Impacts

Hoa Binh province DARD expressed their view that they utilize Dong Tam 1 (PAC) as an advanced example. Nguyen Xa (SAC) of Thai Binh province is also recognized as a successful AC. The overall goal can be achieved if sharing good AC models and examples among concerned people are continued. Furthermore, 'New Rural Area Project' by the Vietnamese government adopts 'a good AC model' as one of its criteria. 'New Rural Area Project' has also referred good practice shown in the Project. Thus, it is expected that the achievement of the overall goal of the Project contributes to development policies by Vietnamese government. However, it should be carefully examined the different circumstances between the northern part and central and south parts in Vietnam (e.g. the number and ratio of organized ACs, size of farms) when the models by the Project are utilized in the other regions.

It is difficult to say that the economic impacts of the Project have been shown at the time of the terminal evaluation. There are few AC members who receive AC services. Also, as the result of baseline survey in 2007 and 2009, agricultural income of the respondents (AC members) has not changed so much.

#### (5) Sustainability

Technical transfer such as formulating midterm plan based on the needs of AC members is efficiently implemented, and some ACs other than PACs and SACs adopt the methods provided by the Project. In addition, MARD has prepared the governmental instructions on the midterm plan to all ACs. The Vietnamese government highly appreciated the Project, and seeks to the enhancement of AC organization and function via 'New Rural Area Project' (2010-2020). Therefore, it is expected that the policy formulation and budget allocation towards AC development are implemented by the Vietnamese government. Enhancement in capacity of staff members of MARD and DARD by the Project activities was observed. For example, MARD and DARD implement seminars/trainings for AC officials by themselves. It is necessary to keep and develop those capable personnel for continuing supports for establishment/ management of agricultural cooperatives. On the other hand, it should be noted that it will take a few more years to evaluate the effectiveness and efficiency of AC business activities. It is also needed that promoting AC members' participation and gaining more contributions from more AC members for increasing AC capital and ensuring sustainability.

#### 3-3. Factors that promoted realization of effects

- Most of C/Ps highly understand the project purpose and involve in the Project with passion, although almost all C/Ps are busy because they assigned to other jobs.
- Very good relationship is maintained between C/Ps and Japanese experts. This contributes to the close corporation.
- Organizations and governmental support were ready for technical transfer. For example, ACs in pilot provinces were already set up and the government supported them. The problem is that the bottom-up process based on the needs of AC members was not successful. In this circumstance, the Vietnamese government highly appreciates the activities by the Project, especially formulating midterm plan based on the needs and participation of AC members. Very good relationship is maintained between C/Ps and Japanese experts. This contributes to the close corporation.
- Provision of equipment. Especially small equipments such as moisture checking machines and pumps are highly appreciated by AC officials and members.

#### 3-4. Factors that impeded realization of effects

##### (1) Factors concerning to Planning

- Realizing multi-functioned ACs naturally requires various kinds of AC business activities. At the

project planning stage, it was not estimated what kind of support will be needed to put the mid-term plan into action. Taking the Project duration, method and level of technical transfer into consideration, it is needed to prioritize the Project's activities which are directly related, effective and efficient towards improving AC members' livelihood.

- It is desirable for project management members and the people concerned to have common understanding of the "good AC model" from the beginning.

#### (2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

- The example of SACs can be applied to other ACs easily while it requires huge amount of funds in order to upgrade/provide the facilities and equipment in the same way as PACs. It is needed to establish the scheme that enables to finance in ACs, and at the same time, it is expected that Japanese experts provide guidance in order for ACs to be financially sustainable (especially the fund needed at the time of implementing a midterm plan).

### 3-5. Conclusion

The Project is consistent with the national policy of the Vietnamese government and Japanese ODA policy, and sufficiently reflects the needs of the target group. Inputs of the Project have been utilized for the activities, led to sufficient amount of accomplishment in the outputs, although you cannot say it is high efficiency.. The project purpose is also going to be achieved, but when considering the next steps, it is needed to establish process of implementing and reviewing a midterm plan as a part of a good AC model. Then, in order to review the outputs after finishing the next cropping season (until July or August 2010), the possibility would be high if the project duration is extended. Impacts of the Project could also be thought high since the overall goal is highly prospected to be achieved, since the Vietnamese government adopts the concept of a good AC model in its rural development policies. Sustainability after the Project completion could be ensured to certain extent in terms of policy, financial, organizational, and technical aspects. If more AC members provide contributions with ACs, it is expected that AC capital is enhanced and more AC members join AC activities. Judging for these results, it could be concluded that it is recommended that the Project, which is going to be finished in March 2010, is extended for about half a year, after reconsidering the input

### 3-6. Recommendations

It is recommended to work on the remaining period, with half-a-year extension of the Project duration, in order to promote the following issues that are not achieved yet.

#### (1) Wrap-up of the Project for deploying a good AC model to other areas

- It is required to wrap up the activities and the manuals by the Project, and establish a 'tool' for implementing trainings and guidance on AC activities in other areas. For example, it is needed to finish the whole process of planning, implementing and reviewing a midterm plan. At the same time, it is important to care about enhancement of AC organization (including promotion of AC members' participation) and capital, by asking for contributions from more AC members. Furthermore, it is needed for the Project to commit SACs more closely and to monitor spillover effects of the Project.
- It is essential to promote understanding on ACs by AC members and other farmers, in further development. In this regard, it is needed for the Project to commit themselves more to the existing SACs, such as the followings;
  - The trainees from SACs are needed to be expanded.
  - Japanese experts visit and gave technical assistance to SACs.
  - It is needed to invite the leaders of producers' groups to the seminars/trainings as a focal point, since it is very difficult to hold seminars/training directly towards thousands of general AC members.

Thus, it is needed to organize approach towards general AC members, utilizing the outputs and experience by the Project.

- It is also desirable for Japanese experts to advise on criteria for a good AC model in 'New Rural

Area Project.’ Since some PACs and SACs of the Project are also selected as pilot ACs of the New Rural Area Project, knowledge acquired by the Project can be shared.

## (2) Development of the existing AC business activities

- Although it is needed to take measures to solve the problems occurred in the existing AC business activities. Especially regarding new business activities such as joint marketing and internal credit, it is needed to continue to tackle with the issues for a few years via technical cooperation. These measures are vital for deploying the Project to other areas. For example, the technical transfer on farmers’ groups has just started by Japanese experts. Therefore, the practice for at least one more cropping period is needed to monitor and review the activities.
- It is needed to consider the difference between the conditions for AC business activities in Vietnam and those in Japan, when the Japanese AC model is introduced.
- It is needed to clarify what ACs can do and what the government should do about issues concerning AC business activities, such as grasping market needs, collecting and accumulating market data and information, and establishing distribution and marketing mechanism.

It is also discussed on application of a good AC model to other regions such as Central and Southern Vietnam and followings are recommendation from evaluation team.

- It is not appropriate that the Project can establish a AC business model within one or two years, because the Project deals with agriculture, which is heavily affected by metrological condition or short-term demand and supply. In order to avoid these effects, it is needed to continue to work at least for five years. In this regard, it is needed to consider the following points;
  - First, together with the application to other regions, further development of the existing AC business activities is necessary.
  - Then, it is needed to consider how to secure the fund necessary for expansion of AC services over a wide area.
  - Furthermore, it is needed to carefully consider the measures that enable to apply AC model to the southern part of Vietnam, after analyzing the characteristics of the south.

## 3-7. Lessons Learned

- A good model may be found in existing ACs. It is not always necessary to build a good model from the beginning.
- Japanese experts should not concentrate on building a model by visiting PACs only. The Project can lose track of where to go. In the implementation process, it is important for C/Ps to take the lead so that they can utilize their experience even after the Project ends.
- In order to smoothly implement the projects on agriculture, it is needed i) to formulate a plan based on the needs of members, and ii) to input efficiently capitals and techniques required for practice of the plan. In this Project, both of them are duly input, and it brought the high appreciation by the Vietnamese government. In order to expand a good AC model in further areas, it is essential to shift the role of the Project to that of the government. At the point, the government needs to implement these measures by itself; and it is also essential to develop AC business activities.