

終了時評価調査結果要約表(英文)

I. Outline of the Project			
Country: China		Project title: The Sino-Chinese Forestry Ecological Training Center Project	
Issue/Sector: Forestry		Cooperation scheme: Technical Cooperation Project	
Division in charge: JICA China office		Total cost: about 590 million Yen	
Period of Cooperation	(R/D): Oct.18,2008~Oct.17, 2009		Partner Country's Implementing Organization : State Forestry Administration
			Supporting Organization in Japan : Forest Agency, Ministry of Environment
Related Cooperation :			
1 Background of the Project			
<p>China has a forest area of 159 million ha, making it one of the largest possessors of forestland in the world. Despite this, the forest coverage rate is 18.21% (in 2004), which means that the country is poor in forest resources. On top of this, the area of regions that have undergone desertification among China's semiarid and sub humid arid regions has reached 18.12% of China's national land area, and desertification is continuing at a rate of 246,000 ha each year. Consequently, resulting soil erosion and floods cause damage throughout the country in both human and economic terms each year. Given this situation, in 1999 the Chinese government formulated its Construction Plan for National Ecological Demo zones, which is a master plan for ecological preservation that aims for a forest coverage rate of 19% or more by 2010 and of 26% by 2050. Based on this plan, the State Forestry Bureau has been developing six major forestry projects (1.natural forest resources preservation; 2.a project to stop cultivation and plant ring forests; 3. construction of a protective forest system in the Sanbei Region (northeast, north, and northwest China) and the middle and lower stretches of the Yangtze River, 4.Beijing Tianjin sandstorm improvement project; 5.protection of wild animals and plants and construction of natural preserves; and 6. construction of bases for fast-growing, high yield timber forests in priority areas). Furthermore, China's National Development Plan (the "Ten Five Plan") for 2001 to 2005 aims to promote the construction of ecologies with focus on the six major forestry projects. These acts verify that the necessity for forest related action is recognized at the national level. However, understanding, technical levels, and project management levels pertaining to the six major projects among forestry personnel in the provinces are not enough.</p> <p>Thus, Chinese government requested Japanese government to support capacity development of personnel who are involved to six major forestry projects.</p>			
2 Project Overview			
(1) Overall Goal: The Sino-Chinese Forestry Ecological Training Center serves as a base for forestry cooperation between China and Japan. With the center as the leading factor, a training system relating to China's Six Major Forest Engineering Projects, is improved. The system aims to upgrade the county-level forestry personnel's capability in project management and technical operation.			
(2) Project Purpose: Offer training opportunity to China's forestry personnel at the county level, upgrade their capability in project management and technical operation, and enable China's ecological construction centering on the Six Major Forest Engineering Projects to proceed smoothly			
(3) Outputs:			
1) A training and human resource development system for provincial-level forestry personnel is created at the Sino-Japan Forestry Ecology Training Center.			
2) A training course (curriculum and textbooks) is developed or improved and training activities is carried out in each field.			
3) The Sino-Japan Forestry Ecology Training Center, as the center of Sino-Japanese cooperation, works as the base of operations for collecting, accumulating, and provision of information.			
(4) Inputs			
Japanese side: total: about 590 million Yen			
Long-term Expert	7 persons	Equipment	69,409,000 Yen
Short-term Expert	34 persons	Local cost	219,317,000 Yen
Trainees received	59 persons		
Chinese Side:			
Counterpart	52 persons	Local Cost	13,336,000 Yuan

II. Evaluation Team			
Members of Evaluation Team	Leader	Deputy Director, JICA China Office Senior Coordinator for Regional Forest Basin Management, National Forest Planning Division, National Forest Department, Forest Agency Forestry and Nature Conservation Division I, Forestry and Nature Conservation Groups, Global Environment Department, JICA Headquarters	MATSUMOTO Kojiro  HIMI Akira  MIYAZAKI Kaori
	Cooperation Planning		
	Evaluation planning	JICA China Office	ADACHI Kanako
	Evaluation planning assistant	JICA China Office	Li Feixue
	Evaluation Analysis	International Development Associates, Co. ltd	HIROUCHI Yasuyo
Period of Evaluation	13/ 4/ 2009- 24/ 4/ 2009	Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation	
III. Results of Evaluation			
3-1 Accomplishment of the Project			
3-1-1 Achievement of the Outputs			
<p>(1) Output 1(A training and human resource development system for provincial-level forestry personnel is created at the Sino-Japan Forestry Ecology Training Center.): 1)A five-year training plan was approved in the first Joint Coordination Committee (JCC) and annual plans have been prepared; 2)Personnel for development and implementation of training course has been appropriately assigned; 3)Necessary budget for development and implementation of training course has been allocated; 4)"Development plan for training system", which was prepared in June 2007, is considered as "appropriate and will function after the end of the Project" by the members of the Training Network Coordination Committee of the Project; 5) Fifty-three training courses have been developed so far, and it is expected that a total of 60 courses, which is more than initially planned, will have been developed by the end of the Project.</p> <p>(2) Output 2(A training course (curriculum and textbooks) is developed or improved and training activities is carried out in each field.): 1)Curricula for fifty training courses in four technical fields have been developed so far, and teaching materials have been developed for each curriculum (417 materials in total). It is expected that a total of 57 curricula, which is more than planned, will have been developed by the end of the Project; 2) Almost 100% of the training participants evaluate "degree of understanding", "degree of utilization", and "methods" of the training courses as "fair" or "satisfactory"; 3)So far, 50 training courses (47 county level courses) have been organized and it is expected that a total of 57 courses, which is more than initially planned, will have been organized by the end of the Project; 4) So far, a total of 2,031 personnel (including 1,942 county level personnel) have participated in the training. At the end of the Project, 2,311 personnel will participate in the training courses.</p> <p>(3) Output 3(The Sino-Japan Forestry Ecology Training Center, as the center of Sino-Japanese cooperation, works as the base of operations for collecting, accumulating, and provision of information): 1) About 9,100 copies of public relation materials of the Project and 1,900 copies of public relation materials of China's Six Major Forest Engineering Projects had been distributed by the end of March 2009; 2) A total of 620 persons, which was more than planned, had visited the Center by the end of March 2009; 3) The Project has organized symposiums more than once a year (8 symposiums in total) ;4) About 3,100 copies of reading materials related to forestry issues in Japan and China are available at the library room of the Center as of March 2009.</p>			
3-1-2 Achievement of the Project Purpose			
<p>1) By the end of the Project, Sino-Japanese Forestry Ecological Training Center is likely to become able to understand the needs of forestry officers at the Department level and to develop, implement, and improve training courses, because the Center's capacity has been improved through the Project.</p> <p>2) By the end of the Project, 8 regional training nodes of the Project is likely to become able to develop, implement and improve training courses based on the local needs, because the node's capacity has been</p>			

improved through the Project.

- 3) The annual number of page views of the web-site of the Project, which was open in May 2005, has been increased; and its total number was 270,000 at the end of May 2009.

### 3-1-3 Achievement of the Overall Goal (likelihood)

- 1) State Academy of Forestry Administration has developed its training handbook based on the training manual prepared by the Project and has utilized it in implementing its own training courses; and 8 regional training nodes has implemented the trial training courses, using their respective provincial forestry training manuals developed through the Project. It is likely that training courses, using the developing methods of training curriculum and materials of the Project, would be implemented at the Academy and 8 regional training nodes on condition that the Important Assumptions be satisfied
- 2) Chongqing City, a provincial-level city, has shown an interest in implementing the above mentioned trial training courses and the Academy is considering providing technical assistance in future. It is likely that training courses, using the developing methods of training curriculum and materials of the Project, would be implemented in two Provinces besides the 8 nodes with technical assistance of the Academy.

### 3-2 Summary of Evaluation

#### (1) Relevance

The Overall Goal is still relevant with the needs of China and target groups (Department-level forestry officers who engage in the Six Major Forest Engineering Projects in China). The Overall Goal and the Project Purpose are also still relevant with Chinese development policies (“The Eleventh Five-Year Plan”, “National Eco-Environmental Construction Planning” till 2050) as well as Japanese ODA policies. In addition, the approach of the Project, in which training courses are developed, implemented and evaluated through discussions with the relevant organizations based on the local needs, is still appreciated by the relevant parties. Japanese training methods are highly evaluated, so, technical advantage of Japan has been confirmed as well. On the whole, the Project is still relevant.

#### (2) Effectiveness

Judging from the achievement level of the Indicators of the PDM, the Project Purpose has been mostly achieved and is likely to be achieved by the end of the Project. In addition, the Project Purpose is being achieved as results of the achievement of the Outputs. On the whole, the Project is considered effective.

#### (3) Efficiency

Judging from the achievement level of the Indicators of the PDM, the production level of the Outputs is on schedule or more than expected. The Inputs of both Japanese and Chinese side have been done as it planned; and has contributed the production of the Outputs. The collaboration with other Japanese Projects on forestry, GTZ’s projects, and NGOs has been active. The Project has been implemented efficiently.

#### (4) Impacts

Impacts at the Overall Goal level: The Overall Goal is likely to be achieved in three years after completion of the Project on condition that the Important Assumptions, including securing of the training budget, be satisfied.

Other impacts: Positive impacts which were observed at the time of the Mid-term Evaluation, including diffusion of training results by the training graduates to their colleagues, forest farmers, etc., utilization of training contents in the Six Major Forest Engineering Projects, and contribution to the promotion of the Six Major Forest Engineering Projects, were confirmed to have been extended as the Project proceed. Negative impacts were not observed.

#### (5) Sustainability

Institutional aspects: Policies regarding ecosystem and environment conservation projects are likely to continue.

Organizational aspects: It is likely that the C/P would be assigned at the relevant posts after the end of the Project. Training activities at the Center would continue because the Center is part of the Academy, which is the national level training organization of China. The regional training nodes of the Project have enough management capacity because they are also training organizations, which have been implementing training courses since before the Project. In addition, the Academy has indicated its intention to take over the

function of the Center in the area of China-Japan forestry cooperation.

Financial aspect: The Government of China has allocated necessary budget, including part of implementing cost for training. Moreover, the Academy has a plan to implement its own 58 training courses, which is independent of the Project; therefore, training budget is likely to be secured after the end of the Project. Meanwhile, training budget related to the Project has been partly borne by the Project. It is important that their training courses regarding the Six Major Forest Engineering Projects be incorporated in their respective provincial training plan so that the training budget could be secured.

Technical aspects: It is likely that the C/P of the Academy will become able to plan, implement and evaluate the training activities by themselves. It is likely that the C/P at the regional training nodes will become able to plan, implement, and evaluate the training activities, with technical support of the Academy. The Academy, the regional training nodes, and the training graduates are likely to continue to utilize and diffuse the transferred techniques and the project deliverables after the end of the Project. The provided equipment would be utilized after the end of the Project. As for the operation and maintenance system of the provided equipment at the 8 regional training nodes of the Project could not be surveyed.

### 3-3 Factors that promoted realization of effects

#### (1) Factors concerning to Planning

Nothing special

#### (2) Factors concerning to Implementation

- Modification of project approach in line with the implementation structure of the Six Major Forest Engineering Projects
- Utilization of opinions of training participants in planning and implementing new training courses
- Promotion of diffusion of training results by the training graduates to their colleagues and forestry farmers.
- Timely response to the pressing matter, including the earthquake in Szechuan

### 3-4. Factors that impeded realization of effects

#### (1) Factors concerning to Planning

Nothing special.

#### (2) Factors concerning to the Implementation Process

Nothing special

### 3-5 Conclusion

The Project is implemented surely based on the Plan of Operation and the Project Purpose is considered to be achieved. relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and impacts of the Project are high and sustainability is fairly good. So, the Project will be ended in October 2009 as it is planned.

### 3-6 Recommendations

- (1) Implementation of the measures for achievement of the Overall Goal: The Academy should take the measures for achievement of the Overall Goal and should make every effort to disseminate the project deliverables.
- (2) Continuation of systematic diffusion of the training results by the training participants: The Academy and the regional training nodes should continue examining effective ways for diffusion of the training results by the training participants and should tell the training participants to diffuse the training results after the end of their training.
- (3) Development of the human resources in the forestry field below the county level: Forest training has been implemented at the county level through the Project, which has been effective in human resource development. It is important to develop human resource in the forestry field below the county level for effective implementation of China's Six Major Forest Engineering Project. The Academy and the regional training nodes should examine the measures for development of human resource below the county level.
- (4) Maintenance and strengthening of network of training organizations: A training network cooperation committee, which consists of the Academy and the regional training nodes, has been very useful in enhancement of partnership, information sharing, etc.. The Academy should continue and develop such network, utilizing the existing forestry training nodes cooperation network.

- (5) Further strengthening of function as a nodal point of Japan-China forestry cooperation: The Academy should maintain the Sino-Japan Forestry Ecology Training Center as a nodal point of Japan-China forestry cooperation and should deepen the Japan-China exchange through various routes
- (6) Continuation of guidance and support by the relevant departments of the State Forest Agency: The guidance and support of the relevant offices of the State Forestry Administration (Department of International Cooperation, Department of Human Resource, Department of Budget Plan and Control, and National Bureaus to Chinas Six Major Forest Engineering Projects) have been useful in implementing the training under the Project. The Academy should maintain and develop the collaborative relationships with the relevant offices of the State Forestry Administration.

### 3-7 Lessons learned

1. Improvement of the training courses based on the needs of the training participants: The Project has conducted needs surveys before training. Also, it has questionnaires filled out by the training participants after training and has improved the training contents reflecting the needs of the training participant. Needs survey before the training and questionnaire survey after the training are useful in improving training contents.
2. Identification and determination of training target, considering the local peculiarities: In regional training which cover some provinces, there were cases in which the coverage was too broad to meet the needs of all of the training participants because of the local peculiarities. Now, the Project identifies and determines the training target, considering the local peculiarities and needs, which has enhanced the effectiveness of the training. The training target should be determined based on commonalities of local peculiarities and needs.
3. Modification of training approach in accordance with the actual situation: Initially, the Project had a plan to implement cross-sectoral training courses for the China's Six Major Forest Engineering Project, but it has reorganized the training courses into sector-by-sector training, considering administrative structure of implementation of the Six Major Forestry Engineering Project. Modification of the training approach, in accordance with the actual situation of forestry administration of China, has contributed smooth implementation of training because the roles of each department at national and provincial levels has become clear.
4. Development and modification of the local training manual according to the local situation: In developing provincial training manuals, the respective regional training nodes have prepared the manuals under guidance of the Project, have implemented trial training based on the training manuals they prepared, and have modified their manuals based on the results of the training. Modification of the manuals through trial training has made it possible to develop the manuals which meet the actual situation of each Province
5. Effective information sharing between Japanese experts and their counterpart personnel: At office work, Japanese experts and their counterpart face each other across their desks in a big office room and have a weekly meeting, which has made smooth communication and information sharing possible and has brought about the efficient project management
6. Support by the relevant authorities of Japan and China: In implementation of the Project, the relevant authorities, including Ministry of Science and Technology and the State Forestry Administration, etc. on Chinese side and Japanese Embassy in China, Forest Agency, Ministry of Environment, Forest and Forest Product Research Institute, etc. on Japanese side, has valued the Project and has provided necessary advices and assistances. Such support has contributed smooth implementation of the Project.

### 3-8 Follow-up situation

Nothing special