

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Junko Noguchi Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for the Improvement of Regional Veterinary Diagnostic Services in Jalisco State	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	United Mexican States			
Project Period	December 2001-December 2006			
Executing Agency	Secretariat of Agriculture, livestock, Rural Development, Fisheries and Food (SAGARPA), Secretariat of Rural Development (SEDER), Government of the State of Jalisco			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Agriculture, Forestry and Fisheries of Japan			
Total Cost	596 million yen			
Related Projects (if any)	JICA, “Animal Health Center Project”(Project-type Cooperation) (1981-1987)			
Overall Goal	Animal health status is improved in the State of Jalisco.			
Project Objective	The integrated diagnostic system is strengthened at the laboratories of the State Committee for the Fomentation of Livestock and Animal Protection (COMITE) in the State of Jalisco.			
Output[s]	1. Basic examination techniques are improved at El Salto Lab. 2. Diagnostic techniques for infectious diseases prevailing in the State of Jalisco are improved at El Salto Lab. 3. Knowledge and techniques of animal health are improved in personals concerned with animal health, including one of the other COMITE laboratories in the State of Jalisco.			
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Ecuadorian Side)	
Experts	7 for long term, 16 for short term		Staff allocated	22 counterpart personnel
Equipments	120 million yen		Equipments	N. A.
Local Cost	26 million yen		Local Cost	48 million pesos
Trainees Received	16 trainees		Land etc provided	Facilities and equipments
Others	N. A.		Others	N. A.

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>This Project aimed to improve animal health, by upgrading animal disease diagnosis skills for personnel at El Salto Laboratory through lectures and OJT, and upgrading the knowledge and skills of personnel at two regional (small) laboratories through lectures. El Salto Laboratory and the two regional laboratories were under supervision of the State Committee for the Fomentation of Livestock and Animal Protection (COMITE) of Jalisco. Jalisco is a leading livestock production state in the country, while it had challenges in controlling animal health. In this sense, the Project was in accordance with Jalisco's needs.</p> <p>As a result of the Project, staff of El Salto Laboratory acquired new examination techniques and learned to diagnose more animal diseases. Before the Project was completed, 3 diseases were rated “free of disease”, among 9 diseases in a national campaign. However, since the Project terminated, there has not been much change in the phase of the campaign diseases. In addition, it was pointed out in this evaluation survey that some farmers were hesitant to let animals be diagnosed because they feared the commodity value is reduced if some infection is detected.</p> <p>Regarding COMITE's communication with other related organizations, the Secretariat of Agriculture, livestock, Rural Development, Fisheries and Food (SAGARPA) and the Secretariat of Rural Development (SEDER) of Jalisco were to supervise and direct COMITE, and the National Center of Diagnostic Services for Animal Health (CENASA) were to give technical support to each laboratory. However, this collaboration was not functioning well in the early stage of the Project. Communication improved as the Project went on, but after the Project ended, it has restored to its former state.</p> <p>(The two regional laboratories were closed after the Project ended and their functions were transferred to El Salto Laboratory. The samples are now sent to El Salto Laboratory. When they were functioning, these laboratories were certified by SAGARPA and performing as supplementary laboratories to El Salto Laboratory. Therefore, there is no change and problem in the diagnostic services of animal health in Jalisco as a whole.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.</p> <p><Recommendations for COMITE></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Establish a regular communication channel to share animal diseases related issues in Jalisco and discuss necessary actions to take among El Salto Laboratory, SAGARPA (both at national and state level), SEDER and CENASA. 2. For animal disease control, first of all, farmers use the diagnostic services of animal health. Therefore, again they should be informed of the importance of the animal disease diagnosis. <p><Constraints of the this evaluation study></p> <p>The data and information about the two regional laboratories was not available including the data during the Project period.</p>

Therefore, the achievement of the Project Purpose was verified only with the information obtained from El Salto Laboratory.

Note: "Free of a disease" means that a disease doesn't occur again for 12 months after it is eradicated.

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance to the Development Plan of Mexico

The "Sector Program for Agricultural, Livestock and Fishery Development: 2001-2006" reported that the animal health is one of the important elements for the development of the livestock industry. Also in the national program for rural development "Alianza Contigo," the improvement of the animal health and livestock promotion were the target areas for the subsidy.

(2) Relevance to the Development Needs of Mexico

According to Jalisco's "State Plan for Development (2001-2007)", it led the country in the production of pork, chicken and milk, and took second place in meat production in 2000. The agriculture and livestock industry has occupied an important position in state development. However, among the 9 animal diseases which the country tried to eradicate in a national campaign, none was "free" at the time of the Project commencement. There was a great need for the animal health improvement.

(3) Relevance to Japan's ODA Policy

In the policy consultations for economic cooperation held in November 2001 and 2004, "industrial development and regional promotion" was discussed as one of the priority assistance areas, and the Project was in line with this area

This project has been highly relevant to the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore, its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective

As outputs achieved by the end of the Project, the staff of El Salto Laboratory acquired 21 new basic examination techniques (6 virological, 8 bacteriological, and 7 pathological examination techniques), and was able to diagnose 50 kinds of infectious diseases including those prevailing in the state. Also, a total of 33 training courses and seminars were held for the personnel concerned with animal health in the state. These outputs were all more than the targeted. As a result, among 9 national campaign diseases, 7 diseases which COMITE was in charge of were all able to be diagnosed at El Salto Laboratory. The other two COMITE laboratories were closed after the Project, so the function of disease diagnosis was transferred. When they were functioning, these laboratories were certified by SAGARPA and performing as supplementary laboratories to El Salto Laboratory (Terminal Evaluation Study), and therefore, it can be judged that the Project Purpose was achieved.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

The Overall Goal of the Project was to improve the phase of campaign diseases. Before the Project was completed, 3 diseases (CSF, ND and avian salmonellosis) got rated free. After the Project, there hasn't been a big change in the phase of the national campaign diseases. However, animal diseases can be suddenly brought by unregistered farming and smuggled animals from other areas, even though once they become free, and therefore "no deleterious change in the disease phase" doesn't mean "no effects of the Project." Besides, the farmers have come to realize the importance of receiving the animal diagnosis. On the other hand, SAGARPA delegation of Jalisco tells that some farmers are hesitant to let animals be diagnosed because they fear the commodity value is reduced in case some infection is detected.

This project has largely achieved its objectives; therefore its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As mentioned above, the outputs were produced as planned.

(2) Elements of Inputs

It was evaluated that "the inputs were almost as planned in terms of quantity and quality considering the outputs generated, except a small delay of Japanese experts." On the other hand, according to the Project resources at the time of completion, There were some communication difficulties among some personnel and organizations in the early stage of the Project, and this caused the delay of some activities.

(3) Project Cost, Period of Cooperation

The Project planned the input of 596 million yen. Information regarding the planned cost was not available.

The actual duration of the Project was 60 months as planned. The outputs were produced as planned within the period, except the construction of the facilities for animal experiment and for training. In particular, the training facility was constructed just before the Project, much later than planned, and therefore, it was not used during the Project. The training was conducted in the hotels or COMITE rooms. As not many participants were accepted by these rooms at a time, the training had to be repeated more often than planned, and in the result the burden on the Japanese experts as lecturers reportedly increased.

Some input elements (Mexican side) were not appropriate for producing outputs; therefore, efficiency of the project is fair.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

The “National Development Plan 2007-2012” declared that agriculture and livestock provide food, ingredients of processed food, and export items; and therefore is an important sector for the national development. Also in SAGARPA’s “Sectorial Development Plan,” one of the strategies is to improve animal health for food security and product competitiveness.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

During the Project period, a supervisor and a technician were assigned in each area, virology, serology, brucellosis, tuberculosis, and pathology. Regarding the communication including direction and technical training among COMITE, SAGARPA, its delegation of Jalisco, SEDER and CENASA, many of them self-evaluated as “appropriate,” while a some suggested that CENASA needs to be more closely manage COMITE in order to better disease diagnosis. Cognition depends on each. The Terminal Evaluation Study recommended establishing the Project Sustainability Committee for activities continuity, but the committee hasn’t been held.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

After the Project, 4 personnel have left COMITE among 22 counterpart personnel, but lectures and OJT opportunities are given to newly hired staff upon necessity. The major equipments provided by the Project are regularly inspected and are functioning except some which were replaced by COMITE. El Salto Laboratory obtained accreditation of EMA (Mexican Accreditation Entity) on examination during the Project period. Also the animal experiment facility has received NOM (Mexican Official Norm) certification. Thus, there are no technical concerns.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

The government budget for COMITE decreased by 10% in 2009 and by 20% in 2010 compared with the last year of the Project. Contributions from the farmers have remained almost the same. However, El Salto Laboratory reports that the budget is sufficient and two regional laboratories are closed. Therefore, financially, there are no concerns.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

El Salto Laboratory has provided the diagnosis services for 7 diseases among 9 national campaign diseases’ however some organizations point out that “there has not been sufficient diagnosis quality control at El Salto because of personnel changes at COMITE.” As explained above at “Effectiveness / Impact,” there hasn’t been much change in the phase of the campaign diseases.

Some problems have been observed in the structural aspects of the executing agency; therefore, sustainability of the project effects is fair.