

終了時評価調査結果要約表（英文）

1. Outline of the Project	
Country : United Mexican States	Project title : Project to Support the Women' s Empowerment in the Mayan Region in the State of Quintana Roo
Issue/Sector : Human Resource Development	Cooperation Scheme : Technical Cooperation Project
Division in Charge : JICA Mexico Office	Total cost (including estimated cost) Total : 291,000,000yen
Period of Cooperation : Mar. 2007 - Mar. 2010	Partner Country' s Implementing Organization : Instituto Quintanarroense de la Mujer (IQM)
	Supporting Organization in Japan : IC Net Limited
	Related Cooperation : N/A
1-1 Background of the Project <p>In the Mayan Region in inner Quintana Roo State in the United States of Mexico (thereafter referred to "Mexico"), geographical characteristics hinder increase of agriculture income, and the residents depend on handicrafts products by women for their a few income source as well as government subsidy and work away from home. Institute for the Women of the State of Quintana Roo (IQM) is supposed to provide assistance to improve and develop handicrafts products in collaboration with relevant organizations, but its capacity is not sufficient. With this backdrop, the State of Quintana Roo requested a technical cooperation project to Japan, in which organizational capacity of IQM is strengthened and system to continuously provide assistance in development of handicrafts products is established. JICA started the Technical Cooperation Project (thereafter referred to "the Project") in March 2007 for the period of three years with IQM as counterpart organization. Six months before the termination of the Project in March 2010, Terminal Evaluation Team was dispatched.</p>	
1-4 Project Overview <p>(1)Overall Goal: Income of the members of the women's groups who have received the support through the Program of the Production Development of the Female Artisans (thereafter referred to as "the Program") is increased.</p> <p>(2) Project Purpose: The Program that is aimed at the women's groups and implemented by the Department of Training and Economic Development of IQM is established.</p> <p>(3) Output :</p> <p>Output 1: Enhancement of investigative function: Necessary information is collected and organized to understand the actual situation of the communities and to conduct activities.</p> <p>Output 2: Enhancement of administrative operational function: Capacity of administrative operation of the Department of Training and Economic Development of IQM is improved by elaborating The Operation Manual for applying the Program</p>	

Output 3: Enhancement of coordinating and linking function: Coordination and collaboration between the Department of Training and Economic Development of IQM and other relevant institutions are achieved.

Output 4: Elaboration of the Program: the Training Guideline for development of the handicrafts are elaborated through the results of the demonstration project for the targeted women's groups by the Department of Training and Economic Development of IQM.

Output 5: Enhancement of information management function: Information about the operation to support the women is properly managed and utilized.

1-5 Inputs

(As of Oct. 1 2009)

<Japanese side>

Short-term expert 10 in total

Acceptance of trainees (in the United States) 4

Equipment supplied approximately 8,431,000 yen

Local Cost approximately 23,111,000 yen (Equipment supplied not included)

<Mexican side>

Counterparts (CP) 29 (including those who already left their position)

Local cost Personnel cost for CP, provision of space for Project office, cost for materials and consumables, Total expenditure: 340,000 pesos (as of Oct. 2009, 1US\$=13.52 pesos)

2. Evaluation Team

Members of Evaluation Team	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Mr. Norio YONEZAKI (Leader) Senior Representative, JICA Mexico Office 2. Mr. Shirohi ISOGAI (Evaluation Planning) Representative, JICA Mexico Office 3. Ms. Satoko NADAMOTO, Associate Expert, Gender Equality Division, Public Policy Department, JICA 4. Ms. Erika Tanaka (Evaluation and Analysis) Researcher, Social Development Department, Global Link Management
Period of Evaluation	<div>7 October 2009 – 24 October 2009</div> <div>Type of Evaluation : Terminal Evaluation</div>

3.Results of Evaluation

3-1 Summary of Evaluation Results

(1) Relevance

Relevance is generally high.

In Mayan Region, the level of poverty is still serious and assistance is highly required. In the development plan of Quintana Roo State (2005-2011), seven strategies are listed in regard to gender equality, one of which is involvement of women in productive activities and eradication of poverty and marginalization.

In the planning stage of the Project, human security that the Project supports was one of priority areas in assistance policy of JICA in Mexico, which means the Project is consistent with Japanese assistance policy. JICA is planning to terminate assistance in human security area at the end of Japanese fiscal year 2009.

Although the initial project design was problematic, the project approach of current PDM is appropriate.

In preliminary study, the Project aims at assistance to improve and develop handicrafts products from the viewpoint of support for income generation for poor women. However, during the Project, in consideration of the functions and characteristics of IQM, which is a coordinating agency and does not have operational budget for itself, it is concluded that strengthening support program for women at IQM is more appropriate. Thus, in the Mid-term evaluation, PDM is revised, including Project Purpose. Support for women's groups was defined as demonstration project. The revision is considered to be appropriate in terms of functions and roles of IQM and more extensive and effective benefit of the Project.

(2) Effectiveness

Effectiveness is generally high.

Objectively Verifiable Indicators of Project Purpose are being achieved.

Indicators of Project Purpose describe that Plan of the Program, Training Guidelines, and Operational Manuals are elaborated. These three materials are under development and planned to be completed by the end of the Project period. More close cooperation with relevant organizations is necessary in order that various training courses and projects are implemented based on the Program established by the Project.

Each Output and Project Purpose are logically interrelated and Outputs contributed to the achievement of Project Purpose. There is not much influence of natural disaster, which is important assumption to achieve Project Purpose.

(3) Efficiency

Efficiency is high to some extent.

Mexican side did not allocate C/P as planned in fiscal years of 2006 and 2007 due to replacement of personnel and budget constraints. However, after the revision of PDM C/P allocation was improved, with one full-time C/P assigned to the Project. All the experts on Japanese side have good command of Spanish and relevant expertise. Equipment provided by Japan is appropriately utilized except some instruments that are not used any more due to normal wear and tear. Training of C/P in third country, i.e., the United States, was conducted before the revision of PDM, thus focused on production and sales of handicrafts products. However, acquired knowledge and skills of marketing research and development of production and sales strategies are utilized in the framework of revised PDM.

Inputs were implemented effectively in purchasing materials and equipment and provision of training though collaboration with relevant organizations such as Comisión Nacional para el Desarrollo de los Pueblos Indígenas and Instituto de Capacitación para el Trabajo de Quintana Roo.

One of factors to influence efficiency is the selection of targeted women's groups. As communities where selected women's groups belong are far away from Chetumal, where IQM headquarter office is located, transportation took a lot of time. Had women's groups been selected based on revised PDM from the viewpoint of demonstration project, it would have been possible to select women's groups in communities

where access from the State capital is more convenient.

(4) Impact

Achievement of Overall Goal is expected in near future.

Variety, sales, and profit of products newly developed by the Project are increasing. As the Program is still under development, the increase can be attributed to direct support for women's groups as demonstration project (Output 4).

Some unexpected positive impacts are reported. During interview, some members of women's groups commented that they are now more confident than before, and their husbands are pleased with increased income and respect women more than before, for example. Some negative impacts are also observed. There occurred jealousy and criticism among groups that were not selected as target by the Project. It is also reported that some member left their groups because they did not get income soon after they started production activities. To respond to the problems, the Project and IQM provide explanation for these women's groups.

(5) Sustainability

Sustainability can be expected by providing explanation of and building consensus on the Program among relevant agencies in the State.

Sustainability in the aspect of policy can be expected. The current development plan of the State of Quintana Roo covers the period up to the year 2011 and the policy toward gender equality by Quintana Roo is expected to continue for some more years.

Financial sustainability is expected to some extent. Although the budgets in state agencies are decreasing, IQM is planning to incorporate programs planned in the state development plan up to 2011 in its annual plan at IQM and to secure budget for them.

Technical sustainability is expected to some extent. Some of C/P who received training in Rapid Rural Appraisal and cost calculation later conducted training as facilitator and it is expected that C/P will be able to implement their duties on their own, utilizing knowledge and skills acquired during the Project. However, some of the project activities, including information management, are implemented mainly by Japanese experts, and it is not certain at this moment if IQM will be able to operate and manage activities, utilizing the Program on their own in the future.

Members of women's groups will be able to sustain productions, as some members already have capacity to give instructions on production of handicrafts to other members and other women's groups. Activities on sales and development of sales route have been implemented mainly by Japanese experts as most women's groups did not have such experiences before. In parallel, the Project conducts systematic training on sales and sales promotion. In addition to sales promotion activities, it is necessary to organize women's groups as cooperative to promote transaction with registered shops and to receive government assistance.

3-2 Factors that promoted realization of effects

(1) Planning

Revision of PDM in the Mid-term Evaluation made the Project design consistent with functions and roles of IQM and facilitated appropriate activities.

(2) Implementation

In revision of PDM, both Japanese experts and Mexican C/P had common understanding. After the revision of PDM, plan of operation was made clear, and this helped smooth implementation of activities based on PDM.

3-3 Factors that impeded realization of effects

(1) Planning

In PDM at the start of the Project, the role of Department of Production of IQM and branches of IQM was not clearly defined, and activities that are not consistent with functions and roles of IQM were included.

(2) Implementation

PDM was revised at the Mid-term Evaluation, when one and half years have already passed after the commencement of the Project, therefore, establishment of Project implementation organization was delayed. Temporary absence of Director General of IQM and suspension of Project activities due to influenza delayed project implementation. However, thanks to appointment of new Director General and flexible implementation of activities, there is not major delay in activities at the time of Terminal Evaluation.

3-5 Conclusion

It is confirmed that the Project Purpose is likely to be achieved by the end of Project period, i.e., March 31, 2010. It is also confirmed that variety, quality, and sales of handicrafts of Mayan women's group, beneficiaries of the Project, are clearly increased as well as their knowledge and capacity have been improved. Therefore, it is concluded that the Project be terminated at the end of March 2010 as is planned. To achieve Overall Goal, it is necessary to promote and coordinate various training programs and projects implemented by relevant agencies based on the Program developed by the Project under the strong leadership of IQM.

3-6 Recommendations

1) Establishment of the Program of the Production Development of the Female Artisans

- a) The Project should finalize the draft for the Program, Training Guidelines, and Operation Manual, based on the results of demonstration project and through individual discussions with relevant agencies (by the end of December 2009).
- b) In individual discussions above mentioned, the Project should have common understanding on the significance and purpose of establishment of the Program with relevant agencies and should confirm the possibility of collaboration in official program in improving and developing handicrafts products at each agency.
- c) The Project, with the initiative of C/P organization, should review and revise the draft above mentioned. The Project should organize Technical Committee and confirm the contents with participation of relevant agencies.

- d) The Project should receive approval of the Program, Guideline, and Manual by IQM by the end of February 2009. The Project should organize a seminar to share the Program, Guideline, Manual, and the results of demonstration project among those concerned and relevant agencies (by the end of February 2009).
 - e) The project should make final confirmation on benefits of the Project, establishment of the Program, and policy to utilize the Program at JCC with participation of relevant agencies (by the end of February or early March 2009).
- 2) Sustainability of targeted women's groups
- a) The Project should make confirmation to IQM on organization of cooperative with representative of each targeted women's group, and make application to and receive approval of Secretary of Finance of Quintana Roo State (by the end of October 2009).
 - b) The Project should continuously conduct visit to shops to establish collaboration between shops and women's groups and training on sales promotion for women's groups. Trainings should be held in the way that initiatives of women's groups are fully secured (until the end of the Project).
 - c) The Project should discuss utilization of the Program through study of official support program on activities required by women's groups such as improvement and development handicrafts and sales promotion with IQM and relevant organization (Until the end of the Project).

3-7 Lessons Learned

Importance of ex-ante evaluation, project framework design at the start of project, and confirmation of project operation system: PDM was revised twice after the Mid-term Evaluation. The revision is considered appropriate, however, if functions, roles, systems of IQM, the requesting agency of the Project had been fully examined together with their limitations in advance, it would not have been necessary to make revision of PDM in such a large scale.