

## Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

|                        |   |                              |
|------------------------|---|------------------------------|
| Evaluator, Affiliation | Nobuko Fujita<br>Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development   | Duration of Evaluation Study |
| Project Name           | The Project for Promotion of Sustainable Marine Fisheries Resource Utilisation in the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago | January 2010 – December 2010 |

### I Project Outline

|                             |  |  |                                   |   |
|-----------------------------|--|--|-----------------------------------|---|
| Country Name                | The Republic of Trinidad and Tobago  |  |                                   |   |
| Project Period              | September 2001-September 2006  |  |                                   |   |
| Executing Agency            | Fisheries Division, Ministry of Agriculture, Land and Marine Resources(MALMR)<br>Caribbean Fisheries Training and Development Institute(CFTDI)<br>The Department of Marine Resources and Fisheries(DMRF), The Tobago House of Assembly(THA)  |  |                                   |   |
| Cooperation Agency in Japan | N.A.   |  |                                   |   |
| Total Cost                  | 716 million yen  |  |                                   |   |
| Related Projects (if any)   | 1. JICA, Project-type Technical Cooperation “The Regional Fisheries Training Project in Trinidad and Tobago”(Phase 1) (April 1996-March 2001)<br>2. JICA, Development Study “Master Plan Survey on Development and Management of Fisheries Industry in Caribbean Countries”(March 2008-March 2011)   |  |                                   |   |
| Overall Goal                | Sustainable utilisation of fisheries resources in the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago is facilitated.  |  |                                   |   |
| Project Objective           | Fisheries extension and training activities for sustainable utilisation of fisheries resources are to be practiced by the mutual cooperation among the Fisheries Division, the CFTDI and the DMRF, THA.  |  |                                   |   |
| Output[s]                   | (1) Resources management capabilities of Fisheries Division and DMRF, THA are enhanced.<br>(2) Technical capabilities of CFTDI in capture fishery technology and fishing gear development, seafood technology, marketing, and marine engineering are enhanced.<br>(3) Fisheries extension capabilities within the Fisheries Division and DMRF, THA are enhanced. |  |                                   |   |
|                             | Inputs (Japanese Side)   |  | Inputs (Trinidad and Tobago Side) |   |
| Experts                     | 6 for long term, 4 for short term  |  | Staff allocated                   | 23 counterpart personnel  |
| Equipments                  | 94.8 million yen   |  | Equipments                        | 2.96 million TTD (Trinidad Tobago \$)   |
| Local Cost                  | 181 million yen  |  | Local Cost                        | 3.849 million TTD (disbursement by CFTDI up to September 2004, including above costs for equipment. Other costs are unknown.) |
| Trainees Received           | 13 trainees  |  | Land etc provided                 | Facilities and training sites   |
| Others                      | N.A.   |  | Others                            | N.A.  |

### II Result of the Evaluation

|   |
|---|
| Summary of the evaluation   |
| <p>This project was a continuation of “The Regional Fisheries Training Project in Trinidad and Tobago” (Phase 1) to improve the training capacity of the Caribbean Fisheries Training Development Institute (CFTDI) that was established by Trinidad and Tobago to develop human resources in the fisheries sector in Caribbean countries. The Project was implemented to enhance fisheries extension and training activities for sustainable utilisation of the fisheries resources of the Fisheries Division, Ministry of Agriculture, Land and Marine Resources (MALMR) and CFTDI. After the first Joint Coordination Committee (June 2002), the Department of Marine Resources and Fisheries, The Tobago House of Assembly (DMRF, THA) was included as a beneficiary.</p> <p>By the end of the project period the Project’s outputs (as stated above), had been achieved except for some extension capabilities. The linkage between the project purpose and the overall goal, however, was weakened because the Fisheries Division did not approve extension activities in Trinidad. In addition, currently Tobago officers and fisher folks are not included in CFTDI training activities for fisheries officers and fisher folks in Trinidad. As for extension activities, although the Fisheries Division and DMRF, THA are in charge of extension services on Trinidad and Tobago island respectively, utilisation of methods and techniques introduced by the Project for sustainable utilisation of fisheries resources including; fishing methods, fishing gears, processing techniques for marine products, and capture fishery technology is limited. On the other hand, in Tobago island, fisher folks have been using one of the newly introduced fishing methods. In addition, fishermen’s association organized during the project period is still active and several new organizations have been established after the Project in Tobago island.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.</p> <p>Parallel to this project, the Regional Technical Cooperation Promotion Programme “RTCPP,” started in Phase I by JICA was continued with long-term experts of this project. RTCPP was a human resource development project targeting 13 Caribbean countries for sustainable utilisation of marine resources based at CFTDI. In this evaluation, RTCPP was treated as an impact of this project. Similar activities at CFTDI are no longer conducted, however some Caribbean countries send their trainees to CFTDI on their own</p> |

budget.

Note: Due to high-level decisions, financial information for the Fisheries Division and the DMRF, THA were not provided.

## 1 Relevance

### (1) Relevance to the Development Plan of Trinidad and Tobago

The “Sector Policy of Food Production and Marine Resources of Trinidad and Tobago,” stresses the importance of sustainable management of natural resources.

### (2) Relevance to the Development Needs of Trinidad and Tobago

The necessity to ensure the sustainability of natural resources by coordinating both public and private sector stakeholders was pointed out in regards to the fisheries sector of Trinidad and Tobago. A number of factors including, the waning seine fisheries, international law disputes with Barbados over catch quota of flying fish, and the downsizing of catch, raised concern in regards to the sustainable utilisation of resources and contributed to the active participation on the part of fisher folks. Such active participation further indicates that the local need for the Project was high.

### (3) Relevance to Japan’s ODA Policy

ODA Data book states that development of sustainable marine resources in Trinidad and Tobago is important in terms of sustainable development. Also, “the New Framework of Cooperation of Japan and CARICOM in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century” formulated in 2000, suggests greater focus on tourism, fisheries and agriculture industries and calls for closer cooperation in the infrastructure development, equipment provision, human resource development and technical assistance for further development of fishing industry.

This project is highly relevant to the country’s development plan, development needs, as well as Japan’s ODA policy; therefore, its relevance is high.

## 2 Effectiveness / Impact

### (1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective

As for Output 1 (Resources management capabilities of Fisheries Division and DMRF, THA) , all the goals in terms of biological data collection, developing textbooks, etc., were achieved by the end of the Project. Regarding Output 2 (technical capabilities of CFTDI in capture fishery technology and fishing gear development, seafood technology, marketing, and marine engineering), counterparts were able to conduct training by themselves and pre-set goals were achieved. As for Output 3 (fisheries extension capabilities within the Fisheries Division and DMRF, THA), because of the policies of the Fisheries Division, the output was limited to Tobago island

As for the project purpose, except for the target related to extension works in Trinidad, the pre-set goals were achieved by the end of the Project. “Recommendation for the proper fisheries management” was drawn up, and Fisheries Extension Work Group was established in Tobago in 2003. Training sessions organized by counterparts were conducted by the end of the Project.

### (2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

Limited achievement was obtained in regards to the stated overall goal to facilitate the sustainable utilisation of fisheries resources in the Republic of Trinidad and Tobago. Among fishing methods introduced during the Project, FADs (fish aggregating devices) are still used in Tobago, however, other methods including set net fishing, diamondback squid drift with vertical/horizontal longline fishing, and appropriate mesh size net fishing are not used today. The reason why FADs are not used in Trinidad is that FADs, which are suitable for deep water with floating fish passing through, are not suitable to Trinidad since its coast is shallow. As for set net fishing, the testing of the fishing technology was not fully conducted during the project period and as for appropriate mesh size net fishing, the activities were suspended during the Project both due to the policies of the Fisheries Division. As for diamondback squid drift, fishing grounds for squid were too far for this method to be used conveniently.

Since the end of the Project, no new fishing methods have been introduced. (The stated target for introducing new methods was that more than three kind of new fishing methods would be introduced by 2011.) In regards to marine products processing techniques, sanitary treatment of catch, and how to make Satsuma-age fish cake, CFTDI did organize training courses; however, neither local processing companies nor fisher folk are currently producing Satsuma-age. (The stated target was that more than three kind of processed products would be commercially produced by 2011). Other processed products such as bottled flying fish roe, Hanpen fish cake, and fish sauce were also not produced after the Project. When fisher folks were asked if they currently use sustainable fishing methods, respondents gave the following wide-variety of answers: The Fisheries Division answered 0%, CFTDI answered 25%, and DMRF, THA answered 30%. Considering the above situation, at least Tobago fisher folks are highly likely to achieve the stated goal of 20% by 2011.

By RTCPP, output of this project has spread to Caribbean countries, and FADs are utilized in Dominica and Saint Lucia. In addition, although diamondback squid drift fishing has not been used in Trinidad and Tobago since the end of the Project, it is being used in Saint Christopher and Nevis. There is no negative impact on natural environment.

This project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair.

## 3 Efficiency

#### (1) Outputs

As mentioned above, in regards to Output 3 (Fisheries extension capabilities within the Fisheries Division and DMRF, THA are enhanced), a Fisheries Work Group was established, and a fishermen's association was organized but it was limited to Tobago island. Other outputs were achieved as planned.

#### (2) Elements of Inputs

Input from the Japanese side, in terms of experts and equipment, was appropriate. Some of the counterparts were assigned part-time for this project and therefore did not have enough time to participate in the Project, according to the terminal evaluation among others.

#### (3) Project Cost, Period of Cooperation

The actual duration of the Project was 60 months as planned. The actual cost was 716 million yen while planned input was 740 million yen.

The inputs are appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective; therefore project efficiency is rated high.

### 4 Sustainability

#### (1) Related Policy towards the Project

In Trinidad and Tobago, overexploitation of marine products is still a serious issue and sustainable marine resource management remains an important issue. A draft of the New Fisheries Act, which was submitted during the Project to realize sustainable management, was not adopted, and as mentioned earlier, the "Recommendations for Appropriate Fisheries Management Policies" were not implemented. The Tobago Five-year Development Plan of Fisheries Villages drafted in 2005 during the Project was also not realized.

#### (2) Institutional/Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

At the time of the ex-post evaluation, it was reported that coordination among the Fisheries Division, DMRF, THA, and CFTDI remains at an informal level. As for trainings, CFTDI offers training courses for fisheries officers in Trinidad (twice a year) and fishermen (6 times a year). Training is provided in (among others) the field of fishing methods, processing, proper handling of catches, marine engineering and navigation techniques. However, the target training groups do not include either Tobago fisheries officers or fisher folks and no training has been conducted in Tobago since the end of the Project.

As for extension works, although Tobago Fisheries Work Group stopped their activities in 2009, the Fishermen's Association that was established with the support of the Project, still continues activities such as fish gear production. Three new fishermen's associations, modeled after the Tobago fishermen's association, were also established.

#### (3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

Nine out of ten counterparts of the Project at CFTDI, and ten out of eleven at the Fisheries Division keep working. Although only one out of four remains at Tobago Fisheries Division, new staffs are trained using some of the textbooks developed during the Project.

#### (4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

In regards to financial aspects, no problems are evident. Budgeting problems did not exist during the Project and CFTDI's budget increased every year from 2005 to 2009 for a total increase of 186%. (Detailed financial information was not provided by the Fisheries Division and DMRF of THA).

#### (5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

Part of the project effectiveness remains. On Tobago, some of the fishing methods introduced or developed by the Project such as FADs are still in use, and proper handling of the catch and marine engineering are utilized in CFTDI training.

Some equipment is reported to be unused. (For example, a four stroke engine at DMRF, THA, and a profile projector at the Fisheries Division). Other equipments are fairly well utilized and in good condition.

Sustainability of the project effects is considered fair because some problems have been observed in related policy and institutional aspects of some of the executing agencies.