

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Junko Noguchi Foundation for Advanced Studies on International Development	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Improvement of Vocational Training in Ecuador	January 2010 – December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	Republic of Ecuador			
Project Period	July 2002-June 2007			
Executing Agency	Servicio Ecuatoriano de Capacitación Profesional [Ecuadorian Professional Training Service] (SECAP)			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Health, Labor and Welfare Employment and Human Resource Development Organization of Japan			
Total Cost	815 million yen			
Related Projects (if any)	JICA, “The Project for Improvement of Vocational Training in Ecuador (Grant Aid Project)”			
Overall Goal	The Project aims to establish vocational training system which provides skilled workers with required level of professional ability by the industrial sector and to contribute to improvement of the employment opportunity in Ecuador.			
Project Objective	The project aims to improve the operation and administration system in SECAP and its main vocational training centers in order to produce a large number of workers having technical skills (i.e. electricity, electronics, industrial mechanics, welding and sheet metal processing) that meet the needs of the industrial sector using CERFIN as a pivotal center.			
Output[s]	<p>Stage 1</p> <p>(1) The training needs in industry (in major cities) will be assessed by each target field through the reinforcement of the relationship with the industrial sector and the current status of major regional vocational training centers will be examined.</p> <p>(2) Based on the assessment in (1) above, skill up-grading courses will be modified, developed, and implemented.</p> <p>(3) Based on the assessment in (1) above, an implementation plan for the specialized training courses for technique and technology within CERFIN will be drawn up.</p> <p>(4) Based on the analysis in (1) above, an implementation plan for instructors retraining course will be drawn up.</p> <p>Stage 2</p> <p>(5) A system will be set up in order to perform regular monitoring of the above-mentioned training needs and to reflect the results in the training program.</p> <p>(6) A training system for employed workers will be set up in CERFIN, and monitoring of these workers' performance in industry will be implemented.</p> <p>(7) Specialized training courses for technique and technology will be implemented at CERFIN and a job placement support system will be set up for trainees.</p> <p>(8) Retraining of instructors working at the major regional vocational training centers will be implemented at CERFIN.</p> <p>(9) Training course curriculums and teaching materials developed at CERFIN will be spread to other regional vocational training centers.</p>			
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Ecuadorian Side)	
Experts	7 for long term, 21 for short term and 12 from the third country		Staff allocated	26 counterpart personnel
Equipments	298 million yen		Equipments	N. A.
Local Cost	31 million yen		Local Cost	N. A.
Trainees Received	18 trainees		Land etc provided	Office space for the Japanese experts, space for installation of provided machinery and equipment
Others	19 million yen (equipment brought with the experts' dispatch)		Others	Assistant to the Japanese experts, driver, and secretary

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation

As a result of this Project, a system for operating and managing training courses has been established at the 4 target training centers* (including the Industrial Training Center of the North Region (CERFIN)), including training needs assessment, curriculum development, instructors retraining, etc. The number of implemented courses has increased at these centers. After participating in the courses, the trainees have performed well and built good reputations. Thus, the Project achieved its objectives and its effects continue. Also, it should be noted that this Project has generated synergetic effects with the Grant Aid Project which was implemented at the same timing.

The training courses have been actually increasing, but the fact is that demand for training has also increased. In order to establish new courses, further needs assessment is necessary, and also more instructors will be necessary.

In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.

<Recommendations for the Ecuadorian Professional Training Service (SECAP)>

1. To satisfy demand of the increasing applicants, it is recommended to increase the number of courses and instructors.
2. For the new courses to be established, instructors need to be retrained to provide practical training courses.
3. The experience of CERFIN and also of the other 3 training centers* should be shared with the other SECAP training centers, by facilitating communication among instructors of different centers.

Note: The major activities of the Project were firstly implemented at CERFIN, such as training needs assessment, curriculum development, and retraining of the instructors. Then, these outputs were extended to the other 3 training centers: the Industrial Training Center of Cuenca (CEFIC), the Industrial Training Center of Ambato (CEFIA), and the Industrial Training Center of the Coastal Region (CERFIL).

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance to the Development Plan of Ecuador

In the "National Development Plan (2002-2003)" vocational training and human resource development were listed as priority issues, and the successive plan for 2005-2007 likewise aimed to improve the productivity of the domestic industries and to develop vocational capacities. In the "National Development Plan (2007-2010)," these issues continue to be priorities, identifying the modernization of SECAP and vocational training of the vulnerable, including women, as the national strategies.

(2) Relevance to the Development Needs of Ecuador

In Ecuador, the petroleum and industry sectors account for 12% of GDP. These are easily affected by changes in international oil price, so it was urgent to develop alternative industries and human resources. However, SECAP, which was the only vocational training center in the industrial sector, needed to upgrade instructors, equipment, and machinery to satisfy the demand from industry.

(3) Relevance to Japan's ODA Policy

In the policy consultations held in 1999 and 2005, "poverty reduction," "environmental conservation" and "disaster prevention" were discussed as priority areas for assistance. Among these areas, "poverty reduction" includes the development of key industries (industrial human resource development, vocational training for the vulnerable).

This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective

As a pivotal center, CERFIN conducted training needs assessment almost every year and revised the training curriculum and teaching materials, and these results were shared with other training centers. Also, 36 instructors in the area of "Electricity and Electronics" and "Metal and Mechanics" were retrained as planned. Based on these outputs, it can be judged that the operation and administration system has been established for providing training courses. During the Project period, for up-grading training in "Metal and Mechanics" and "Electricity and Electronics," respectively 116 and 184 courses were implemented, in which 1,379 and 2,238 workers participated. Also, for specialized training for "tecnico/tecnologo" (high school graduates), respectively 28 and 32 courses were implemented, and 467 and 481 trainees participated. Although the training opportunities have increased as such, there were more applicants which couldn't be accepted. At CERFIN, a job placement support system was established, but the majority got jobs at the enterprises where they received OJT training. Only 6 trainees from 60 of the "tecnico" courses found employment through this system in 2005.

At the 3 training centers other than CERFIN, the up-grading training courses expanded; the number of the trainees increased from 80 (2006) to 279 (2007).

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

First, cases of new technologies being applied were reported, a process was automated at the factory level, and the quality of the products has improved at the enterprises which the trainees belong to. Also, these organizations and the Chamber of Commerce express their satisfaction with the training contents. Second, as many as 90% of the training graduates gained employment after the course at all the target centers, satisfying the demand from the industry sector. Other impacts include that the retrained instructors of different centers started communication to improve the curriculum/material and the operation and maintenance of the equipment, and that they have come to help other regional training centers besides the Project's target centers to improve the training facility and

curriculum/material.

(3) Synergetic Effects with the Grant Aid Project

The instructors retrained by this Project repeated retraining also to the instructors of the target centers of the Grant Aid Project, and monitored their performance. Also, the curriculum and material developed by this Project have been utilized at other centers. The Japanese experts of this Project gave advice so that useful equipment was selected for the Grant Aid Project.

This project has largely achieved its objectives; therefore its effectiveness is high.

3 Efficiency

(1) Outputs

As mentioned above, the Project achieved results as planned.

(2) Elements of Inputs

The inputs were mentioned in the "Project Outline." Some of the equipment was delayed due to the delay of the freight process and disparity of the specification, but this didn't affect the Project outputs. Other inputs were appropriate in terms of quality, quantity and timing.

(3) Project Cost, Period of Cooperation

The Project planned inputs of 234 million yen for Stage 1, and the actual cost was 815 million yen for Stage 1 and 2. The actual duration of the Project was 60 months, as planned.

The inputs are appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective; therefore efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

In the "National Development Plan (2007-2010)," vocational training and human resource development continue to be priorities, identifying the modernization of SECAP and vocational training of the vulnerable including women, as the national strategies.

(2) Institutional/Operational and Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

At each center, staff are assigned for management of the training courses, such as training needs assessment, follow-up of the graduates, revision of the curriculum/materials, support for job placement, etc. Instructors have been retrained at each center in all areas except industrial sewing. However, teaching staff isn't sufficient in terms of quantity and skills in some areas, as sufficient instructors haven't been newly hired, while training courses in the new area have been increasing. Out of 26 instructors who were working for the Project, 24 remain at CERFIN. For the revision of the curriculum/materials and its sharing among the centers, the procedure and the person in charge is clearly defined. The major equipment procured by the Project, with one exception, is functioning with regular inspections.

(3) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

The budget of SECAP has been increasing even since the Project ended in 2007. There was a slight deficit in 2008, but in other years the financial status was sound.

(4) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

Since the Project was completed, the number of some courses for up-grading and specialized training has been decreasing. This is because the duration of some courses was extended, and also two courses were integrated into one course. The number of graduates in all courses has been increasing, except one course at CERFIN. 90% of the graduates can find jobs after the training every year.

Some problems have been observed in the technical aspects of the executing agency; therefore, sustainability of the project effects is fair.