

## Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Akihiro Nakagome, Hideyuki Takagi Ernst & Young Advisory Co., Ltd.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project on the Improvement of Audio-Visual Aids and Instruction Methods in Vocational Training at the Instructor Training Center	February 2010 – December 2010

### I Project Outline

Country Name	Islamic Republic of Iran			
Project Period	June 1, 2002-May 31, 2005			
Executing Agency	Technical and Vocational Training Organization (TVTO) of the Ministry of Labor and Social Affairs (MoLSA)			
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Ministry of Health, Labor and Welfare; Employment and Human Resources Development Organization of Japan			
Total Cost	471 million yen			
Related Projects (if any)	Iran “Project for Enhancement of Vocational Training Administration” (July 2007-December 2010)			
Overall Goal	High-quality training is conducted at the Technical and Vocational Training Centers (TVTCs).			
Project Objective(s)	The standards of the Instructor Training Center (ITC) are improved in terms of the production of audio-visual aids and instruction methods for vocational training.			
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The equipment necessary for the development, production and use of audio-visual aids is introduced into ITC; and the staff of ITC gains the ability to maintain and continuously use the equipment.</li> <li>2. ITC gains the ability to develop and produce video aids using the adequate video equipment.</li> <li>3. ITC gains the capacity to manage the instructors’ training courses on production of audio-visual aids and instruction methods.</li> </ol>			
	Inputs (Japanese Side)		Inputs (Iran Side)	
Experts	4 for Long term, 6 for Short term		Staff allocated	14
Equipments	146 million yen		Equipments	-
Local Cost	15 million yen		Local Cost	607 thousand US dollar
Trainees Received	12		Land etc provided	Offices and commuting cars for experts, and warehouses for the equipment provided, etc.
Others	-		Others	-

### II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>The project was carried out generally as planned. Expected outputs such as implementation of training at ITC concerning the production of audio-visual aids and instruction methods, and technical acquisition by ITC were achieved. Even after the project completion, TVTC instructors who participated in training at ITC have maintained a high pass rate of the completion-of-course examinations. As recommended in terminal evaluation, TVTC instructors have provided similar training to instructors at private training institutions so that a partnership with them could be strengthened. On the other hand, partly due to delays in adopting candidates for new instructors, the number of participants of instructor’s training courses was significantly lower than planned, suggesting that the effect of the project was limited.</p> <p>In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be satisfactory.</p>

## 1 Relevance

### (1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Iran

During the project period, the Iran National Five-year Plan for the Development of the Economy, Society and Culture (Third: 2000-2004; Fourth: 2005-2009), placed a high priority on vocational training and human resources development and explicitly stated the roles that TVTCs and ITC should play.

### (2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Iran

During the project period, the unemployment rate in Iran was more than 10% on average: it fluctuated between 14% before the project and 11% at the end of the project. In this context, in order to respond to the problem of unemployment among young people and the sophistication of industry, TVTC was required to offer more sophisticated vocational training and job education to meet the needs for training. As a result, these issues became recognized as issues to be solved: the renewal and improvement in the training equipment, the development of audio-visual aids and other training materials, and capacity development of the instructors.

### (3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

In 1999 Japan and Iran agreed in their economic cooperation policy talks to position vocational training as a key aid area. Since then this issue has been carried in JICA's basic policy.

This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy; therefore its relevance is high.

## 2 Effectiveness / Impact

### (1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

In this project, improvement in training concerning audio-visual aids production and instruction methods was achieved. It was recognized that the participants had acquired some techniques for the production of audio-visual aids for vocational training, such as production and editing and scenario-writing for audio-visual teaching materials. The number of instructors trained in the project was significantly lower than planned and 1,149 instructors at the time of terminal evaluation had been trained. This was mainly due to delays in adopting trainees as new instructors. The TVTC instructors who received training at ITC have achieved a high pass rate of the completion-of-course examinations; therefore, the instructor training has largely accomplished the objective of the project in term of quality of training. However, such outputs were attributed in part to the leadership of experts from Japan. Thus, further efforts by the counterpart are still needed.

### (2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

TVTCs still use the audio-visual aids that they produced in this project for vocational training. However, responses from the counterpart to the questionnaire suggest that the provision of high-quality vocational training has not been achieved because the level of participants' understanding and knowledge is below expectation. In this regard, the attainment level of the overall goal of the project is fair at best. As for positive indirect effects of the project, instructor training was provided by the TVTCs instructors to instructors of private training institutions. In addition, to make use of results accomplished in this project, ITC now provides Afghanistan with support for vocational training there through JICA.

This project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair.

## 3 Efficiency

### (1) Outputs

As stated above in (1) of "Effectiveness / Impact", this project produced outputs generally as planned.

### (2) Elements of Inputs

Inputs of this project are as stated above in the "Project Outline." During the project period, a delay of several months occurred in equipment procurement, and so did another delay in the assignment of two counterpart personnel. However, outputs had been accomplished by the time of project completion. In the terminal evaluation, it was concluded that, except for the delays mentioned above, activities were carried out in an efficient manner in line with the PDM, suggesting that the delays had no impact on production of the outputs.

### (3) Project Period of Cooperation

The project, designed to be completed in 36 months in the plan, actually finished in 36 months just as planned (ratio of 100% to the plan).

### (4) Project Cost of Cooperation

The project, designed to cost 440 million yen in the plan, actually cost 471 million yen, slightly higher than planned (ratio of 107% to the plan). However, compared to technical cooperation projects whose content and target area are similar to this project, the project cost is judged appropriate for producing outputs; therefore, it is thought that there is no particular problem.

The inputs are appropriate for producing outputs and achieving the project objective, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

## 4 Sustainability

### (1) Related Policy towards the Project

The Iran National Five-year Plan for the Development of the Economy, Society and Culture (Fourth: 2005-2009) explicitly refers to vocational training policies just as the preceding five-year plan did. That is, high priority on vocational training has been given among the country's policies.

### (2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency

The counterpart has played the same role as it did during the project period. However, the number of its staff members decreased from 14 to 8 (decline rate is approximately 43%) as some resigned or were transferred. Thus, the counterpart does not seem to have sufficient personnel to continue offering instructor training.

### (3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

The counterpart still continues video program production through the use of audio-visual equipment introduced in this project, and the maintenance and inspection of the equipment. The level of instruction techniques is also maintained. According to a report from

the counterpart, some improvements in the training courses were made.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

According to a report from the counterpart, the government budget has been secured to maintain instructor training at ITC and vocational training at TVTC; thus there seems to be no financial problem.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

Even after the project completion, the TVTC instructors who participated in training at ITC have maintained a high pass rate of the completion-of-course examinations. On the other hand, as stated above in (2) of "Effectiveness / Impact", the scale of instructor training at ITC is still below the level expected at the beginning of the project.

Some minor problems have been observed in the structural aspects of the executing agency; therefore, the sustainability of the project effects is fair.

【Comments from ITC】

1. As for 4. *Sustainability* (2) *Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executive Agency*, although six counterpart personnel of the project in Audio-visual department have moved to another positions, but at the moment, two full time official instructors as well as three contract-based instructors are doing training activities. Both AV and pedagogy departments are the most active departments of ITC both in video aids production and teaching methods.
2. As for 4. *Sustainability* (5) *Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact*, after terminating the project, training courses were conducted for 600 newly employed public instructors and 1500 newly employed private instructors from all over the country. These training courses continue for instructors. Thus, referring the conducted evaluation, we believe the project had sufficient effectiveness.