

Simplified Ex-Post Evaluation for Technical Cooperation Project

Evaluator, Affiliation	Junko Miura Global Link Management Inc.	Duration of Evaluation Study
Project Name	The Project for Strengthening of National Bureau of Statistics in Data Providing Service	March 2010—December 2010

I Project Outline

Country Name	United Republic of Tanzania		
Project Period	From February 2004 to February 2007		
Executing Agency	National Statistics Bureau (NBS)		
Cooperation Agency in Japan	Statistics Bureau, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications Japan Statistical Association		
Total Cost	213 million Japanese Yen		
Related Projects (if any)	9 officials of the NBS participated in the various trainings by JICA between 2000 and 2006. Some of the officials were the counterparts of this project. From 2007 to 2009, the Poverty Monitoring Data Management Advisor was dispatched for following up this project as one of his tasks. From February to March 2009, an expert for Geographical Information System (GIS) was dispatched for assisting in storing the GIS data into the Integrated Statistical Database (ISD).		
Overall Goal	Statistical information is fully utilized in the process of policy and implementation with regard to poverty reduction in Tanzania.		
Project Objective(s)	NBS is able to provide policymakers, administrators, academics, NGOs, development partners and other general public with more reliable statistical data in a timely manner.		
Output[s]	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. NBS Integrated Statistical Database (ISD) is established and operated appropriately. 2. Statistical Library acquires the capacity to compile and disseminate the statistical data such as statistical abstracts and other publications through its own web site and library. 3. Users of statistical information (officers at NBS Regional Offices, line ministries, etc.) will be able to use the Database appropriately. 		
	Inputs (Japanese Side) Note: At the time of the Final Evaluation	Inputs (Tanzania Side)	
Experts	2 for Long term, 18 for Short term	Staff allocated	9
Equipments	2 million yen	Equipments	NA
Local Cost	17 million yen	Local Cost	NA
Trainees Received	6	Land etc provided	Statistical Library, Office for Experts
Others	None	Others	None

II Result of the Evaluation

Summary of the evaluation
<p>• This project has been highly relevant with the country's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high. Although the achievement of the indicators for the Overall Goal has not been confirmed, this project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair. In spite of the delay in dispatching the experts and the limited inputs by the counterparts, the Outputs and the Project Purpose have been achieved except some indicators within the planned project period and cost, therefore efficiency of the project is high. In spite of the limited human resources of the counterparts, no major problems have been observed in the policy background, technical, financial aspects of the counterparts, therefore, sustainability the project effects is high. In light of the above, this project is evaluated to be highly satisfactory.</p> <p><Recommendations to NBS></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The search system of the statistical data in the website should be improved. 2. The tariff system for the data dissemination should be established. <p><Lessons Learned></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. In this project, delay in installing Local Area Network (LAN) by NBS along with the renovation of the NBS building prevented its staff from accessing to the database and from enhancing their job quality. In the future similar projects, establishment of LAN should be stated as Pre-condition in the Project Design Matrix (PDM), and the project should start only after the pre-condition is met. 2. In this project, although the project period was decreased from five years to three years at the time of ex-ante evaluation, the contents of the Outputs and Activities were not modified appropriately. As a result, there is a high possibility that some indicators for Output 3 were not achieved and the capacity of the counterparts responsible for the applied training courses could not be strengthened to a satisfactory level. Therefore, in the future similar projects, if the project period is changed, it is recommended to modify the contents of Outputs and Activities accordingly. <p><Constraints of this evaluation study></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) The data obtained by direct observation are not included in this study because this study was conducted based on only the

- document review and the questionnaire to the counterparts.
- 2) When the data in the questionnaire answer, information from JICA and the report by the Poverty Monitoring Data Management Advisor is used, the raw data for those data were not confirmed.
 - 3) The degree of users' satisfaction, which was the indicator of the Project Purpose, was not measured because the questionnaire survey to the research institutes, line ministries and donors could not be conducted.
 - 4) Due to the lack of a field survey, there was no opportunity to hold discussions with the executing agency regarding the recommendations.
 - 5) It was difficult to measure the achievement of the Project Purpose due to the problems with the definition and indicators in the PDM.
 - The Project Purpose in the PDM cannot be achieved only by NBS because the cooperation by other statistical units is required for the improvement of the statistical reliability and the timeliness in dissemination.
 - Most indicators for the Project Purpose were Output level indicators.
 - Criteria and a benchmark were not established for the indicator "Satisfaction of users (about the data quality)".

1 Relevance

(1) Relevance with the Development Plan of Tanzania

At the time of planning, in the Master Plan for Poverty Monitoring System, which was formulated as a part of Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP) in December 2001, it was emphasized that there is a need to provide users with statistical information properly and to monitor the progress of the indicators along with the PRSP. At the end of the project, the Master Plan II in March 2006 stressed the same point. Therefore, the support in strengthening the capacity of NBS in statistical data management and dissemination for poverty monitoring was relevant with the development plans of Tanzania from the planning to the end of the project.

(2) Relevance with the Development Needs of Tanzania

At the time of planning, the capacity of NBS in statistical data collection, management and dissemination was not sufficient. Statistical surveys conducted by the NBS and statistical units of other ministries were saved separately by themselves due to the lack of integrated system. In this project, the above statistical surveys were saved in the statistical integrated database. However, enhancing the capacity of NBS in statistical data collection, management and dissemination was still a development priority for Tanzania at the end of the project. Therefore, the assistance in the above area was relevant with the development needs of Tanzania from the planning to the end of the project.

(3) Relevance with Japan's ODA Policy

At the time of planning, the Japan's ODA policy towards Tanzania in the year 2000 and the policy consultations between the two governments in 2001 stressed the following five priority areas: 1) development of agriculture and small-scale enterprises, 2) basic education, 3) population, HIV/AIDS and children's health, 4) improvement of basic infrastructure particularly in cities, 5) preservation of forest. The poverty reduction was included in the first four priorities. In the Japan's ODA policy towards Tanzania in August 2006, the improvement of the administrative capacity for poverty reduction was added to the above priorities. Therefore, the assistance to NBS in strengthening the capacity in statistical data management and dissemination for poverty monitoring was relevant with the Japan's ODA policy from the planning to the end of the project.

This project has been highly relevant with the Tanzania's development plan, development needs, as well as Japan's ODA policy, therefore its relevance is high.

2 Effectiveness / Impact

(1) Achievement of Project Outputs and Project Objective(s)

【Achievement of the Outputs】

All the indicators for Output 1 (NBS Integrated Statistical Database is established and operated appropriately) and Output 2 (Statistical Library acquires the capacity to compile and disseminate the statistical data such as statistical abstracts and other publications through its own web site and library.) were achieved. However, two out of three indicators for Output 3 (Users of statistical information will be able to use the Database appropriately) were not achieved. For Indicator 1 for Output 3, the actual number of sessions of applied training courses conducted was limited to twice whereas it was planned to conduct more than nine times¹. For Indicator 2 for Output 3, the actual number of participants in the applied training courses was also limited to thirty whereas more than 135 persons were planned to participate. The reasons for non-achievement were as follows. 1) The twelve-time-applied training courses were planned based on the conditions that the project period is five years and that ISD is established before the applied training courses. However, the actual project period was three years², thus it was not possible to secure sufficient time for conducting the courses for twelve times. 2) The trainers for the applied training courses appointed by NBS had limited capacity as trainers. Meanwhile, it can be said that Indicator 3 for Output 3 (participants acquire skills and knowledge) was achieved because the pre-post test result in the applied training course showed the increase of the score by 35.4 point after the training.

【Achievement of the Project Purpose】

Regarding the Indicator 1 for Project Purpose (satisfaction of users), the improvement of the data quality and of website contents were acknowledged by line ministries, research institutes and donors at the time of the final evaluation. However, it was pointed out that it is difficult to search data on the website. The satisfaction of users at the end of the project is unknown because questionnaire survey for the concerned could not be conducted.

¹At the time of final evaluation, a benchmark (more than nine times) was newly established for the number of the applied training courses based on the actual number of basic training courses conducted (nine times). However, it is unknown whether a full discussion was held or not by the evaluation mission regarding the appropriateness of the benchmark (conducting the applied training courses for seven times in six months).

²As the project period in the ex-ante evaluation summary was 3 years, there is a possibility that the project period was shortened from 5 years to 3 years without the modification of the activities which were planned before the ex-ante evaluation.

Meanwhile, Indicator 2 for Project Purpose (data stored in ISD and uploaded in the website within two to three months after receiving statistical surveys from ministries and other statistical units) was established at the time of ex-post evaluation because the PDM did not contain an indicator which demonstrates the improvement in the timeliness. For the above indicator, all the authorized data had been immediately stored in ISD and uploaded in the website by the end of the project. In light of the above, it is judged that the Project Purpose has been largely achieved.

【Contribution of the Outputs to the Project Purpose】

In spite of the fact that the reliability and timeliness had been largely improved by the three Outputs, the final evaluation report pointed out that it was difficult to measure the contribution of the Outputs to the Project Purpose because there is a logical gap between the Output and the Project Purpose.

No particular contributing and preventing factors have been observed.

(2) Achievement of Overall Goal, Intended and Unintended Impacts

According to the NBS, the Overall Goal has been achieved. However, regarding Indicator 1 (statistical data is more quoted in the Poverty and Human Development Report) and Indicator 2 (Discussion is enlarged and deepen based on the statistical data in the Poverty Monitoring Working Groups), any specific case for evidence has been reported. No other particular impacts have been observed. Although this is not a negative impact, space for storing data is immediately to be enlarged because the data quantity was increased after the project.

This project has somewhat achieved its objectives, therefore its effectiveness is fair.

3 Efficiency

(1) Inputs

For the Japanese side, the actual number of the trainees received was the same as the planned. The equipment was also provided as planned. Whether there is a gap or not between the number of the planned experts and the actual could not be confirmed due to the followings: 1) planned number of experts and Man-Month (M/M) were not indicated in the ex-ante evaluation summary; 2) the planned and actual assignment sheet could not be obtained; and 3) the difference between the plan and the actual for the number of experts was not pointed out in the final evaluation report.

Regarding the appropriateness of timing in dispatching the experts, two issues were pointed out by the final evaluation report. 1) At the planning, the Statistics Bureau of the Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications in Japan was supposed to offer some experts, but it did not realize. It was extremely difficult to secure appropriate experts in timely manner given that the tasks are related to governmental statistics. As a result, the implementation of the database applied training courses was delayed. 2) Experts who were involved in the similar project in other country had to adjust their schedules. Consequently, experts were not dispatched in the perfect timing for the counterparts.

For the Tanzanian side, statistical library and the office for experts were provided as planned. However, there were two problems. 1) The number of staff for the data processing was not sufficient. 2) LAN was planned to be installed in the first or second year, but it was seriously delayed (not completed by the final evaluation). Consequently, it prevented NBS staff from accessing to the database and from enhancing the job quality.

In light of the above, the final evaluation stated that there was a room for improvement in terms of efficiency. But, inputs for not contributing to the Outputs were reported. According to the final evaluation report, it is noteworthy that this project cost is approximately 210 million Japanese Yen (JPY) for three years (70 million JPY per year) whereas the cost of the similar project in Cambodia is about 240 million JPY for two years (120 million JPY per year). Thus, the annual cost of this project is lower than the equivalent of Cambodia. However, the project in Cambodia covers the wider range of activities such as planning of statistics, data collection and dissemination, thus it is not possible to simply compare those cost.

(2) Period of Cooperation

Both the planned and actual project period was 36 months. Thus, the period of cooperation is as planned.

(3) Project Cost

The planned cost was approximately 210 million JPY whereas the actual cost was 213 million JPY. Therefore, the project cost was almost as planned.

In spite of the delay in dispatching the experts and the limited inputs by the counterparts, the Outputs and the Project Purpose have been achieved except some indicators within the planned project period and cost, therefore efficiency of the project is high.

4 Sustainability

(1) Related Policy towards the Project

Even after the end of the project, the enhancement of the capacity of NBS in statistical data management and dissemination for poverty monitoring is an urgent issue for Tanzanian Government. Tanzania Statistical Master Plan (TSMP) in 2009 stated that the data storing space and National Statistical System (NSS) should be established.

(2) Institutional and Operational Aspects of the Executing Agency

According to the NBS, the number of staff for data processing is limited and only IT Manager is in charge of website update. On the other hand, two staff is assigned for the library. In spite of this limited number of human resources, statistical surveys have been continuously stored in the ISD and uploaded in the website, as described later. Thus, if the current number of staff with current level of capacity is continuously retained in the future, there is a high possibility that NBS can sustain its capacity in data management and dissemination.

(3) Technical Aspects of the Executive Agency

It can be said that the IT staff has acquired required skills for database and network management because statistical surveys have been continuously stored in the ISD and uploaded in the website even after the end of the project. Local Area Network was introduced after the completion of the renovation of the second floor of the NBS. Out of the technical issues to be improved, the following two issues were improved: 1) file formats of raw data of various statistical surveys have been standardized; 2) attribution data of statistical surveys have been improved and the raw data transmission between NBS and other statistical units became smooth by introducing the Microdata Management Toolkit (MMT) through the Accelerated Data Program by the World Bank. The new system introduced by the project for the smooth data transmission between the NBS and other statistical units is still functioning at the ex-post evaluation. Such system includes the participation of NBS IT Department staff in the statistical surveys and censuses, and the appointment of responsible persons in the statistical units in each ministry for data transmission to NBS. In light of the above, there is no major problem with the technical aspects.

(4) Financial Aspects of the Executive Agency

Detail financial status of the NBS is unknown. Although the tariff policy for data dissemination was formulated by the NBS, the system has not been established. However, there is an access for NBS to the basket fund for TSMP, therefore it cannot be said that there is a problem with financial status.

(5) Continuity of Effectiveness and Impact

At the Project Purpose level, statistical surveys have been continuously stored in the ISD and uploaded in the website soon after receiving statistical surveys from other statistical units. However, according to the NBS, statistical data search system in the website has to be further improved as pointed out at the final evaluation. Degree of users' satisfaction is unknown because a questionnaire survey could not be conducted.

At the Output level, regarding Output 1, the number of statistical surveys stored in the ISD is increasing. The data transmission between NBS and statistical units became smooth although no quantitative data is available. For Output 2, the number of statistical books sold in the library between March 2007 (end of the project) and May 2010 reached 3,757. This means that the statistical publications have been sold at the same pace with the project implementation period (1,200 books per year). Although the statistical library was closed due to the renovation until June 2010, it is expected to be used by more people in the future.

Although the number of human resources is limited, no major problems have been observed in the policy background, technical, financial aspects of the executing agency, and the effects by the project is continuously maintained, therefore sustainability the project effects is high.